

## Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry

Witness Statement of

MMC

Support person present: No

1. My name is MMC. My maiden name is MMC. My date of birth is 1957. My contact details are known to the Inquiry.
2. I am giving this statement on behalf of my brother MMD, whose date of birth was 1961. MMD was a boarder at Carlekemp Priory School and Fort Augustus Abbey School. MMD took his own life in 2014.

### Background

3. MMD lived with our parents, and younger brother, in Malaysia before he started at Carlekemp. died in 2010. He was two years younger than MMD. also attended Carlekemp and Fort Augustus. My two sisters, and , and I were boarders at the Convent of the Sacred Heart, Kilgraston, Bridge of Earn, Perthshire. is a year older than me and is a year younger.
4. I don't have any memory of MMD's very early life as I was sent to boarding school when I was six and only went home once a year. We were all looked after by a nanny whom we were all very close to. She did all the childcare. Remembering her as I do, I would assume that MMD's very early years were probably quite settled. My dad worked and my mum was very involved in the Catholic Church, so she spent a lot of time supporting the Catholic ministry.

**Carlekemp Priory School, North Berwick**

5. **MMD** began his education at Carlekemp when he was seven years old. [REDACTED] joined him there when he turned seven. As far as I am aware, **MMD** and [REDACTED] were housed together throughout their time at school.
  
6. I had very intermittent contact with my brothers when they attended Carlekemp. I was at a Catholic boarding school, so the nuns took me and my sisters to visit them a couple of times. We would all come together in the summer holidays when we returned home to our parents, but I wouldn't describe us as being close. This was the only time that we had any meaningful contact with the boys so we were quite cut off from them. I have a distant memory of **MMD** being unhappy and withdrawn, but he did not disclose that anything was troubling him.
  
7. I don't have any specific knowledge about Carlekemp. I know that **MMD** first came into contact with a monk called [REDACTED] **MFC** when he started at the school. [REDACTED] **MFC** took a personal interest in **MMD** and he promoted himself to my parents as a trusted adult whom they and **MMD** could rely on. My mother was a devout Catholic, and, with my parents living so far away, it was of great comfort to my mother that [REDACTED] **MFC** befriended **MMD** and then [REDACTED] too.
  
8. My mother used to exchange letters with [REDACTED] **MFC** and she would talk about him, so I was very aware that he had moved into my mother's circle and that he was looking after my brothers. I know that [REDACTED] **MFC** sent my mother photographs of **MMD** and [REDACTED] and regular updates about their progress at school. I saw these when I was older so I know that my mother kept them. My sister and I have looked through everything but can't find any of them now.
  
9. My parents did not know [REDACTED] **MFC** before **MMD** started at Carlekemp. I can only surmise that he took it upon himself to make contact with them. He would also visit my parents at home when they came back to Scotland for holidays. My mother often had priests in the house so this was quite normal. I have no memory of seeing [REDACTED] **MFC** interacting with **MMD** during the time he was at Carlekemp.

### Fort Augustus Abbey School, Inverness-shire

10. **MMD** started at Fort Augustus when he was twelve years old. Father **MMF** **MMF** was the monk **SNR**. **MFC** was also at Fort Augustus during **MMD**'s time at the school. **MMD** slept in a dormitory and initially **MFC** **MFC** was his housemaster. **MFC** continued to send my mother updates about **MMD** while he was at Fort Augustus.
11. I am only four years older than **MMD** but from a very young age my mum made it clear to me that it was my job to look after my brothers. I remember feeling that something was wrong when **MMD** was at Fort Augustus and that I needed to be with him to help him. I did not know then that **MFC** was sexually abusing **MMD**. I just remember feeling that something was wrong and that I had to go to **MMD**. It was like when you look at a picture and you think there's something wrong but you can't quite put your finger on it. So I repeatedly absconded from Kilgraston and made my way to Fort Augustus. I did this about seven or eight times. The police were never called. **MMD** didn't disclose anything to me at that point, but he was always delighted to see me.
12. **MMD** used to hide me behind a pub in a tent. I'd usually only last a day before I got caught. Father **MMF** would then take me to Fort Augustus and lock me in a room. He was very frightening. He treated me as if I had done something terrible. He would shout at me and then he'd arrange for me to be taken back to Kilgraston. He never asked me why I kept coming to Fort Augustus. I didn't say anything to him about my concerns for **MMD**. I was too scared.
13. I tried to tell the nuns at my school that I was going to Fort Augustus because I had concerns for my brother, but nobody would listen. I was punished for it, actually. My parents were informed about my running away but they thought that I was just causing trouble. Their view was that we were a good family and I was bringing them into disrepute. There was never any opportunity to speak to my parents and tell them that I was running away because I felt concerned for **MMD**.

14. I don't remember anything more about Fort Augustus other than very vivid memories of [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED]. I don't remember any specific conversations with him. He was just always there. He was never kind or understanding towards me, whereas he was very gentle and caring with [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED]. He'd put his arm around [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED]'s shoulders and reassure him, telling him not to worry and that it wasn't his fault that I had come to the school. He didn't attempt to talk to me to find out why I kept coming to the school. I always got the feeling that he didn't like me. I think he saw me as a bit of a threat.
15. I was told to leave Kilgraston School when I was seventeen, so I didn't remain at school for very long after [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] started at Fort Augustus. My parents and the nuns at the school made arrangements for me to go somewhere else. I then became estranged from my parents and was caught in my own crisis and lost touch with [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED]. The only family member I continued to have contact with during this time was [REDACTED].
16. My parents moved to Africa and then the Far East when [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] was at Fort Augustus, so I think [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] maybe only saw them a couple of times a year. My sister [REDACTED] remembers [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] coming home during the holidays and she told me that he was always really quiet.

## Abuse

### *Fort Augustus*

17. I did not find out until 2010 that [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] had been sexually assaulted by [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED]. [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] My brother [REDACTED] died very suddenly and [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] told me about [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] when he came over to Scotland for [REDACTED]'s funeral. At this point [REDACTED] MMD [REDACTED] was highly distressed and frightened and his world was falling apart. He asked me first of all if I had been abused. He was very concerned that something had happened to me and he asked whether it had been dad or someone in school, and he kept going on like this until I asked him whether anything had ever happened to him. He first of all said that [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] really liked him and I said that I knew

that because mum had always said so. He then said no, [MFC] really liked him a lot. By that point I was a social worker, so I realised that he was going to tell me something and I just asked him some brief questions around what might have happened and he started to cry. He then told me some of what had happened to him. He told me that it had been in his head all those years and that he had hoped he could make it go away by getting married, but it never had.

18. It is clear from what [MMD] told me that [MFC] skilfully groomed [MMD]. He initially "befriended" [MMD] and found ways to be alone with him. When you go to boarding school you don't finish your working day until 5:00 pm, then you have your dinner and then you have prep which lasts for two hours. I remember [MMD] describing all the boys sitting at desks in a big hall doing prep, and [MFC] [MFC] would come and take [MMD] from the hall and give him private lessons. [MMD] said that's when it started. He wasn't very clear about the timeframes so it's possible it started at Carlekemp. [MMD] told me that [MFC] would also ask him to do extra housework and cleaning and he would always be there while [MMD] was doing this. Then he would get [MMD] to come to his room and he would tell [MMD] that he could keep his hands warm by putting them down his cassock. Fort Augustus was a really old and cold school, so [MMD] would do this to keep his fingers warm. He would then ask [MMD] to touch his penis.
19. [MMD] told me that [MFC] then took him and anally raped him one night. I think he would have been about fourteen years old. It must have been so horrifying and frightening for him. [MMD] said that that was the point when he knew something was wrong and that he had to do something. He told me that he tried so hard never to be alone with [MFC]. He said he joined every single sports club, society, team, anything that involved doing things in a group outside of school hours. I asked him if that worked and he said not all of the time. He said that he was so frightened that somebody would have seen them and would tell so it became a secret. He said that he had to keep this secret. [MMD] then stopped talking about it and I didn't ask him any more.

20. **MMD** also spoke to me about the confusion that was felt as we were growing up over how affection was physically expressed. None of us knew anything. We didn't get any sex education at all. My mother gave us all a picture of the Virgin Mary when we were getting our periods, so God knows what the boys were told.
21. **MMD** was able to talk about the level of aggression in the school. He was able to talk about boys being punched and kicked by the monks. He said that one man, Father **MFA**, was particularly vicious towards some boys. It seems that **MFC** **MFC** protected **MMD** from the worst of the physical violence.
22. I am certain that Father **MMF** knew what was going on. There was something about that man that was really cruel. And it wasn't a huge school. It didn't have thousands of kids in it. There were probably less than three hundred children there, so I believe he would have known what was going on in his school.
23. I don't think **██████████** was abused at Fort Augustus. **██████████** suffered a brain injury as an adult and was very impaired as a result. I did try to talk to him after the accident about his experiences in school, but he didn't understand what I was talking about. **██████████** was an incredibly able student. When I look back now, I think that's probably what kept **██████████** safe. He got accepted at Oxford when he was sixteen and the school would have been able to promote itself on the back of this.
24. **MMD** and **██████████** were very different. **MMD** was very pretty. They always made him the girl in the school plays. I've seen photographs of him with lipstick smudged on his lips and big, blue eye make-up on. I remember seeing those photographs and thinking they were horrible. None of the other boys in the play had make-up on, just **MMD**. **MMD** and **██████████** weren't close as brothers. They were highly competitive towards each other and were always set up against each other. I think this must have come from the school.

*Carlekemp*

25. I don't remember who spoke about this but we knew that [REDACTED] and MMD were both beaten with belts by the monks at Carlekemp. It wasn't a pleasant experience for any of us at a Catholic boarding school. It was quite normal at boarding school to be beaten and humiliated. We were beaten with a little whip thing that the nuns kept under their habits, and in Carlekemp it was a belt. That's just what happened when you went to school. It didn't seem odd to us.
26. Both [REDACTED] and MMD spoke about bullying at school, particularly at Carlekemp. They were quite isolated there. I think a lot of the boys went home on weekend leave and [REDACTED] and MMD were there all the time. Before his accident, [REDACTED] had talked about being frightened of older pupils and how sad he was because he was little and fat with ginger hair and glasses. He was a real target. I think he was incredibly bullied at prep school but when he went to Fort Augustus he came into his own.
27. There was no protection for the boys at school. There was no-one whose responsibility it was to look after their wellbeing. There was a matron in Carlekemp, but I think she was as bad as the monks. The only person [REDACTED] spoke of as being kind was a monk called Paul McCarron. I have heard that he left the Order and became a social worker in Edinburgh.
28. The schools weren't set up in a way that you could speak to someone from outside if you had any concerns. They were boarding schools. You live there and you don't get out. In our school we had to write a letter to our parents every week and the nuns read them, so I'm pretty sure the monks would have read the boys' letters too. You'd just write that you were working hard and doing the usual, pretty standard stuff.

### Life after Fort Augustus

29. **MMD** left Fort Augustus after completing his final year and moved back to Edinburgh to stay in my parents' Scottish home. My sister **[REDACTED]** recently reminded me that **[REDACTED]** **MFC** was still coming to the house at this point and **MMD** tried to get my mum to stop it. My parents took great offence at this and their relationship with **MMD** fractured. My father eventually threw **MMD** out of the house and he became estranged from my parents completely. I think **MMD** was about seventeen or eighteen at the time.
30. **MMD** then moved to London, studied at the London School of Economics, graduated and moved into the banking industry. He met his future wife **[REDACTED]** a New Zealander, in London. **MMD** was separated from the family, but I saw him a few times and he seemed happier. He was really happy to have met somebody. He had no qualms about moving to Auckland with **[REDACTED]** which he did without a backward glance. He seemed to be determined to put significant distance between himself and Scotland.
31. I attended **MMD**'s wedding with my sister and daughter and I remember feeling so happy and so relieved. **MMD** looked happy, he was marrying a lovely woman, and I felt that I didn't have to worry about him any more, that I had done my job. **MMD** went on to have three children with **[REDACTED]** two girls and a boy.
32. **MMD** didn't keep in touch with any of his former school friends. It was like he wanted to cut out everything of his life in Scotland when he moved to New Zealand. He had no connections with anybody at all. He just left and went to the furthest away place in the world. He said to me that he wouldn't leave me, but he had a new family now and he wouldn't be coming back.

## Impact

33. What MFC did to MMD ate destructively away at him for all his life. The pain he must have endured was indescribable. MMD's only method of keeping the darkness at bay was alcohol and he paid a terrible price for this.
34. told me that MMD started drinking when he was in London, although the drinking seemed kind of social at first, not problematic. After the birth of his first child, MMD started to phone me quite regularly and I became aware that his drinking had got worse. used to phone too sometimes, or she'd write to me and she'd let me know in little bits and pieces that they were struggling. There were serious difficulties in their marriage, MMD's alcohol use was out of control and he struggled to show affection to his son.
35. MMD used to come back to Edinburgh on a fairly regular basis, maybe once or twice a year, and we would walk round all the places we remembered. I saw then that his alcohol use was starting to get out of control but not to the point that I got so alerted. He used to say it was just pressure of work. supported MMD into two or three detox facilities in New Zealand but it never worked. He was one of those alcoholics who thought he could handle it, that he was smarter than everybody else, and he continued to drink.
36. MMD was an with the Bank of New Zealand and earned an astronomical amount of money. He lived with his family in an enormous house and they had a good lifestyle. He got sacked in the end because of his drinking and they lost everything. was so angry with him. She lost her beautiful house, her income, pension, everything. She and MMD separated and MMD moved to live in a horrible, little one-bedroom bedsit in Auckland. He got a job in a sort of publishing house, proof-reading for pennies, and he gave pretty much everything he earned.

37. MMD and [REDACTED]'s children were still quite young when [REDACTED] left him. The eldest would have been about twelve and the youngest about eight. MMD used to talk to me about how he felt towards his son. This was after he disclosed what MFC [REDACTED] had done to him. MMD couldn't tell his son that he loved him and he couldn't hug him. He could touch his daughters, but he could never touch his son. It broke his heart that he couldn't hug his son. MMD really wanted to love him but he couldn't. MMD would also talk about how he was only ever able to be intimate with [REDACTED] when he was drunk. He was so full of shame and used to say that he just wanted to be normal.
38. MMD had a relationship with his children to some extent after he and [REDACTED] separated, but I think he embarrassed them a lot of the time. He would turn up drunk to school things and sports events. At that point [REDACTED] and I were still talking so I would hear about this. [REDACTED] didn't know about MFC [REDACTED]. I asked MMD why he didn't tell her and he said that she wouldn't have understood. [REDACTED] tried her best to support MMD after they separated. MMD used to go missing at times and she would phone me. I quite often got the police in Scotland involved and they would ring the police in New Zealand and they would find him.
39. It was only when MMD came over to Scotland for [REDACTED]'s funeral that it became apparent to me he had to use alcohol daily purely to function. MMD was staying with me when he came over. I would hear him crying when he went to bed at night and I would go in to talk to him but he wouldn't tell me why he was crying. He would get me to go to the shops to buy him more vodka because he couldn't sleep. When he was asleep he would scream, not words, just screaming.
40. It frightened my boys so much that I decided MMD couldn't stay with me. So I went to A & E and managed to persuade them to give me four Valium for him, and then I took him to my sister's. My sister knew how to manage it. She got a family GP to prescribe for him and she managed him through the worst of it. He then came back to live with me for a week and that is when he told me about MFC [REDACTED]. The shame that MMD carried with him overwhelmed him and it was only during this

period of great stress that he was able to let me know some of what had happened to him.

41. When **MMD** returned to New Zealand, he phoned me every single week. I was the only one he could talk to. He used to say how sad he was and that he couldn't see an end to it. He couldn't make anything work in his life, nothing was right, everything was wrong. He thought things would get better after he told me. I tried really hard to get him to go for help, but he wouldn't do it. As a family, we're not very good at that. In boarding school you learn to self-care. That's why it is so difficult to ask for help. And for **MMD** there was so much shame. He was so full of shame, it ate away at him. The only way he could control it was to drink. He kept explaining to me that alcohol was the only thing that made it go away.
42. I kept in touch with **MMD** weekly by phone, just trying to keep him going emotionally. I'd tell him not to go and see his kids drunk, to drink just a little bit before he went or wait until afterwards. My own marriage was falling apart at that point and **MMD** tried to help me and offer me some comfort through that. I can't begin to explain how incredibly isolated we were as children so actually forming relationships as adults for us is incredibly complicated. If I put my work head on, I absolutely know that we all had massive issues around attachment but somehow I could do it with **MMD**. And I think he felt the same way about me, so we managed it and we kept in touch.
43. **MMD** quite often talked to me about taking his own life. I think if somebody tells you that they're going to kill themselves it's usually a good indicator that they are not going to do it. They are just in so much pain that they want to tell someone. I would talk **MMD** through what had happened that day, what was causing it and he would move on. I would then feel reassured that he was going to be okay. The one time he didn't tell me was when he did it. This was in **[REDACTED]** 2014, sometime between the **[REDACTED]**.
44. **MMD** was found in the bathroom, in the shower, completely naked. I think the fact he was completely naked is significant. He wasn't having a shower, he was just in the bathroom completely naked. The police told **[REDACTED]** it was probable that **MMD** had

taken his own life. She hadn't seen him for five days and went to his house, and when she couldn't get in she phoned the police and they broke in and found him. There was no note. There was a post mortem and they put it down to alcohol. [REDACTED] wouldn't pass over any reports to me, so I haven't seen anything.

45. [REDACTED] didn't give me time to get New Zealand for [REDACTED]'s funeral. She cremated him within twenty-four hours and sent me his ashes through the post.
46. [REDACTED] has stopped speaking to us now. She is very angry and I understand that. I would have liked to have known [REDACTED]'s children but I can't. I feel like I've let [REDACTED] down. His children will never know him, and they'll never know his family. I don't want them to know what happened to him, I just want them to know him. He was a good man at heart. He was a child and he wasn't responsible for what people did to him. I hold [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] totally responsible for taking the innocence and joy of [REDACTED]'s childhood and destroying [REDACTED]'s sense of self. I hope that one day [REDACTED]'s children will have questions and they will come to me to ask about him.
47. It's really hard to put into words how to describe [REDACTED]. There was so much goodness and kindness in him. My boys thought he was lovely. He had a sense of humour and he was funny. He just carried such darkness in him. I can't begin to even scrape the surface of how awful it was for him. There really are no words that can adequately describe the level of emotional distress [REDACTED] was in, and he carried that all of his life.
48. I am not saying that [REDACTED] would have lived a successful, happy life if he hadn't been abused. I think we had enough going against us to begin with, with the kind of parents we had and the upbringing we had, but he just didn't get the chance.

## Reporting of abuse

49. **MMD** didn't tell my parents what was happening to him, but when he was still at school he used to say to my mum that he didn't want **MFC** to come to the house and that he didn't like it when he came. **MMD** told me that he used to say this to my mum, and my sister **████████** also remembers him saying this. My mum never asked him why. She would give him a row instead. My mum would say to him, "What would we have done without dear Father **MFC**?" She could never have questioned **MFC** motives. It would have destroyed her.
50. **MMD** didn't report the abuse to the police. He never told anybody other than me. Talking about sexual abuse is almost impossible for men of a certain generation. They are just not equipped to talk about it because there is so much shame to it. They can't talk about it, so they destroy themselves internally which is what happened to **MMD**.
51. When I look back now, I think I should have called the police when **MMD** told me. I don't know why I didn't. I am still frightened of the Catholic Church. I think **MMD** felt the same. I meet a nun and my foot still goes behind me, because we had to curtsy to nuns when I was younger. I have to force myself now not to do that.
52. About two or three years ago, the police from Inverness phoned me and said that they were investigating the potential abuse of children in Fort Augustus and asked if they could come and speak to me. I don't know how they knew who I was because I haven't used the name **MMC** for a long time. They must have told me how they got my name, but I don't remember. The police contacting me made it real. Even though none of us went on to become practising Catholics when we finished our education, I was brought up a Catholic and what happened to **MMD** was so horrific that there was a part of me that thought it couldn't have happened. Two police officers, a male and female, came to see me and took a statement. I told them pretty much what I've told the Inquiry, but nothing happened. They gave me an email

address to contact them for updates and I did email to ask what was happening, but I never got a reply.

### Other action taken

53. Since MMD died, I have tracked MFC I know he is in a town somewhere in Canada, having been moved there by the Catholic Church. I have read a lot about institutional abuse and I know that that's what the Catholic Church does. They don't admit to it. They either retire them or they move them somewhere quiet.
54. I do not feel vengeful but I feel angry. And I feel that MFC should not be allowed to remove himself from any accountability. There are too many people who get away with things that they shouldn't. The only thing I can do for MMD now is to tell people what happened to him. And I hope that the procurator fiscal somehow finds a way to extradite MFC back into this country and he is prosecuted. I believe there will be other men. From my years of experience as a social worker I know that MFC will have targeted other boys. When it's a family member they might just target the one child, but it is very unusual for somebody in an institution to abuse only one child.
55. When I saw the television documentary Sins Of Our Fathers, I got in touch with Mark Daly and he put me in touch with a wonderful man called Murdoch who produced the film. He gave me photographs of MMD and put me in touch with someone, MMD, who was at school with MMD
56. MMD lives in India now. He was at Carlekemp and Fort Augustus with MMD. He came to speak to me about MMD. MMD said he was aware that something was wrong with MMD but he didn't know what. He said there was a group of four or five of them and they just tried to look after each other all the time. I don't know the other boys' names. I asked MMD if MFC did anything to him and he said no.

57. [REDACTED] was able to tell me that Father [MFA] beat him up and he punched Father [MFA] but he wasn't excluded for that. [REDACTED] also said that Father [MMF] [MMF] knew what was going on in the school. He knew about the boys being beaten by Father [MFA]. [REDACTED] had nice parents and when he was assaulted by Father [MFA] he told his parents and his parents confronted the school. He said when his parents spoke to Father [MMF] it wasn't a shock to him, he knew what was going on.
58. [REDACTED] also told me that when the boys got beaten with belts by the monks in Carlekemp, they would be sent to the matron and she would chastise them. I haven't spoken to anyone else who went to school with [MMD]
59. I took enormous comfort from speaking to [REDACTED] because he was able to tell me things about [MMD] that I didn't know, like what type of music he liked, what kind of clothes he liked, the silly things they had done at school and all the times they'd had a laugh. It was really important for me to meet [REDACTED] and hear that there were times when [MMD] was smiling and that it wasn't all terrible.
60. I have not reported [MFC] to the Benedictine Order and I have not tried to recover any records for [MMD] I don't even know how to do that. I have had no contact at all with the Order.

### **Hopes for the Inquiry**

61. I know from the job I do that a lot of children in foster care and in children's units have access to children's rights workers and all sorts of other people now. But for some reason people seem to think that if you are in a religious establishment it will be better and kinder, and nobody questions it because it's about God. There is a whole generation of children who are probably still in boarding schools run by religious orders where there are no safeguards. I would like the Inquiry to address

what happens in these schools. Nobody came into our school to ask anything. If you were a very lucky little girl you got to go and see the parish priest, but you had to be a very lucky little girl. There were no external visitors and you never got out. If you did go out there was a nun with you, and I am sure it was exactly the same for MMD and [REDACTED]

62. I have no objection to my witness statement being published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry. I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are true.

MMC

Signed..... [REDACTED] .....

Dated..... 16<sup>th</sup> April 2019 .....