

1 Tuesday, 17 September 2019

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome back to the hearings  
4 in this case study. I think, as was mentioned on Friday  
5 before we finished, our first witness this morning is  
6 joining us by video link; is that right, Mr MacAulay?

7 MR MacAULAY: Yes, that is correct. He's joining us from  
8 Delhi and there's about a 4.5-hour time difference --  
9 they're 4.5 hours ahead of us, so I think it'll be  
10 heading into the afternoon where he is.

11 This next witness is an applicant and he wants to  
12 remain anonymous and he wants to use the name "Ian" in  
13 giving evidence.

14 LADY SMITH: Ian, good afternoon to you; as I think you just  
15 heard me explain it's the morning here in Edinburgh.

16 First of all, thank you for agreeing to join us by  
17 video link from Delhi today; that's very helpful.

18 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.

19 LADY SMITH: I'd like to begin by explaining a few things.

20 First of all, I chair this inquiry -- I'm Lady Smith --  
21 and, as has probably already been explained to you,  
22 we're in a hearing room in Edinburgh, which is open to  
23 the public. There are various representatives of those  
24 with an interest in the inquiry here and some members of  
25 the public in the public benches along with some of the

1 inquiry team.

2 Before we turn to your evidence, I'd like to begin,  
3 please, by asking you to raise your right hand, as I'm  
4 doing, and repeat after me.

5 "IAN" (affirmed) (via video link)

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you for that, Ian. Can I just say, I am  
7 hearing you very clearly and seeing you very clearly;  
8 I hope it's operating for you on that basis at your end.

9 A. Yes.

10 LADY SMITH: Are you hearing me all right?

11 A. Perfectly.

12 LADY SMITH: Good. If at any time there are any  
13 difficulties, please would you let us know and we'll  
14 stop and see what we can do about it. Otherwise, if  
15 you're ready, I'll hand over to Mr MacAulay and he will  
16 explain to you what happens next. Is that all right?

17 A. That's great, thank you very much. I'm ready.

18 Questions from MR MacAULAY

19 MR MacAULAY: Hello, Ian. The first thing I want to do is  
20 to take you to your statement, which I think you have on  
21 a screen.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. I'll give the reference of the statement for the  
24 transcript: WIT.001.002.8443.

25 Could I ask you to turn to the last page.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Can you confirm that you have signed the statement?
- 3 A. Yes, I have signed it.
- 4 Q. Do you tell us that you have no objection to your  
5 witness statement being published as part of the  
6 evidence to the inquiry; is that correct?
- 7 A. That is correct.
- 8 Q. Do you also say:
- 9 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
10 statement are true"; is that right?
- 11 A. Yes. That's right.
- 12 Q. I don't want you to tell us what your date of birth is,  
13 but can you confirm for me that you were born in 1959?
- 14 A. Yes, I can confirm that.
- 15 Q. Do you tell us in the first few paragraphs of your  
16 statement a little bit about your background and in  
17 particular that you were born in India in a loving  
18 family?
- 19 A. Yes, that's right, I was.
- 20 Q. Do you also tell us that you have a younger brother and  
21 also a younger sister?
- 22 A. Yes, I do.
- 23 Q. You give us some background about your family history  
24 and in particular that your father was a prisoner of war  
25 in Hong Kong and also in Tokyo; is that correct?

- 1 A. That's right, yes.
- 2 Q. And clearly he had to endure quite a difficult time over  
3 that period of his life.
- 4 A. Indeed. It was a story that we, as young children,  
5 encouraged him to tell us if he felt he could. We were  
6 very inquisitive about why we were in India. So yes,  
7 we were eventually told all the details of that story.
- 8 Q. And you give us some background to that in your  
9 statement.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. One thing you also tell us is that as a child, because  
12 of his own family circumstances, he was put into care in  
13 Nazareth House at Lasswade.
- 14 A. That's right, yes.
- 15 Q. I think along with other siblings; is that right?
- 16 A. Yes. He and his two sisters went into care when they  
17 lost their mother. My father was aged 6 and so -- his  
18 father was injured in the First World War and blinded so  
19 he couldn't look after three children on his own, so  
20 they went to Nazareth House.
- 21 Q. I think what you tell us is that he really endured some  
22 hardships that he told you about when he was there.
- 23 A. That's right, yes, he did. He had a very hard beginning  
24 to his life. He told my mother, who told me in later  
25 years, that he had witnessed something at Nazareth House

1           that he felt was wrong and he tried to intervene. He  
2           saw a priest and a nun together, and he objected to  
3           what was going on, and they -- well, they poured a bath  
4           of cold water and put him under the water to convince  
5           him that he had not seen what he'd seen.

6           Q. You're here today giving your evidence, Ian, so that you  
7           can tell us about your time at two places, that's at  
8           Carlekemp and also at Fort Augustus.

9           A. Yes, that's right.

10          Q. What was the background to you going to Carlekemp?

11          A. Carlekemp was really chosen by, I think, word of mouth  
12          at the time. My father, despite the hardships at  
13          Nazareth House, remained religious through his life. It  
14          was heard that the Benedictines had a good education for  
15          children. That was the reputation that reached his ears  
16          in the 1960s.

17                 So Carlekemp was chosen as a Benedictine school in  
18          Scotland. I've always felt that Ampleforth School in  
19          England had a better reputation educationally, and  
20          certainly looking back, that was deserved in terms of  
21          (inaudible: distorted) educational success and  
22          (inaudible: distorted) former pupils from Ampleforth  
23          compared to former pupils in Carlekemp.

24                 But it was a shot in the dark, really. He was in  
25          India since 1946 and so really unconnected with the

1 Scottish educational scene, so it was a bit of a gamble.

2 So we ended up at Carlekemp.

3 Q. Both your parents, of course, were Scottish, so there  
4 was a Scottish connection?

5 A. Yes: dad was from Edinburgh, mum from Fife.

6 Q. According to what you tell us in your statement, Ian,  
7 you went to Carlekemp in 1967 and you left Carlekemp in  
8 1973; is that right?

9 A. That is right, yes.

10 Q. So you'd be aged about 8 when you went to Carlekemp  
11 first of all?

12 A. Yes, correct.

13 Q. And did your brother, your younger brother, follow you  
14 to Carlekemp in due course?

15 A. He did. He started in 1969.

16 Q. You tell us a little bit about the background. For  
17 example, there were prefects who had various  
18 responsibilities at Carlekemp. We'll also look at  
19 Fort Augustus later, but what role did the prefects have  
20 to play at Carlekemp?

21 A. Well, they had an incredible amount of authority. As  
22 an 8-year-old, coming into a school, I think pretty much  
23 all the new boys were frightened of prefects, who were  
24 five years older and were becoming -- were on the verge  
25 of becoming young men. So there was a lot of bullying

1 by the prefects on the younger boys, so it was a fearful  
2 environment from the start.

3 One had to be very careful about not crossing  
4 a prefect because he could send you for punishment to  
5 either Father MFD, SNR or Father MFA  
6 or he could rough you up himself.

7 But it was the fear of being sent to either of the  
8 former I mentioned that made them very powerful because  
9 they had that power of saying -- on a prefect's word,  
10 a boy would be strapped by SNR who'd not  
11 seen the event himself.

12 Q. So far as the bullying aspect of it was concerned, what  
13 form did the bullying take?

14 A. Apart from sort of thumping boys or perhaps using  
15 a sports shoe or a wet towel to flick -- to inflict pain  
16 on the target, they would ... I mean, my main memories  
17 of stronger, older boys actually relate to Fort Augustus  
18 and not so much to Carlekemp. It was just that we were  
19 very young at Carlekemp and so we started off in a  
20 (inaudible: distorted) environment so we were very much  
21 more impressionable and vulnerable and young.

22 So those memories are not as sharp in terms of the  
23 prefects and the effect on us. The incident I can  
24 remember of a boy whose head was put down the toilet  
25 (inaudible: distorted) effect. That was traumatic to

1 witness because you could be next. So the threat of  
2 that was always -- created a psychosis in the  
3 environment that was not very healthy.

4 Q. You describe the environment as one of a climate of  
5 fear.

6 A. Mm-hm.

7 Q. Did that remain the position throughout your time at  
8 Carlekemp?

9 A. Yes. Yes, it did.

10 Q. And what --

11 A. It remained my position such that when I had (inaudible:  
12 distorted) year at Carlekemp, it came as a surprise to  
13 me. I had had mumps during the time when you take the  
14 common entrance exam to go to an upper school and I was  
15 (inaudible: distorted) towards the upper end of my class  
16 and had mumps during those exams, so [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] by  
17 this time had persuaded my guardians and my parents --  
18 my guardians being my aunt and uncle -- and my parents  
19 being in India, to have me repeat a year.

20 The prospect of it -- I don't think I've ever quite  
21 lost it as much at the prospect of repeating a year at  
22 Carlekemp. But I did on the emotional blackmail note  
23 that my father was far away and he'd be prouder of me if  
24 I just repeated the year and matured, and so I did give  
25 in to coming back to Carlekemp to repeat the year.



1 Q. And I think you tell us in your statement it was  
2 a devastating blow for you to have to do that.

3 A. It was, absolutely, yes.

4 Q. Can I just ask you a little bit about the monks that you  
5 had contact with. You've mentioned [REDACTED] SNR  
6 already, Father [REDACTED] MFD; is that correct?

7 A. Yes, that's right.

8 Q. Who else can you name for us?

9 A. Father [REDACTED] MFA. I had a lot of contact with him.  
10 He was [REDACTED]. He also meted out discipline. He  
11 also directed school plays, which either had to do with  
12 the Passion, the Passion Play, the crucifixion of  
13 Jesus Christ, and then the happier Nativity play,  
14 happier narrative. So those two.

15 Father [REDACTED] MFC, I can remember him. If you  
16 want me to characterise my memories, I can.

17 Q. We'll do that. If you give us the names, we'll look  
18 at the characters in a moment.

19 A. So Father [REDACTED] MFC. Father [REDACTED] MEV.  
20 Father [REDACTED] MEY. Those are the ones I remember.

21 Q. And did you mention Father [REDACTED] MEV as well?

22 A. Yes, Father [REDACTED] MEV, yes.

23 Q. Can I just touch a little bit on aspects of the routine  
24 at Carlekemp with you. You provide details of that in  
25 your statement and I'll just pick up one or two points.

1           First of all, so far as the sleeping arrangements  
2           were concerned, can you describe these for me?

3           A. There were large rooms allocated to boys of a similar  
4           age, dormitories, housing between nine and 12, roughly,  
5           (inaudible: distorted) in a room. We each had a bed.  
6           (inaudible: distorted) springs, which were pretty faulty  
7           and jumping up on the bed once or twice might lead to  
8           breaking the springs.

9           (Inaudible: distorted) a locker and a trunk were  
10          accessible, but not locked, for clothes and washing  
11          stuff and towels. So that was the -- a room with  
12          multiple beds in it and lockers.

13          Q. Did you move dormitory as time went on or did you stay  
14          in the same place?

15          A. That is a little fuzzy for me at Carlekemp. I can only  
16          picture one room at Carlekemp when we were tucking into  
17          some sweets round about midnight and listening to the  
18          radio. I have a clear picture of that room but the  
19          other ones have sort of been erased by time.

20          Q. You mention in your statement -- this is at  
21          paragraph 23 -- a system whereby if a boy talked out of  
22          turn or in the dorm something would happen. Can you  
23          tell me about that?

24          A. Yes. So silence after lights out was mandatory and if  
25          that was flouted, a boy could be hauled out. A monk,

1 say Father MFA, could be listening at the door and haul  
2 the person who was speaking (inaudible: distorted)  
3 identify who was talking, decide who was talking, and  
4 take them out for punishment, which could either be  
5 kneeling out on the milder end of things, or it could be  
6 twice-three on the hands.

7 "Kneeling out" meant the boy would be gone for half  
8 an hour or an hour or more, it could be two hours.  
9 Extensive time was spent kneeling out in a solitary  
10 fashion outside his office on a linoleum floor, either  
11 one or two boys at a time. If two people were talking,  
12 then they both (inaudible: distorted) kneeling out.

13 Q. You pass some comments on the food. How did you find  
14 the food at Carlekemp?

15 A. Just about edible sometimes, but it was pretty awful  
16 most of the times. I never actually ended up being  
17 forced to eat my food. Let's say fish -- some boys had  
18 an aversion to fish, especially cold fish, so they just  
19 couldn't get it down or ... Those boys were forced to  
20 remain in the refectory until the food was either  
21 consumed, so it was a battle of wills or breaking down  
22 the defiance of not finishing the food. So it never  
23 happened to me, but again people were made an example  
24 of. It's like, I don't know, shooting a crow and  
25 putting it in the fields to frighten other crows.

1           The image of boys crying over the fact that they  
2           couldn't finish their food ... It's a sad sight.

3       Q.   You do mention in your statement that Father MFA, who  
4           you've already mentioned, would on occasion also act as  
5           the cook; is that correct?

6       A.   Yes, that's right.

7       Q.   And you tell us about a practice that he had in relation  
8           to warming hands. Could you tell me about that?

9       A.   Yes. So two or three boys, me included, were asked to  
10          help out in the kitchen, and either we would put spuds  
11          into a potato-peeling machine -- that memory's just  
12          occurred to me -- and switch on the spud peeler or  
13          retrieve frozen food from the freezer. There were very  
14          large freezers there, very, very cold work, so after  
15          retrieving and getting your hands completely frozen from  
16          that work, he pretty much forced us to put our hands  
17          together, place them between his thighs, under his  
18          cassock on his bare skin, to warm them up.

19          Any protest at that or feeling embarrassed or  
20          ashamed was sort of roughly -- "Come on, it's the  
21          warmest place in the body, don't be so silly, this is  
22          normal". So that is something I did and the other two  
23          did. It wasn't done in the privacy that -- other boys  
24          were aware of that happening to me and I was aware of it  
25          happening to them. We just thought it distinctly very

1 odd indeed, but we went along with it for a quiet life.

2 Q. And your hands would be placed between his thighs; would  
3 that be close to his private parts?

4 A. Yes, yes, very close.

5 Q. Can I also ask you about washing and bathing. I think  
6 what you tell us in your statement is that the baths  
7 were open. By that I mean, they weren't private;  
8 is that right?

9 A. Yes. The baths were pretty much like the dormitories --  
10 it was a sort of mirror of that. There were pretty much  
11 as many baths in the room as there were beds in the  
12 dormitory. That was the layout of open baths.

13 From a very young age, matron would bathe the very  
14 youngest boys, if they didn't seem to be managing  
15 themselves, and then later we were supervised bathing.

16 Q. Were there also showers available?

17 A. The shower memory for me is more after games, not as  
18 a sort of routine every day. We didn't shower every day  
19 or bathe every day. There was sort of bath day.

20 Otherwise, unless -- after a sporting event, there were  
21 communal baths. Father **MFA** would supervise turning on  
22 the showers for the older boys. Matron tended to bathe  
23 the very youngest new boys at Carlekemp. And after  
24 sports, either Father **MFA** or Father **MFC** would  
25 supervise the showers and determine -- I believe

- 1           Father MEV also, yes, he would supervise the  
2           showers, deeming the length of showering, when it was  
3           over, turning the water off.
- 4           Q. Did they remain in the area when boys were getting  
5           showered?
- 6           A. Yes, they remained in the area throughout. Again, as we  
7           got older, it felt embarrassing and unnecessary for them  
8           to be patrolling showering.
- 9           Q. What were they doing? Were they looking at the boys?
- 10          A. Just sort of -- I mean, you're showering and you tend  
11          not to look at the monk who's -- you know he's there,  
12          you know he's watching, but we're sort of just getting  
13          on with what we needed to do. So no eye contact, not  
14          checking them out. So I couldn't say what they were  
15          doing. They were standing still throughout the  
16          showering and when it was done, they would declare it  
17          over and turn off the taps and we'd go and dry off in  
18          another area near our locker rooms.
- 19          Q. You've also told us, Ian, about how it came to be that  
20          you did the extra year at Carlekemp. I think you say  
21          that you were appointed            at least for a period  
22          of time.
- 23          A. Yes.
- 24          Q. What happened then?
- 25          A. Yes. Because I crumbled and stayed down and repeated

1 the year, I think as a sop to me I was made [REDACTED].  
2 That lasted one term, so that lasted for the  
3 [REDACTED] term of 1973 or 1972 going into 1973.  
4 And I was [REDACTED] for a term. However, I was perhaps  
5 not strict enough or ... it was a particular  
6 conversation with Father [REDACTED] MFD that made it impossible  
7 for me to continue and undesirable for me to continue as  
8 [REDACTED], and that was if I remained friendly with  
9 another pupil I could not remain [REDACTED] because that  
10 pupil was deemed to be a troublemaker.

11 Father [REDACTED] MFD had a battle of wills going on with  
12 this pupil, who I do name in my statement.

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. And so I was given a choice: to remain [REDACTED] and  
15 break my friendship with this pupil, which was  
16 unpalatable for me, so I told him he should look for  
17 another [REDACTED].

18 Q. You also tell us about a comment you overheard when  
19 [REDACTED] LRM visited and spoke to Father [REDACTED] MFD.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What was said?

22 A. [REDACTED] LRM came to the school, as he'd recently been  
23 ordained a [REDACTED] LRM and that was a really big deal. As  
24 we were -- we all had to line up to kiss [REDACTED] LRM  
25 ring, including Father [REDACTED] MFD and the other priests at

1 Carlekemp.

2 [REDACTED] LRM , I overheard him congratulate

3 Father [REDACTED] MFD on preparing -- "I'm sure you're doing

4 a good job preparing these boys for life", and

5 Father [REDACTED] MFD ' reply was that he liked to think he was

6 preparing boys for the afterlife. That stayed with me

7 ever since. It shook me to my core then and I thought

8 this was just too bizarre for words.

9 Q. Did you have the opportunity of having contact with

10 home? By that I mean writing letters to home.

11 A. Yes. We wrote once a week at Carlekemp, it was

12 formalised, so we did write home once a week.

13 Q. I'll come on to look at aspects of Carlekemp in

14 a moment. But did you say anything in your letters to

15 your parents about what life was really like at

16 Carlekemp?

17 A. No, no, we did not. I did not and I'm sure my brother

18 did not. We lived in India and in a place that seemed

19 like paradise: a rural setting, a tea garden, a lovely

20 house, an ambience of love. That paradise contrasted so

21 starkly with the school we were at. We just kept

22 thinking and asking questions about life where we loved

23 to be.

24 So we didn't go into the nitty-gritty of what was

25 happening at school unless there was good news to report



1 because we didn't want our parents to be sad.

2 Q. You've mentioned your brother again and I think you said  
3 that he went to Carlekemp in 1969 because of the age gap  
4 between the two of you. How did he take to the school?

5 A. It was a disaster for him, an absolute disaster from the  
6 word go. He attended -- he was too young, he was seven  
7 and a half when he attended and he had a defiant streak  
8 in him and this -- I mean, to stand up or be defiant or  
9 to look a monk in the eye and not do (inaudible:  
10 distorted) yes or no to that. That could lead you where  
11 it led my brother and that was to brutal -- repeated  
12 brutality.

13 He was hit -- I mean almost on a weekly basis. Some  
14 of this news reached me through his classmates, who had  
15 brothers in my year or two or three years -- two years  
16 ahead of him. So it was after the fact that I would  
17 find out this has happened and this has happened. The  
18 pain of these memories (inaudible: distorted) to do with  
19 the tragedy of how such people can report on the defects  
20 of a boy to their parents in school reports or letters  
21 home, characterising the boy as a bad lot, and knowing,  
22 years later, where the roots of that disturbance lie.

23 My brother became very, very disturbed in later  
24 life, and so I live with the constant fear, even today,  
25 that the consequences of what happened then lead him to

1 have lost faith with himself as a person.

2 So it was two shatterings ... it was ... the  
3 parents' belief in their own child and the child's  
4 belief in themselves. That applies to me in a milder  
5 form. My brother can't participate ...

6 (Pause)

7 I will be fine. My brother can't participate in  
8 these hearings and I can give you a mild account of what  
9 happened to me.

10 Q. Can I then leave your brother aside for the moment, Ian,  
11 and just focus on discipline and punishment.

12 A. Sure.

13 Q. What was discipline like at Carlekemp?

14 A. It was summary and quixotic in nature. People were  
15 victimised and the usual suspects bore the brunt of  
16 discipline, you know. Mass punishments were ... either  
17 the usual suspects kept getting twice-three or twice-six  
18 repeatedly, as in the case of my brother and  
19 a contemporary of his. One offence -- for one offence  
20 to be hit every day in the morning at the same time for  
21 seven days.

22 Q. And what sort of hitting was it? What was being used?

23 A. The tawse or the strap, hitting on the hands or, when  
24 the aim was bad, on the wrist so the weals would go  
25 halfway up the arm sometimes. The wrist is very tender,

1 the palm is tender enough and, you know, a full anger-  
2 blow to try and break the spirit that was in front of  
3 the headmaster or the bursar or the younger, stronger  
4 priest like Father MFC or Father MEV. They  
5 were all cold and hard men and they hit with a  
6 vengeance.

7 Q. The incident you told us about, seven days being hit  
8 with the strap, was that something that happened to your  
9 brother and another boy?

10 A. Yes. Yes, it did. For one offence, for smoking.

11 Q. Was this in public?

12 A. No, this wasn't in public. The two of them -- I mean,  
13 we all heard about it, but the two of them would know  
14 what happened to the other. They just had to report to  
15 Father MFD --

16 Q. So it was Father MFD who was doing the strapping?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Did you see if your brother or this other boy had  
19 suffered any injuries because of this?

20 A. Yes, on the hands and wrists.

21 Q. What sort of injuries?

22 A. Well, just red, black and blue injuries. In the odd  
23 lighter moment, my brother moved his hand away when the  
24 strap was coming down and Father MFD fell over  
25 through the effort put into the stroke, which of course

- 1           made things worse.
- 2           Q. I think you've talked about a twice-three and
- 3           a twice-six.
- 4           A. Yes.
- 5           Q. Does a twice-three mean three strokes on each hand?
- 6           A. Yes, it does.
- 7           Q. And likewise, twice-six, six strokes on each hand?
- 8           A. That's correct.
- 9           Q. You mentioned mass punishments; what do you mean by
- 10          that?
- 11          A. Just long detentions in silence in the study hall as
- 12          a lesson to the whole school. That was the main thing
- 13          in terms of mass punishments. There was another kind of
- 14          mass punishment at Fort Augustus, which we'll probably
- 15          come to later.
- 16          Q. Yes.
- 17          A. But Carlekemp, just long silences to contemplate how bad
- 18          we were.
- 19          Q. You've told us about your brother's experiences to some
- 20          extent, Ian. What about yourself? Were you physically
- 21          punished at the school?
- 22          A. Yes, I was. Probably at Carlekemp on a handful of
- 23          occasions, I'd be given twice-three, twice-four
- 24          sometimes, and maybe twice-six once in six years.
- 25          Q. And who inflicted the punishment on you?

1 A. It was always Father [REDACTED] MFA .

2 Q. You tell us in your statement about an incident when  
3 Father [REDACTED] MFA called you to his room; can you  
4 tell us about that?

5 A. Yes. That incident relates to when I was, I think --  
6 I think I was 10. I had been in plays that he directed.  
7 He called me to his room and locked the door, which  
8 I thought was very unusual, and then he said he had  
9 something very important to talk to me about, and it was  
10 the subject of love.

11 He, in a kind of quiet, confidential kind of tone,  
12 started saying that it could exist between two men or  
13 two people. He then demonstrated what he wanted me to  
14 do. I discovered quite quickly that he was erect and  
15 that he -- he took my hand and placed it on his penis  
16 and he was talking to me --

17 Q. Was he wearing a cassock?

18 A. Yes, he was wearing a cassock with no undergarments --

19 Q. And did he open the cassock?

20 A. It was just a black cassock -- yes, he opened the  
21 cassock.

22 The sight of his erect penis made me frightened  
23 straightaway but his words were encouraging and soothing  
24 and he asked me to stroke his penis. I panicked at that  
25 point and ran for the door and unsnibbed it -- I think

1 it was a chain. I took the chain off and just bolted  
2 out of the door.

3 There was a familiarity between Father [REDACTED] MFA  
4 and myself that had grown through being his altar boy.  
5 I served as his altar boy when he celebrated Mass, often  
6 on his own. There wasn't a congregation, so it was just  
7 him serving Mass, myself and another -- there would be  
8 two altar boys.

9 So this incident was after being an altar boy for  
10 some time. So one is used to taking direction and  
11 serving the priest as an altar boy, hence my being  
12 caught unawares by this strange invitation to have this  
13 discussion about love and what he wanted me to do next.  
14 So it went as far as that.

15 Q. Did anything else happen after that insofar as  
16 Father [REDACTED] MFA was concerned?

17 A. No, nothing of a ... I was sort of thankfully not  
18 popular with him.

19 Q. Do you know if he did anything to any other child?

20 A. I know he did something to my brother. I only found  
21 that out -- it's another sort of blow, when you find  
22 something out because you carry ... I carry the  
23 (inaudible: distorted) reporting Father [REDACTED] MFA .  
24 (Inaudible: distorted) much further with my brother and  
25 (inaudible: distorted) devastated ...

1 Q. It broke up a little bit there.

2 LADY SMITH: Ian, I'm sorry to have to ask you to repeat  
3 something. Could you just tell us again what you said?  
4 We were slightly losing the sound.

5 A. Yes, sure.

6 I was aware that Father [REDACTED] MFA sexually  
7 abused my brother. I had no clue about this whilst at  
8 school at Carlekemp. I only discovered this in my 30s  
9 and my brother's turning 30, that he went much further  
10 than he went with me. That was shattering.

11 MR MacAULAY: This is something that your brother told you?

12 A. To discover that ... Yes, that's right. That's right.

13 Q. Did he provide you with any details or was it just  
14 simply as you've described it to us?

15 A. I feel there's a line that I can't cross with him  
16 because I have to continually -- I have a good  
17 relationship with my brother and it's a very, very  
18 precious one. The fact that he is still fighting the  
19 battle of depression ...

20 LADY SMITH: Did you find out how old your brother was when  
21 it happened?

22 A. I think he was 9 years old, 9 or 10 years old.

23 LADY SMITH: Had your brother been an altar boy?

24 A. I don't know. The extent to which -- he refers to or  
25 has referred to two abusers at Carlekemp, and we only

1 spoke about Father [REDACTED] MFA . It was a very heated  
2 conversation in our 30s because it had a different  
3 context and it came out in the heat of the moment. It  
4 wasn't a conversation of reminiscence when -- I needed  
5 to know for myself --

6 MR MacAULAY: Did he name the other abuser?

7 A. He thinks it's Father [REDACTED] MFC . Other boys have  
8 told me it was Father [REDACTED] MFC  
9 Father [REDACTED] MFA is a ... That's personally  
10 hurtful, of course, because I keep thinking if I'd  
11 reported him or made it public, he would have been  
12 stopped.

13 Q. And I don't think you mentioned it to anybody.

14 A. No. We did tell our parents in our 30s.

15 Q. When you say "we", both yourself and your brother?

16 A. Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: Did your brother tell you where at Carlekemp  
18 the abuse by Father [REDACTED] MFA that he was describing took  
19 place?

20 A. No, he didn't say where.

21 LADY SMITH: So you don't know if it was the same situation  
22 of Father [REDACTED] MFA taking him into his room and locking  
23 the door and then talking to him?

24 A. I assume that's what happened to my brother, just that  
25 he didn't run for the door, but he submitted to what was



1           being asked.

2           LADY SMITH: Can you help me with this, Ian -- and if it's  
3           too much, tell me: if you hadn't run away, what do you  
4           think was going to happen?

5           A. If I hadn't run away -- well, he was erect, so I thought  
6           what was going to happen was he would want me to stroke  
7           him continually and that he might ... The most  
8           frightened I was was this man, this grizzly grey-haired  
9           man trying to kiss me. I thought that would be  
10          horrible.

11          So what he asked me to do -- I mean, he placed my  
12          hand on his penis. It was there for maybe 5 or more  
13          seconds until I panicked. I didn't stroke him, I ran.  
14          So I imagine what happened to my brother was in the same  
15          environment, in [REDACTED] office, behind a locked  
16          door.

17          LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18          MR MacAULAY: Did your brother indicate whether there was  
19          just the one incident or more than one incident?

20          A. He said, "My two abusers are dead", but he does not read  
21          any material to do with this subject matter. He can't  
22          even look at a school photograph and identify himself in  
23          it. That incapacity means he's not interested in any  
24          details, he just wants to get on with work that does not  
25          make him think about these things.

1 Q. So he didn't indicate then whether this had happened on  
2 only one occasion or more than one occasion with  
3 Father [REDACTED] MFA ?

4 A. That's right, he didn't indicate it was more than one  
5 sexual experience.

6 Q. You also tell us about an event that involved your  
7 brother and another boy, who were, as you tell us in  
8 your statement, publicly flogged at the school.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Can you tell me about that?

11 A. I heard about this at whatever age I was. If that had  
12 been tried in my presence, I would have physically tried  
13 to stop it.

14 Q. Were you somewhere else?

15 A. Yes, I was. I was at a sporting event, an away match,  
16 so the whole team, the senior team, would be away  
17 playing, most likely, cricket. On return to the school,  
18 I heard that -- and I couldn't believe what I heard,  
19 which was that these two boys had been taken to the  
20 study hall and the rest of the school assembled to  
21 witness their flogging with the tawse. That was on the  
22 back as well as the buttocks.

23 Q. Was that over their clothing?

24 A. No, it was not over their clothing.

25 Q. Did they require to strip?

- 1 A. Yes. Now, that's my memory and that's -- you know, it  
2 was hearsay to me, but there were boys there. It's an  
3 incident I feel that is incredibly important to probe as  
4 far as possible to see who witnessed that event.
- 5 Q. Did you speak to your brother about it?
- 6 A. Not until much later. He ran away from the school very  
7 shortly after.
- 8 Q. In later life did he speak to you about this public  
9 flogging?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And did he confirm --
- 12 A. He confirmed it and that the injuries were all the way  
13 down the back and on to the buttocks. He said that it  
14 drew blood. Certainly, you know -- yes. And I believe  
15 it was six strokes.
- 16 Q. Do you know who it was that inflicted the strokes?
- 17 A. I believe it was Father MFC.
- 18 Q. Did you find out what the punishment was for?
- 19 A. Yes, from my brother. He and his best friend and fellow  
20 serial victim of repeated punishments were entertaining  
21 themselves by going on the roof of the school and there  
22 were some carved gargoyles on the rim around the school  
23 and they were swinging off the gargoyles. The other boy  
24 had an older brother who was in my year or possibly the  
25 year below me, because I stayed back a year, and it was

1 the older brother who reported both of them to the  
2 headmaster, in my brother's belief, and that's what got  
3 them both into such hot water. So that led to the  
4 public flogging; it was for swinging off the gargoyles.

5 Q. You tell us in your statement, Ian, that this was in the  
6 summer of 1972.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And I think at that time your brother would be about 10.

9 A. Yes. That's right, he would be 10.

10 Q. Was his friend the same age?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What was your reaction to this once you were told about  
13 it when you returned to the school?

14 A. I went straight to see Father [REDACTED] MFD [REDACTED]. I was  
15 very, very upset, very emotional. I just managed to  
16 scream at him, shout at him, "Father, you are a bastard  
17 for" -- I didn't -- the subtext was -- "permitting  
18 this". That's all I could get out at him. I just  
19 shouted at him and he just looked at me, I think  
20 a little shamefaced, but he didn't offer any words one  
21 way or the other.

22 Q. Had he been involved in the public event?

23 A. Well, if ... [REDACTED] that they were on  
24 the roof of the school and doing dangerous things, so  
25 he was involved, certainly he knew. I believe, because

1 he was not a well man, Father MFD , he was physically  
2 a little weak through illness, I believe, so I think  
3 he'd deputised the punishment to Father MFC  
4 MFC or Father MFC volunteered. One  
5 way or the other.

6 Q. And he was a much younger man of course?

7 A. A much younger man, very fit, very large compared to  
8 a small boy, could run fast, and did not hesitate to  
9 throw things at boys or strike them informally.

10 Q. I think you tell us about that in your statement, that  
11 in particular he would strike your brother; is that  
12 correct?

13 A. Yes, that's right.

14 Q. What did he do to your brother?

15 A. He would grab him by the hair and drag him out of the  
16 refectory, the dining room, and I think hit with  
17 a bunched fist in the back. He was a frightening figure  
18 for the fact that he had a combination of a really foul  
19 temper, a very, very quick temper, which I describe in  
20 my statement as "a red mist". I don't think he was in  
21 control of himself when he got angry.

22 Q. You've mentioned already that your brother ran away from  
23 the school shortly after the flogging event.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Can you tell me what happened?

1 A. Yes, he found -- so he ran away along the coast from  
2 Carlekemp in the direction of Edinburgh. He got as far  
3 as the British Open Championship, which was being played  
4 at Gullane Golf Course that year, and hid in a shrub,  
5 thorny shrub bush, whilst what he thought was a huge  
6 search party looking for him was actually a crowd  
7 following the golfers in the British Open.

8 And so he ... a golf ball rolled up to where he was  
9 hiding and then he realised that it might not be  
10 a search party for him.

11 But anyway, by that time he'd decided to give  
12 himself up to the security people and then they handed  
13 him over to the police at the golf and he remembers  
14 petting a police dog and he was allowed to be with the  
15 police dog until the [REDACTED] teacher from Carlekemp was  
16 deputised to go and pick him up. That was  
17 [REDACTED] MFB . And [REDACTED] MFB went and picked up  
18 my brother and returned him to the school.

19 Q. Did anything happen to him that you're aware of because  
20 of that event?

21 A. Not that I'm aware of because of that event because --  
22 I think that was a consequence of an event that is  
23 pretty shameful to look back on. Even those that  
24 participated in it probably wanted a quiet life for  
25 a bit.

1 Q. And the event you mention is the public flogging?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Was that why he ran away?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. How would you wish to sum up your own experiences, Ian,  
6 at Carlekemp?

7 A. They were extremely bleak years. My only kind of  
8 lighter moments were the belief in myself remained alive  
9 as an intelligent young boy. The Latin teacher,  
10 Ms Greco, she believed I would work with words in life,  
11 and based on a facility for English and writing poetry  
12 and winning a poetry prize there, along with winning  
13 a golf tournament, those were the only highlights I can  
14 remember.

15 The rest of the time was being mystified as why  
16 people were being so brutalised for seemingly quite  
17 small, routine and small ... Why did people have to be  
18 repeatedly punished?

19 To sum that up as a sort of contemporary memory of  
20 Carlekemp -- looking back, of course I have the rest of  
21 life and the context of growing up and looking back. It  
22 doesn't get any better looking back, it gets worse.

23 I had friends there. Some of those friends are not  
24 alive and that's extremely painful. I think there's a  
25 kind of kinship between boys that survived this. I use

1 the word "survive" -- I take it back, actually. I don't  
2 actually like the word "survivor". I think that's  
3 a little PC for what we actually are.

4 Those who have pulled through and made some kind of  
5 a life are endurers of what happened. Endurers.  
6 "Survivor" seems to me to let these people off the hook  
7 and I don't think they should be.

8 Q. Can I just go back to the monks themselves. You've told  
9 us a little bit about Father MFA and the  
10 particular encounter you had with him. How would you  
11 characterise him as a person?

12 A. Extremely dour and sad. He often had the whiff of  
13 alcohol on his breath. He had a huge stock of  
14 cigarettes in his office, so he smoked a lot, and  
15 I think drank a lot. He had a severity about his  
16 demeanour that ... he was not someone you would want to  
17 open up to because of the mien on his face was a closed  
18 -- he was a closed person, someone who I felt maybe had  
19 turned in on himself and with whom interaction was  
20 tricky.

21 It's a vivid memory of him. I'm trying to remember  
22 him laughing or being warm and normal, as people who  
23 interact with each other in a relaxed way do, and  
24 I can't remember him being like that. I can only ever  
25 remember this dour personality, whose job it was to mete



1 out discipline, manage the school [REDACTED] manage the  
2 boys' [REDACTED] and he was severe and just talked down  
3 to young boys all the time.

4 The whole school, the culture at the school, was not  
5 to encourage a boy to open up and develop, it was to  
6 crush the spirit and to rebuild it maybe in some other  
7 image that is not of the boy's own nature. That's my  
8 memory, both of Father [REDACTED] MFA and  
9 Father [REDACTED] MFD .

10 Father [REDACTED] MFC did read us bedtime stories,  
11 but given that we knew what a temper he had, listening  
12 to The Hobbit being read out to you, you don't trust it,  
13 you kind of listen to it without trusting it.

14 Father [REDACTED] MEV was probably the biggest example  
15 of being completely turned in on himself and morose and  
16 dour and severe and no warmth at all.

17 Q. Did he have favourites?

18 A. Yes, he did. Anyone who had a desire or showed some  
19 talent in learning the [REDACTED] as a precursor to  
20 learning the [REDACTED] was a favourite. Yes, I can  
21 remember the favourites of Father [REDACTED] MEV . I pitied  
22 them being in the company of someone so severe to the  
23 rest of the world. His demeanour was so cold and hard.  
24 That's all I can say, really: cold and hard to the rest  
25 of the world.

- 1 Q. You mentioned Father MEY as well, I think, at  
2 the beginning.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. What about him? Did you have any dealings with him?
- 5 A. Yes, I dined at his table, the table in the refectory at  
6 Carlekemp, where he would be the head of that table. He  
7 had a propensity to speak in Italian and teach us  
8 a little bit of Italian, to order more bread or whatever  
9 in Italian. He had a very warm -- he was sort of the  
10 complete polar opposite of all these other  
11 personalities. He was warm and over the top with his  
12 warmth, but he focused very much on his favourites.
- 13 I would describe him as very unabashedly effete.  
14 I think he was homosexual. I'm convinced he was  
15 homosexual. I don't have any evidence other than an  
16 instinct of mine to pity the boys he was tickling and  
17 giving them female nicknames.
- 18 Q. Did you see him tickle boys?
- 19 A. Yes, yes, very openly.
- 20 Q. How would that be done? Would the boys be sitting on  
21 his knee or in contact with him?
- 22 A. On his knee or -- to initiate a contact he would grab  
23 them and tickle them, but in a ... It was in an  
24 affectionate way because it was in public, so  
25 affectionate, but it's not the kind of affection I would

1 want to be near or a part of. It seemed so over the top  
2 and so giggly that ... the giggliness of it was  
3 off-putting and the fact that it was directed towards  
4 a few favourites, you kind of went: okay, thank goodness  
5 I'm not one of them. So I kept my distance from  
6 Father **MEY**.

7 Q. You left Carlekemp in 1973 and at the beginning of the  
8 academic year you go to Fort Augustus; is that correct?

9 A. That's right.

10 Q. Did you go home for the normal school holidays, the  
11 summer holidays, Christmas and Easter holidays?

12 A. Yes, went home for at least two holidays in most years.  
13 In odd years when my parents could afford to fly us to  
14 India for the third holiday, we'd also go for Easter,  
15 but it was definitely Christmas and summer, definitely  
16 two holidays out of three every year. Please ask any  
17 other -- I've forgotten if there was another aspect to  
18 this question.

19 Q. I'm content with that. When you went to Fort Augustus,  
20 you went in 1973 and you left in 1975; is that correct?

21 A. That's correct, yes.

22 Q. So you'd be aged about 14 when you went and about 16  
23 when you came to leave?

24 A. Yes. That's right, yes.

25 Q. What was the environment like at Fort Augustus during

1           your time?

2           A.   The reputation of Fort Augustus for boys at Carlekemp  
3           who had older brothers there was that it's going to be  
4           a scary ride.  So that sort of pre-image was in our  
5           minds.  So I arrived there as an apprehensive  
6           14-year-old, wondering what this meant.

7                     And it is a fort, you know, it's a military  
8           establishment, it's not a benign -- in India, my first  
9           school was called the Little Flower School, which  
10          incidentally was run by Franciscan priests, who were  
11          wonderfully warm and normal and lovely.  So that is only  
12          relevant in that I have a very early childhood memory of  
13          warmth with people of a religious order who were part of  
14          the community and who were normal, jovial people.  One  
15          of them even came home in India and celebrated Mass for  
16          my parents and us in our house.  So I didn't start with  
17          an antipathy towards the religious order that I schooled  
18          at.

19                    So Fort Augustus.  We had to learn what "fort" meant  
20          and it had a history and a towering presence.  So there,  
21          the senior boys were much bigger and they would be 16,  
22          17, maybe even touching 18.  So there -- the culture at  
23          Fort Augustus was the harder at sports you were, the  
24          tougher you were, the more admiration you got.  It  
25          seemed to place an emphasis on physical prowess.

1           The [REDACTED] was from the village. He was  
2 not -- the monks didn't teach us sports. It was  
3 a relief to see some lay teachers at Fort Augustus.

4           First impressions were, though, how do I survive in  
5 this place? Because it's got a reputation I've heard  
6 about. It looks -- it's a cold place, it's in a very  
7 beautiful environment. There's Loch Ness. The monster  
8 of Loch Ness was -- is there one or isn't there one,  
9 that sort of conjecture.

10           And there was the fact that there were a lot more  
11 monks in the adjacent abbey. So the school was in one  
12 part of the fort and the abbey was in another part of  
13 the fort. So the interaction was less with a larger  
14 number of monks and more with lay teachers.

15 Q. What about bullying? Was there bullying?

16 A. Yes. It was rife at Fort Augustus. There, the prefects  
17 took measures into a ridiculously far -- physical abuse  
18 of younger boys. The initiates or the new boys, even  
19 coming into third year at Fort Augustus, were -- a 13 or  
20 14-year-old would come into third year. There was  
21 a junior school but I didn't see much of the junior  
22 school at Fort Augustus because I'd already passed those  
23 years in Carlekemp.

24           The bullying took the form of being chased down  
25 in the snow outside the school, and in the playing

1 fields adjacent to the school, and if you were caught  
2 you would be stripped to your underwear or sometimes  
3 naked as a kind of initiation into -- yes, this is  
4 a big, tough place and you're going to have to be big  
5 and tough quite soon to survive it.

6 So the prefects, the people in the senior year --  
7 not just the prefects, but sixth formers or fifth  
8 formers, rather -- would chase the third formers and  
9 catch them and strip them in the snow.

10 Q. Is this some form of initiation ceremony?

11 A. It felt like there was a "You're here now and we're the  
12 boss and we're going to break you early on so that you  
13 do what we tell you to do, as authority figures".

14 Q. But more generally, what sort of powers did the prefects  
15 have?

16 A. Whether they were given this officially or not, they  
17 used sports shoes or hockey sticks to rap boys on the  
18 backside, just very informally. It wasn't, "I'm  
19 punishing you for this, therefore line up", because  
20 no one's going to accept that a prefect can do that,  
21 they're going to run. So they'd be caught and whacked.  
22 But in the guise of: well, I have the authority to do  
23 this. The boy can't question or may not want to  
24 question, might want a quiet life and take it and move  
25 on.

1           Whether they had the authority to do that, I don't  
2 know if they had the authority to do that; I just know  
3 that they were quite free in dishing out physical  
4 punishment.

5       Q. Can I ask you about the monks. Who was [REDACTED] SNR  
6 during your time in 1973 to 1975?

7       A. That was -- Father [REDACTED] MMF was the [REDACTED] SNR.

8       Q. I think we understand that Fort Augustus was divided up  
9 into separate houses.

10      A. Yes.

11      Q. Were you allocated to a particular house?

12      A. Yes, I was allocated to Lovat House and there was also  
13 Vaughan House. So for Lovat House, the housemaster was  
14 Father [REDACTED] MRQ of Lovat and for Vaughan it was  
15 Father [REDACTED] MFG

16      Q. What role did the housemasters have to play in relation  
17 to the boys?

18      A. All discipline was handled by them, by the housemasters  
19 of the houses. They were responsible for the well-being  
20 of the boys. That was their main job, but all  
21 discipline seemed to be a big focus.

22           Father [REDACTED] MRQ had attempted to socialise with the  
23 older boys and give them a cup of tea or coffee of an  
24 evening. It was called a social, so whoever wanted to  
25 turn up for that, it wasn't compulsory but it was

1 encouraged, to kind of socialise and break the ice. So  
2 if you were hungry for a piece of toast or a cup of tea,  
3 you'd go there, but it wasn't for the company.

4 Q. I think you also mention in your statement that  
5 Father [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] was also present for some of  
6 your time at Fort Augustus.

7 A. Yes. But our paths didn't cross much, visually perhaps,  
8 but not in any kind of encounter, because he was not  
9 with the senior boys.

10 Q. Again, in your statement, at paragraph 78 onwards, you  
11 provide us with some insight into the routine and you  
12 tell us, for example, that so far as washing and bathing  
13 was concerned, there was nothing untoward about the  
14 supervision of that; is that correct?

15 A. Yes, that's correct.

16 Q. Are you making a comparison there between what you saw  
17 the position to be at Carlekemp and at Fort Augustus?

18 A. Only insofar as we were older and more resistant to --  
19 slightly more confident about ourselves physically and  
20 therefore we were purposefully showering after a game of  
21 sports and it wouldn't do to ... You know, I can't see  
22 anyone trying it on publicly in, let's say, third year  
23 or fourth year or fifth year in a public environment.  
24 That would not fly.

25 There was -- I mean, I'm pretty sure these



1 housemasters knew they weren't liked by most of the  
2 boys. So it wasn't ... you didn't go, get changed --  
3 there was more to worry about from older boys in the  
4 locker room with a wet towel, if someone wanted to whip  
5 you with a wet towel. That sort of peer-to-peer  
6 violence was more of a concern and a worry for  
7 a newcomer at Fort Augustus. You had to find your way  
8 to survive, mainly from other boys.

9 Q. Can I ask you about the schooling and the level of  
10 education. What was your impression as to the sort of  
11 education that you'd been provided with at  
12 Fort Augustus?

13 A. Looking back, I thought it was an absolute disaster of  
14 an education. I spent the three years there mainly  
15 depressed about my confidence in myself academically.  
16 There was such an emphasis on sports and such an  
17 emphasis on discipline and such an emphasis on the  
18 Combined Cadet Force, you know, which was -- one  
19 Thursday afternoon a week, the place turned into an army  
20 camp for Combined Cadet Force training. And hiking and  
21 rugby and sports.

22 Learning in class, it was ... Looking back,  
23 I thought I had a terrible, terrible, education. I came  
24 out with the worst results. I did my Highers -- I think  
25 I got two Cs first time -- I did five Highers. I got

1 ungraded in a subject I thought I was good at,  
2 absolutely ungraded, and I thought I'd become stupid.

3 So on leaving the school, my parents and I didn't  
4 know what to do. I hadn't got the qualifications to go  
5 to university. There was no point in thinking of  
6 university, and so my near miss in life was believing  
7 I was stupid and then enrolling in a technical --  
8 perhaps trying to enrol into a technical college in  
9 Falkirk and learning woodwork or metalwork and  
10 forgetting about future academic education and getting  
11 into a practical trade.

12 Q. But I think in fact, moving on a little bit, when you  
13 left Fort Augustus you went in fact to a local high  
14 school --

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. -- and did well in that environment?

17 A. Yes, at the suggestion of the principal of the technical  
18 college, who said, "You shouldn't be coming here, you  
19 should go back and repeat a year". To me, repeating  
20 a year was not a terribly appetising idea, to repeat  
21 another year of school, in case it was like Carlekemp or  
22 Fort Augustus. But I did go to Stirling High School and  
23 I'm so glad I did. That was the saving of my education,  
24 the absolute saving.

25 Q. Because there you got --

- 1 A. There, I flourished, three Bs, two Cs, and went to  
2 Stirling.
- 3 Q. If you were to be punished at Fort Augustus, what were  
4 the arrangements then?
- 5 A. Again, the tawse was used by the housemasters. For more  
6 severe occasions, the cane was used and by the  
7 **SNR** That was Father **MMF** who would  
8 administer the cane.
- 9 Q. If we take Father **MRQ** who was your  
10 housemaster, if you were to be punished would you  
11 require to go to him to be punished?
- 12 A. I'm sorry, my phone just -- I thought I had that on  
13 silent. I do beg your pardon.
- 14 (Pause)
- 15 If I could ask you to repeat that question.
- 16 Q. Yes. You've told us that Father **MRQ** was your  
17 housemaster; would he be involved in punishing you?
- 18 A. Yes. He would give twice-three generally for  
19 misdemeanours, deemed misdemeanours or misdemeanours.
- 20 Q. Would you require to report to him for that?
- 21 A. Yes, report to him, yes.
- 22 Q. Did you say a moment ago that he tended to use the  
23 strap, the tawse?
- 24 A. Yes, that's right.
- 25 Q. Did he use a cane?

- 1 A. Not to my knowledge. His preference was the tawse.  
2 I don't think the ... I may be wrong, but I don't think  
3 the cane was used on the hands; I think the tawse was  
4 used on the hands.
- 5 Q. And so far as [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] was concerned, I think you  
6 mentioned that he would use a cane.
- 7 A. Yes, that's right.
- 8 Q. Were you caned by [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]
- 9 A. I was caned by Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED], yes -- very  
10 unjustly, I may say.
- 11 Q. And I think we'll come and look at that in a moment.  
12 You've mentioned the Combined Cadet Force, the CCF;  
13 who was [REDACTED]
- 14 A. Father [REDACTED] MFG [REDACTED] or [REDACTED] MFG [REDACTED] as we were  
15 encouraged to call him -- not encouraged, forced to call  
16 him.
- 17 Q. How did you get on with him?
- 18 A. Initially very well. Initially he selected me to be his  
19 batman. We went on army exercises outside the schools  
20 in the hills around Fort Augustus and stayed overnight.  
21 As his batman, I cooked his breakfast, tidied away his  
22 clothes and generally kept (inaudible: distorted) in his  
23 six-man tent. It was just him and myself in the six-man  
24 tent.
- 25 The boys were all in two-person -- two-man bivouac

1 tents, positioned around the main -- Father MFG  
2 tent.

3 Q. Again, I'll look at an incident involving Father MFG  
4 in a moment. Just looking at aspects of routine,  
5 healthcare is something that you talk about and in  
6 particular an incident when you got a very bad infection  
7 and the school wouldn't involve a doctor.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Can you tell me about that?

10 A. I got a fever, first of all, and it was assumed to be  
11 a kind of flu. I took to my bed. Father MRQ came  
12 round to see, visit me, and from his demeanour I could  
13 tell he thought I was shamming because there was nothing  
14 initially very visible on the leg. But a day or two  
15 later, the leg started swelling and a red rash covered  
16 the entire area below the knee.

17 The doctor was not called for. I was a week, nearly  
18 a week in bed and the temperature was just kept  
19 extremely high and I was absolutely delirious.

20 Eventually, after a week, Dr Buchanan from the  
21 village was called and he was absolutely horrified.  
22 I had a 104 temperature and I was rushed in an ambulance  
23 to Raigmore Hospital in Inverness, where it was  
24 discovered I had blood poisoning, toxæmia, and was  
25 within hours of -- my parents were contacted and they

1           were told, "You'd better come quickly, we may have to  
2           amputate your son's leg".

3           Luckily, I responded to intravenous antibiotics at  
4           Raigmore, but at the time of -- just after  
5           hospitalisation, there were 12 suppurating boils, open  
6           sores, that had burst out of the inflamed leg, and it  
7           was like the size of an elephant's trunk. So it was  
8           a very close run thing, not being amputated, but  
9           responding to intravenous antibiotics.

10          Q. Do you know why the school was so reluctant to involve  
11          a doctor?

12          A. I think Father MRQ got it in his head that I was  
13          shamming. This is a very -- you know, he didn't come  
14          after the first couple of days, so the dramatic event of  
15          the leg getting more and more red was only something the  
16          doctor eventually said, "This looks like a skin  
17          infection". It was a staphylococcal infection of the  
18          skin.

19          Q. Who was caring for you during this period?

20          A. No one.

21          MR MacAULAY: My Lady, I don't know if we intend to have  
22          a short break.

23          LADY SMITH: Yes. Ian, we usually take a break at this time  
24          in our morning of about 15 minutes. Would it be  
25          convenient for you if we did that now?

1 A. Yes, surely. Absolutely.

2 LADY SMITH: We'll break now and resume the link in about  
3 a quarter of an hour or so.  
4 (11.30 am)  
5 (A short break)  
6 (11.45 am)  
7 LADY SMITH: Ian, welcome back. Are you ready for us to  
8 carry on?  
9 A. I'm ready.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you. I'll return you to Mr MacAulay  
11 then.  
12 Mr MacAulay.

13 MR MacAULAY: You've already mentioned, Ian, the role that  
14 prefects played at Fort Augustus. Did they have  
15 a particular role to play in connection with the  
16 dormitories?  
17 A. Just -- well, yes, in charge of discipline in the  
18 dormitories. They would carry out whatever summary  
19 punishments were needed in their estimation to keep  
20 discipline. But these are boys disciplining other boys,  
21 so, again, you know, they were feared for this reason:  
22 a misuse of power. There would always be people that  
23 they would pick on and others they didn't. So there was  
24 an air of injustice about the whole discipline climate  
25 at Fort Augustus.

1           The prefects were given privileges and had --  
2           I think they could wear their hair longer. They were  
3           treated as younger men, as in young adults, and so,  
4           again, arriving at Fort Augustus, a climate of fear was  
5           right until you went to bed at night. So in the  
6           dormitories, again, somebody would get it from  
7           a prefect.

8           Q. You've already mentioned use of the hockey stick or  
9           shoe.

10          A. Yes.

11          Q. You also talk about something that you call a Gorgie.

12          A. Yes.

13          Q. What was the Gorgie?

14          A. I don't know how a suburb of Edinburgh suddenly became  
15          used to describe a fist with a prominent knuckle, middle  
16          knuckle, and that on your head is extremely, extremely  
17          sore -- or on your back, but on the head particularly.

18                 Those were -- yes, a Gorgie was not something you  
19          wanted to happen. So either bullies used them or  
20          sometimes prefects would resort to the Gorgie.

21          Q. You also mention an incident involving an older boy and  
22          yourself in the course of which you were attacked;  
23          can you tell me about that?

24          A. Yes. So this was an occasion where this older boy was  
25          trying to dominate me by forcing me to sit at his table



1 in the dining room, and I chose to assert myself and sit  
2 where I wanted to sit, which was not on "his table". He  
3 warned me and said, "Right, you've had it". This was  
4 the sort of thing I'd been waiting for, that  
5 Fort Augustus was going to promise to deliver a tough  
6 environment, so I wanted -- I expected that would be  
7 a challenge to a fight.

8 It wasn't that at all, it was a cowardly attack on  
9 me. So all I knew of the attack, because it was from  
10 behind without warning, was that his boot hit me in the  
11 nose and I just went immediately unconscious, there was  
12 no fighting back, and I regained consciousness in a pool  
13 of blood in the study hall at Fort Augustus. That was  
14 in front of all the other boys.

15 He was a scary figure. He carried a flick knife in  
16 his pocket and a chain. He was quite adept at using the  
17 nunchucks, two bits of -- like Bruce Lee's weapon, two  
18 bits of wood and a chain between them, swinging,  
19 flailing.

20 So it was -- yes, so that ... He was expelled that  
21 very day for that attack on me. My nose remains broken.  
22 I explained it to my parents when I next saw them in  
23 India as, "It's only fractured" -- I didn't know the  
24 difference between broken and fractured, there isn't  
25 one.

1           So my contemporaries, two of them, came to my aid,  
2           which is actually why I feel that I was also responsible  
3           for their kind of safety later on, because it was the  
4           same two characters, the same two boys that I tried to  
5           help. So they wanted to go after this boy and teach him  
6           a lesson. It would take two of them because we were  
7           younger than him, but the bully had been expelled  
8           straightaway.

9           Q. For his attack on you?

10          A. For his attack to me, yes.

11          Q. But you've mentioned these two boys and you do tell us  
12          about an incident where I think you went to their  
13          rescue.

14          A. Yes.

15          Q. Can you just explain that to me?

16          A. Yes. So that was in the winter because it was icy cold,  
17          and these two boys had gone up the side of the  
18          River Tarff, about a couple of miles, maybe three miles  
19          outside school, and they planned to have a drink and it  
20          turned out that they had sourced a bottle of vodka.  
21          I just knew that they were planning to go and have  
22          a drink possibly, but spend some time outside school.

23                 I got worried when the light started to fade and  
24                 there was no sign of them coming back. So I went out  
25                 looking for them, where I thought they would be, and

1 found [REDACTED], who was trying -- he was trying to lift the  
2 prone unconscious body of [REDACTED] -- can I name names  
3 here?

4 LADY SMITH: They will be redacted because they can't be  
5 repeated outside this room, Ian, but if you just find it  
6 easier to use them, I'm not going to stop you.

7 A. All right. So [REDACTED] was crying over the body of inert  
8 [REDACTED] and he couldn't move him. So it turned out  
9 that they had sourced a bottle of vodka, not a half or  
10 a quarter but a whole bottle, and [REDACTED] had consumed  
11 most of this very quickly. So he had fallen  
12 unconscious. [REDACTED] wasn't making much sense, except to say  
13 that [REDACTED] MRQ had caught them out of school in his -- he  
14 used to drive a Jeep around and he did some [REDACTED]  
15 and he would -- you know, out and about. So I was told  
16 that they'd already been caught.

17 We were -- I mean, [REDACTED] was half cut, I would say,  
18 half drunk, and [REDACTED] was out. So I panicked at the  
19 sight of this and I ran back into the village, where  
20 I knew the [REDACTED] [REDACTED] MIH, would be at  
21 home, and knocked on his door and said, "You've got to  
22 come, bring your car". So he did and he got there and  
23 what he discovered was that Father [REDACTED] MRQ had caught  
24 these boys and he was pretty angry. We got [REDACTED]  
25 in the back of the car and so [REDACTED] and I were

1 ferried back to school by [REDACTED] MIH in his car.

2 I thought they'd be in trouble because [REDACTED] MRQ had  
3 caught them. What I didn't expect was to be woken up at  
4 1 in the morning by [REDACTED] MRQ and told that  
5 Father [REDACTED] MMF wanted to see me. So I went to the  
6 [REDACTED] SNR office and then was accused of being in the  
7 know of this drinking plan and that I was going to be  
8 disciplined for it.

9 I couldn't believe what I was hearing from  
10 Father [REDACTED] MMF, who was clearly -- and [REDACTED] MRQ was  
11 there and [REDACTED] MRQ was dismissed by Father [REDACTED] MMF and  
12 I was given four strokes of the cane on my pyjama bottom  
13 by Father [REDACTED] MMF, which was adding humiliation to  
14 injustice, in my opinion.

15 Q. The injustice I think you're focusing on is the fact  
16 that you had helped the boys --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- whereas it appears that Father [REDACTED] MRQ had not  
19 helped them?

20 A. Yes. The rights and wrongs of the issue go out of  
21 window when there's a medical problem. However, it may  
22 have been self-inflicted, but there's a boy who's not in  
23 control of himself and another one is unconscious. They  
24 may both have been conscious when [REDACTED] MRQ passed by and  
25 told them to make their way back to the school. That's

- 1           what █████ told me.
- 2           LADY SMITH: Ian, you say in your statement that you thought
- 3           the reason why you were being caned was because you were
- 4           in the know about the drinking.
- 5           A. Yes.
- 6           LADY SMITH: So do I take it from that that you were being
- 7           punished for not grassing on two other boys?
- 8           A. Yes, absolutely.
- 9           LADY SMITH: That's the long and the short of it, isn't it?
- 10          A. That is the long and the short of it and that
- 11          characterises the kind of punishment mentality at
- 12          Fort Augustus from the head downwards: punish the
- 13          collective, forget about justice for an individual.
- 14          LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 15          MR MacAULAY: And the other two boys, I think you tell us
- 16          that one was caned and indeed expelled.
- 17          A. Yes. I never saw █████ again after that night. It was the
- 18          last day of term, which is why I think these two decided
- 19          to take a risk and have some early fun. That turned out
- 20          very badly. So I was just -- I left school that term
- 21          with a sense of deep injustice and the other boy didn't
- 22          regain consciousness until the end of the following day.
- 23          Q. This sense of injustice, I think you tell us, stayed
- 24          with you into the following year; is that correct?
- 25          A. Yes, it did, yes.

1 Q. You tell us about an incident involving Father MFG  
2 MFG, who you've indicated was the  
3 CCF. Can you tell me about that incident?

4 A. Yes. So this was a sort of mass punishment for three  
5 platoons of the CCF, again for not giving up the name of  
6 somebody who had done something. The particulars -- 90%  
7 of us didn't understand why we were being mass punished  
8 that day, but we were caught up in it all.

9 So to get the guilty party and those shielding the  
10 guilty party for whatever it was -- I still to this day  
11 don't know what it was -- he instigated a number of --  
12 first of all, he told us -- and it was the summer of  
13 1975, it was extremely hot, I think the hottest summer  
14 on record until that time, 1975 -- to go and put on our  
15 winter army jumpers and come back down for what would be  
16 defaulters or punishment.

17 This took the most meaningless form of punishment.  
18 Each platoon was a team and they were given a plastic  
19 cup and we had to run about 30 metres between where  
20 we were and the swimming pool, which was at the front,  
21 on the front ground outside the front at Fort Augustus,  
22 and fill the cup full of water and sprint back and pour  
23 it into a bucket. Then we would have to pass the cup to  
24 the next person and that would go on and on until the  
25 buckets had reached a certain height, which he had

1 chalked out to the bucket.

2 So much running in winter clothing on a summer's day  
3 led to a lot of dizzy spells and people fainting or  
4 retching, and I decided to take an early bath on this  
5 one and I thought, "This is just ridiculous", so I faked  
6 a fainting spell and watched the rest of this ridiculous  
7 punishment to its conclusion. When it was deemed that  
8 platoon A and B had won the relay race and C was for  
9 it -- "for it" meant being thrown in the pool by  
10 platoon A and B -- I thought, "This is just beyond  
11 a joke", and I saw red and I went for [REDACTED] MFG or  
12 Father [REDACTED] MFG.

13 Q. What did you do?

14 A. Well, a two-to-one sort of tussle broke out. I wouldn't  
15 describe it as -- platoon C are trying to escape  
16 platoons A and B from being caught and thrown in the  
17 pool. So in that confusion, there was a lot of running  
18 around. I just went straight for Father [REDACTED] MFG at full  
19 sprint, I headbutted him in the chest. He went down and  
20 he lost his breath. I winded him and then I hit him on  
21 the chin with my fist.

22 Then the fight behind me suddenly stopped and all  
23 these angry boys, particularly the ones who were being  
24 victimised, who are who had lost this stupid relay race,  
25 descended on Father [REDACTED] MFG and rained kicks and punches

1 on him and dragged him to the pool to give him a bit of  
2 his own medicine that was in store for them and stripped  
3 him to his orange underpants, orange and holey  
4 underpants, they were moth-eaten. So that made him  
5 a figure of fun. He was very badly injured by some very  
6 heavy army-booted kicks to the head and I started  
7 pulling boys off him. So having so-called started it in  
8 my mind, I thought, "Oh God, this is going to go very,  
9 very badly wrong".

10 What happened then was he kind of regained his  
11 senses and shouted and roared at us, so we kind of  
12 melted away, laughing at him, having broken his cane,  
13 stripped him and taken his watch and smashed it. And  
14 that was the end of that matter. I thought I would  
15 definitely be expelled for that, but nothing happened.

16 Q. Did teachers or anyone, witness this?

17 A. There was definitely -- definitely [REDACTED] MZV , who  
18 was a teacher. He was there. He ran for his car, drove  
19 out of the school. And I think [REDACTED] MIH might  
20 have been there, but it was a situation that none of  
21 those two thought they could stop.

22 Q. And did you see Father [REDACTED] MFG afterwards and what  
23 condition he was in?

24 A. Yes, he was very badly -- badly swollen face, lumps on  
25 the forehead. I passed him in the corridor the



1 following morning. He didn't make eye contact with me,  
2 but I glanced at him. But it was obvious by then  
3 nothing was going to happen to me or anyone else. The  
4 number of boys involved -- if we'd all been expelled, it  
5 would have been the economic end of the school probably.

6 Q. How many boys were involved, taking the three platoons?

7 A. For all three platoons, at least 36. Of those,  
8 certainly as many boys as you can get around a prone  
9 figure.

10 Q. When you came to leave Fort Augustus, did your father  
11 come to collect you?

12 A. Yes. That was the first time he'd visited  
13 Fort Augustus, on my last day.

14 Q. Did you tell him then what life had been like at the  
15 school?

16 A. Yes, I told him about the incessant injustice in terms  
17 of punishment of everyone or a whole class or a whole or  
18 all three platoons. He'd been a soldier, so I felt I --  
19 as my father and as a soldier, he needed to know what  
20 had happened. I wanted his view on it.

21 He was very, very angry that such a situation could  
22 arise through the abuse of power and the punishment of  
23 90% or 95% innocent to try and catch a few guilty and  
24 make the innocent fearful of those in power.

25 Q. I think you've told us that after leaving Fort Augustus,

1           you went to Stirling High School.

2       A.   Yes.

3       Q.   And I think that was at a time when your parents had

4           come back to live in Scotland; is that right?

5       A.   Yes, that's right.

6       Q.   Thereafter, after university, I think you worked in

7           marketing, but then you turned to writing, and that's

8           what you do now?

9       A.   That's right, that's what I do now, yes.

10      Q.   What would you say the impact of your experiences at

11         Carlekemp and Fort Augustus has been on you?

12      A.   I had to regain my confidence through many, many years,

13         certainly academically. I was convinced I was going to

14         end up on the academic scrapheap. I thought I had

15         a bright start at Carlekemp. I was gifted in English

16         and Latin and geography. I think the impact was a loss

17         of that confidence for many years.

18                 It was such a close run thing for me to give up on

19         all academics, all academic pursuits and not think

20         myself fit or competent to pursue an academic vocation

21         or even further education. Within three weeks of

22         starting Stirling High, I realised that I was on

23         a different journey. I was supposed to be repeating

24         a year, but it felt like new material to me, and I took

25         to the co-educational environment and the reasonable

1 people that were running that school and the balanced  
2 people that were running that school as my saviour.

3 Q. You describe Fort Augustus in particular, I think, as  
4 a sink-or-swim environment.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And that you learned to swim, but some did not.

7 A. Yes. Some did not. I think about those boys a lot. We  
8 reminisce -- I mean, I'm best friends with a school  
9 friend from both Carlekemp and Fort Augustus. We remain  
10 best friends today and we talk, I think a very unnatural  
11 amount of time, about the episodes that happened at both  
12 these schools. We should be living our lives and not  
13 thinking about who fell, who did harm to themselves, who  
14 took their life.

15 Two or three people bright enough to survive with  
16 just reading the academic books for themselves and not  
17 being taught, they'd be bright in any situation. Those  
18 who were dependant on being taught well were let down  
19 across the board at both schools.

20 Q. You've already mentioned your brother and I don't want  
21 to dwell upon that for too long, but I think he did not  
22 go to Fort Augustus, as it happened.

23 A. No, he did not.

24 Q. You've told us about the time he ran away. Did he run  
25 away again from Carlekemp?

1 A. He ran away, I believe, a couple of times from  
2 Carlekemp. He certainly ran away from another school he  
3 went to. He just lost all faith in authority. That was  
4 to have devastating consequences on his life and the  
5 choices that he subconsciously made to put himself  
6 in the way of harm.

7 The impact on me is for the last 45 years I have  
8 been waiting on a call to see if he's given up the  
9 struggle against depression. That's a fear.

10 Again, without dwelling on it, he has voiced the  
11 compulsion -- sometimes he feels he wants to take his  
12 own life. That's an extremely serious thing. Others  
13 have taken their lives.

14 He doesn't know I'm here today and I won't be  
15 telling him. I just don't want anything to echo his  
16 pain.

17 Q. But what you do say in your statement at paragraph 130  
18 is that:

19 "Through [your] testimony, [you] hope to validate  
20 the experiences of others, who, like [your] own brother,  
21 find it impossible to share their experiences."

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. That is your position?

24 A. Yes, that is my position, absolutely.

25 Q. And you've mentioned people who have taken their own

1 lives; do you know of such people?

2 A. I know that the boy who took over from me as [REDACTED] at  
3 Carlekemp after my own time as [REDACTED] there,  
4 [REDACTED] I'm aware [REDACTED] took his life.

5 Q. Who told you that?

6 A. His sister told me that.

7 Q. And did she tell you why?

8 A. Yes. She told me that he couldn't live with the feeling  
9 of what happened to him at the hands of  
10 [REDACTED] MFC.

11 Q. What you say in your statement at paragraph 128 is:  
12 "Their oppressive and unjust regime may have bred  
13 a few warriors who learned to endure or evade their  
14 abuse, but at what horrendous cost?"

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And for this individual you have mentioned, the cost to  
17 him was the loss of his life?

18 A. Yes, the loss of that and the many decades of pain, of  
19 facing himself and not being able to face himself  
20 ultimately. That's the horrendous cost. And for all  
21 those that have suffered or whose relatives have  
22 suffered.

23 These people shattered the self-belief boys had in  
24 themselves or didn't allow it to sprout and develop into  
25 people who are confident, confident in themselves. And

1 I believe they shattered also the trust between parents  
2 and their own children by providing reports on those  
3 children that were angled and that were designed to  
4 diminish the personality of their child in their  
5 parents' eyes, to bring such a rift -- sometimes an  
6 unbridgeable rift -- between parents and children.  
7 That's unforgivable.

8 Q. Did [REDACTED] sister tell you what had happened to [REDACTED]  
9 at the hands of Father [REDACTED] MFC ?

10 A. Just in general terms, that he was repeatedly,  
11 repeatedly sexually abused.

12 Q. If I take you to paragraph 134 of your statement, Ian --  
13 do you have it there on your screen?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Can you read out what you are saying there.

16 A. "The Catholic Church polices itself. Its claim that  
17 there were just a few bad apples rings hollow for me  
18 when at Carlekemp four out of five priests were  
19 paedophiles. It was so obviously a dumping ground where  
20 the church allowed troubled and predatory men to have  
21 access to innocent boys. Why did the church think it  
22 could get away with shuffling them around and not  
23 engaging with the state authorities or the police? In  
24 my view the Benedictine Order and the Catholic Church  
25 think that God's work puts them above the law and that

1 the state has no business with it. That is truly  
2 unforgivable and I hope steps are taken to dismantle  
3 that very idea, not just in Scotland but globally."

4 Q. And the four out of the five priests that you mention,  
5 who are they?

6 A. Father MFA, Father MFC,  
7 Father MEV, and  
8 Father MEY.

9 Q. Then if you move on to your hopes for the inquiry, if  
10 you go on to paragraph 137. Can you perhaps summarise  
11 what message you want to give us?

12 A. Yes. I think that the church knows and the Holy See  
13 knows the full extent because they are, I believe, quite  
14 good at investigating themselves. I've done my own  
15 research on internationally -- the subject matter  
16 that is thrown up by films like Spotlight and other  
17 things that on the way you discover that even some  
18 bishops have tried to actually name or out offending  
19 paedophiles within the church but have met resistance  
20 from above and resistance from more than one Pope.

21 It's well documented how sexual abuse was a part of  
22 the recruiting procedure of a sect, if you like, of the  
23 Legionnaires of Christ, led by a priest who was  
24 very, very close to the Pope. So in coming across that  
25 freely available information, you discover that priests

1 left the priesthood because of this, bishops have  
2 tried -- some, I believe a minority, have actually been  
3 strong enough to stand up and try for justice from above  
4 them from the Holy See, and it has not been forthcoming.

5 All we've had are apologies which are utterly  
6 meaningless, utterly meaningless given the catastrophic  
7 consequences of this global phenomenon. If good-looking  
8 young men are predated upon as they become priests, it  
9 becomes part of what they think is all right and  
10 sanctioned from above because they're not given up to  
11 the authorities of these countries. I think it is an  
12 absolute disgrace.

13 So I hope the inquiry sees itself in a global  
14 context at a very important time when people are  
15 speaking about what happened to them and others, and all  
16 of this information is so available now that the  
17 political will has to be there for it to be acted upon  
18 and for the church not to be seen as a state within  
19 a state but as a guest within countries, but needs to  
20 behave itself.

21 MR MacAULAY: Very well, Ian. Thank you for coming forward  
22 to the inquiry and giving us your evidence.

23 My Lady, no questions have been sent to me to be put  
24 to Ian.

25 LADY SMITH: Ian, let me check first: are there any



1 outstanding applications for questions? No.

2 Ian, I can confirm that we have no questions left  
3 for you. Indeed, we've asked you a lot of questions  
4 already and I'm very conscious of that.

5 Thank you so much for engaging with the inquiry  
6 in the way you have done, both by giving us your very  
7 detailed statement and talking to us today over the  
8 video link. Your evidence has been so thoughtful,  
9 detailed and careful. There's much material here which  
10 is going to be of considerable assistance to me in the  
11 work I have to do. Thank you for taking the trouble to  
12 make sure that we hear through you about others,  
13 including your brother. That is also of enormous  
14 assistance.

15 I'm conscious of the fact we've taken up the best  
16 part of your afternoon today. Thank you for giving it  
17 up for our benefit. That's of enormous help to me and  
18 I'm now able to let you go.

19 A. Thank you, my Lady. Thank you.

20 (The video link was terminated)

21 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, I think the next item on the agenda  
22 would be a read-in at some point.

23 LADY SMITH: Yes. Just before I move to that, is that the  
24 end of the link now? Can I just check? Thank you.

25 We will turn to further evidence in a moment. But

1 before we do that, there's something I would like to  
2 say. Two days ago, a report was published in the  
3 Sunday Times newspaper in which it was stated that:

4 "Last week the inquiry restarted again after  
5 a seven-week break."

6 That is not correct. The inquiry did not restart.  
7 It had not closed down for seven weeks; the inquiry was  
8 working throughout that period.

9 The wide-ranging work of this inquiry includes  
10 particularly demanding and detailed investigation work,  
11 the ingathering of evidence from many different  
12 witnesses, the recovery of thousands of documents,  
13 considering all material in the light of the tasks set  
14 by all of the extensive terms of reference, including,  
15 but not by any means limited to, determining whether  
16 children were abused in care within a period of over  
17 80 years, considering and deciding what findings should  
18 be made after the close of each case study, publishing  
19 those findings, and researching a range of topics I need  
20 to consider. This work is going on all the time. It is  
21 quite wrong to suggest that the inquiry is only working  
22 during hearings.

23 Further, the inquiry uses careful processes which  
24 follow the advice and guidance of its expert trauma  
25 psychologist. The inquiry takes a trauma-informed

1 approach to its work. It thus seeks to take care to  
2 treat all witnesses fairly and with dignity, supporting  
3 them appropriately through the process of providing  
4 their statements and, where relevant, the provision of  
5 oral evidence. That process is complex and it can  
6 sometimes be lengthy to take account of an individual's  
7 needs.

8 I would like to take this opportunity to pay tribute  
9 to the hard work of the diligent inquiry team, which  
10 goes on every day. Much of it is such that it is not  
11 and will not be visible to the public eye, but that is  
12 the nature of a public inquiry.

13 The inquiry team cares deeply about its work and  
14 those whose interests lie at its heart, namely children  
15 in care, past, present and future. We all look forward  
16 to the day that our work is completed here, but it is in  
17 no one's interest, least of all those children, to rush  
18 this critically important work.

19 We can now turn to read-ins. Would it be helpful to  
20 have a break before we do that?

21 MR MacAULAY: Yes, five minutes.

22 (12.25 pm)

23 (A short break)

24 (12.30 pm)

25 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod, where are we turning now?

1                   Witness statement of "ROBERTO" (read)

2           MS MACLEOD: My Lady, I will now read in a statement from an  
3           applicant who wishes to remain anonymous and use the  
4           pseudonym "Roberto".

5           This applicant didn't wish to attend to give  
6           evidence at oral hearings but is happy for his statement  
7           to be read in, in this way:

8           "My name is Roberto. I was born in 1968. My  
9           contact details are known to the inquiry.

10          "I was born in Glasgow and I am the youngest of  
11          three children. My dad ran an Italian restaurant.  
12          He would work 14 hours a day, six days a week. He  
13          wanted something better for us. He wanted me to make  
14          something of myself. He didn't want his children to be  
15          working the way he did."

16          The witness speaks about time he spent initially at  
17          [REDACTED] School in Dennistoun, Glasgow. He  
18          says he was hit there by other children, a priest, and  
19          nuns. He goes on to speak about the next school he  
20          attended, which was [REDACTED] also in Glasgow. There,  
21          he says that he was bullied, he says he had a good  
22          teacher, and he says he was beaten with a tawse by  
23          another teacher.

24          He goes on to discuss his next school, which was [REDACTED]  
25          [REDACTED] and he was there until Primary Seven.

1 That was a preparatory school for [REDACTED] School,  
2 a fee-paying Catholic school in Glasgow. He tells us  
3 that he next went to [REDACTED] School for the first  
4 two years of his secondary school.

5 He tells us that there, he was picked on because  
6 he was Italian. He tells us he suffered physical abuse  
7 at that school.

8 He tells us also that he was beaten at [REDACTED]  
9 and he says you were sent to get beaten, and that you  
10 were beaten with a ferula, and it would be either two,  
11 four or six strokes on each hand.

12 He tells us the teachers and the priests called it  
13 "cashing a bill" and that the teachers, priests and  
14 prefects thought it was funny. He tells us he got abuse  
15 from the gym teacher and would get sent on a run.

16 The witness goes on to tell us that the next school  
17 he attended was [REDACTED]. He tells us  
18 that the headmaster there allowed "sectarian nonsense"  
19 to go on. The witness says:

20 "I was pissed on, spat on, punched and kicked by  
21 other pupils. There was no safeguarding whatsoever."

22 In paragraph 18 of the statement, the witness says:

23 "I had had enough of the school and I told my mum  
24 I was not going back. My parents took me away from  
25 there in 1983 and I went to Fort Augustus at the end of

1 the summer term."

2 I will pick up the statement from paragraph 19  
3 because from there it relates to Fort Augustus Abbey  
4 School:

5 "My dad spoke to a friend of his, who said his son  
6 was doing well at Fort Augustus. I couldn't stand his  
7 son.

8 "Following that, Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED] came to our  
9 house to talk about the school. I was involved in the  
10 discussion. He sold my parents a very rosy picture of  
11 Fort Augustus. He was telling them what a great school  
12 it was, what a great education I would have, and what  
13 great career prospects I would gain. My dad had the  
14 money to pay the fees. I didn't visit Fort Augustus  
15 before I started school there."

16 The index card recovered for this witness, my Lady,  
17 shows that he was admitted to the school on [REDACTED] 1983  
18 and that he left the school in [REDACTED] 1987:

19 "Fort Augustus was up a pass over the A9. We used  
20 that road the first time my parents took me there. The  
21 school was up a driveway and the first thing you saw was  
22 the church and the monastery, then the west wing of the  
23 school. There was a cricket field with a pavilion and  
24 a tree-lined avenue. Then you would see the whole  
25 school, the Hanoverian fort, and all the bits added on

1 by the monks. The school was a dilapidated dump when  
2 you went inside. It was the opposite of what  
3 Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED] described to my parents.

4 "When I went to Fort Augustus, there were about 130  
5 pupils at the school in total. By the time I left, that  
6 number had dropped to about 80. The number of pupils in  
7 each year changed because boys would come to the school  
8 and others would leave. There were only about 10 to  
9 15 boys in each year by the end.

10 "Boys left because it was a hellhole. They told  
11 their parents what it was like and their parents removed  
12 them. My parents didn't remove me when I told them  
13 about the school. They said I had to stay and be a good  
14 Catholic.

15 "I started at Fort Augustus in [REDACTED] 1983 when I was  
16 14. My parents just dropped me off on the first day.  
17 I was terrified. There was no effort made to introduce  
18 me to other kids. I knew the son of my dad's friend.  
19 There were lots of boys who came from very wealthy  
20 families. I had nothing in common with them. There was  
21 a lot of upper class right wing stuff. They were all  
22 conservatives. The staff put all these right wing  
23 papers in the library.

24 "I couldn't relate to the other pupils. I started  
25 halfway through the last term of the school year, then

1 I was made to repeat third year.

2 "Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED] was [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]  
3 initially. Because of the falling school roll, which  
4 meant it was loss making, Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED] wanted to shut  
5 the school. In 1985 or 1986 there was a big campaign to  
6 keep it open; I ran a campaign to shut it down.

7 "The abbot was Nicholas Holman. After  
8 Father [REDACTED] MMF [REDACTED], Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] was the  
9 [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] for a year. Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] had a large  
10 collection of pornography and a blow-up doll. I saw  
11 these things in his study in the east wing. He would  
12 confiscate pornography from pupils and he was supposed  
13 to burn it but he didn't. He would flirt with any  
14 female visitor to the school.

15 "At [REDACTED] because he denied  
16 he was the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] He was removed as [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] in  
17 the [REDACTED] 1987 because of his behaviour. The abbot  
18 told him to resign and he wasn't allowed to teach. He  
19 was out of the school but remained in the monastery.

20 "Father [REDACTED] MFA [REDACTED] and Father [REDACTED] MEZ [REDACTED] were  
21 both at Carlekemp School and I heard stories at school  
22 that they abused infants at Carlekemp.

23 "Father [REDACTED] MEW [REDACTED] was [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] at the  
24 end of my time at Fort Augustus. He put in a smoking  
25 room for the over 16s. When it had been



1 Father [REDACTED] MRQ as [REDACTED] SNR if [REDACTED] MRQ caught you  
2 smoking, you were beaten with a cane. Boys that were  
3 caught smoking in Vaughan House were just given a fine  
4 or manual labour, but [REDACTED] MRQ would cane you. I think  
5 he was into sadomasochism.

6 "After Father [REDACTED] MEW, it was Father [REDACTED] MER  
7 who became [REDACTED] SNR but I had gone by that time.

8 "[REDACTED] MZU taught [REDACTED]. He committed suicide.  
9 I can remember we all went to his funeral.

10 "Michael Haines was gentleman of the highest  
11 calibre. He is the only member of staff I would  
12 exonerate. He encouraged me and he tried to keep Father  
13 [REDACTED] MRQ out of my way. He had run-ins with Father  
14 [REDACTED] MRQ over me. He died of a heart attack a year  
15 after I left.

16 [REDACTED] MIH was okay. He taught [REDACTED]  
17 He was nice to me too, but some of the boys didn't like  
18 him because he was quite authoritarian. He was an old  
19 boy of the school.

20 "Andy Dempster was the maths teacher. No one  
21 respected him. He had no control over his class. Those  
22 who were not A+ at maths would take the piss out of him.  
23 He was a pathetic excuse of a man. He sent me to my  
24 housemaster a lot of times for petty things, like not  
25 being able to do my algebra. The lay teachers weren't

1 supposed to physically punish you themselves; they had  
2 to send you to your housemaster.

3 "Gary Morris taught geography. He had come from the  
4 Army Education Corps. He was okay, he was quite a nice  
5 guy. He came from St Helens. He sent me to get caned  
6 for smoking when I was 17. I resented him for that so  
7 I didn't speak to him after that.

8 "Gordon Wilson was the English teacher. He was  
9 a nice guy and I got on very well with him. I only got  
10 a C for my English Higher but I was well read in lots of  
11 French literature which was on the Catholic register  
12 called The Vatican Index. The Catholic Church had a  
13 register of things that were banned because they were  
14 against the teachings of the church.

15 "The other monks who taught at the school were  
16 Father [REDACTED] MFA, Father [REDACTED] MEZ, Father  
17 [REDACTED] MER and Father [REDACTED] MKT. Brother  
18 [REDACTED] MNS, Father [REDACTED] MFF and Abbot Holman did not  
19 teach.

20 "Father [REDACTED] MKT was the [REDACTED] responsible for the  
21 day-to-day running of the monastery. There were other  
22 monks at the monastery but I can't remember their names.

23 "There were three houses at Fort Augustus: Lovat,  
24 Vaughan and Calder, which was the junior house. I was  
25 in Lovat House. Father [REDACTED] MRQ was my

1 housemaster. Father [REDACTED] MFC was the  
2 housemaster of Vaughan House. Father Anthony Haines  
3 was the housemaster for Calder.

4 "Father [REDACTED] MRQ would beat and cane the boys  
5 in his house. Father [REDACTED] MFC used a belt. He  
6 didn't use a cane, at least not when I was at  
7 Fort Augustus.

8 "I asked various times to be moved to Vaughan House  
9 so I wouldn't get caned but Father [REDACTED] MMF said no.  
10 When Father [REDACTED] MRQ became [REDACTED] SNR Father  
11 [REDACTED] MER became my housemaster. There was a head  
12 appoint. In each house there were several house  
13 prefects and one school prefect.

14 "We got up at 8 am. You either went to a prep  
15 meeting or you went to Mass. I would sneak off and have  
16 a coffee and a cigarette in the library annex. Then we  
17 had breakfast, then school.

18 "The dormitory was like a big church hall with  
19 wooden partitions. There was no privacy at night. The  
20 dormitory changed halfway through from Vaughan to Lovat.  
21 Off to one side was the junior dormitory. I was in the  
22 dormitory until the end of fifth year. In sixth year  
23 I got a little study of my own. That was in the east  
24 wing, a different part of the school that the monks  
25 built using breezeblocks. They made little studies like

1 bedsits. It was freezing cold, but at least I had  
2 privacy.

3 "At night pupils went to bed at different times  
4 depending what year you were in. Third and fourth year  
5 pupils went to bed at 9.30 pm. Fifth year pupils went  
6 to bed at 9.45 pm and sixth year pupils could go to bed  
7 when they wanted, although the official bedtime was  
8 10 pm or 10.15 pm. You had a bit more freedom by the  
9 time you were in sixth year.

10 "The prefects would supervise bedtime. House  
11 prefects would take it in turn to sleep in a dormitory.  
12 The housemaster would also come along and shine a torch  
13 into each individual cubicle to check no one had  
14 absconded.

15 "At night you could hear everyone masturbating.  
16 There was a lot of noise. There were fights. One boy  
17 from Nigeria brought a quarter of a pound of grass back  
18 from Nigeria and would sit in his cubicle smoking joints  
19 and listening to Bob Marley. Father MRQ was  
20 convinced I was addicted to cannabis because I briefly  
21 hung about with the boy from Nigeria, although I was  
22 smoking cigarettes.

23 "The food was so bad that after I left school, I was  
24 drinking three to four pints of milk a day because  
25 I thought I was suffering from some form of infection.

1 I went to my GP. I was diagnosed with suffering from  
2 Helicobacter pylori, a stomach disorder, and got  
3 medication.

4 "The food was just slop. I grew up with my father  
5 running an Italian restaurant and I was used to eating  
6 nice Italian food. One night we were given veal chops  
7 and everyone refused to eat them. Father MRQ  
8 was screaming and shouting at us all, but we never got  
9 given them again. We usually got things called 'golden  
10 cutlets'; I don't know what was in them, probably just  
11 processed rubbish.

12 "There were showers and sinks in the basement. You  
13 had to shower naked and I didn't like showering naked in  
14 front of these guys -- I mean the pupils as well as the  
15 monks -- as some of them were closet gays.

16 Father MRQ would come down and watch us  
17 shower, so did Father Anthony Haynes, Father MFA  
18 and Father MFC From the stories going round the  
19 school which I heard, Father MFA was a notorious  
20 paedophile. He would come down and watch the junior boy  
21 shower after they had played rugby.

22 "We had to wear a white or grey shirt, charcoal or  
23 black trousers, a house tie, a tweed jacket during the  
24 week and a red blazer at the weekends. We had to wear  
25 the red blazers for Mass. There were specific clothes

1 for specific events. I even had a set of whites for  
2 playing cricket.

3 "The school was an old fort with a tower in the  
4 middle. When you went in, there was a big long  
5 corridor. Mr [REDACTED] MIH had a classroom on one side.  
6 There was another classroom on the other side. Then  
7 there was the study hall, then the refectory. Then you  
8 went through doors to the cloisters, the monastery and  
9 the church. On the first level there was more  
10 classrooms and then next door were the dormitories, like  
11 a big church hall with wooden partitions.

12 "We had classes in the morning until 12.30 pm and  
13 then in the afternoon we did games until 3.30 pm or on  
14 Wednesdays we did Combined Cadet Forces stuff. Then we  
15 had tea, then more classes from 4 pm to 5 pm, and then  
16 we had free time for half an hour. From 5.30 pm we had  
17 an hour of prep. We had dinner, then we had more prep  
18 until bed at 9.30 pm.

19 "At weekends we had classes on Saturday mornings  
20 until 12.30 pm, then we had free time unless you were in  
21 a sports team or there was CCF stuff.

22 "On Sunday's after Mass we had prep or letter  
23 writing, writing letters home to our families. They  
24 didn't tell us what to write, but they could ask to see  
25 your letter. Sometimes they would throw it in the bin.

1 This was the routine the whole time I was there is.

2 "On my return to school after the summer of 1983,  
3 I repeated my third year at school at my parents'  
4 insistence. They were all told by the new [REDACTED] that  
5 discipline would be tightened up as it had been too lax.  
6 It was then that the hierarchy of the school was brought  
7 home to me, with the prefects acting like the police  
8 force of the school, who were a law unto themselves and  
9 who frequently abused their authority and played God  
10 with the rest of the pupils. They would send us to our  
11 housemasters for minor infractions, knowing full well  
12 that we would receive a beating.

13 "Although it was a boys' school there were two girls  
14 who attended as day pupils. They were from quite a  
15 wealthy family. They just came in every day for classes  
16 and they didn't stay for prep. A lot of the boys didn't  
17 go near the girls because they were closet homosexuals.

18 "I got on well with two of the girls and I would  
19 speak to them all of the time. They would go home at  
20 12.30 pm on a Saturday; they weren't there the rest of  
21 the weekend. There weren't any male day pupils; they  
22 were all boarders.

23 "Initially, I did well at school. I got the English  
24 and history prizes in fourth year but towards the end of  
25 fourth year Father [REDACTED] MRQ brought in the cane for

1 punishment. After the beatings started, my grades just  
2 fell through the floor. My grades got so bad that  
3 Father [MMF] said that if I didn't buck up  
4 academically, I would be expelled or given corporal  
5 punishment by my housemaster. I complained several  
6 times to Father [MMF] that Father  
7 [MRQ] was picking on me. I requested a move out  
8 of Lovat House so I wouldn't get beaten by Father  
9 [MRQ]. Father [MMF] said it was up  
10 to Father [MRQ] how he chose to discipline me.  
11 He later denied [ ] that he had any knowledge  
12 of Father [MRQ] beating me but he is a liar.  
13 He was lying to try and save his own skin.

14 "The school did provide report cards. When my  
15 grades dropped, my parents wanted to know what was going  
16 on. I became clinically depressed. The villagers used  
17 to call me Arthur after Arthur Fowler, the character in  
18 Eastenders who had depression and went nuts. I was  
19 in the village at the Filling Station. They had a pool  
20 table and video games through the back and a lot of the  
21 boys from the school used to hang out there. Some of  
22 the boys went out with girls from the village but  
23 I found them a bit rough.

24 "If you were struggling with a subject at school  
25 there was no extra tuition or support. Father [MMF]



1           MMF just threatened me with expulsion or corporal  
2 punishment. In any event, who would want extra tuition  
3 from Father MRQ or Father MFA  
4 There was no guidance teacher or careers advice.

5           "I remember during my Higher English exam, Father  
6 MRQ said that no one was to move a muscle,  
7 that no one was most move their desk or they would be  
8 caned. A boy who was in the year above me moved his  
9 seat and his desk slightly. Father MRQ blew  
10 his top and told the boy to go up to the  
11 for a caning. The boy then came back down crying as he  
12 had been caned by Father MRQ. This was  
13 literally 10 minutes before the exam. I sat in the exam  
14 vomiting in my own mouth and crying my eyes out.  
15 I wanted to throttle MRQ for being a bully.

16           "We had to do manual labour at Fort Augustus. It  
17 could be anything that Father MRQ saw fit to  
18 make you do, from helping out with his to chopping  
19 sticks. In autumn it was always leaf raking. Other  
20 times he would get us to do ridiculous stuff like  
21 cleaning toilets and cleaning drains. This was despite  
22 there being ground staff. There was a weekly rota of  
23 things Father MRQ would get people to do.

24           "There wasn't much leisure time at Fort Augustus.  
25 There were club activities on a Tuesday night. They had

1 a rifle club and a cinema club. I was in the rifle  
2 club. I was [REDACTED] at the school. I was [REDACTED]  
3 [REDACTED] semi-automatic rifles and sometimes fully  
4 automatic rifles. They had pistols and pump-action  
5 shotguns. One night I had to clean 40 rifles. I was  
6 20 minutes late for prep and got caned for that by  
7 Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED].

8 "There was a tradition in the Combined Cadet Force  
9 that [REDACTED] was given the rank of sergeant. I was  
10 [REDACTED] during my time at Fort Augustus but I was  
11 just a [REDACTED]. Mike Haynes wanted to promote me to  
12 sergeant, but Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] wouldn't promote me.  
13 It was just another way of having a wee dig at me.

14 "I can't remember all the other clubs but there was  
15 a home brew club. Bear in mind this is 13 and 14s we're  
16 talking about. Fort Augustus was awash with alcohol.  
17 I don't just mean amongst the pupils, I mean the monks  
18 too. Every week you had a social gathering with your  
19 housemaster. Normally you would sit and drink tea and  
20 eat toast. Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] made home brew. It was  
21 really strong, like special brew. One time he gave us  
22 some at a social, which was the weekly meeting with your  
23 housemaster. We were all steaming drunk at 13 or  
24 14 years old. We went up to the dormitory singing and  
25 talking after lights out. Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] came up

1 to the dormitory, dragged us all back down to the room  
2 in the tower where we had been for the social gathering,  
3 and gave us all three strokes of the belt on each hand  
4 for making too much noise. I got three extra strokes on  
5 each hand for wearing a non-regulation shirt.

6 Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] picked on me; I think it was  
7 sexually motivated. This was in the room where he had  
8 been giving us drink and acting like our best mate  
9 20 minutes before.

10 "Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] would drink the home brew too.  
11 He would go into a psychotic rage when he was drunk.

12 "Father [REDACTED] MER [REDACTED] was my housemaster when I was  
13 17, from fifth year until the end of sixth year. At  
14 weekends he would give me a few cans of cider or beer.

15 "Father [REDACTED] MER [REDACTED] was in charge of the church at  
16 Fort Augustus. He was responsible for arranging which  
17 boys were to help with serving Mass. These altar boys  
18 were the most zealous Catholics. He would have social  
19 gatherings for the servers and they would all get  
20 steaming drunk. I remember seeing vomit in the corridor  
21 after one of these socials. I think it may have been  
22 a form of grooming, giving us alcohol at these meetings.

23 "I remember seeing a beer lorry arrive at  
24 Fort Augustus. I have never seen so many cans of beer  
25 in my life. There must have been about 50 pallets of

1 beer. I stole about six cans of McEwan's Export;  
2 I thought they would never miss them.

3 "On Sunday we had to go to Mass. We had to go to  
4 confession and receive the benediction. We had to  
5 confess if we had thoughts of a sexual nature and  
6 we were asked if we had touched ourselves. It was  
7 usually Father [REDACTED] MEZ that took confession.  
8 I found this both disturbing and disgusting. Since  
9 leaving Fort Augustus I have not attended a church at  
10 all.

11 "I became a Buddhist at the age of 13 or 14. I told  
12 the staff at Fort Augustus and they just laughed at me.  
13 I still had to go to Mass.

14 "Father [REDACTED] MEZ would ask us inappropriate  
15 questions during confession. He would ask if we gave  
16 each other oral sex. While asking these questions he  
17 would masturbate. I could see his hands making the  
18 movement. Father [REDACTED] MFA and [REDACTED] MEZ would  
19 both also seem very aroused and would be touching  
20 themselves through their trousers during confession.

21 "During the school holidays I would go back to  
22 Glasgow and I would see my friends and my girlfriend.  
23 We had summer, Easter and Christmas holidays. We had  
24 a mid-term as well, just three or four days. The staff  
25 would take us in a swan to Spean Bridge to get the train

1 and we would be picked up by our parents at Queen Street  
2 station in Glasgow.

3 "My parents would deposit money with Father  
4 **MRQ** for sweets or stationery. We would just  
5 spend it on cigarettes that we bought in the village.  
6 If you got caught smoking you would be fined. Initially  
7 it was £1 then £2 and then £5. It was funny that at the  
8 end of every school term Father **MRQ** would have  
9 a new TV or a cassette player or something. Instead of  
10 giving the fines money to a charity in Africa or  
11 whatever, I think he was embezzling the money. The  
12 tobacco smokers had a loose sort of society. Because  
13 there were no recreational facilities, we would go out  
14 and have a smoke. Some of non-smokers tagged along too  
15 just for something to do, somewhere to go.

16 "Jimmy Savile turned up at Fort Augustus. He was  
17 a regular visitor. I remember seeing a red Rolls Royce  
18 and asking another boy whose it was.

19 "Jimmy Savile was a papal knight, so he had every  
20 excuse to go to Mass and receive the benediction. There  
21 were bishops and priests who would visit too. There  
22 were visits from retired military persons, people who  
23 would talk about the Crimean War and things. They were  
24 there for inspection of the Combined Cadet Force.  
25 I wanted to pursue a career in the Royal Marines. I was

1 interviewed for the Royal Marines and the engineers. My  
2 grandfather had fought in the First World War in the  
3 engineers. The reason I couldn't join was because I was  
4 asthmatic. I wasn't able to join the army or the  
5 police.

6 "I didn't have any visits from my family when I was  
7 at Fort Augustus, but two of my friends from Glasgow  
8 came up to visit. Visitors would stay in the Lovat  
9 House Hotel.

10 "All of my friends were Protestant. One of my  
11 friends was Protestant and wanted to see how the  
12 Catholics were treating me. He was appalled by the  
13 state of Fort Augustus. He said the place was a dump.  
14 He couldn't believe what a tip it was. I asked Father  
15 **MRQ** if I could go up to the hotel to see my  
16 friends. He said no but I went anyway.

17 "There was a matron at Fort Augustus. Her name was  
18 Mrs Gunn. We called her 'Ma Gunn'. She was some kind  
19 of quasi-qualified medical person. She was ancient.  
20 I think she had been a nurse years before. She was  
21 a nasty old witch. I had to see her because I was  
22 asthmatic and I had to get inhalers.

23 "One time Father **MRQ** his me so hard that  
24 I broke one of knuckles on my hand and I had to go and  
25 see her for that. I had to get referred to

1 Raigmore Hospital in Inverness. They said I had  
2 a hairline fracture.

3 "Mrs Gunn wasn't really interested in our  
4 well-being, it was just a job to her. She certainly  
5 wasn't reporting to the police that boys were being  
6 beaten at Fort Augustus. I'm sure she saw injuries that  
7 couldn't have been considered accidental. She didn't  
8 say anything, nobody did. Nobody said anything about  
9 Fort Augustus until the 'Sins of Our Fathers'  
10 documentary came out.

11 "William John McCrae was the village GP at  
12 Fort Augustus. I had to go and see him for an injury on  
13 my hand at one point. It would have been in my fourth  
14 or fifth year. I had been caned the night before.  
15 I showed him the marks on my buttocks and said he was  
16 disgraceful. He said it was disgraceful that something  
17 like this should happen under Mr [REDACTED] MIH watch  
18 because he knew Mr [REDACTED] MIH quite well. He said,  
19 'I should report it to the police', but he didn't report  
20 it. I didn't go to the police.

21 "Boys tried to run away five or six times when I was  
22 at Fort Augustus. It was a joke. Their parents just  
23 sent them back. We would sing The Great Escape music to  
24 them. I didn't try to run away; my parents would have  
25 just sent me back. I don't remember if boys got

1 punished for trying to run away. In Lovat House they  
2 probably just got a lecture. God knows what Father  
3 [REDACTED] MRQ would have done if a boy tried to run from  
4 Vaughan House.

5 "I said to Father [REDACTED] MRQ that he might as  
6 well put up a sign saying 'Arbeit macht frei', which was  
7 the sign they had above the gates of Dachau. The school  
8 colours were red, white and black, the same as the  
9 Nazis.

10 "I instantly noticed a climate of fear at  
11 Fort Augustus. It was common for boys to be beaten.  
12 Usually it would happen in third and fourth year. There  
13 was a lot of violence and punishment by prefects and  
14 housemasters. Typically, punishment would involve being  
15 hit with a belt or cane or an open hand. You could also  
16 be fined, made to do physical exercise, or made to do  
17 manual labour.

18 "My first experience of abuse at Fort Augustus was  
19 during the first couple of weeks. I was caught smoking  
20 by a prefect and he reported it to Father [REDACTED] MRQ .  
21 I was beaten by Father [REDACTED] MRQ for this.

22 "In the third week of the summer term when I arrived  
23 at Fort Augustus in 1983, I was attacked in my dormitory  
24 cubicle after lights out. I was pinned down on my bed  
25 and a pillow put over my face in an attempt to either



1 asphyxiate me or silence my cries for help. I was then  
2 assaulted about the body with a hockey stick. I managed  
3 to push my assailant off me using the pillow over my  
4 face, whereupon I was punched and another assailant  
5 groped my penis and testicles. At this point, one of my  
6 assailants put his penis in my face and ejaculated. My  
7 anus was penetrated but I don't know if it was by  
8 a penis, a finger or another object.

9 "I fought the assailants off with the hockey stick  
10 and my fists and I chased them out of my cubicle. Both  
11 my assailants were dressed in black but I do not know  
12 who the individuals were. I couldn't identify them.  
13 I was absolutely terrified and complained to the duty  
14 prefect but nothing was done. I am not aware of this  
15 sort of attack happening to anyone else in the  
16 dormitory, however it was not uncommon to hear crying,  
17 shouting and distress within the dormitory.

18 "Two weeks after that incident, I was belted four  
19 times on each hand by Father MRQ because I'd  
20 been caught smoking in the village. I also received  
21 a £5 fine and two hours' manual labour. I was not  
22 allowed to change cubicle from May 1983 until July 1986  
23 when I was in sixth form and got my own study.

24 "At night in the dormitory, you could hear the boys  
25 masturbating. It was disgusting and I was stuck in the

1           same cubicle where I was assaulted in May 1983."

2           My Lady, I notice that it's after 1 o'clock and

3           I have a fair bit to go with this statement.

4       LADY SMITH: Let's just pause now for the lunch break and

5           we'll start again at 2 o'clock.

6       (1.02 pm)

7                               (The lunch adjournment)

1

2 (2.00 pm)

3 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod.

4 MS MACLEOD: Good afternoon, my Lady. I will continue

5 reading the statement of Roberto. The statement itself

6 starts at WIT.001.002.8148. I'll continue from

7 WIT.001.002.8164, from paragraph 79:

8 "Father **MRQ** would beat you at four times  
9 of the day: 1.30 pm, 3.30 pm, 6.30 pm or at bedtime. He  
10 would cane you or use the tawse. Her would beat you in  
11 the tower or the **MRQ**. If you were getting  
12 punished in his office, it would be just the tawse on  
13 your hands. If it was in the **MRQ**, it could be  
14 the tawse or the cane. It was just mad. He had two  
15 tawse belts, one thicker than the other. When he beat  
16 me, he always used the thicker one.

17 "When someone was being belted or caned last thing  
18 at night, the rest of the pupils would go into the maths  
19 class and turn off the lights, so Father **MRQ**  
20 couldn't see who was watching; he didn't want any  
21 witnesses. The maths class overlooked the **MRQ**  
22 and we would watch the person being belted.

23 "From the outset, I found **MRQ** extremely  
24 intimidating and most pupils were cared of scared of  
25 him. Father **MRQ** was prone to outbursts of

1 what can only be described as psychotic rage. He was a  
2 thug and a bully who should never have been allowed near  
3 children.

4 "On each of the numerous occasions I was belted by  
5 him, I was left with severe bruising to the hands and on  
6 several occasions my wrists and the insides of my  
7 forearms were bruised to the extent that I was unable to  
8 write or open and close my hands for two or three days  
9 at a time due to the bruising and swelling. It was not  
10 uncommon for boys to be belted twice on the same day,  
11 leaving the victim with severe bruising and acute pain  
12 for a considerable length of time.

13 "The corporal punishment was the tawse administered  
14 as twice-three or twice-four. That meant you would get  
15 three or four strikes to etch on a hand. This was also  
16 used to describe the number of strokes of the cane you  
17 would get.

18 "At the end of the third year, Father MRQ  
19 told us that he had procured a malacca cane and showed  
20 it to us in the [REDACTED]. Father MRQ  
21 said he oiled it with linseed oil so it was supple and  
22 very flexible. It made a whooshing noise.

23 "Father MRQ would cane people last thing  
24 at night. You would be terrified all day, knowing you  
25 were going to get caned. He made you take your jacket

1 off. If you got caught with books down your trousers,  
2 you would get two extra strokes. The cane was about  
3 6 feet long. He would say, 'I've oiled it for you'.

4 "If you refused corporal punishment, he would either  
5 get prefects to hold you down or you would get beaten by  
6 the prefects. I always told the prefects that if they  
7 touched me I would either fight them or phone the  
8 police.

9 "I was caned on 14 occasions during a 2.5-year  
10 period. This was mostly for smoking, even though I was  
11 legally allowed to buy cigarettes after I turned 16.  
12 The majority of the times, my skin would be broken.  
13 There was bruising and sometimes Father MRQ  
14 drew blood.

15 "On one occasion I suffered a broken knuckle.  
16 I went to Raigmore Hospital in Inverness for treatment.  
17 I had to get my hand X-rayed. The other boys saw the  
18 marks.



1 [REDACTED]  
2 [REDACTED]

3 [REDACTED]

4 "Father MRQ also caned and victimised  
5 another pupil. He was in the year below me. He was  
6 often with me when I got beaten, maybe 70% of the time.  
7 I would say he was picked on even more than I was  
8 because he wasn't physically strong so couldn't fight  
9 back. I also believe that he was sexually assaulted by  
10 Father MER and Father MFC. I saw  
11 him coming out of both those housemaster's rooms and  
12 he was limping. Those housemasters didn't use a cane so  
13 he couldn't have been limping from that. He was always  
14 being picked on by the housemasters, especially  
15 Father MRQ. I would be quite happy to go to  
16 court and confirm the abuse he suffered which  
17 I witnessed.

18 "During my first half-term I was taught [REDACTED] by  
19 Father MEW. I was frequently slapped and  
20 hit for poor work or [REDACTED] incorrectly. As  
21 a result, I did not continue as a [REDACTED] student on my  
22 return in September 1983.

23 "I was caned five times because another pupil caught  
24 me smoking when I was 16 and I was legally able to go  
25 and buy tobacco. His brother was in my year and he was

1 a bully too according to the younger boys but he didn't  
2 bother me. Their family was very influential in the  
3 running of the school.

4 "Father [REDACTED] MFA sexually assaulted me. In my  
5 fifth year I studied [REDACTED] and was taught by  
6 Father [REDACTED] MFA. He would often chastise me and  
7 punish me for bad work. He would often ask me to remain  
8 behind after class for extra tuition. On four separate  
9 occasions he groped my crotch and made inappropriate  
10 remarks of a sexual nature. I was shown sadomasochistic  
11 homosexual pornography by [REDACTED] MFA. He kept it  
12 in a green filing cabinet along with his cigarettes and  
13 whisky. He was an alcoholic and he would also watch us  
14 showering, as did Father [REDACTED] MRQ.

15 "I had to study under Father [REDACTED] MFA again in  
16 sixth year. One time near the end of my stay at  
17 Fort Augustus, he said I was more beautiful than Venus  
18 and begun attempting to grope me again. He wanted me to  
19 go to Rome with his and be his secretary. He told me  
20 that he loved me. He offered me cigarettes and whisky  
21 to go to his room in the monastery and have sex with him  
22 or perform oral sex. He would threaten to have me caned  
23 and beaten if I didn't do what he told me to. He never  
24 beat me personally; he would get the housemaster to beat  
25 me. Those beatings would always be on my buttocks.

1 I complained to Mr Paul Vallot, the chemistry  
2 teacher, who said he would do something about it, but  
3 nothing happened.

4 "At the time I was being abused by  
5 Father [REDACTED] MFA, I was between 16 and 18 years old.  
6 He was 80 years old. His abuse lasted for a couple of  
7 years. Other people in the school used to make fun of  
8 me regularly. They would say, 'Pain is pleasure', and  
9 that I was [REDACTED] MFA servant. On the final occasion I was  
10 abused by Father [REDACTED] MFA I punched him in the  
11 face. By that time I was 18 and 6'3", so he knew he  
12 couldn't do anything to me.

13 "The monks running the school delegated duties to  
14 the prefects but they gave the prefects far too much  
15 power. The monks didn't take enough responsibility for  
16 the day-to-day running of the school. There were two  
17 school prefects, five or six house prefects in each  
18 house, and there were two college men in each house.  
19 They would be responsible for turning the lights out at  
20 night. I was never a prefect. I was always overlooked  
21 in that way.

22 "The prefects could give you punishments. We were  
23 made to do press-ups. I was forced to empty the bins  
24 all round the school, which was ridiculous as they had  
25 ground staff employed to do that. We were forced to do



1 manual labour. We were forced to take cold showers  
2 naked in front of prefects.

3 "You could be given lines; 400 or 500 lines a time.  
4 We were made to do press-ups if we were caught with our  
5 hands in our pocks -- and this could be outdoors or even  
6 in the village. We would be made to run up and down  
7 a small hill with an extremely steep incline. It was  
8 known as the ski slope. You would be given 25 to  
9 50 repetitions for something as trivial as disagreeing  
10 with a prefect. I always found this hard as I am  
11 asthmatic. We could be made to run around Arachdee(?)  
12 or to the Christ Lives landmark, which was more than  
13 halfway up a hill on the side of the Great Glen.

14 "We could be punished by not being allowed out of  
15 the school for one or two weeks. We would be given  
16 lines, usually given out in lots of 50; it was not  
17 uncommon to receive 500 lines. Detentions would be for  
18 half an hour or an hour in the study room.

19 "In the academic year 1983 to 1984, a senior boy who  
20 was a prefect singled me out for ridiculing Mr Andrew  
21 Dempster, the maths teacher. His classes were nothing  
22 less than a riot. When he left Fort Augustus, he went  
23 to teach at Kilgraston Catholic Girls' Public School in  
24 Perth, where he was locked in a cupboard by the sixth  
25 girls. This boy said that I had been winding up

1 Mr Dempster and wanted to teach me a lesson. He made me  
2 go on a cross-country run as a punishment around  
3 Arachdee, which was a 4-kilometre run up a hill and  
4 round a track. I suffer from asthma, so I found this  
5 punishment difficult. This senior boy brought a  
6 silver-topped military cane with him, which he used to  
7 repeatedly hit me with. He was telling me that if I  
8 didn't start behaving I would get more of the same  
9 treatment and I was to treat Mr Dempster with respect.

10 "I was left from 3.30 pm until 9.00 pm, missing  
11 dinner that night. I was left with bruises on my body  
12 and legs. This happened in the Christmas term of 1983.  
13 I think this shows the attitude of the prefect and the  
14 staff that left the prefects in charge.

15 "At Fort Augustus if you were good at sports or in  
16 a school team you were one of the boys. It meant you  
17 weren't subjected to the draconian punishment the rest  
18 of us got. This often led to pupils of low intelligence  
19 being put in positions of authority. They were often  
20 bullies and cronies of the prefects.

21 "When I returned for fourth year, I was caned for  
22 the first time in September. I was caught smoking.  
23 I received a £5 fine, two hours' manual labour, and four  
24 strokes of the cane on my buttocks. It was  
25 Father MRQ who caned me in the [REDACTED].

1 He told me to take my jacket off, to bend over, and put  
2 my hands to the side. He then caned me. After the  
3 second stroke, I asked him to stop as I was in  
4 excruciating pain. It was to no avail, he carried on.  
5 After four strokes I was left with severe bruises and  
6 welts on my buttocks. I was unable to sit down without  
7 severe discomfort and I had to sleep on my stomach to  
8 avoid exacerbating the pain.

9 "Father MRQ caning was at its worst  
10 during my fourth year at school. At this point it was  
11 not uncommon to be beaten three or four times a day to  
12 the point where I became suicidal. I would walk around  
13 crying my eyes out all the time. This had a negative  
14 impact on my grades at school.

15 "In the weeks leading up to my 16th birthday I joked  
16 with Father MRQ that I would be legally  
17 allowed to buy cigarettes on my birthday. I was belted  
18 after lunch for a minor infraction, twice three-belted  
19 in the evening for another minor infraction, and caned  
20 for smoking as well as being given a £5 fine and two  
21 hours' of manual labour.

22 "On one occasion I had to see the village GP,  
23 Dr WJ McCrae at the surgery about my asthma. I had been  
24 caned the previous night. The doctor saw the severe  
25 bruises and welts on my buttocks. He was shocked and

1 gave me painkillers. Each time I was caned I was left  
2 with severe bruising, had to sleep on my stomach, and  
3 had difficulty walking.

4 "Father [REDACTED] MRQ brought in a rule that if you  
5 were caught smoking outside twice in one day you would  
6 be caned. I have lost count of the number of times  
7 I was belted from my arrival at Fort Augustus until the  
8 abolition of corporal punishment. I was belted about  
9 20 times a term for minor infractions, each time leaving  
10 my hands severely bruised.

11 "Father [REDACTED] MRQ would deduct money from our  
12 pocket money. He would get me to do all sorts of manual  
13 labour. I had to clean up leaves, I had to clean drains  
14 and do sanitary work. I had to dig up stones from the  
15 grounds and do joinery work. Basically, I had to do  
16 everything they were too tight to pay the groundsmen to  
17 do.

18 "Our mail was frequently opened by our housemasters.  
19 A prefect read my mail. He was trying to intercept  
20 cigarettes that my mum sent me; this was because he  
21 smoked the same cigarettes as me. He kept sending me to  
22 my housemaster because of smoking. I would get letters  
23 from my parents and they had already been opened. Both  
24 Father [REDACTED] MMF and Father [REDACTED] MRQ told me that  
25 they censored the mail.

1            "If you were caught mucking about at Combined Cadet  
2 Forces training, you were known as a defaulter. You  
3 would have to do cleaning work on a Monday afternoon in  
4 your cadet uniform.

5            "I remember seeing a pupil coming out of  
6 Father [REDACTED] MER [REDACTED] office one time. He had gone in  
7 smartly dressed and when he came out he was all  
8 dishevelled. I had seen him going in and coming out.  
9 I heard him in Father [REDACTED] MER [REDACTED] office shouting,  
10 'No Father, no'. When he came out, it looked like  
11 Father [REDACTED] MER [REDACTED] had been shaking him about.

12           "That kind of thing used to happen to another boy  
13 all the time too. I remember once I saw that other boy  
14 coming out of Father [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] room. He was  
15 crying and limping. I asked him what was wrong. He  
16 said, [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] got me'.

17           "I don't know if the abuse of caning and beltings  
18 was recorded anywhere. It was every day. The  
19 discipline of that type wasn't recorded in our report  
20 cards. There might be a comment about, 'Roberto's  
21 discipline is XYZ'. I hate to think what a psychopath  
22 like Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] could have written in my  
23 permanent school record because the guy was a nutcase.

24           "I remember Father [REDACTED] MRQ [REDACTED] talking to me about  
25 the church and how a boy at the school's family had paid

1 for the (inaudible). I asked him if he didn't think it  
2 was immoral to have these paid for by money earned from  
3 gambling. I reminded Father [REDACTED] MRQ about the  
4 biblical quote about not building your house on sand.  
5 Father [REDACTED] MRQ went nuts and threw a hatchet at  
6 me.

7 "I was caned by Father [REDACTED] MRQ three weeks  
8 before the abolition of corporal punishment. After the  
9 date of abolition I said, 'Ha ha, you can't cane me any  
10 more'; he said, 'I can fucking rape you'. Those were  
11 his exact words.

12 "When I was at Fort Augustus I was verbally abused  
13 and threatened by a number of boys at the school. They  
14 used to follow me about over a two-year period at  
15 school, calling me a fat Italian bastard and things like  
16 that. I complained to Father [REDACTED] MRQ but he said  
17 the boy was a lovely chap.

18 "When I was attacked in the dormitory at night  
19 in the summer term of 1983 I told the [REDACTED] who was  
20 on duty. He told me to just ignore it. At that time  
21 he was about to leave the school and go to university.  
22 He did not want to become involved. I did later report  
23 this assault to the police.

24 "I attempted to complain to Father [REDACTED] MMF  
25 about my treatment by Father [REDACTED] MRQ . I was met

1 with the response that Father [REDACTED] MRQ had every  
2 right to punish me as he saw fit. Father [REDACTED] MRQ  
3 replaced Father [REDACTED] MMF as [REDACTED] SNR toward  
4 the spring term of my fifth year. When Father  
5 [REDACTED] MER became my housemaster, it was like night  
6 and day. Father [REDACTED] MER was a compassionate man  
7 with a good understanding of the human psyche and he  
8 helped me a lot.

9 "I did tell my parents about the abuse but they  
10 didn't believe me. I told Dr McCrae and I told my  
11 friend from Glasgow. He had no idea what was going on.

12 "The people who say that Fort Augustus was great,  
13 that those school days were their halcyon days, were the  
14 ones who were involved in the abuse. I can't believe  
15 the police aren't taking action against them.

16 "I left Fort Augustus because I was 18. I left  
17 in the summer of 1987. I had done my Highers. I failed  
18 all of them. I have got 12 or 13 O-grades at C level.  
19 When I was 30, I went into adult education. I got the  
20 qualifications to get into Glasgow University but had  
21 a lot of alcohol and substance issues at the time. The  
22 old building at Glasgow University was like  
23 Fort Augustus and I kept having flashbacks and I had to  
24 leave. If I hadn't been abused and if I hadn't been  
25 taking substances because of the abuse I don't know

1 where I could have been in life. I could have studied  
2 archeology, I could have done anything I wanted.

3 "Just after leaving school, I worked briefly as  
4 a porter in Glasgow fruit market for a couple of months.  
5 I went to Langside College but dropped out. I bummed  
6 about for a while and then I did an HND in business  
7 studies but that fell through.

8 "In 1988 I started to see a psychiatrist. I was  
9 given a massive dose of anti-depressants and did  
10 six months of psychotherapy.

11 "Father MRQ turned up in a barber shop in  
12 my street in Glasgow [REDACTED] and started  
13 trying to speak to me. He shouldn't have done that. He  
14 shouldn't have been there. I told him to get out of the  
15 shop. He had been visiting a former pupil of  
16 Fort Augustus who stayed near there.

17 "I have suffered further harassment from the  
18 Catholic Church. I have had leaflets about Catholicism  
19 put through my door. Another priest who was at  
20 Fort Augustus, Gerry something, saw me in Glasgow and  
21 said, 'Your sins are numerous'. I didn't know what he  
22 meant.

23 "I have been unemployed and in receipt of disability  
24 benefits since I was 25. I worked briefly for a firm of  
25 stockbrokers. I should have had a promising career in



1 front of me but due to the PTSD and abuse I suffered at  
2 Fort Augustus I couldn't handle it. The initial wages  
3 were a pittance and I couldn't hang about waiting to be  
4 promoted. I was better off unemployed rather than being  
5 an office junior.

6 "I have had four or five sessions of psychotherapy.  
7 It was organised by Future Pathways. It was rubbish.  
8 She asked me if I was violent. That's no way to speak  
9 to someone who has been physically, sexually and  
10 emotionally abused. It was easier for a doctor to say  
11 that it was drug-induced psychosis rather than look  
12 at the real problems, which were the physical, sexual  
13 and emotional abuse I suffered at Fort Augustus.

14 "I told the psychologist about this at sessions  
15 twice a week for about six weeks. She was the only  
16 person I opened up to about the abuse. I have been  
17 hospitalised many times. I can't remember how many.

18 "I now get my medication from a nurse. I wouldn't  
19 miss a session. It helps me. It helps to stop all the  
20 horrible thoughts about Fort Augustus.

21 "I had a painful injury to my left knee as a result  
22 of playing rugby in a house match. I was offered no  
23 treatment for it at the time and it's sore to this day.  
24 I have spent the last 30 years of my life arguing with  
25 my parents about what happened to me at Fort Augustus,

1 about why they ever sent me there in the first place.

2 "The Catholic Church have ruined the lives of  
3 countless individuals throughout the world and they have  
4 tried to cover these crimes up. They must be held  
5 accountable and made to compensate for the damage, both  
6 physical and psychological, that they have inflicted on  
7 innocent children. No amount of apologies or even money  
8 from the Catholic Church or the Benedictine Order can  
9 ever adequately compensate for the suffering we endured.  
10 We only get one life and mine was ruined by the  
11 Catholic Church.

12 "I have received £10,000 compensation from the  
13 Benedictine Order through solicitors in England. The  
14 Benedictines have admitted that their members abused me.  
15 As far as I am concerned, that should be the first of  
16 many payments. I want to inflict as much damage on them  
17 as I can.

18 "Future Pathways, the government organisation that  
19 should have been helping me, didn't bother their  
20 backside with me for two years. I have phoned them up  
21 on about 15 occasions asking for help and when they were  
22 going to see me. They kept postponing me. Eventually  
23 they sent two guys to my flat and I told them about the  
24 things that I needed, but they have refused to reimburse  
25 me for things that I have bought that they said they

1 would pay for. I think it is a disgrace the way they  
2 are dealing with public money. I told them on about the  
3 tenth or eleventh time I phoned that they were nothing  
4 but a bunch crooks and liars. They have lied to me on  
5 numerous occasions.

6 "I think the apology by Archbishop Tartaglia and the  
7 Scottish Government ring hollow unless they are prepared  
8 to seriously engage with abuse survivors, to compensate  
9 them, and to give them healthcare and the treatment they  
10 require.

11 "After I left school in my 20s, I told my parents  
12 again about the abuse. I told them about that first  
13 incident in the dormitory where I was attacked at night.  
14 Even then, my mum didn't believe me. It caused a lot of  
15 trouble in our house.

16 "In 2014 the police came to see me. This is because  
17 another boy reported abuse he suffered to the police.  
18 I had wanted to report the abuse I suffered to the  
19 police for a number of years, but I didn't know how to  
20 do it. I thought no one would listen to me. When the  
21 other boy came forward, so did everybody else. I gave  
22 the police a four-page statement. It was the police  
23 from in Inverness. They just asked me general questions  
24 about the school. The abusers are all dead apart from  
25 Father **MRQ** Father **MER** and

1 Father [REDACTED] MFC .

2 "By the time the police spoke to me, Father [REDACTED] MFA  
3 was dead. As for Father [REDACTED] MFC I don't think anyone  
4 witnessed the abuse so no one could vouch for that.

5 "I have not had any further involvement with the  
6 police since the [REDACTED]  
7 Father [REDACTED] I think Father [REDACTED] MRQ knew  
8 people in the SAS, the Diplomatic corps, and the  
9 Civil Service. They were pupils at Fort Augustus when  
10 I was there who told me that their fathers were in these  
11 organisations and some of their fathers were former  
12 pupils of Fort Augustus. [REDACTED]

13 [REDACTED].

14 "I have not tried to get my records from  
15 Fort Augustus. I expect it would be lies, just  
16 a fabrication.

17 "I think the English Benedictine Congregation and  
18 Catholic boarding schools should be shut down. The  
19 Catholic Church should be shut down. They shouldn't be  
20 allowed to practice, not only in Scotland but in other  
21 places where there has been abuse by priests, such as  
22 Ireland, the USA, South America and Italy. Wherever  
23 they go, the exact same things that happened to me  
24 happens to other people.

25 "The Catholic Church have ruined the lives of

1           countless individuals throughout the world and they have  
2           tried to cover these crimes up. They must be held  
3           accountable and be made to compensate for the damage  
4           inflicted upon innocent children both physical and  
5           psychological.

6           "However, no amount of money or apologies from the  
7           Catholic Church or the Benedictine Order can ever  
8           adequately compensate for the suffering we endured. We  
9           only get one life and mine was ruined by the  
10          Catholic Church.

11          "I hope the inquiry will make all this abuse public  
12          to shame these organisations into doing something.  
13          I would like to see all of the people I have named as  
14          being abusers in this statement being prosecuted.

15          "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
16          published as part of the evidence to the inquiry.  
17          I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are  
18          true."

19          The statement was signed by Roberto on  
20          21 August 2019.

21   LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

22          You indicated we've got one or two more statements  
23          available; is that right?

24   MS MACLEOD: Yes, we have another four statements. They are  
25          shorter statements so together I think they will take

1 half an hour or so.

2 LADY SMITH: Let's proceed with those. Thank you.

3 Witness statement of "FRED" (read)

4 MS MACLEOD: The next is from a witness who wishes to remain  
5 anonymous and to use the pseudonym "Fred". His  
6 statement can be found at BEN .001.004.4308:

7 "My name is Fred. I was born in 1940. My contact  
8 details are known to the inquiry.

9 I attended Carlekemp Priory School between 1948 and  
10 1954, ages 8 on to 14, and Fort Augustus Abbey School  
11 from 1954 to 1959, ages 14 to 19.

12 "I married in 1966 and moved to Australia. I have  
13 three sons. I am a retired chartered surveyor and  
14 currently sit on the boards of three IT companies.

15 "Both schools were situated in beautiful scenic  
16 surroundings and my days there were some of the happiest  
17 days of my life. I not only left school with many happy  
18 memories but with a lifelong admiration and respect for  
19 many of my teachers that has not changed even with the  
20 benefit of hindsight.

21 "From the staff I only experienced courtesy, good  
22 humour and a total absence of foul language, so much so  
23 that I often took my family there in the decades that  
24 followed to see the place and meet the staff that had  
25 influenced my future.

1 "I was a boarder at Carlekemp. The usual daily  
2 routine was to get up at 7 am, attend church for about  
3 half an hour, eat breakfast, and begin classes at  
4 8.30 am. We would have a morning break and then more  
5 classes until 12.30. Lunch was from approximately 12.30  
6 to 1.15 followed by a quiet period when we would read  
7 a book until about 2 pm. On weekdays we had games in  
8 the afternoon and then tea at 4.15. From 4.30 to 6 pm  
9 there were more classes. Supper was 6.15 to 6.45 after  
10 which was study and homework time. The length of the  
11 study period depended on how old you were, with older  
12 students studying until about 9 pm and younger ones  
13 until 8 pm.

14 "On Saturday the morning routine was the same as  
15 during the week. On Saturday afternoons we had  
16 interschool sports. In the evening there would be  
17 a film for the boarders. On Sunday morning we would go  
18 to church. Sunday afternoons were free time until tea.  
19 The younger students engaged in supervised activities,  
20 for example a walk to the beach. The older students  
21 would do their hobbies or practice sports.

22 "In terms of staff, there was a matron,  
23 Miss O'Donnell, and one lay teacher, Mr MFB. The  
24 rest of the staff were monks. There were about eight  
25 monks working there. I remember Father MFX was

1 the headmaster when I started. [REDACTED] MFA ,  
2 Father [REDACTED] MEZ , Father [REDACTED] MEW and  
3 Father Maurus Whitehead were all teachers. It was  
4 a small school and there were under 100 students when  
5 I attended.

6 "The entire school was in one building, which had  
7 been a large private home set in some wooded acres  
8 overlooking the Firth of Forth and North Berwick's west  
9 golf course.

10 "The downstairs had classrooms and the upstairs had  
11 dormitories. About eight to ten students, grouped by  
12 age, would sleep in a room. The chapel was also part of  
13 the same building. The headmaster had an office on the  
14 same level as the dormitories. The matron had a bedsit  
15 next to the dormitory of the first year students. There  
16 was one other bedsit on the same level as the dormitory  
17 where a lay staff or monk would stay. The rest of the  
18 monks stayed in a separate area of the building for  
19 sleeping which is off limits to students.

20 "The calendar was divided into three terms. The  
21 first was September to December, the second January to  
22 Easter, and the third was the summer term which went  
23 from after the Easter break until the beginning of July.  
24 Students would go home for the holidays in between the  
25 terms.



1           "Healthcare was generally handled by the matron.

2           There was a doctor who would attend the school whenever  
3           he was needed and we went to a dentist in North Berwick.

4           "If a student had a birthday during the term, there  
5           would be a cake at teatime and a birthday song. The  
6           student might have presents that had been sent by his  
7           parents, which he would open and keep or share if it was  
8           something like chocolates.

9           "There was a half-term break when many parents would  
10          visit, either for the day or to stay overnight in  
11          North Berwick. You might go and have afternoon tea with  
12          your parents at one of the hotels.

13          "I was aware that the school was inspected once  
14          a year by people who I understood to be from the  
15          Education Department. An inspector would visit each  
16          class and say a few words.

17          "At the end of each term each student got a report  
18          card with comments from all the teachers reading  
19          academic performance. The headmaster would make  
20          a comment on the report that would address general  
21          issues such as behaviour and character.

22          "There were a number of adults not on staff who had  
23          unsupervised access to the students. For example,  
24          a former boxer came to the school to give boxing  
25          lessons. There was two women from Edinburgh who used to

1           come and teach Highland dancing. Some of us went to  
2           stables in North Berwick for horse riding. As far as  
3           I know, there was no vetting of such people of the type  
4           carried out today.

5           "At the time I attended Carlekemp, physical  
6           discipline was still a regular occurrence. Each teacher  
7           had his own cane or strap which he would use to punish  
8           students who misbehaved in class. We were always hit on  
9           the hand in front of the class. If the misbehaviour was  
10          more serious, the headmaster would administer the  
11          punishment in front of the school.

12          "If there was misbehaviour in the dormitories, for  
13          example pillow fighting, the punishment was usually  
14          a hit to the backside administered by whoever heard the  
15          ruckus.

16          "The headmaster had an office on the same floor as  
17          the dormitories and he could hear any mucking about and  
18          would come in to discipline the students. Over the  
19          course of my time at Carlekemp there was a shift away  
20          from corporal punishment to punishment by removal of  
21          a privilege. For example, I was once told I couldn't  
22          watch the Saturday film. My classmates and I discussed  
23          it and we all preferred the caning because it was over  
24          and done with.

25          "I had no awareness whatsoever of any sexual abuse

1 during my time at Carlekemp. It was hard for me to  
2 imagine it happening as it was such a small school.

3 "I left the school in 1954 to go to Fort Augustus  
4 Abbey School.

5 "The daily routine at Fort Augustus was the same as  
6 Carlekemp. [REDACTED] MFX [REDACTED], who had been the [REDACTED] at  
7 Carlekemp, became the [REDACTED] fort Augustus so there was  
8 a lot of continuity in how things were done at the two  
9 schools. There were the same three terms and birthdays  
10 were celebrated in a similar way to Carlekemp.

11 Fort Augustus was much bigger than Carlekemp. There  
12 were maybe 100 to 150 students when I was there. The  
13 school was a three-storey building. The ground floor  
14 had the lockers, showers and baths. The first floor had  
15 the classrooms, refectory and study hall. The second  
16 storey was the dormitories. The dormitories were  
17 extremely large rooms with many students in them. They  
18 were sub-divided into different areas. There were  
19 prefects who were in charge of discipline in the  
20 dormitories. They were older students.

21 "The abbey was physically connected to the school  
22 building but was quite separate and the students never  
23 went into the abbey. I remember some of the monks who  
24 were involved with the school: Father [REDACTED] MFD [REDACTED]  
25 was the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]; Father [REDACTED] MFE [REDACTED] was the

1 housemaster for Lovat House; and Father Celestine  
2 Haworth was housemaster for Vaughan House.  
3 Father Aidan Duggan arrived in my first year at  
4 Fort Augustus and I think Father [REDACTED] MEY and  
5 Father [REDACTED] MEV arrived a year later. I got  
6 to know them quite well. Father [REDACTED] MFF also  
7 worked at the school.

8 "Unmarried staff often stayed in a bedsit in  
9 a different building. If they were married, they would  
10 live in the village. There might have been four or five  
11 lay staff teachers when I was there. I remember  
12 Mr [REDACTED] MIH Mr Palmer and Mr Treadaway.

13 "There was a full-time matron who dealt with any  
14 medical issues. There was also a local doctor and if  
15 a student needed to go to hospital they went to  
16 Inverness. I ended up going to hospital in Inverness on  
17 one occasion. That's when I met Father Aidan Duggan.  
18 We had afternoons off once a month or so and if you were  
19 in a lower form you would go on a supervised outing into  
20 the hills. About six months after I arrived I was up  
21 in the hills and I fell into a river and broke some of  
22 my ribs. I ended up in the sanatorium by myself and  
23 Father Aidan Duggan visited me. He didn't sexually  
24 abuse me, even though it was the perfect opportunity.

25 "Most people's families lived further away from

1 Fort Augustus than Carlekemp and I don't remember the  
2 same kind of visits happening at half-term. Parents  
3 could come and visit any time if they wanted. There was  
4 a prize day at the end of the school year that was a big  
5 event at both Carlekemp and Fort Augustus. Many parents  
6 would come for that event.

7 "I recall there being similar Education Department  
8 inspections at Fort Augustus as there were at Carlekemp.

9 "We got school reports at the end of each term.  
10 There were comments from each teacher about your  
11 academic achievement and also a housemaster report that  
12 was more about how you were developing as a person and  
13 what your sports achievements were. The headmaster  
14 concluded the report with a overview of your general  
15 progress towards the goal of being a well-rounded young  
16 gentleman when you left.

17 "Like at Carlekemp, there were instructors who had  
18 unsupervised access to students at Fort Augustus.  
19 Student, especially older students, had a fair amount of  
20 freedom to go into the village by themselves and even  
21 further afield to places like Fort William and Inverness  
22 on day holidays.

23 "By the time I was at Fort Augustus the use of  
24 corporal punishment was lessening. The housemasters  
25 were the major distributors of punishment. If they used

1 corporal punishment, it was always on the hand. Unlike  
2 Carlekemp, each teacher didn't have their own strap.  
3 The headmaster was not involved in punishment. Prefects  
4 also had the authority to punish students. They might  
5 give a clip around the ear or make someone shine their  
6 shoes as punishment for misbehaviour in the dormitories.  
7 I am not aware of anything that I would call physical or  
8 psychological abuse.

9 "Father MRQ was a nice fellow but I could  
10 see him losing his cool if he was pushed.

11 "I have no awareness of any physical or sexual abuse  
12 during the time I was at Fort Augustus. From what I've  
13 heard, it seems to be something that people say happened  
14 significantly after my time. I became aware that there  
15 were allegations of sexual abuse by former students of  
16 Carlekemp and Fort Augustus through a forum on the old  
17 boys' web page. Then I saw the BBC documentary. I was  
18 in Glasgow the night it was first shown and I can only  
19 say that it did not represent anything I could relate  
20 to. I have canvassed many of my school colleagues and  
21 none of us could remember anything to suggest that such  
22 abuse was going on in our time. I left Fort Augustus  
23 School because I graduated.

24 "I would like too stress that the behaviour of the  
25 monks at Carlekemp and Fort Augustus needs to be judged

1 by the standards of the time. When I knew these monks  
2 they were nice, decent people and the school was  
3 a pleasant environment -- at least for me, if not for  
4 all.

5 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
6 published as part of evidence to the inquiry. I believe  
7 the facts stated in this witness statement are true."

8 The statement was signed by Fred on 12 May 2019.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 Witness statement of "DANIEL" (read)

11 MS MACLEOD: The next statement is a statement of a witness  
12 who wishes to remain anonymous and to use the pseudonym  
13 "Daniel" when I read out his statement. That statement  
14 is to be found at BEN.001.004.4317:

15 "My name is Daniel. I was born in 1966. My contact  
16 details are known to the inquiry. I attended Fort  
17 Augustus Abbey School from 1972 to 1983, ages 11 to 17  
18 (sic) ."

19 My Lady, I think that perhaps should be 1978 to 1983  
20 and that could coincide with the index card for this  
21 former pupil which notes him going into the school in  
22 [REDACTED] 1978. It records no leaving date:

23 "After I attended Fort Augustus, I went to college  
24 in Perth so I could sit more Highers and then I went to  
25 the University of Strathclyde. I work as an accountant.

1           "Fort Augustus was a great school. A lot of public  
2 schools were run on a similar basis in those days. It  
3 was tough to be away from my family and there were some  
4 ups and downs. But I was with friends and the monks  
5 were like your parents away from home. I got to play  
6 a lot of sports. There was rugby, hockey and cricket  
7 and I played all three. I was in the navy section of  
8 the cadet forces. We went sailing on Loch Ness. I got  
9 to play in a pipe band. There were so many fun  
10 activities and I made lifelong friends.

11           "During the week you would get up at 7.15 and all  
12 head downstairs to wash and dress. Then we would go  
13 back upstairs for half an hour of preps or you could go  
14 to Mass if you chose. Breakfast was 8 am and at 8.45  
15 there would be a school assembly with morning prayers  
16 and announcements. We were then in class from 9 until  
17 noon and it was lunchtime. At 1.45 we had sports until  
18 about 3.30. There was tea with bread and jam at  
19 4 o'clock and then more classes from 5 to 7. Dinner was  
20 at 7 and then we had preps for the rest of the evening.  
21 Bedtime was 9 or 10 depending on your age.

22           "Thursday afternoon was the cadet forces and on  
23 Wednesday and Saturday afternoons there weren't any  
24 classes. On Saturday evening there was confession. On  
25 Sunday morning at 9.15 there was Mass which the whole



1 school attended. Sunday afternoon depended on the  
2 season. You might go sailing or skiing or you could  
3 study. We were always kept very busy with activities.

4 "There were three houses when I attended. Calder  
5 was the junior house and Lovat and Vaughan were the  
6 senior houses. I had an older brother in Lovat so  
7 I went into Lovat House. The dormitories were split by  
8 house. The higher up in the school you were, the more  
9 space you got. Up until fourth year you slept in  
10 a large dormitory with bunk beds. Some fifth years got  
11 to be in a study with three other students depending on  
12 their fourth year exam results. The other fifth years  
13 slept in the dormitories in single cubicles. In sixth  
14 form everyone got a study, but I didn't do sixth form at  
15 Fort Augustus so I never had a study. You had your own  
16 locker in the dormitory for your things and you also had  
17 a locker in the basement for your wash things and locker  
18 in the classroom area for your books.

19 "In first and second year, you sat your own  
20 classroom and had an assigned desk. The teachers for  
21 the different subjects would come to your class. In  
22 third to sixth year you moved classes for the different  
23 subjects.

24 "The monastery was in a separate area and generally  
25 students didn't go in there although you might go in

1 there occasionally for religious studies. We all walked  
2 quietly through the cloisters to get to Mass.

3 "I remember a number of the monks who taught at the  
4 school. Father MFC was the housemaster for  
5 Calder House, Father MRQ was the housemaster  
6 for Lovat House, which was my house, and Father MFG  
7 MFG was the housemaster for Vaughan House.  
8 Father MMF was the SNR and Father MKT  
9 was the prior and taught . Father MEW taught  
10 . Brother MNS ran the tuck shop and  
11 Father MEZ taught . He  
12 played the . Father MFX was the .

13 "The role of the housemaster was to make sure the  
14 boys in their house kept in line. They were in charge  
15 of discipline. They also took care of your needs, for  
16 example they handed out pocket money on Saturdays. If  
17 you misbehaved, you ended up in front of your  
18 housemaster or, if it was more serious, the headmaster.

19 "I liked Father MRQ. He was a clever chap. He  
20 would have social evenings once a week where you went  
21 with the other boys in your year and you would have  
22 toast with butter and jam and honey. Father MRQ  
23 kept and made . You might have a chat about  
24 politics. Sometimes he would read from an article in  
25 the Economist and you would have a discussion about the

1 issues.

2 "I remember some of the lay staff as well and I'm  
3 still friends with some of them. Andrew Dempster who  
4 taught maths is a still friend of mine. He ended up  
5 going to teach at a girls' school that was the sister  
6 school to Fort Augustus. [REDACTED] MZV taught [REDACTED]  
7 [REDACTED] MIG taught [REDACTED], [REDACTED] MZU taught [REDACTED],  
8 and Mike Haines taught history.

9 "There were two or three different matrons over my  
10 time there. The matron was in charge of health and  
11 would do health checks. You would see her if you were  
12 sick or injured. She could usually deal with things as  
13 she was a qualified nurse but if it was more serious you  
14 would go to the hospital.

15 "When I was at Fort Augustus there were about  
16 165 students. I have a brother who is five years older  
17 than me so we overlapped when I was in my first year.  
18 I have another brother who is younger who attended for  
19 his fifth and sixth years. My family lived in Dunblane,  
20 north of Stirling. My older brother was given an  
21 entrance exam for the school because we were a Catholic  
22 family. He got in and my parents went to visit the  
23 school and liked it. He would come back home and talk  
24 about the school and it sounded like fun. I always  
25 wanted to go too.

1            "My family visited quite often. There was a term or  
2 half-term break about every six weeks and my parents  
3 would visit about twice at half term. I had a cousin  
4 there too whose family also visited, so there would be  
5 visitors almost every weekend. We would go for a nice  
6 meal, maybe a walk in the hills. Sometimes my parents  
7 would come to the school to see a play or a rugby match,  
8 depending on what was happening.

9            "I don't remember any inspections of the school.  
10 The MoD inspected the Combined Cadets Force. You got an  
11 end of term report which was a booklet with a mark and  
12 comments from each of your teachers. There was also  
13 a housemaster's report. At the end of the year you got  
14 a final report.

15           "I left Fort Augustus after fifth year because my  
16 grades from my Highers weren't good enough to get into  
17 university, so I decided to go to a college in Perth and  
18 sit more Highers. After that, I went to  
19 Strathclyde University.

20           "There was a school rulebook so you knew the rules  
21 of the school. Housemasters had a discretion regarding  
22 discipline. For example, if you were talking in prep,  
23 which took place in the big hall, you would get  
24 a warning from one of prefects. If you kept talking,  
25 you would be sent to your housemaster. The housemaster

1 might give you a warning or the belt. You would get  
2 more strokes of the belt for repeat offences. There was  
3 also the possibility of the cane but that was rare and  
4 I never had that; that was for more serious offences  
5 like smoking or running away from the school overnight.

6 "Another possible punishment was to be given certain  
7 chores. For example, you might have to chop logs and  
8 take them to the older people in the village who needed  
9 them for firewood or you might have to dredge the port  
10 where they kept the boats. I thought the discipline was  
11 fair. I was belted myself for various things like  
12 repeatedly talking during preps or once for punching  
13 a prefect.

14 "The prefects provided a layer of discipline below  
15 the housemasters. There were school prefects and a head  
16 boy and also house prefects. The prefects policed the  
17 preps and the line-up at mealtimes. They might also  
18 referee some of the games. They could give punishments  
19 like press-ups or lines, but couldn't administer  
20 corporal punishment.

21 "I never experienced anything that I would call  
22 physical abuse. It was a different time then. You  
23 would get a kick up the bum and you just took it.

24 "There was bullying that went on between students as  
25 it was a boarding school. Some people couldn't handle

1 it. I believe it was unbeknownst to the staff. If the  
2 monks found out about it, they would intervene. But  
3 I saw it mostly as banter and making fun. You just had  
4 to toughen up.

5 "I had no inkling of any sexual abuse. I never saw  
6 anything like that. It might be because I am a strong  
7 character and those people tend to pick on weaker  
8 characters. I'm not saying it didn't happen. I learned  
9 about the allegations from the press and I was quite  
10 shocked.

11 "I live in Switzerland now so it is not easy to keep  
12 in touch with people, but I am still in touch with one  
13 of the teachers. We go hill walking together.

14 "For me, Fort Augustus was a positive experience  
15 that set me up for life. It taught me self-sufficiency  
16 and made it easier to go to university.

17 My experience at Fort Augustus served me well when  
18 I was in the army for a time.

19 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
20 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry.  
21 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are  
22 accurate and true."

23 My Lady, the statement was signed by Daniel and  
24 we're still waiting for the date of signature to be  
25 confirmed.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 Witness statement of "SIMON" (read)

3 MS MACLEOD: The next statement is from a witness who wishes  
4 to remain anonymous and to use the pseudonym "Simon"  
5 when I read in the statement. This statement can be  
6 found at BEN.001.004.4313:

7 "My name is Simon. I was born in 1961. My contact  
8 details are known to the inquiry.

9 "I attended Fort Augustus Abbey School from 1978 to  
10 1980, ages 16 to 18."

11 Those dates, my Lady, correspond with the index card  
12 for this former pupil:

13 "After I attended Fort Augustus, I went on to  
14 university and worked as a mechanical engineer for a few  
15 years. Then I decided to become a priest and have been  
16 a priest for 25 years now.

17 "For me, Fort Augustus was a very positive  
18 experience. I gained a sense of discipline and an  
19 appreciation for others. I became less self-centred.  
20 It was very helpful for the formation of my character.

21 "In my first few years of secondary school in  
22 Glasgow, I had been a truant, a troubled student. I was  
23 given one more chance at the end of my third year and  
24 I did okay in my fourth year. I had always heard the  
25 stories of my cousins who attended Fort Augustus and

1 I decided to board there for my last two years of  
2 secondary school. I had been warned that the school  
3 involved strict discipline and I was prepared for that.

4 "The majority of fifth year students shared rooms,  
5 three to a room. However, the number of rooms available  
6 for fifth year students was limited so not all fifth  
7 years had a room.

8 "When I started I was in fifth year. I stayed in  
9 a single cell in the dormitory area with three fifth  
10 year students who had similar dormitory accommodation.  
11 Younger students were in large dormitory areas up until  
12 fourth year and were generally doubled up with a bunk  
13 bed in a cell. Fourth year students had a single cell  
14 area.

15 "The wake-up bell would ring at 7.10 am. We would  
16 all rise and go down to the basement for washing and  
17 dressing. At 7.40 you could either study or go to  
18 morning mass. I chose to go to mass. I didn't want to  
19 study at that hour in the day. Going to mass in the  
20 mornings was a formative experience for me and  
21 I continued the habit when I went to university.

22 "Breakfast started at 8.05 and lasted until about  
23 8.45. The first class started around 9.10. Classes  
24 were about 45 minutes each. There would be two classes  
25 followed by a morning break and then two more classes



1 followed by lunch. Lunch was served just about 12.30  
2 in the refectory. You would queue to be served.  
3 I liked the food. We sometimes got fresh salmon or  
4 honey. One of the monks, Father MRQ, kept  
5 [REDACTED]. You would have soup and a main course for lunch.  
6 At dinner there was a main course and then pudding.  
7 We were well looked after.

8 "After lunch there was a break, and then around 1.30  
9 we would gather for sports. There was rugby in first  
10 term, hockey in second term and cricket in third term.  
11 One afternoon a week, you got time for yourself. After  
12 sports, you would get showered and dressed and then have  
13 tea. At 4 pm there were two more classes that lasted  
14 until 5.30. Then there was a study period that lasted  
15 for an hour and a half. Supper was 7 pm, followed by  
16 another study period. The length of it depended on your  
17 age. The younger students would finish at 8 and the  
18 older students would study until 9. In the fifth and  
19 sixth year your bedtime was 10 pm.

20 "You could go into the village after the study  
21 period or at other times such as the weekend if you were  
22 free. Any time you went into the village you needed  
23 permission from your housemaster. You would be wearing  
24 your school uniform so everyone would know you were  
25 a student. On Saturday mornings we had classes. In the

1           afternoon you would go walking or play sports games  
2           against other schools if you were on the team.  
3           I remember once a week the whole school had to go for  
4           a run in the afternoon. You had to run up a hill and  
5           how far up you had to run depended on which year you  
6           were in.

7                     "On Sunday you got to lie in an extra half hour and  
8           then it was breakfast. There was school mass on Sunday  
9           mornings. In the afternoon you might play sports or go  
10          for a walk. Some parents visited and then you could go  
11          to a hotel for lunch or dinner with them.

12                    "The students at the school were divided into three  
13          houses. Calder House because the junior house for the  
14          boys who were about 10 to 14 years old. The senior  
15          students were divided into Lovat and Vaughan. Each  
16          house had a housemaster. Once a week you would have an  
17          evening social with your housemaster and the other  
18          students from your year in your house. You would get  
19          some biscuits and tea or coffee and you had a chance to  
20          chat about how you were getting on. Sometimes you could  
21          be a bit cheeky when making your case, something which  
22          helped to build a fuller relationship with your  
23          housemaster.

24                    "The school was separate from the monastery. As you  
25          came up the main drive, you would go left to the school

1 or right to the monastery and church. There was  
2 a cloister and the abbey was on the farthest or north  
3 side of the cloister. The school was on the west side.  
4 The church was on the east side. On the south side  
5 there were offices. I remember that's where you could  
6 get school supplies from Brother Adrian.

7 "The school consisted of an older building with  
8 a newer part added on. There were classes in the new  
9 part of the building as you first went in and some  
10 classes in the old part of the building. The new part  
11 had the main hall with the stage, which was also used as  
12 a study hall. Classrooms were on the ground and first  
13 floors. You went up a floor from the classrooms to get  
14 to the dormitories. As you moved up years in the  
15 school, you went from a bunk bed to a single bed. In  
16 sixth year you got your own room, which gave you a bit  
17 of privacy. Each student had a chest of drawers,  
18 a wardrobe and a little bit of space. Once a week you  
19 stripped your bed for the sheets to be laundered. The  
20 washing and changing facilities were in the basement.  
21 There was also a place in the basement where you kept  
22 your sports gear.

23 "The lay staff I remember are Mr **MZV**, who taught  
24 **[REDACTED]** Mr Dempster, who taught maths; and Mr **MIG** who  
25 taught **[REDACTED]** He had a **[REDACTED]** in

1 the school. Mr MZV did rugby, MIH taught  
2 and hockey team. The school  
3 had a very good hockey team. I played rugby but was no  
4 use as hockey. Coming from Glasgow, I considered hockey  
5 a girls' sports.

6 "There was a matron, but I can't remember her name.  
7 You could go and see her if you were ill or injured.  
8 She was the person who could get you excused from  
9 classes if you were sick. She would come and check on  
10 you if you were confined to bed. If you broke a bone or  
11 something more serious like that, you would be taken to  
12 hospital in Inverness by a teacher or monk. I once had  
13 to go to Inverness for a sprain. Your housemaster was  
14 the person who would be told about your care plan and  
15 make sure you did what you were supposed to do to  
16 recover.

17 "I remember a number of the monks who were involved  
18 with the school. Father MMF taught  
19 and was the SNR. Father MRQ taught  
20 and was the housemaster for Lovat House, which  
21 was my house. Father MKT was and  
22 taught I always thought of him as a gentle  
23 giant. He had a powerful mind and was very well  
24 mannered. Father MFG was the  
25 housemaster for Vaughan House and also ran the ,

1 which met once a week. Father MFC was the  
2 housemaster for the Junior House. There was  
3 Brother Adrian, who ran the shop and dealt with school  
4 supplies. Father MEZ was the [REDACTED] and taught  
5 [REDACTED] My housemaster, Father MRQ, could  
6 be very kind; I remember going salmon fishing with him  
7 one day on Loch Ness. He looked after you, but he was  
8 also a justly strict and sound disciplinarian.

9 "There were consequences, including the belt, for  
10 misbehaviour. Certain sixth year students were chosen  
11 to be prefects. They were the school's police force.  
12 They were responsible for keeping discipline. For  
13 example, they made sure the students ran where they were  
14 supposed to run during the weekly run. They made sure  
15 everyone was studying during the study periods. They  
16 supervised the refectory queue and generally made sure  
17 the students followed the rules.

18 "My parents visited two or three times while I was  
19 at the school. My uncle used to visit more regularly.  
20 He had four sons there. It was great when he visited  
21 because we got to go with him to get a fine meal at a  
22 hotel. He would usually come for the weekend when he  
23 came. He would generally be there once a term.

24 "I think there were government inspections to check  
25 the facilities for safety and standards. They checked

1 the chemistry labs, the dormitories, the washing  
2 facilities, the cooking facilities. We had very good  
3 sports facilities. We had excellent cricket and hockey  
4 pitches. I believe the inspectors came once a year, or  
5 maybe once a term. We were told to behave like angels  
6 that day and be disciplined and well mannered.

7 "There were three school terms with Christmas,  
8 Easter, and summer breaks in between. You got a report  
9 at the end of each term and a more full, reflective  
10 report at the end of the year. There would be comments  
11 from each of your teachers. Your housemaster gave  
12 a report that dealt with behaviour. The headmaster also  
13 gave a report that addressed how you were doing overall  
14 in the school and what you could work on in terms of  
15 your relationship to the school community.

16 "Discipline could involve getting lines or getting  
17 belted. I can't remember whether classroom teachers  
18 could give the belt. A prefect or classroom teacher  
19 could send you to your housemaster, who could belt you.  
20 The ultimate sanction was the cane, which was three hits  
21 across the backside. I never got the cane but I did get  
22 the belt a couple of times. The belt was given on the  
23 hand. The cane was seldom used but, when given, it was  
24 because someone had continually broken rules and shown  
25 no purpose of amendment. The headmaster could be

1 involved in discipline in terms of trying to help or  
2 guide you if there were ongoing problems but didn't give  
3 the belt or the cane.

4 "The kinds of things you might get in trouble for  
5 included not doing what a teacher asked or not doing  
6 your homework. I always thought the discipline was  
7 fair. It was a bit tough, but usually if you got  
8 punished, you deserved it. There were clear rules and  
9 if you were breaking them you got punished because you  
10 needed to understand the impact your actions were having  
11 on others in the community. I don't think there is  
12 enough discipline in today's schools and the  
13 misbehaviour of a few students can ruin or hinder the  
14 learning experience of many others.

15 "Whilst at the school I was not aware of any  
16 physical abuse. There was some shouting and raised  
17 voices by the staff. For example, during a sports  
18 practice, a coach might yell, 'You didn't pass the ball,  
19 you stupid idiot.'

20 "I was totally unaware of any sexual abuse during my  
21 time at Fort Augustus. I heard things later from my  
22 cousins about Father MFA touching boys  
23 inappropriately. I was taken aback to hear that.  
24 I believe it was something that happened to more junior  
25 students at Carlekemp. I left Fort Augustus in 1980

1 with the required exam grades to enter  
2 Glasgow University and studied for a BSc in mechanical  
3 engineering. On graduating, I worked for three years  
4 before entering seminary to study for the priesthood.

5 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
6 published as part of evidence to the inquiry. I believe  
7 the facts stated in this witness statement are accurate  
8 and true."

9 The statement was signed by Simon on 22 June 2019.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

11 Witness statement of "FRANKIE" (read)

12 MS MACLEOD: The final statement for today is a statement  
13 from a witness who wishes to remain anonymous and to use  
14 the pseudonym Frankie when I read his statement in. The  
15 statement is to be found at BEN.001.001.5970:

16 "My name is Frankie, I was born in 1969. My contact  
17 details are known to the inquiry.

18 "I attended Fort Augustus Abbey School from 1981 to  
19 1987, aged 12 to 18. After I attended Fort Augustus  
20 I went to college in Glasgow. I trained as  
21 a construction site engineer. I worked for my family's  
22 business for about 20 years. Seven years ago, I started  
23 my own construction business. I am married and have  
24 four children. I live in Inverness.

25 "I was very fortunate to board at the Abbey School



1 from 1981 to 1987. It had a unique standing, good  
2 spirit and an emphasis on sports and activities. The  
3 boys were from a mix of backgrounds and I would have  
4 probably sent my own sons to attend the school if it was  
5 still open. The school was well disciplined. Prefects  
6 dealt with most offences and the more serious were  
7 referred to the housemasters, who were priests.

8 "My experience of the clergy was that they were fair  
9 and consistent in their approach to teaching,  
10 developing, supporting and caring for their pupils.  
11 They were always very busy and active with the variety  
12 of school activities that filled our day.

13 "I grew up in South Uist and was the youngest of six  
14 children. I attended the local primary school. My  
15 father's accountant, who was also a friend of his, had  
16 sent his sons to Fort Augustus Abbey School and they had  
17 done well. By then, my parents could afford to send me,  
18 and the available local education was not great, so it  
19 was decided that I would go to Fort Augustus.

20 "Life at Fort Augustus was very busy. We rose at  
21 7.15, attended prep or church at 7.40, and then ate  
22 breakfast at 8.00. We had classes from 8.45 to 12.30,  
23 followed by lunch. At 1.30 or 2 pm, there was sports.  
24 At 3.30, we had tea and sandwiches, followed by more  
25 classes from 4.00 to 5.10. At 5.30 there was a short

1 prep session before dinner at 6 o'clock. Then we had  
2 further supervised prep from 7.00 in the evening until  
3 maybe one hour before bedtime, depending on your age.

4 "We had classes on Saturday morning, and Saturday  
5 afternoon was often taken up with sports matches. We  
6 travelled a lot to other schools for matches. There  
7 were also skiing trips or hill walking. I would often  
8 be out until 7 pm on a Saturday. On Sunday we had  
9 church in the morning and there were often no formal  
10 activities in the afternoon.

11 "The dorms were open-plan. There were two main  
12 dorms. The first and second years slept in the junior  
13 dorm, which had dividers between cubicles. Each cubicle  
14 contained a bunk bed. Bedtime was supervised by  
15 prefects. You were woken up by your housemaster. The  
16 second main dorm was much bigger and was where the third  
17 and fourth years slept. It was split into three areas  
18 and had dividers between cubicles. Each cubicle  
19 contained one bed. Again, the prefects monitored  
20 bedtime and one prefect slept in each dorm to ensure  
21 good behaviour. The fifth year wing had studies with  
22 three beds each. The sixth year boys had their own  
23 individual studies in the east wing. The head boy had  
24 his own study.

25 "The junior students were in one house and the

1 senior students were divided into two houses, Lovat and  
2 Vaughan. The housemaster for the Junior House was  
3 Father [REDACTED] MFC . He was supportive but you  
4 didn't have that much contact with him as a student.  
5 Students tended to connect more with their peer group.  
6 I was in Lovat House and my housemaster was Father  
7 [REDACTED] MRQ and then Father [REDACTED] MER when Father  
8 [REDACTED] MRQ was promoted to [REDACTED] SNR . The  
9 housemaster for Vaughan was Father [REDACTED] MFG when  
10 I started and I can't remember who replaced him.

11 "The teaching staff I remember are Father [REDACTED] MEZ  
12 for [REDACTED] Fathe [REDACTED] MEW for [REDACTED]  
13 Father [REDACTED] MRQ for [REDACTED] Mr [REDACTED] MIH and  
14 Mr Dempster for [REDACTED] Mr Haynes for history; Mr [REDACTED] MIG  
15 for [REDACTED] Mr Wilson for English; Mr Morris for  
16 geography; and Mr [REDACTED] MIF for [REDACTED].

17 "A lot of the discipline was handled by the  
18 prefects. They could give lines or duties such as  
19 litter picking or leaf raking. More serious matters  
20 such as being caught smoking were handled by the  
21 housemasters. I did receive the belt a few times myself  
22 and was caned once. I and another boy were caught  
23 coming out of the secretary's office when we didn't have  
24 permission to be there. It was the time of year when  
25 the examination papers would have been in her office,

1 which is why it was considered so serious. I didn't  
2 like it, but it was carried out in the proper, legal  
3 manner. Father [REDACTED] MRQ had me bend over a stool and  
4 hit me three times with the cane while I was fully  
5 clothed.

6 "I felt that the punishment was administered fairly  
7 and not excessive. You only got punished if you broke  
8 the rules and got caught. The cane was very rare. The  
9 belt was more common. The belt meant a leather strap to  
10 the hand. Although it was not a pleasant experience,  
11 I never saw anyone bleeding and it did not seem  
12 excessive to me.

13 "The school was full of teenage boys, so there was  
14 not perfect harmony at all times. The boys could be  
15 cheeky or even offensive with the staff or other  
16 students. There was some bullying among students but  
17 I was never a target.

18 "I was not aware of any physical or sexual abuse  
19 while I was there. Even in hindsight, there is nothing  
20 that I can think of that causes me concern. I'm not  
21 saying nothing bad ever happened.

22 "The first I heard of the allegations of abuse was  
23 when the BBC programme aired. I was involved with the  
24 [REDACTED]. The police  
25 [REDACTED] some time before the BBC

1 programme and said they were investigating allegations.

2 I gave a statement to the police at that time.



3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12 "For me, Fort Augustus was a positive experience  
13 that benefited me greatly. Life at Fort Augustus was  
14 busy and there were always lots of activities. I wasn't  
15 particularly academic myself, but I got a lot out of  
16 participating in the sports and other activities. My  
17 time there gave me the confidence to take on life.

18 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
19 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry.  
20 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are  
21 accurate and true."

22 The statement was signed by Frankie on  
23 12 August 2019.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. That completes the  
25 read-ins for today?

1 MS MACLEOD: That completes the read-ins for today.

2 Tomorrow, we have three witnesses lined up to give oral  
3 evidence, the first of which is by video link from  
4 Australia at 8.30 am our time.

5 LADY SMITH: So that's when the video link evidence will  
6 begin, to be clear about that, so people need to be here  
7 before that if they want to be ready for the start of  
8 it.

9 I'll rise now until tomorrow morning, starting the  
10 video link returning at 8.30. Thank you.

11 (3.04 pm)

12 (The inquiry adjourned until 8.30 am  
13 on Wednesday, 18 September 2019)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

I N D E X

21

22 "IAN" (affirmed) (via video link) .....2

23

24 Questions from MR MacAULAY .....2

25

1                   Witness statement of "ROBERTO" .....68  
2                   (read)  
3           Witness statement of "FRED" (read) .....109  
4           Witness statement of "DANIEL" (read) .....118  
5           Witness statement of "SIMON" (read) .....126  
6           Witness statement of "FRANKIE" .....135  
7                   (read)  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23