

1 Wednesday, 27 June 2018

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, good morning.

4 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, my Lady. I would like to recall

5 Sister Anna Marie Doolan and also call at the same time

6 Christine Hughes.

7 SISTER ANNA MARIE DOOLAN (sworn)

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES (sworn)

9 LADY SMITH: Please, if you'd both sit down and make  
10 yourselves comfortable. At the outset, can I thank you  
11 both for agreeing to come and give evidence together.  
12 We're hoping that will be helpful -- not just to us but  
13 to you -- in explaining what needs to be explained in  
14 answer to Mr MacAulay.

15 We do, though, only have one microphone behaving  
16 this morning. I don't know what's happened to the other  
17 one, so you may have to move it between you. But  
18 Sister Doolan, you've been here often enough to hear me  
19 explaining to people how important it is that the  
20 microphone picks you up. I will pass over to  
21 Mr MacAulay.

22 Questions from MR MacAULAY

23 MR MacAULAY: Perhaps I can begin by addressing you,

24 Christine, and just to confirm that you are

25 Christine Hughes?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: Were you born on [REDACTED] 1959?

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: [REDACTED] 1959.

4 MR MacAULAY: In front of you, you will find the statement  
5 that you have provided to the inquiry. I'll give the  
6 reference of that to the stenographers: it's  
7 WIT.001.001.7610. If you were to turn to the last page,  
8 7621, can you confirm that you have signed the  
9 statement?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: Do you tell us in the last paragraph:  
12 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
13 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry"?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

15 MR MacAULAY: Do you also go on to say:  
16 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
17 statement are true"?

18 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

19 MR MacAULAY: If I can address you for a moment or two,  
20 sister, of course you have already given evidence to the  
21 inquiry; I think that was on 14 June 2017.

22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct.

23 MR MacAULAY: So over a year ago. I will be asking you  
24 questions in particular in connection with parts of the  
25 response that the order has made to the inquiry in

1 response to the Section 21 notice, and in particular to  
2 the more recent changes that I think have been made  
3 standing the evidence that the inquiry has heard.

4 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

5 MR MacAULAY: Christine, if I can focus on you, first of  
6 all, you tell us in your statement that throughout your  
7 employed life, you have worked in either libraries or  
8 archives; is that correct?

9 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's correct, yes.

10 MR MacAULAY: I think you tell us that you started, first of  
11 all, many years ago at the London School of Economics.

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

13 MR MacAULAY: And you then went on mainly to work with Local  
14 Authorities, but that was within libraries and reference  
15 libraries?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

17 MR MacAULAY: Prior to working at Nazareth House, and we'll  
18 come to that in a moment, did you work in an archive  
19 centre for the City of Westminster?

20 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, I did.

21 MR MacAULAY: In 2003, did you move to work at  
22 Nazareth House as a volunteer?

23 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

24 MR MacAULAY: At that time, was your father, Dr Peter  
25 Hughes, the general archivist of Nazareth House?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: He was, yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: How long had he been there?

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Since 1994.

4 MR MacAULAY: Indeed, was it then that the archive was set  
5 up?

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: Can you tell us a little bit about the  
8 background to that?

9 CHRISTINE HUGHES: My father had done a lot of research with  
10 other religious congregations and he had met  
11 Mother Bernard, the Superior General, and she asked him  
12 if he would set up a archive for the Sisters of Nazareth  
13 and he agreed.

14 MR MacAULAY: Was he an archivist?

15 CHRISTINE HUGHES: He was, yes.

16 MR MacAULAY: Was that a full-time position for him at that  
17 time when he started?

18 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, it wasn't. It gradually became more  
19 full-time as the years went on.

20 MR MacAULAY: Before that, before 1994, am I to understand  
21 that there was no archive, general archive kept by the  
22 order?

23 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, there wasn't.

24 MR MacAULAY: What was your understanding as to where  
25 records were kept?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I don't know where they were kept.  
2 I believe that they were kept in individual houses or  
3 in the regional offices, but I don't know.

4 MR MacAULAY: This is perhaps the benefit of having both of  
5 you here together and you can perhaps pass the mic over  
6 to Sister Doolan. Can you perhaps help us with that,  
7 sister, in relation to the position prior to 1994 and  
8 where records might have been kept?

9 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: My understanding is originally they  
10 were in the individual houses, but when the children's  
11 homes closed, they were sent to the Generalate building  
12 in Hammersmith and then eventually moved into the  
13 archive and the archive was set up.

14 MR MacAULAY: So far as storage in the generalate would be  
15 concerned, are you able to help me with how they were  
16 stored?

17 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: As far as I know, they were in boxes.

18 MR MacAULAY: So is the picture that so far as the Scottish  
19 houses are concerned -- and we're focusing on the four  
20 Scottish houses -- once the children's sections had  
21 closed, someone collected all the available records and  
22 they were transported to London?

23 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's my understanding, yes.

24 MR MacAULAY: Thank you.

25 LADY SMITH: You said records were kept in the individual

1           houses and obviously we know about the four in Scotland.  
2           How many in total does that mean that you were referring  
3           to?

4           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Across the UK?

5           LADY SMITH: Yes.

6           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Originally, across the UK we had 32  
7           houses; now we only have 13.

8           LADY SMITH: So it would have steadily shrunk from the 32 to  
9           the 13?

10          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, over the years they were closed  
11          down.

12          LADY SMITH: With records originally being kept in the  
13          individual houses and then, you think, transferred to  
14          London?

15          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

16          LADY SMITH: Thank you.

17          MR MacAULAY: Very well, thank you, sister.

18                 When you took up your position in 2003, what role  
19                 were you playing at that time?

20          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Basically, I was there to help my father,  
21          so he told me -- he showed me and explained to me the  
22          archive as he'd set it up and I did whatever he asked me  
23          to do to begin with, as I started to learn more about  
24          that particular archive.

25          MR MacAULAY: What did setting up the archive involve? Can

1           you give us some idea as to what that involved?

2       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  So, to begin with, he gathered together

3           all the documents from the generalate itself and then

4           from Hammersmith Nazareth House and then gradually

5           things came into the archive from all over the UK and

6           indeed all over the world.

7       MR MacAULAY:  Where was the archive being constructed at

8           that time?

9       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  So it was in the generalate in

10          St Michael's at Hammersmith Nazareth House.

11       MR MacAULAY:  Are we to assume there was a room dedicated to

12          being the room for the archive?

13       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

14       MR MacAULAY:  As we've just been told, it wouldn't just be

15          the Scottish houses that would be involved, but also the

16          other Nazareth Houses; is that right?

17       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  That's right, yes.

18       MR MacAULAY:  And as the children's sections were closing

19          down, would the records be coming to London?

20       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  No, the children's homes had already

21          closed.  The last one, at least in Scotland, was at

22          least nine years prior to the archive being set up.

23       MR MacAULAY:  What about in the rest of the UK?  Did any --

24       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  They'd all closed before the archive was

25          set up.

1 MR MacAULAY: I think your father continued to be the  
2 archivist or to be the general archivist until 2011;  
3 is that right?

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

5 MR MacAULAY: Did you then take over?

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: Did your father work as a consultant?

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: And I think he died last year; is that right?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Just to follow through what you were explaining  
12 about the gap between closure of children's units in  
13 homes up and down the country and the setting up of the  
14 archive, did that mean that in that gap of time, which  
15 could have been many years, the records would be, you  
16 think, sitting in the individual children's homes, given  
17 what Sister Doolan's told us, and all or whatever's left  
18 in the homes was transferred to London in 1994?

19 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No. Some of the houses had completely  
20 closed, not just the children's homes.

21 LADY SMITH: What had happened to the records they had?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I don't know.

23 LADY SMITH: Sister Doolan, any idea?

24 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: The records for the elderly as well?

25 LADY SMITH: Yes.



1           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Some were kept in the houses and only  
2           at the moment are we setting up now a regional archive.  
3           Just in the last month we employed two archivists for  
4           the region.  So in future, all the elderly people's  
5           records will come to Finchley, which is the regional  
6           house, but my understanding is that when the houses  
7           closed that had care of the elderly, they also went to  
8           Hammersmith.

9           LADY SMITH:  Right.  And the children's records?

10          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes, they would have gone as well.

11          LADY SMITH:  They would have gone to Hammersmith even before  
12           1994?

13          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Well, that's my understanding, yes.

14          LADY SMITH:  I'm not expecting you to be categoric about  
15           this; I am just trying to get some idea --

16          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  But they were sitting in boxes in  
17           St Michael's --

18          LADY SMITH:  They were waiting for --

19          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  They were waiting for an archive.

20          LADY SMITH:  -- the arrival of Christine's father?

21          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

22          MR MacAULAY:  I suppose, sister, just before you pass on,  
23           the only other option would be that the records would be  
24           kept, let's say, for example, at Cardonald after  
25           Cardonald had closed, but that would involve keeping

1 children's records at a location where there wasn't  
2 a children's home in operation?

3 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's right, and as I think, you know,  
4 maybe that's -- during the period some of those records  
5 got lost or were destroyed.

6 MR MacAULAY: I think you tell us, Christine, that you  
7 didn't receive any specific training before you arrived  
8 at Nazareth House but you had gained a lot of experience  
9 from your previous employment.

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

11 MR MacAULAY: In the time you spent with your father,  
12 clearly you received quite a significant amount of  
13 training from him?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I did, yes.

15 MR MacAULAY: You tell us a little bit about your current  
16 role. How has your role changed over the years that  
17 you've been connected to the archive?

18 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Well, the majority of my work up until  
19 the last four years was looking after the documents  
20 in the archive. So as things came into the archive  
21 I would be giving them an accession number, recording  
22 them, and gradually cataloguing and listing all the  
23 documents to go into the archive catalogue and making  
24 sure the documents were safely boxed up and accessible.

25 Over the last four years, almost all my work has

1           been related to work for public inquiries and police  
2           inquiries.

3           MR MacAULAY: I think it's right to say that you've also had  
4           to respond to requests from the English inquiry.

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES: And Northern Ireland before that.

6           MR MacAULAY: Apart from yourself, do you have others to  
7           assist you in the work that you are now doing?

8           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes. I have an assistant, a part-time  
9           assistant, who's worked with me since 2014. It's  
10          Kevin Brown. I also had another assistant for a short  
11          time on a short-term contract, but she's no longer  
12          working for us.

13          MR MacAULAY: The assistant, is he a trained archivist?

14          CHRISTINE HUGHES: He isn't, but his background is in  
15          library work.

16          MR MacAULAY: In relation to the cataloguing and indexing of  
17          the material, can you just give me some insight in how  
18          that is done?

19          CHRISTINE HUGHES: So when documents arrive in the archive,  
20          we give them an accession number, so that's basically  
21          a running number and a short description. Now, there  
22          won't necessarily be a number for each individual item  
23          at that stage, it could be a number given to a box of  
24          papers deposited by a member of the generalate team or  
25          from another house in the order. So that's the first

1 step.

2 Then eventually, each item individually is described  
3 and given an archive code and boxed and stored in the  
4 archive.

5 MR MacAULAY: Do you use particular software for this?

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We do, yes, we use specialist software  
7 developed by Axiell, and it's called CALM.

8 MR MacAULAY: Do I understand from what you've been saying,  
9 because of the fact that the archive wasn't set up until  
10 1994, that you have a significant backlog of material to  
11 deal with?

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

13 MR MacAULAY: Apart from the records for the UK houses, does  
14 the archive that you run also receive records from  
15 houses outwith the UK?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, all over the world. Wherever there  
17 are Nazareth Houses, we have some records.

18 MR MacAULAY: Are you the archive for Nazareth Houses  
19 worldwide now?

20 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We're the general archive. So up until  
21 very recently we've been the only repository for  
22 documents, but within the last two years there has been  
23 a plan to develop regional archives, which will then  
24 house the material within the region of the  
25 congregation.

1 MR MacAULAY: And a region would be a separate country?

2 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

3 MR MacAULAY: At the moment, I think you tell us there are  
4 36 Nazareth Houses in total worldwide; is that correct?

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: And at the moment you are the repository for  
7 any records that they may wish to pass on?

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Not in terms of children's records. The  
9 general archive has only ever held the children's  
10 records for England, Scotland and Wales; that's all.

11 MR MacAULAY: So the children's records from other houses,  
12 are they retained somewhere else?

13 CHRISTINE HUGHES: The Irish records, north and south, are  
14 retained in Dublin, the majority of them. Some are at  
15 individual houses. I don't know where the children's  
16 records are held for the other regions, but I think  
17 they're probably at the regional offices.

18 MR MacAULAY: You tell us at paragraph 13 of your statement  
19 that there are plans to build a purpose-built archive.

20 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

21 MR MacAULAY: What stage is that at?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It's not been started yet, but I think  
23 all the planning permission and everything is in place,  
24 so it's just about to begin, the project to build it.

25 MR MacAULAY: And will the material that you've kept at

1 Hammersmith be moved to this new purpose-built building?

2 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, it's at Hammersmith still.

3 MR MacAULAY: It's still at Hammersmith?

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

5 MR MacAULAY: You tell us in your statement, at

6 paragraph 14, that at present you have all the surviving

7 documents for the foundation of the order.

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: Can you explain to me what that includes?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It would be all the documents that

11 survived from the correspondence between the early

12 sisters and the Roman Hierarchy, so the church, about

13 the founding of the order. So it will be all the

14 correspondence that we hold relating to the first

15 Superior General.

16 MR MacAULAY: So these are quite historical records?

17 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

18 MR MacAULAY: You say you also have all the records for

19 sisters who have died?

20 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

21 MR MacAULAY: But not for living sisters.

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

23 MR MacAULAY: I think you say you also have information and

24 records in connection with the day-to-day running of the

25 congregation as an order; is that right?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

2 MR MacAULAY: What sort of records are these?

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We have the general chapter minutes;  
4 that's the minutes of the General Congregational  
5 Conference, which is held every six years. We have  
6 those going back to the very first General Chapter.  
7 We have the council minutes, the General Council  
8 minutes, and the Regional Council minutes. We have  
9 books, a series of books, called the Directory of the  
10 Congregation, which give guidance to the sisters from  
11 the General Council about their life as sisters and how  
12 to go about their work, either with the children or with  
13 the elderly or whatever occupation they're undertaking.

14 We also have a series of books called the History of  
15 the Foundation. Now, the main History of the Foundation  
16 is related to the congregation as a whole, so was  
17 written within the generalate, but there are already  
18 Histories of Foundation for each individual house in the  
19 congregation.

20 MR MacAULAY: And I think you have made these available to  
21 the inquiry, the latter?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We have, yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: We'll take an example of one of those shortly,  
24 but they are effectively a fairly regular account of  
25 events at a particular house?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: But the documents you've just mentioned, some  
3 of these go back many, many years?

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, right back to the 1850s.

5 MR MacAULAY: Did the order have regulations in place  
6 instructing the order what documents to keep?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes. The first such document that we've  
8 got in the archive was dated 1925. That was  
9 a regulation for the keeping of books and documents  
10 within the congregation. I don't know if that was the  
11 first time such a document was written or whether that's  
12 just the first one that survived to be in the archive.

13 MR MacAULAY: Well, can we look at that first document; it's  
14 at NAZ.001.003.6725.

15 Is this the document you had in mind?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

17 MR MacAULAY: We see the title of it is:  
18 "Regulations for keeping the various books and  
19 documents in the congregation of the Poor Sisters of  
20 Nazareth."

21 Then we read:  
22 "Superiors and sisters who are responsible for the  
23 keeping of books, et cetera, will take the greatest care  
24 to ensure accuracy and neatness and keep them written up  
25 to date."



1                   So there's a clear instruction given there?

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

3           MR MacAULAY:   Do we then get a list of the books that are  
4                   envisaged?

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

6           MR MacAULAY:   The first two deal specifically with sisters  
7                   themselves, "Register of Vows", "Final Vows"; is that  
8                   right?

9           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

10          MR MacAULAY:   Do you have these registers in the archive?

11          CHRISTINE HUGHES:   We have some for houses that have closed,  
12                   but any house that is still open, those books are  
13                   retained at the house.

14          MR MacAULAY:   The next reference is "History of Foundation"  
15                   and I'll just read the first couple of sentences:

16                    "It is well to keep a diary and put down any  
17                   interesting item that may occur to be written later on  
18                   in the history of the house.  This book should be  
19                   written in regularly and not left until the time of the  
20                   chapter or visitation."

21                   So I think this is the History of the Foundation  
22                   that you mentioned earlier in connection with each  
23                   house.

24          CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

25          MR MacAULAY:   It's described as a diary; would that be how

1           it should be read?

2       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.  Sometimes entries were made daily,  
3           other times it was once a month or, if something  
4           momentous happened, there would be a long account and  
5           then very short entries following that so, yes, it was  
6           like a diary.

7       MR MacAULAY:  When one reads these documents, of course,  
8           they covered long periods of time and therefore there  
9           are different authors, but there are different styles as  
10          to how regularly they would be entered.

11       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

12       MR MacAULAY:  Who would be responsible for making the  
13          entries?

14       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  I am not sure.

15       MR MacAULAY:  I don't know, sister, if you can help us on  
16          that.

17       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  It's usually the Sister Superior of the  
18          house or she might delegate a sister to write that up.  
19          Nowadays we have a list of guidelines on what we are  
20          putting because there were a lot of unnecessary things  
21          being recorded, like garden fêtes and things, whereas  
22          now it's more specific to major events that happen.

23       MR MacAULAY:  I see, thank you.

24                 If we move on to the second page then, we see --  
25          this is on page 6726 -- there's a register of the

1 sisters to be kept. And I think you've provided the  
2 inquiry with those --

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

4 MR MacAULAY: -- in connection with the four houses. Then  
5 there's the Register of Inmates. Can I just read a bit  
6 of that:

7 "In this register the names of the inmates must be  
8 written in full, with the names and occupation of  
9 parents (also in full), and all other particular for  
10 which the register is kept."

11 Are these registers that perhaps we've been  
12 referring to in the inquiry as admission and discharge  
13 registers? Are these the registers that would record  
14 information about a child when he's admitted, for  
15 example, to one of the houses or is this something  
16 different?

17 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, I think this refers specifically to  
18 what's termed "the children's registers". There are  
19 other smaller, rougher books called admission and  
20 discharge registers, so these books are just called  
21 "children's registers".

22 MR MacAULAY: The register of inmates, am I right to picture  
23 large ledger type books?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, that's right.

25 MR MacAULAY: Going back many, many years in some cases?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, right to the founding of the houses,  
2 so the 1860s in the case of Aberdeen.

3 MR MacAULAY: So the Aberdeen example would be one that  
4 really is so fragile it would be quite difficult for it  
5 to travel?

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: The early register for Aberdeen is too  
7 fragile. The whole of the register for Glasgow  
8 Nazareth House is too fragile.

9 MR MacAULAY: I think what you've done, insofar as the  
10 inquiry is concerned, is provide the inquiry with  
11 specific entries in these registers when it has been  
12 possible to provide names.

13 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

14 MR MacAULAY: The reference to the bottom of a disposal  
15 book, can you tell me about what that is?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Basically, they were aftercare report  
17 books, so an entry would be made when a child was  
18 discharged with the date and where they'd gone or where  
19 they were going. Then periodically, if the sisters had  
20 a report from that child or had some contact with  
21 a young person, they would make a note in the book, just  
22 a comment to say that they had seen them and what their  
23 situation was.

24 MR MacAULAY: Did you find many of such books for the four  
25 houses that we're looking at?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I can't remember without looking, I'm  
2 afraid.

3 MR MacAULAY: I may come back to that.

4 The next reference on the top of page 3 is  
5 a discharge book. You mentioned a minute ago -- we are  
6 told:

7 "A discharge book will be kept which must be signed  
8 by the relative or other person taking a child from the  
9 house. This signature must be witnessed."

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: And these were kept?

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It's a discharge receipt book, so it's  
13 basically a book of receipts signed by the person  
14 collecting the child or young person and witnessed by  
15 somebody within the house.

16 MR MacAULAY: I think I can put an example on the screen.  
17 This is at NAZ.001.003.4846. I don't think this will go  
18 on the general screens because of perhaps a difficulty  
19 with redaction.

20 If I can blow that up a bit, it is essentially  
21 a receipt which says:

22 "I hereby certify that I have received my ... from  
23 under the care of the Sisters of Nazareth."

24 And as you say, it's signed, witnessed and dated, so  
25 quite a formal document.

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: And I think you have supplied the inquiry with  
3 this sort of document.

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

5 MR MacAULAY: The next reference in these regulations is an  
6 observation book. Can you tell us the function of that?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: In our experience, from going through the  
8 records, we believe that this was the first book that  
9 was entered, so that when a child actually arrived at  
10 the home, comments would be written as to the child's  
11 name, date of birth, date of admission, any details  
12 about their parents that were known. Sometimes it  
13 wasn't parents who took the child into the home, so  
14 sometimes there wouldn't be details known and there  
15 would be comments made about a child's baptism, if it  
16 was known, and sometimes the parents' addresses,  
17 sometimes a few sentences about the child's  
18 circumstances or situation, and sometimes a comment  
19 about how payments were to be made for the child.

20 MR MacAULAY: Would this form the basis of the entries that  
21 went into the registers?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: But that basis would still be kept?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

25 MR MacAULAY: If we turn over to the next page -- perhaps

1 I can ask you this -- I'll leave that.

2 If we turn over to the next page, you'll see  
3 there -- that's on page 6728 -- reference to account  
4 books. We have a fairly detailed narrative going on for  
5 about three pages in connection with account books.  
6 What were these?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: To tell you the truth, I don't recall  
8 seeing account books. There may be some in the archive,  
9 but it's not something I've looked at.

10 MR MacAULAY: So do I take it then that you have --

11 CHRISTINE HUGHES: To clarify that, I have seen books called  
12 account books in the children's records, but not this  
13 kind of book that's described here.

14 MR MacAULAY: We're looking here at a document, as you  
15 indicated, that is dated 1925, I think; is that correct?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

17 MR MacAULAY: If I take you to NAZ .001.003.6717, again this  
18 is headed "Intermediate Chapter 1925" and is "Concerning  
19 the various books and documents to be kept"; is this  
20 a copy of the same document?

21 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, it is.

22 MR MacAULAY: Has there been a more recent promulgation of  
23 these regulations?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: When I first made my statement,  
25 I mistakenly assumed that the second copy that we have

1           was from 1946.

2           MR MacAULAY: This copy we're looking at?

3           CHRISTINE HUGHES: I'm not sure if it's this one. Because  
4           in the archive there are three copies of this document,  
5           so I don't know. But one of these three is inside  
6           a hard folder and stuck into the back of that folder is  
7           a document dated 1946, so I'd assumed that the whole  
8           document was from 1946.

9           What I believe now is that this document was  
10          probably still in use in 1946.

11          MR MacAULAY: The 1925 version?

12          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, and that it was with another  
13          document from that year.

14          MR MacAULAY: So I can understand then, is the 1925 document  
15          the relevant document for present purposes?

16          CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, I shouldn't think so for a minute.  
17          I'm sure that it had been updated over the years and  
18          amended, but nothing else has survived in the archive.

19          LADY SMITH: So are you saying that what you found marked  
20          1946 doesn't appear to have superseded the 1925  
21          document?

22          CHRISTINE HUGHES: I didn't find any other edition of this  
23          document.

24          LADY SMITH: Right. And nothing in the 1946 document told  
25          you that it was revoking the 1925 document?



1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

2 LADY SMITH: Right. Thank you.

3 MR MacAULAY: As I understand the position, so far as your  
4 records go to show, they do provide evidence that the  
5 regulations were generally being followed by the various  
6 houses.

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

8 MR MacAULAY: We mentioned a minute ago the way in which the  
9 registers, the admission registers, would be built up on  
10 the back of the observation books. Perhaps I can put  
11 this on the screen for you. It's NAZ.001.003.1671.

12 The difficulty we have with this sort of material  
13 is that because it contains many, many names, redaction  
14 makes it quite difficult to understand. But if we move  
15 towards the bottom, can we see there are headings.

16 First of all, can you identify this as being taken  
17 from the admissions register?

18 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

19 MR MacAULAY: If we look towards -- and the black bit,  
20 if we look at the left, that's the redaction of a whole  
21 series of names. Likewise, moving to the right, the  
22 third column is the redaction of dates of birth, and so  
23 on and so forth.

24 If we look towards the bottom we have one name of  
25 someone who has given evidence who did not remain

1 anonymous, Mr Calvey. That's his Christian name. We  
2 get an entry as to where he was born. We're given the  
3 date of birth; that has been redacted. We're told when  
4 he was baptised and his parents' names are provided,  
5 occupation for parents --

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: -- and if we go over to the next page, because  
8 the way these ledgers run, they're very, very big pages.  
9 So if we go on to 1672, can we see there's also  
10 a heading "Recommended by", and here we have "Edinburgh  
11 Children's Department"; do you see that?

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

13 MR MacAULAY: And the next heading is "Received", and that's  
14 when he would be admitted, the "Died" column is blank,  
15 and then when he left. So this person was only in  
16 Nazareth House for about a month or so, and there are  
17 some further observations. He's also been given  
18 a number.

19 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

20 MR MacAULAY: So this gives us an insight into how the  
21 registers were constructed. As I understand it, this  
22 information in relation to this individual would have  
23 been, first of all, noted in the observation book and  
24 transferred into the register?

25 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's the way I understand it, yes.

1 MR MacAULAY: While we're looking at the pages on the  
2 screen, we're looking at a time when this child was  
3 received in May 1965 and he'd been placed there by the  
4 Edinburgh Children's Department.

5 Can I ask you about what the picture in relation to  
6 placement of children was generally, looking at it  
7 historically? Here we have a Local Authority Children's  
8 Department placing a child, but was that always the  
9 position?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No. In the early days, children were  
11 much more frequently referred to the sisters by Catholic  
12 Children's Societies or local priests, other benefactors  
13 who would know of Nazareth House, other charities,  
14 charitable organisations.

15 MR MacAULAY: Was there a time when there began to be  
16 a change in that a Local Authority began to dominate the  
17 placement of children?

18 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, I would say from the late  
19 1950s/1960s onwards, more and more referrals came from  
20 Local Authorities.

21 MR MacAULAY: But even into the 1960s, was there something  
22 of a mix with also the Catholic Church, whether it be  
23 a parish priest or a Catholic organisation, placing  
24 children?

25 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

1 MR MacAULAY: I would imagine it would be possible to do  
2 a more detailed analysis than the one we've just carried  
3 out, but I think you've given us a broad picture as to  
4 how the registers tell that particular story.

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: Can I then take you back to your statement,  
7 having digressed. At paragraph 17 you say:

8 "Copies of these documents ..."

9 And there you're talking about the regulations:

10 "... have been provided to the inquiry. I have no  
11 knowledge of any reason why some of the records from the  
12 houses are missing."

13 You are aware that there are missing records?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes. I believe that all of the houses  
15 would have kept all of the records listed in those  
16 regulations, but we don't have them for all of the  
17 houses.

18 MR MacAULAY: If we focus in particular -- and we'll do  
19 a bit more later -- on children and what records  
20 you have for the children, can you give me an overview  
21 as to what you see the position to be?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Well, we have examples of most of those  
23 documents for different houses; we very rarely have  
24 a complete set of all the documents for each house.

25 MR MacAULAY: Do you mean the documents we've looked at,

1           like -- you have the History of the Foundations, for  
2           example, for each house?

3           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

4           MR MacAULAY:   Observation books?

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Not necessarily, no -- or if we do then  
6           they're not necessarily -- it's not necessarily  
7           a complete set covering the number of years that the  
8           children were in residence.

9           MR MacAULAY:   I think that applies to other documents that  
10          we'll talk about like visitors' books, for example,  
11          where is the picture very patchy --

12          CHRISTINE HUGHES:   It is patchy, yes.

13          MR MacAULAY:   -- particularly in relation to Scotland.

14                 Can I just say the context I'm asking you about is  
15                 in relation to Scotland: can you remember roughly how  
16                 many visitors' books for Scottish homes you were able to  
17                 recover?

18          CHRISTINE HUGHES:   We don't have any visitors' books  
19                 specifically for the children's homes in Scotland.

20                 I can't remember offhand if we have any for the houses  
21                 as a whole. I can't remember.

22          MR MacAULAY:   Okay.

23          CHRISTINE HUGHES:   I think we might have for Aberdeen, but  
24                 I'm not sure.

25          MR MacAULAY:   Punishment books are another example where

1 I think we know that there is a punishment book, at  
2 least in part, for Aberdeen and you've sent that to us.  
3 There's also two punishment books for Kilmarnock.  
4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.  
5 MR MacAULAY: Again in part.  
6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.  
7 MR MacAULAY: But no punishment books have been submitted to  
8 the inquiry for Lasswade or Cardonald.  
9 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We don't have any in the archive.  
10 MR MacAULAY: So I think your position, Christine, is that  
11 you can tell us what you have in the archive, but you  
12 can't tell us whether these documents/records ever  
13 existed --  
14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.  
15 MR MacAULAY: -- or are just missing?  
16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, I can't.  
17 MR MacAULAY: I wonder if I can pass on to Sister Anna.  
18 Sister, so far as you're concerned, can you help with  
19 that? You have heard some of the evidence in the  
20 inquiry that some sisters, particularly latterly, did  
21 keep some records.  
22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.  
23 MR MacAULAY: But I think quite a number of sisters have  
24 said they never kept records and, in particular, put  
25 entries into things such as a punishment book. What's

1           your position on that?

2           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: From the evidence we heard, some of the  
3           sisters seemed to intimate it was the senior sister that  
4           entered records into those books, but I'm sorry but  
5           I can't throw any light on what's happened to them or  
6           whether they ever existed in some of the houses because  
7           they've either been lost or destroyed.

8           MR MacAULAY: Perhaps I can go back to Christine. So far as  
9           you're aware then, Christine, have we received all the  
10          relevant records for the Scottish houses --

11          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

12          MR MacAULAY: -- that are in existence?

13          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

14          MR MacAULAY: I now want to look at part of the response  
15          that the order has made to the inquiry; that's part C.  
16          Before I just look at the part I want to take you to,  
17          can I just understand how part C of the response was  
18          constructed by the order? That begins at  
19          NAZ.001.001.0298. It's in the folder that's before the  
20          sister.

21                 Sorry, I gave you the wrong reference. I'll need  
22          the reference for the transcript: NAZ.001.001.0267.  
23          Thank you.

24                 That's where it begins. I just want to understand  
25          how this was put together. Can you help me with that?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It was a joint effort by -- well, from me  
2 and the General Councillors at the generalate, but I'm  
3 sure they also liaised with other sisters. So the  
4 actual writing of the response was done by me and the  
5 General Councillors.

6 MR MacAULAY: Insofar as that part of the dealing with the  
7 records would be concerned, would you bear the brunt of  
8 that?

9 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

10 MR MacAULAY: It was the section dealing with records that  
11 I was going to take you to; that's at page 0298.

12 Towards the bottom we have a section beginning at  
13 4.12, "Records", and the first question actually is  
14 dealing with policies. What's asked is:

15 "What policies and/or procedures did the  
16 organisation/establishment have in relation to  
17 record-keeping?"

18 We're told:

19 "In the earlier years there were no formal policies  
20 or procedures."

21 But we have seen the regulations, of course, that  
22 governed records.

23 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I think you need to -- we need to make  
24 a distinction between record-keeping, which was the  
25 initial instruction to actually write the records or,



1           you know, produce the record, and record retention. We  
2           didn't find any policies, any formal policies, for the  
3           retention of records.

4       MR MacAULAY: And as you've pointed out, the archive didn't  
5           come into existence until 1994. But do you have  
6           a policy now?

7       CHRISTINE HUGHES: Basically, we would keep everything that  
8           was related to residents or children, and that's always  
9           been the case since the archive was set up: more or less  
10          everything has been kept.

11       MR MacAULAY: Yes, okay. If we read on into page 0300, the  
12          above record books, and you've talked about some of the  
13          material we've already discussed like the registers and  
14          the discharge and observation books.

15                You say:

16                "They were maintained throughout the period the  
17                sisters cared for children in Scotland. However, in the  
18                late 1960s, formal policies and procedures also required  
19                that each child should have a medical and dental  
20                record."

21                Can I just understand that? You suggest that there  
22                were policies that would require each child to have  
23                a medical and dental record.

24       CHRISTINE HUGHES: Sorry?

25       MR MacAULAY: The suggestion there is there was a policy

1 from some source requiring the keeping, rather, of  
2 mental and dental records.

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes, but we didn't find  
4 anything in the archive giving those policies.

5 MR MacAULAY: So what I want to ask is: how do you know  
6 there was such a policy in place?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Because that would have been a legal  
8 requirement.

9 MR MacAULAY: So you're relying really on the fact that  
10 there would be a national legal requirement for such  
11 records to be kept?

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: And local authority requirements.

13 MR MacAULAY: But you found no such policy in your records?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

15 MR MacAULAY: Can I take you to page 0304. At (xvii), you  
16 were asked:

17 "Please provide details of any records currently  
18 held relating to the establishment in respect of the  
19 following: children in its care, staff, complaints ..."

20 And so on.

21 Again, we've looked at these materials.

22 If we turn over to page 0305, at (j) you address  
23 visitors' books and you say:

24 "Very few have survived ..."

25 And I think you've already told us that, so far as

1           Scotland is concerned, perhaps possibly with the  
2           exception of Aberdeen:

3                     "There are no visitors' books, if they existed, that  
4           have survived."

5   CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

6   MR MacAULAY: At (l):

7                     "Daily diary notes for each establishment."

8                     Did you find daily diary notes that related to any  
9           of the Scottish houses?

10   CHRISTINE HUGHES: We did, yes. We found some logbooks and  
11           event books, that kind of thing.

12   MR MacAULAY: So if I put this document on the screen: it's  
13           ABN.001.001.0776.

14   (Pause)

15                     I may have to come back to this document. But I'm  
16           looking at a document that's said to be a logbook from  
17           Aberdeen and it's covering a period beyond 1969; I'll  
18           come back to that. Is that what you mean by having --  
19           that's not it -- a daily diary?

20   CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

21   MR MacAULAY: You also say that -- and we've touched upon  
22           this already -- at (m):

23                     "Punishment books. These were only recorded in the  
24           later years."

25                     We have only identified the few punishment books

1           that I've already mentioned, but in any event, are you  
2           saying that insofar as the recording of punishment would  
3           be concerned, that would only be something that would  
4           happen in more recent times?

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES: I believe so. I don't know personally,  
6           but I think the sisters said that was the case.

7           MR MacAULAY: Again, we'll look at the punishment book then  
8           and just see what the position is. If we go down to  
9           (r), there's a suggestion there that the progressive  
10          case history of a child would be recorded. Did you find  
11          much evidence of progressive case histories of children?

12          CHRISTINE HUGHES: We only have a few for Aberdeen and  
13          Glasgow children, mainly Glasgow children.

14          MR MacAULAY: I think it's fair to say that it really is  
15          quite small, certainly what's been produced to the  
16          inquiry in relation to that sort of material.

17          CHRISTINE HUGHES: We were only asked to provide material  
18          for specific children.

19          MR MacAULAY: Indeed.

20          CHRISTINE HUGHES: So in fact, in the archive, we have  
21          a number of boxes full of case files.

22          MR MacAULAY: But if you're talking over thousands of  
23          children --

24          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, that's right, it's not very many  
25          that survived.

1 MR MacAULAY: So far as the material produced to the inquiry  
2 is concerned -- and this may not be surprising because  
3 some sisters, I think, said in evidence that they didn't  
4 make this sort of record for the children. As far as  
5 what has been produced to the inquiry is concerned,  
6 there isn't a lot of material.

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: A lot of material about -- for example,  
8 a progressive case history of a child would leave the  
9 house along with the child. So wherever the child was  
10 going, the case history and medical records and so on  
11 would go with the child.

12 MR MacAULAY: What if the child was leaving at the age of  
13 15?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: If that is the case, I don't know whether  
15 it would have gone back to the referring authority  
16 rather than staying at Nazareth House.

17 MR MacAULAY: But I think that answers my question then.  
18 Insofar as what's been provided to the inquiry is  
19 concerned, there is not a lot of material that would fit  
20 into this category of material?

21 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

22 MR MacAULAY: In a similar vein, if we look at (x), that  
23 deals with care plans. The suggestion there is these  
24 were only used in the later years. Again, so far as  
25 what's been produced to the inquiry is concerned, again

1           there isn't -- we don't see this sort of material;  
2           is that correct?

3           CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

4           MR MacAULAY:  Can I then just take you to look at the  
5           History of the Foundations material and to take one or  
6           two examples from Scotland, and to start with let's look  
7           at Aberdeen.  I'll put this on the screen in a moment.

8           The number is NAZ.001.003.7695.

9           Can we see that this is said to be:

10           "The History of the Foundation of Nazareth House  
11           Aberdeen, Scotland"?

12           We see that's the title.

13           I think someone, it may have been you, has written  
14           on the other side, "1862 to 1951, volume 1".

15           CHRISTINE HUGHES:  That's right, yes.

16           MR MacAULAY:  So this is really from the very beginning of  
17           its existence?

18           CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

19           MR MacAULAY:  I don't propose to look at many entries, but  
20           can I take you to page NAZ.001.003.7829.

21           If we look towards the top left we have the date  
22           "1933" and do we read:

23           "The Christmas parties were very much enjoyed by  
24           all"?

25           Do you see that?  And do we see that sort of entry

1           really, possibly, on an annual basis --

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

3           MR MacAULAY: -- in the histories?

4           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

5           MR MacAULAY: So they do record that there were Christmas

6           parties --

7           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

8           MR MacAULAY: -- and also, I think, on occasions, Christmas

9           gifts?

10          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11          MR MacAULAY: The other entry I want to take you to is on

12          the same page, since we have it on the screen. On the

13          bottom of the second page:

14                 "On April 30th, we had a visit from Miss Harrison,

15          inspector from the Health Department for Scotland."

16          Again, we can stop there. I think we do see this

17          sort of entry throughout the history, again recording

18          each inspection?

19          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

20          MR MacAULAY: Can I take you to page 7844, because this is

21          something that has been mentioned in the evidence. This

22          is dated 1939. We see that towards the top. It's

23          dealing with a fire that happened in 1939. In the

24          second main paragraph, can we read, moving down the page

25          a bit:

1           "On his own little bed in the ruined dormitory was  
2 found the still little body of [REDACTED]. May his  
3 soul rest in peace."

4           It goes on to describe the scene and then there's  
5 a question posed:

6           "Did [REDACTED] leave the dormitory with the other  
7 boys?"

8           So we know that there was a fire and a boy died in  
9 the fire.

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: But there was an inquiry, as I think this  
12 document tells us. If we turn to page 7847, if we look  
13 towards the right-hand page, we're given a description  
14 there of the inquiry before the sheriff, who was  
15 appearing. For example:

16           "The mother appeared first in the witness box and  
17 was kept almost one hour being questioned and  
18 cross-examined."

19           If we move down a little bit, we're told that  
20 Canon Grant was present and remained with mother.

21           If we look towards the bottom, we see:

22           "Sheriff Laing spoke very highly of the spirit  
23 animating the boys of Nazareth House."

24           Reading this short, the sheriff exonerated the  
25 sisters from any fault in connection with the fire.



1           That is the conclusion if we are to read on in the  
2           document?

3           CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

4           MR MacAULAY:  Is that correct?

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

6           MR MacAULAY:  Again, taking some other examples, if we turn  
7           to page 1957 -- I think for that we're looking at  
8           a different volume -- sorry, it's 6957.  It's  
9           a different volume, but we can go to the page in the  
10          volume.

11          Can we see we're now into 1957, towards the top  
12          left?

13          CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

14          MR MacAULAY:  Again, just to draw attention to the fact that  
15          halfway down we're told:

16                 "The annual inspection of the house was carried out  
17                 by Miss Morrison and Miss Anderson of the Home  
18                 Department.  They emphasised the number of boys should  
19                 be reduced so that their dormitories could be converted  
20                 into smaller bedrooms."

21          So that was what was being proposed at that time.

22          But again I think we see evidence of inspection.

23          CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

24          MR MacAULAY:  If we move in the same volume to 6987, we're  
25          now getting a bit more up to date, we're now in 1969.

1           If we look towards the bottom left, can we read:

2           "During the festive season the children and old folk  
3           had a truly wonderful time thanks to the kindness of our  
4           friends and benefactors. Parties were held in all  
5           departments and were thoroughly enjoyed. The boys and  
6           girls entertained with songs and little sketches."

7           And so on. Again, it's the sort of record we've  
8           already mentioned; is that right?

9           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

10          MR MacAULAY: Perhaps one entry from this volume, the final  
11          entry, page 6996. We're looking at 1974. Can we read  
12          towards the top that Sister FAF, who we've heard  
13          about in evidence, has died and there are some comments  
14          about her?

15          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

16          MR MacAULAY: So we've seen from just the very cursory look  
17          we've had at that particular document that there are  
18          quite detailed events -- records being made of certain  
19          events?

20          CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

21          MR MacAULAY: On quite a regular basis?

22          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

23          MR MacAULAY: Is that the pattern that we see in the other  
24          foundation documents?

25          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, it is.

1 MR MacAULAY: I will take you to Kilmarnock just to pick up  
2 one or two points; that's at NAZ.001.003.7396. Again,  
3 this is December 1963 and there's reference there to  
4 Christmas parties.

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Is this from Kilmarnock?

6 MR MacAULAY: Yes.

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Right. Yes.

8 MR MacAULAY: Is there an entry there that talks about  
9 lunch?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: What does it say? Can you read it for me?

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: "The old people and children had a little  
13 party for the happy occasion and His Lordship enjoyed  
14 a spot of lunch with Fathers [REDACTED] LNN and Kennedy."

15 MR MacAULAY: So there's a reference there to  
16 a Father [REDACTED] LNN and a Father Kennedy.

17 If you turn to page 7390, we're now into 1963 and  
18 towards the bottom is there reference there to a:

19 "Father [REDACTED] LQR paying us a visit (childcare) and  
20 seemed very pleased with the children"?

21 Do you see against the date for February:

22 "Reverend Father [REDACTED] LQR paid a visit (childcare) and  
23 seemed very pleased with the children"?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

25 MR MacAULAY: If we turn to page 7417, moving down to

1 1 November, if we can focus on that, can we read that:

2 "The welfare officer, the chief of police and  
3 Mr Donnelly paid a visit to the house. They went all  
4 through and were very pleased and commented all looked  
5 happy and well cared for."

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: That's in 1968. If I turn to page 7429,  
8 looking now at [REDACTED] 1970, where there's quite  
9 a lengthy entry. About halfway down the page can we see  
10 that again there's reference to a funeral and that:

11 "The Requiem Mass was celebrated by the Very  
12 Reverend Canon [REDACTED] LNN ."

13 Can you see that?

14 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It's redacted.

15 MR MacAULAY: It is. I don't know why, but there we go. In  
16 any event, I can tell you that's what it says.

17 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

18 MR MacAULAY: Perhaps the last entry to take from the  
19 Kilmarnock document is page 7448. If we move down,  
20 we're now into 1974 and we're looking at December.  
21 Again, there's reference to the children being invited  
22 to several parties during the holidays. Do you see  
23 that?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

25 MR MacAULAY: We read on:

1                    "We had midnight Mass as usual celebrated by ..."  
2                    That has been redacted but I can tell you the name  
3                    is "Father [REDACTED] LQH".  
4                    So what we've seen, the entries I have taken you to,  
5                    there's been reference to three particular priests.  
6                    CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.  
7                    MR MacAULAY: I have done that because these priests have  
8                    been mentioned in evidence as having contact with  
9                    Kilmarnock. But this is a picture we see throughout  
10                    these documents for each of these houses?  
11                    CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.  
12                    MR MacAULAY: Just to make it clear, what we do see is we  
13                    see visits by outside parties --  
14                    CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.  
15                    MR MacAULAY: -- such as welfare officers and there are  
16                    Christmas celebrations? That's the case, isn't it?  
17                    CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.  
18                    MR MacAULAY: Is it fair to say, looking at that material,  
19                    that we don't see negative comments in the material?  
20                    CHRISTINE HUGHES: No. No, you don't. You do get  
21                    descriptions of not necessarily, as we saw with the  
22                    fire, of not necessarily happy events but, no, the  
23                    inspections, they're all favourable comments or  
24                    suggestions for improvements.  
25                    MR MacAULAY: I understand that the document I tried to put

1           on the screen before can now at least go on to your  
2           screen. It's ABN.001.001.0776.

3           You'd mentioned logbooks and diaries; is this the  
4           sort of presentation you had in mind?

5           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6           MR MacAULAY: So we're looking here at what is said to be  
7           the logbook, I think, for Aberdeen -- from Aberdeen.  
8           It's covering the period for September 1969 -- these are  
9           just extracts from it. Can we read, for example, the  
10          sort of material that is mentioned:

11          "Five of the older girls really enjoyed a very  
12          exciting and amusing film entitled 'The King and I'."

13          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

14          MR MacAULAY: The next entry:

15          "The children enjoyed a long walk and played in ...  
16          Johnston's gardens."

17          Do you see that?

18          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

19          MR MacAULAY: Again, that is the sort of entry that we see  
20          in this sort of material. Do we see anything negative  
21          being recorded?

22          CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, I don't think so. I should say  
23          I haven't read every single word in these books.

24          MR MacAULAY: I wouldn't have pretended to have done so as  
25          well, but even just looking at it quickly -- but no

1           doubt if others find negative comments, they'll draw  
2           them to my attention.

3           We have talked about visitors' books and you  
4           wondered about Aberdeen. If I can put this on the  
5           screen for you: NAZ.001.003.6783.

6           If you look at the left-hand side, this is described  
7           as:

8           "Aberdeen Nazareth House: loose pages from  
9           a visitors' book 1960 to 1969."

10          Is that your handwriting?

11         CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, it is.

12         MR MacAULAY: So you clearly had access to a visitors' book  
13          for Aberdeen?

14         CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

15         MR MacAULAY: I am not aware there being any other visitors'  
16          books which have been made available to the inquiry.

17          I don't think there are.

18         CHRISTINE HUGHES: I don't recall any others, no.

19         MR MacAULAY: I think the Aberdeen visitors' book or books,  
20          they're not complete.

21         CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

22         MR MacAULAY: If I take you to page 6807, we're looking at  
23          an entry for 9 April 1968. I think we can read:

24                 "I have today made a [I can't quite read that next  
25          word] of the house with the Reverend Mother and found

1 everything in perfect order. The children are very  
2 happy and well cared for, the elderly ladies warm and  
3 comfortable in this very cold weather."

4 And that has been signed. We're not actually told  
5 who it is, but it's certainly someone who has visited  
6 for that particular purpose.

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

8 MR MacAULAY: In relation again to the visitors' book for  
9 Aberdeen, that's the only one we have that you've seen,  
10 is this the type of entry that we come across?

11 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I can't really say because there are so  
12 few examples of them in the archive, but as far as I can  
13 recall, there are other visitors' books which are just  
14 lists of names and dates.

15 MR MacAULAY: I think Aberdeen is also -- as we move on into  
16 the later books, we do have that picture. Let's look at  
17 NAZ.001.003.6809.

18 (Pause)

19 I'll try that again. It's NAZ.001.003.6809.

20 I think it may just be the next page from the page  
21 that's on the screen in fact.

22 LADY SMITH: Sorry, Mr MacAulay, I'm not seeing hopeful  
23 signals. Very much a shaking of the head.

24 MR MacAULAY: Okay. We may come back to that. It's another  
25 visitors' book for Aberdeen, which you supplied to the



1 inquiry, beginning in 1978, and as you have just  
2 mentioned, what we have there is simply just the name of  
3 a person and an address. So that's a different type of  
4 visitors' book, is it?

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: So were there different types of visitors'  
7 book depending on the visitor?

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes. I mean, it seems as if the early  
9 one, with the dates and the longer comments, would  
10 probably have been for official visitors or inspectors,  
11 whereas the later one may have just been any visitors  
12 who called into the house. I'm not sure, but that's the  
13 way it appears.

14 MR MacAULAY: Perhaps I can ask Sister Doolan about this  
15 next point.

16 As you have seen, sister, there is evidence that  
17 these types of visitors' books were kept for Aberdeen  
18 because we've recovered these. We haven't recovered any  
19 similar type of document for the other three  
20 Nazareth Houses because they don't exist.

21 Can you help on that? Would you have expected that  
22 such books would have been in existence?

23 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, yes, you would have thought so,  
24 but I thought in the past few weeks we sent in  
25 a visitors' book from Bonnyrigg/Lasswade. It would be

1 more the latter type book that you're talking about with  
2 a name and date of the visit, not a detailed one like  
3 that.

4 MR MacAULAY: Thank you for --

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Maybe I've got that wrong, but it was  
6 photocopied and it was sent in.

7 MR MacAULAY: I can check that. Was that just discovered  
8 recently then?

9 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Since the inquiry started definitely.

10 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, the one you just referred to,  
11 which wasn't on the screen, you said showed a name,  
12 a date and an address. Was the address what looks like  
13 a personal address or a workplace address? Don't tell  
14 me the address if it's a personal address.

15 MR MacAULAY: They look like personal addresses.

16 LADY SMITH: Personal addresses? Right.

17 MR MacAULAY: Quite full addresses, with a full address,  
18 number, street and town.

19 LADY SMITH: Oh, I see. Thank you, which might fit with  
20 somebody who's just a visitor as opposed to an official  
21 visitor, I suppose. Would that be right?

22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, and that's what we would have now  
23 for visitors coming in.

24 LADY SMITH: Whereas it would be more understandable that if  
25 somebody was there latterly, an implement of the

1 statutory duty, for instance, they might make a short  
2 note in your book of what they find, which they would  
3 then no doubt transpose and add detail to when they're  
4 writing up the report.

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: As it happens, I have opened the page for  
7 1987, and this is not disclosing any secrets, there's  
8 a signature there, Mario Conti, and his address is given  
9 simply as the Bishop of Aberdeen.

10 My Lady, that might be a good moment to stop for the  
11 morning break.

12 LADY SMITH: Very well.

13 (11.28 am)

14 (A short break)

15 (11.48 am)

16 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

17 MR MacAULAY: Can I then now turn to the issue of punishment  
18 books, and we've already discussed that and what  
19 punishment books are still in existence. In particular,  
20 there's punishment books for Aberdeen and also for  
21 Kilmarnock.

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: If we look at Aberdeen, I'll put this on the  
24 screen: NAZ.001.001.2076. I think earlier you wondered  
25 how far back this would go. Can we see here this is the

1           punishment book for Aberdeen for 1909 to 1968?

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

3           MR MacAULAY: Perhaps we can begin at 1909 at page 2077,  
4           just to pick up one or two of the entries. Do we see  
5           that the entry for 3 February, for example, the name has  
6           been blanked out, but it has:

7                     "Two slaps of the strap on the hands for being  
8           untidy at housework."

9                     So there's a record there of physical chastisement  
10          of a particular child?

11          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

12          MR MacAULAY: There are some records of a similar nature  
13          in the punishment book where it talks about either slaps  
14          or use of the strap. For example, if we go -- let's see  
15          if I can get another more recent date.

16                     Page 2221. We're looking here at 1954. If we look  
17          at the entry for 28 March, there's a reference to  
18          a child there:

19                     "Given two slaps with the strap for staying away  
20          from school (half day)."

21                     Do you see that?

22          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

23          MR MacAULAY: I think there's another entry on the next  
24          page, perhaps, two pages on, 2223. This is 1956,  
25          27 January 1956. We can see that a child is given:

1            "[A] sharp smack on the hand with own hand for  
2            repeated quarrelling."

3            That gives us a feel for the type of punishments  
4            that were being recorded at that time.

5            CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6            MR MacAULAY: If we look at more recent times then, let's  
7            turn to page 2231. In fact, perhaps I can go back  
8            a little bit to -- yes, 2231, that's fine.

9            At the very top can we see it's against July 1962,  
10           there's a child who:

11           "Absconded and remained out two nights. Was  
12           transferred to Senior Approved School Bishopton. Was  
13           kept apart from other pupils until transfer was made."

14           So that was the way that was dealt with?

15           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

16           MR MacAULAY: Do we see then from July 1962 to October 1962  
17           there's something of a gap?

18           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

19           MR MacAULAY: Then we see the next entry is for  
20           26 November 1962, is that right, after that?

21           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

22           MR MacAULAY: If we go on to page 2232, do we see there is  
23           an entry for 16 November 1963 and the next entry isn't  
24           until 24 August -- it looks like 1965. That's a gap of  
25           over a year and a half. What that entry says in fact

1 is:

2 "Seven girls went off after supper this evening.  
3 They were followed by our van and brought back. They  
4 are not being allowed Christmas vacation."

5 That's how they were dealt with, but again it's  
6 a case of absconding?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

8 MR MacAULAY: In the next entry in October 1965, are we told  
9 that there are:

10 "Two children who absconded this day. They  
11 travelled to Glasgow without tickets and they were  
12 apprehended at Buchanan Street Station by the police."

13 So again, it's absconding that seems to be the  
14 problem?

15 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

16 MR MacAULAY: If we move on to page 2233, for November 1965,  
17 do we have another entry that tells us that a child  
18 absconded and went by train without a ticket to Dundee?  
19 Do you see that?

20 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

21 MR MacAULAY: Do we see in the next entry, which is a couple  
22 of months later in January 1966, "Two girls absconded",  
23 with one approved schoolgirl among the number. Again,  
24 are we focusing on absconding as being a problem at that  
25 time?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: If we turn to page 2234, we have on that page,  
3 I think, again references to children absconding,  
4 without looking at the detail of it.

5 If we move on to page 2235 -- and we're into July  
6 and October 1966 -- again do we see reference to  
7 children absconding?

8 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: So what we see from the latter period is that  
10 one of the main problems, as evidenced by the punishment  
11 book, is that of children absconding from the home --

12 CHRISTINE HUGHES: During that period, yes.

13 MR MacAULAY: -- during that period? But we also see during  
14 that period that, in the main, these are the main  
15 entries, and there are gaps in between these entries?

16 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

17 MR MacAULAY: The other series of documents that you've made  
18 available to the inquiry, Christine, were visitation  
19 reports. Can you tell us about these, what their  
20 function was?

21 CHRISTINE HUGHES: There are two types of visitation. There  
22 were general visitations of each house by either the  
23 Superior General or one or two of her -- two, I think,  
24 usually of the councillors, General Councillors. Also,  
25 once the regions were established, so once the northern

1 region was established, there would be regional  
2 visitations of the houses by the regional councillors.

3 MR MacAULAY: Was there a different purpose between the two  
4 types of visitation?

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, they both had the purpose of going to  
6 visit the home, the house, speak to the sisters, and  
7 inspect the house and the children's home, the elderly  
8 care home, and see how things were being managed.

9 MR MacAULAY: How regularly were these visitations carried  
10 out?

11 CHRISTINE HUGHES: The general visitations, I think, were  
12 every two years. Sister Anna might be better able to  
13 answer that. The regional visitations I think were at  
14 least once a year, if not more frequently.

15 MR MacAULAY: Can you help us with that, Sister Anna?

16 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: The generalate visitations were usually  
17 once in three years -- and I have seen that in the  
18 records. It said the regional visitation is once a  
19 year, but it's the same once in three years. But like  
20 in my position, in that role, I would visit the houses  
21 maybe four or five times in the year.

22 MR MacAULAY: I see. Can I perhaps look at one of these  
23 reports with you, Christine, and put on the screen  
24 NAZ.001.003.1496.

25 We're looking at a document that is headed



1 "Nazareth House Aberdeen" and the date is 26 March 1969.

2 Do you see that?

3 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

4 MR MacAULAY: Is this the format then of the report that  
5 would be completed?

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: So for example, there's a council meeting held  
8 in connection with the visitation and that's presided  
9 over by the Mother General; do you see that?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: And we're told who's present. For example,  
12 we're told that Sister [FAF] is present as is  
13 Sister [LFB]. Is that correct? These are names we've  
14 heard in evidence.

15 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I don't know, they're redacted.

16 MR MacAULAY: Yes.

17 We're looking at the headings. There's reference to  
18 the bursar's remarks, chapel, and so on. Then towards  
19 the bottom, under "Reference to employments", are we  
20 told that at this time there are 91 children, 40 boys  
21 and 51 girls, in five groups? Do we see that?

22 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: And we go on and read:

24 "They are a happy lot of children, well fed, well  
25 dressed, well groomed, and are given every opportunity

1           for educational advancement."

2           So that's what the Mother Superior has concluded?

3   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

4   MR MacAULAY:  We then have a look at the description of the

5           old people.  Then under "General remarks" we're told

6           that in the approved school there are nine girls;

7           do you see that?

8   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

9   MR MacAULAY:  "It was decided at this visitation, after

10           a consultation with the Very Reverend Father Robson, the

11           administrator, discussing the various problems connected

12           with it, that it would be in the best interests of the

13           house to close this section."

14           And it goes on to say:

15           "Catholic care for these girls can be provided by

16           the Good Shepherd Sisters.  The girls do not belong to

17           the Aberdeen area ..."

18           And so on.

19           So this was at a point in time when the decision was

20           essentially made to close the approved school section of

21           Aberdeen?

22   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

23   MR MacAULAY:  We know, I think, in Aberdeen we had the

24           elderly care section, the approved school section and

25           you had the voluntary home section.

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: But does this document generally set out what  
3 we would find in these reports?

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, that's right.

5 MR MacAULAY: Do you have a pretty full set of --

6 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We do, yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: You were asked, I think, to look, in  
8 connection with the issue of child case conferences,  
9 whether you had any minute books, because there had been  
10 a suggestion that such minute books would be in  
11 existence. I think you carried out a search to see  
12 whether you did or not. What did you find?

13 CHRISTINE HUGHES: We only have one minute book and that's  
14 from Glasgow Nazareth House for -- I can't remember now,  
15 I think it's just a period of seven years. It's a very  
16 short period.

17 MR MacAULAY: I'll put your email on the screen. It's  
18 NAZ.001.003.9380.

19 I'll come back to the first three points in  
20 a moment, but you say under the heading "Child case  
21 conference minute books":

22 "The only child case conference minute book held in  
23 the general archive is the one for Glasgow  
24 Nazareth House 1964 to 1967."

25 So it's for that short period of time?

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: A short three years, yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: We've looked at a number of different types of  
3 document, but insofar as records for the children are  
4 concerned -- and I think we've touched upon this  
5 already -- apart from the admissions records and what  
6 might be in the punishment book and any reference to  
7 children in the logbooks, is it right to say that for  
8 individual children you don't have very much, if I can  
9 put it that way, by way of individual children's files?

10 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: Do you have anything at all that you can  
12 describe as a child's file?

13 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, we do, for Aberdeen and Glasgow.

14 MR MacAULAY: But it's very sparse?

15 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Considering the number of children, there  
16 aren't very many that have reached the archive.

17 MR MacAULAY: Okay. If we put your email back on the  
18 screen, because you were asked a number of questions  
19 that have cropped up in the course of the evidence and  
20 you very kindly researched these issues for us.

21 In point 1 you say:

22 "I have searched the Kilmarnock Nazareth House  
23 registers of children and no children were recorded as  
24 having died in the house in 1965 or at any date after  
25 15/10/1953."

1                   Is that what you have --

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

3           MR MacAULAY: You say:

4                   "[You've] read the Kilmarnock Nazareth House History  
5                   of the Foundation for the years 1960 to 1970. No deaths  
6                   of children were recorded or referred to."

7           CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

8           MR MacAULAY: I think that was against the background of  
9                   there having been evidence of a child having either  
10                  fallen or jumped from a fire escape.

11          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

12          MR MacAULAY: You go on to say:

13                   "I have read the Kilmarnock Nazareth House council  
14                   minutes for the years 1960 to 1970. No deaths of  
15                   children were recorded or referred to."

16          CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

17          MR MacAULAY: So there's no record of a child having died  
18                   during that period?

19          CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

20          MR MacAULAY: Can we go back to your statement then,  
21                   Christine, having looked at these documents, and can I  
22                   take you to page 6; that's at 7615.

23                   Under the heading "Journals/books", what you say is:

24                   "I know there are some surviving daily journals from  
25                   Scottish houses."

1                   That's the logbooks you're talking about?

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

3           MR MacAULAY:   And you talk about some records for individual  
4                   children at Aberdeen and these include some medical  
5                   records.

6           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   Yes.

7           MR MacAULAY:   And you've provided all these to the inquiry  
8                   in respect of the names that you were provided with?

9           CHRISTINE HUGHES:   That's right, yes.

10          MR MacAULAY:   If we move on to paragraph 31 -- and this is  
11                   under the heading "Policies", this is on page 7 of the  
12                   statement -- what you say there is:

13                         "As such there are no records of policies for  
14                   individual houses.  There were guidance notes within the  
15                   directories of the congregation.  These were called  
16                   'Directories and Books of Custom'."

17                         We looked at this the other way and perhaps I can  
18                   look at this with Sister Anna because I think this is  
19                   directly more related to you.

20                         So the reference is NAZ.001.001.2377 and we're  
21                   looking at a document that I think is entitled  
22                   "Directory and Book of Customs".  This is for the year  
23                   1921.  We've also been supplied with another version --  
24                   and I'll come to it in a moment -- for 1982.  Am I right  
25                   in thinking, Christine, before I ask Sister Anna the

1 question, that these are the only two that --

2 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, no, not at all; there are other

3 editions.

4 MR MacAULAY: Since 1982?

5 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: And between?

7 CHRISTINE HUGHES: And between, yes.

8 MR MacAULAY: Okay. Very well, I'll come back to that.

9 Sister Anna, then, if we look at the 1921 edition, can

10 I just ask you about what the function of this document

11 is?

12 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: It's a document I'm not familiar with

13 because it wasn't in use in my day, but we have

14 different versions of the directory now. It seemed to

15 be, reading it -- the function was to give direction to

16 the children, looking after -- sorry, the sisters

17 looking after the children or the old people of how to

18 carry out their duties and some customs are in it as

19 well.

20 MR MacAULAY: In particular, it does provide some guidance

21 as to how children are to be cared for?

22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: We touched the other day on the paragraph

24 in the second column that tells us that:

25 "When in bed [and this is dealing with the very

1 young children] they should be trained to keep their  
2 hands in the form of a cross on their breast to commend  
3 themselves to the Blessed Virgin to remember their  
4 guardian angel is often with them and often to speak to  
5 him."

6 So was that news to you when I read it the other  
7 day?

8 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, we'd heard it from a number of  
9 applicants in their evidence that they were required to  
10 do that.

11 MR MacAULAY: Yes, but I meant were you aware that such  
12 a provision existed in the directory in the past?

13 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I wasn't, no.

14 MR MacAULAY: But that could be an explanation for the  
15 background --

16 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Why it was in practice, yes. The next  
17 version of this book is 1958, which is very similar, and  
18 I think the next -- it was every six years, at the  
19 General Chapter, it was updated and it goes on, I think,  
20 to 1964. It's a much shorter document and at our recent  
21 chapter a few weeks ago, our directory was updated but  
22 it wouldn't have any of those details in it now because  
23 obviously systems are very different and it pertains  
24 more to the sisters.

25 MR MacAULAY: I understand that because the caring of



1 children is no longer on the agenda. Are you able to  
2 tell me when that particular provision was no longer to  
3 be found in the directory?

4 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: About crossing the arms?

5 MR MacAULAY: Yes.

6 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I'm sure I recollect it in the 1958  
7 one, but I think it's not in the 1964.

8 MR MacAULAY: It's in the 1958, you think, but not --

9 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: The 1958, to me, seems to reflect very  
10 much this one in length and everything, whereas the ones  
11 after that are much shorter.

12 MR MacAULAY: I have certainly seen the 1982 version and  
13 it's not in the 1982 version.

14 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No.

15 MR MacAULAY: If I can take you, sister, to page 2381. Here  
16 we're looking at children, I think, in a more general  
17 way. Towards the bottom of page 68 there's this point  
18 about:

19 "Two children should not sleep in the same bed. It  
20 must never be allowed except perhaps for two little  
21 brothers or sisters for three or four nights on a very  
22 urgent occasion."

23 Again, were you aware of that before any evidence  
24 was presented to the inquiry that children who might --  
25 a child who might join another child in bed might be in

1 trouble?

2 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I wasn't.

3 MR MacAULAY: But the paragraph at the bottom of page 2381:

4 "Any sister who punishes the children too severely  
5 degrades the religious habit she wears."

6 And if we read on:

7 "Sisters experienced with the children have found  
8 that since the children were allowed the privilege of  
9 daily communion, corporal punishment has become almost  
10 unnecessary."

11 I take it you agree with the provision that too  
12 severe a punishment would degrade the habit?

13 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Oh certainly, yes. I mean, too much  
14 punishment for any child is not the way to treat them.  
15 They should be treated with love and care. Obviously  
16 they need discipline and correction, but not in a severe  
17 manner.

18 MR MacAULAY: I know you've been present here for quite  
19 a bit of the evidence, sister. If what has been said by  
20 some applicants is true in relation to how they were  
21 treated, would you consider that that sort of treatment  
22 would severely degrade the habit?

23 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, it certainly wouldn't be what  
24 we would expect of any of our sisters to act in that  
25 way.

1 MR MacAULAY: And do you agree then that that would be  
2 something -- that sort of treatment, if true, would be  
3 the sort of treatment that would severely degrade the  
4 religious habit?

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: If I move on then to the next page, 2382,  
7 again this is a passage I think we looked at the other  
8 day on the left-hand column. That reads:

9 "Severe corporal punishment, such as whipping and  
10 caning, may never be given without the permission of the  
11 Superior, and then only for a very grave fault, and  
12 in the presence of at least two sisters."

13 That suggests that in certain circumstances, severe  
14 corporal punishment, as described, could be given. Was  
15 that something that you had been aware of as  
16 a possibility?

17 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I hadn't been aware of that. I was  
18 very astonished to see whipping in there.

19 MR MacAULAY: If we turn to the 1982 version that has been  
20 provided to the inquiry, that's at NAZ.001.001.2392.  
21 Perhaps Christine, you can confirm that's your  
22 handwriting at the top, indicating this is the directory  
23 for 1982?

24 CHRISTINE HUGHES: It's not my handwriting; it's Kevin's, my  
25 colleague's. But it is that directory, yes.

1 MR MacAULAY: I don't think we see the arms crossed  
2 provision in this version. If we go on to -- well,  
3 perhaps ... I was about to say go on to page ... Yes,  
4 we don't actually have the next page.

5 Can you help me with this, sister, then: the section  
6 I took you to about whipping and caning, have you any  
7 understanding when that might have come out of the  
8 directory? Because you told me you didn't have any  
9 knowledge of it.

10 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I'm almost certain it was out at the  
11 1964 version.

12 MR MacAULAY: Okay. Can I then go back to you, Christine,  
13 under reference to your statement at WIT .001.001.7616.  
14 Towards the bottom of the page, at paragraph 34, you  
15 talk about disposal of records. I think you mentioned  
16 this earlier. What you say is:

17 "Nothing has been destroyed in relation to records  
18 held for children in care."

19 CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right.

20 MR MacAULAY: That's your policy now?

21 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

22 MR MacAULAY: But what you can't help us with is in relation  
23 to what was destroyed before the archive came into  
24 existence.

25 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, and also I can't say -- in addition,

1           the children's records themselves didn't come into the  
2           archive until 2006.

3       MR MacAULAY:  You also confirmed to us earlier in an email  
4           or a letter that there are no records relating to lay  
5           staff.

6       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  That's right.

7       MR MacAULAY:  Similarly, there are no records relating to  
8           any lay volunteers?

9       CHRISTINE HUGHES:  That's right.

10      MR MacAULAY:  Can I go back to part C again of the document  
11           at NAZ.001.001.0267.

12           At question 4.1, you are being asked whether there  
13           was:

14           "... any national policy/guidance relevant to the  
15           provision of residential care."

16           And I think what you said in response to that is  
17           that:

18           "The archive [did not] contain any national policy  
19           or guidance."

20      CHRISTINE HUGHES:  That's right.

21      MR MacAULAY:  I think you tell us at page 0269, at  
22           paragraph 4.3, when asked about admissions that:

23           "There was no formal written policy or procedure in  
24           connection with the admissions to any of the  
25           establishments."

1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I didn't find any, no.

2 MR MacAULAY: This may be for you, sister, to answer because  
3 the response goes on to say:

4 "If there was a vacancy within the children's home  
5 and the sister in charge felt that the child in question  
6 could be adequately cared for at the home, then the  
7 child would be admitted upon referral."

8 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: Did you understand that to be the general  
10 policy?

11 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's correct.

12 MR MacAULAY: Can I then take you to section 4.4. I think  
13 here you have introduced some changes quite recently to  
14 the responses in light of some of the evidence that  
15 we've heard.

16 So for example, at 4.4, which headed "Day to day",  
17 the question is:

18 "What policies and/or procedures did the  
19 organisation/establishment have in place in relation to  
20 the day-to-day running of the establishment?"

21 And the answer is:

22 "There was no formal written policy or procedure.  
23 However, each house had guidelines for the day-to-day  
24 running of the house."

25 I think you want to change that; is that right? Can

1 I put this email on the screen for you, or letter. It's  
2 NAZ.001.003.9371.

3 This is a letter from Clyde & Co dated 22 June 2018,  
4 so it has just come in very recently.

5 If we read the second paragraph, it reads:

6 "In light of the evidence the inquiry has heard  
7 during this case study, there are certain aspects of the  
8 parts C and D responses which the sisters would wish to  
9 revisit. The sisters sought to prepare the original  
10 parts C and D responses with diligence and with  
11 reference to both the archive material available to them  
12 and the recollections of individual sisters. However,  
13 they recognise that in light of the evidence heard by  
14 the inquiry, certain answers were either incomplete or  
15 inaccurate, despite their best endeavours."

16 And Sister Anna, you're aware of this?

17 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, I am, yes.

18 MR MacAULAY: So in relation to 4.4, I'll just read what's  
19 on the letter:

20 "The congregation's response set out that there were  
21 no formal written policies or procedures, but that each  
22 house had guidelines for the day-to-day running of the  
23 house. It was also stated that sisters tried to ensure  
24 that the guidelines were adhered to and that, to the  
25 best of their knowledge, the guidelines were adhered

1 to."

2 And the author goes on to say:

3 "In light of the evidence before the inquiry, it is  
4 apparent that was not always the case. The congregation  
5 itself did not provide individual establishments with  
6 guidelines or policies on discipline. It is not  
7 apparent that there were consistent local guidelines  
8 from the Local Superior. Rather, sisters tended to  
9 learn from each other."

10 Is that what you've taken from the evidence,  
11 sister --

12 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, it is, yes.

13 MR MacAULAY: -- from your own sisters?

14 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

15 LADY SMITH: And do you mean to cover the evidence that  
16 we've heard, that not only would it be a matter of  
17 sisters maybe learning from each other but that would  
18 still be restricted to their own employment, their own  
19 group, because we've heard about sisters going to  
20 a particular group in a particular house and then really  
21 working in a silo and not knowing how the other groups  
22 were functioning, and that's accepted, is it?

23 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, that was the way it was at the  
24 time; it certainly wouldn't be acceptable now --

25 LADY SMITH: I see that. I'm just trying to identify what



1           was happening and obviously it's important for us to  
2           learn from that and learn from you if you've decided  
3           that's not the best way to operate.

4       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Oh, certainly not, no. And they would  
5           have learned from the staff that were there as well when  
6           the sisters went. But unfortunately, also, as we've  
7           heard, there was no handover, and the same applied with  
8           the care of the elderly when we changed over. That  
9           wouldn't happen today, obviously.

10       LADY SMITH: Thank you.

11       MR MacAULAY: That practice, though, of having autonomous  
12           groups within an institution, an establishment like one  
13           of the Nazareth Houses, we've heard, for example, there  
14           were five in a particular place, referred to as their  
15           employments, but that was a policy that the order had at  
16           that time?

17       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, it was, yes.

18       MR MacAULAY: Do you know what the rationale behind that  
19           particular policy was?

20       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Having spoken to some of the sisters  
21           about it, it seemed to be that if a sister went into  
22           another sister's group, say, with the children, that  
23           they could be seen as interfering. There was also in  
24           those days, when the children's homes were still in  
25           operation, it was frowned upon sisters having particular

1 friendships with another sister. So I think some of the  
2 thinking behind it was to prevent that as well.

3 MR MacAULAY: But it does lead to a situation or could lead  
4 to a situation where a particular group was being  
5 disciplined in a way different to another group?

6 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

7 MR MacAULAY: The other proviso that I think you want to  
8 make at this point is the third paragraph in the letter:

9 "Where a child was punished, that ought to have been  
10 recorded within a punishment book. The congregation  
11 accepts that this was not always the case and indeed  
12 some sisters seem not to have been aware that there was  
13 a punishment book. To the extent that there was an  
14 expectation that the punishment book be completed, in  
15 practice there was limited adherence to this."

16 Again, you've taken that from the evidence, sister?

17 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's right.

18 MR MacAULAY: Had your understanding before that been  
19 different, that sisters did generally tend to record in  
20 punishment books?

21 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, that was my understanding, yes,  
22 but having heard the evidence, it's different.

23 MR MacAULAY: Was that understanding derived from what  
24 sisters had said to you?

25 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, it was.

1 MR MacAULAY: Then if we go back to the response at  
2 NAZ.001.001.0275, this is focusing on the children.  
3 4.5(i) makes reference to policies. You say that these  
4 were verbal; is that correct, sister?

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: If we turn to 0276, in the second paragraph  
7 you say:

8 "The sisters tried to ensure that each child felt  
9 loved, respected and valued. They tried to nurture each  
10 child's healthy growth and development. This was aided  
11 by good nourishing food, adequate sleep and regular  
12 exercise."

13 And again, you've sought to revise that particular  
14 paragraph; is that correct?

15 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's correct.

16 MR MacAULAY: If we can go back to the letter then at  
17 NAZ.001.003.9372. This is again relating back to  
18 paragraph 4.5 and just to read that:

19 "We refer to the foregoing paragraphs regarding  
20 discipline."

21 You repeat what I have just read. Then:

22 "The congregation accepts that there were specific  
23 incidents where they did not adhere to this and where  
24 children suffered abuse. We make specific reference to  
25 the evidence of Sister Alphonso and the evidence

1 in relation to abuse by Joseph Duffy."

2 Then moving on:

3 "More broadly, the congregation also recognises that  
4 they did not always have an environment where children  
5 were loved, respected, valued and nurtured. While for  
6 many children that was their experience, for others  
7 their care came from sisters who did not demonstrate  
8 affection and seek to nurture those within their care."

9 Looking to that, are you then accepting the evidence  
10 that was given along these lines?

11 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, and certainly up until the latter  
12 days of when we had childcare, there did seem to be  
13 a lack of loving and nurturing the children. I think  
14 some of that stemmed from -- prior to the late 1960s,  
15 the sisters -- our order was a very strict order and the  
16 sisters existed under a very strict regime themselves.  
17 Having listened to the evidence I have listened to and  
18 read the transcripts, et cetera, it looks as if what  
19 they lived under, they kind of transferred into their  
20 care of the children, whereas after the late 1960s, when  
21 things began to change, and the family groups were in  
22 place, the sisters were much more caring and nurturing  
23 towards the children and loving.

24 LADY SMITH: By that stage, had the practice whereby sisters  
25 were discouraged from forming friendships with other

1 sisters begun to fall away as well?

2 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I'd say into the early 1970s, that had,  
3 yes.

4 LADY SMITH: That, for example, would be a way of providing  
5 a good adult role model to children to show them that,  
6 as an adult, it's good to keep and maintain friendships.

7 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Absolutely, and for the groups to mix  
8 together and I think we did hear some evidence from  
9 sisters where they did play together and things in the  
10 latter years.

11 LADY SMITH: Yes. Mr MacAulay.

12 MR MacAULAY: Just reading on then, the last couple of  
13 paragraphs:

14 "The congregation also recognises that there was an  
15 absence of policies or guidelines for sisters in their  
16 day-to-day care and promotion for the well-being of  
17 children who were resident within Nazareth Houses."

18 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

19 MR MacAULAY: You go on to say:

20 "The original response made reference to medical  
21 records being retained in the general archive. In fact,  
22 medical records were largely retained by the appropriate  
23 general practice or hospital, rather than by the  
24 congregation or any one establishment."

25 What's brought you to that conclusion, sister?

1           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, the medical records -- I think we  
2           heard from some of the sisters, even this week, that  
3           there were medical records they kept, what they called  
4           medical records, in-house, which were recording their  
5           children's weight and maybe general(?) visits and  
6           immunisation and things. But the medical records, you  
7           know, due to illness or the GPs, those would have been  
8           kept in the GP practice.

9           MR MacAULAY: I understand that, so if a child visited a GP  
10          and perhaps even if a GP came to see a child and made a  
11          record, the GP would keep that record.

12          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

13          MR MacAULAY: There would still be some medical records of  
14          a type kept?

15          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes. In-house ones, yes.

16          MR MacAULAY: Can I go back then to the response again and  
17          turn to page 0279. This section at 4.6 is dealing with  
18          staffing. The question is asked:

19                 "What policies and/or procedures did the  
20                 organisation/establishment have in relation to staffing  
21                 at the establishment?"

22                 The answer is:

23                 "The congregation had guidelines in place  
24                 in relation to staffing at each house. These were  
25                 usually not written."

1           Have you come across any written guidelines over the  
2           period that we're concerned with?

3           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I haven't.

4           CHRISTINE HUGHES: No.

5           MR MacAULAY: You go on to say:

6                     "In the early days, the congregation had no staff;  
7                     rather the congregation relied on the sisters. There  
8                     was one sister allocated to each group. On occasion  
9                     they were assisted by older children or those who had  
10                    moved on from being resident in Nazareth House and did  
11                    not have employment."

12                   If I can just focus on that response, when you say  
13                    "no staff", does that include cleaning staff?

14           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, that was what I had been told by  
15            sisters: that they had no staff. This is going back to  
16            maybe the 1940s and 1950s. I'm not sure about cleaning  
17            staff.

18           MR MacAULAY: Would that explain why fairly manual tasks may  
19            have had to be carried out by the children, at least  
20            insofar as the evidence tends to suggest that?

21           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, possibly, and also I think why  
22            children were taken to Mass with the sisters in the  
23            morning, because they had nobody to look after them, you  
24            know, during that period. That's my understanding.

25           MR MacAULAY: What period approximately are you talking

1 about? I know it's very difficult, but can you give me  
2 some understanding as to what period you think you're  
3 talking about there? Is it 1940s, 1950s, 1960s?

4 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I think into the 1950s I've heard  
5 sisters mention there were staff and certainly into the  
6 1960s, 1970s.

7 MR MacAULAY: But you go on to say that:

8 "In latter years, the congregation employed lay  
9 staff. There were no formal policies about who could be  
10 employed. Initially only female staff were employed.  
11 However, when children moved to smaller family groups  
12 both sexes would have worked with the children.  
13 In addition, the training and qualifications of the  
14 sisters in childcare, teaching and nursing increased."

15 And we have certainly heard evidence that some  
16 sisters went on training.

17 Can I pick up a couple of points from the next page,  
18 0280. You say:

19 "There are no records for pre-employment checks."

20 But again, I suppose you would say, in those days  
21 pre-employment checks were not so prevalent.

22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's right.

23 MR MacAULAY: Can I pick up the fifth bullet point, that's  
24 the transfer of sisters between establishments. You may  
25 have answered this already, but we have heard evidence



1 of a sister who may have developed a rapport with  
2 a particular group in Scotland and moving to another  
3 Nazareth House in Scotland after two or three years,  
4 whatever it may be, and on the face of it it doesn't  
5 look like the most ideal form of practice. Can you help  
6 me as to why that was the position?

7 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Certainly looking back on it now, it  
8 wasn't an ideal form, but the congregation had a large  
9 numbers of sisters at that time and one change maybe  
10 made other changes happen, you know. I think there was  
11 also the perception that they didn't want the sisters to  
12 get attached to the children and vice versa.

13 MR MacAULAY: So that, you think, fed into this particular  
14 approach?

15 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

16 MR MacAULAY: If I can take you on to page 0285, towards the  
17 bottom of the page, there's a section, 4.8, that deals  
18 with volunteers. The question is asked:

19 "What policies and/or procedures did the  
20 organisation/establishment have in place in relation to  
21 volunteers at the establishment?"

22 The answer is:

23 "As far as we are aware, there were no formal  
24 written policies or procedures. There were only  
25 volunteers at Edinburgh and Aberdeen. There were no

1 volunteers at Kilmarnock or Glasgow."

2 And I think that's something you do want to revise,  
3 sister; is that right?

4 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, in light of the evidence and in  
5 light of the recent court case. We had no records of  
6 volunteers at Glasgow and the sisters I have spoken to  
7 had said there was no volunteers or they couldn't  
8 remember such as on that basis. But we have revised  
9 that now.

10 MR MacAULAY: If we look at that then. At NAZ.001.003.9372,  
11 at 4.8, we're now told that:

12 "The congregation's original response stated that  
13 there were no volunteers at Kilmarnock or Glasgow  
14 (Cardonald). That was incorrect. The congregation now  
15 understands that there were volunteers at Cardonald.  
16 Reference is made to the evidence relating to  
17 Joseph Duffy. It follows that the response for  
18 Cardonald in relation to the existence of policies,  
19 whether those were adhered to and whether records were  
20 kept are incorrect. The congregation does not have any  
21 document to show that there was a written policy  
22 relating to volunteers at Cardonald."

23 And if there was, it has not been kept?

24 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct.

25 MR MacAULAY: I think the evidence in relation to Mr Duffy

1           was he was a regular attender at Cardonald. Were you  
2           present when that evidence was given?

3           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I wasn't.

4           MR MacAULAY: You were asked at page 0291, if we go back to  
5           the response, about internal investigations, and I think  
6           in short there have been no formal internal  
7           investigations in connection with any of the  
8           Nazareth Houses in Scotland.

9           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: In relation to abuse, do you mean?

10          MR MacAULAY: Or any complaints.

11          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, there wasn't.

12          MR MacAULAY: But there were no formal policies in place in  
13          connection with such investigations?

14          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, there wasn't.

15          MR MacAULAY: On page 0293, you begin a section -- it's  
16          4.11 -- that provides the inquiry with information in  
17          connection with child migration. You'll be pleased to  
18          hear, sister, I don't propose to ask you about that  
19          today, but that is for another day.

20          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, so I believe.

21          MR MacAULAY: I think you understand that.

22          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

23          MR MacAULAY: If I take you to page 0298, this is the  
24          section I looked at already with Christine. That's at  
25          4.12, dealing with records.

1           You propose some revisals to that section as well;  
2           is that right, sister?

3       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

4       MR MacAULAY:  If we go back to the letter at page 9372,  
5           towards the bottom you draw attention to 4.12 and what  
6           you say is:

7           "It is clear that the admission and discharge  
8           records are not wholly accurate."

9           I just want to understand what your basis for  
10          that is.

11       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  We don't have the books for all the  
12          houses and even the ones we have, there's gaps maybe.

13       MR MacAULAY:  We've already talked about visitors' books and  
14          punishment books.  You also go on to say:

15          "Child case conference minutes were not consistently  
16          made and retained."

17          And I think as we've heard, really we only have the  
18          one short period of time over which such records exist.

19       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.  The ones I've seen.  During that  
20          period we had a sister who was a social worker in  
21          Cardonald and who did aftercare with the children, and  
22          in those records there's records of case conferences and  
23          things that she held with -- there was a priest in  
24          charge and another lady.

25       MR MacAULAY:  Very well.

1           Can I then turn to part D of the response.  These  
2           will be questions for yourself, sister.

3           Again, I think you've sought to amend some aspects  
4           of what's in part D.  Let's look at how this begins.  
5           Here what is being sought is information in connection  
6           with abuse.  The first question is at 5.1 -- this is on  
7           NAZ.001.003.4883.

8           As I've just said, the question that was being asked  
9           is:

10           "What was the nature of abuse and/or alleged abuse  
11           of children cared for at the establishment, for example,  
12           sexual abuse, physical abuse, emotional abuse?"

13           And what you've done is provide appendices to this  
14           part of the report, which are lists of complaints, both  
15           civil, to the police, and criminal; is that right?

16           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  That's correct, yes.

17           MR MacAULAY:  These are quite detailed and lengthy  
18           appendices.

19           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

20           MR MacAULAY:  And I don't propose to put them on the screen  
21           because they have names and their redaction would be  
22           virtually impossible.

23           What you've also done is you've provided numbers --  
24           I think under the heading "Extent", you're asked the  
25           question:

1           "What is the organisation's assessment of the scale  
2           and extent of abuse of children cared for at the  
3           establishment?"

4           And you have four bullet points. The first bullet  
5           point, I think you've sought to amend that in a recent  
6           amendment, as to the numbers of complaints.

7           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

8           MR MacAULAY: Can you remember offhand or do I need to put  
9           it on the screen for you? I'll put it on the screen.  
10          It's NAZ .001.003.9374.

11          So here we have the amendment for specific  
12          complaints whereas in the previous version you had 109  
13          complaints, has that gone up to 122?

14          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, recent ones.

15          MR MacAULAY: Therefore since section D was prepared, these  
16          additional complaints have come in?

17          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, in the last year, roughly.

18          MR MacAULAY: If we go back to -- well, we can look on the  
19          page we have on the screen -- you provide a breakdown to  
20          which locations the complaints relate. More for  
21          Aberdeen than others, although Cardonald's not too far  
22          behind.

23          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct, yes.

24          MR MacAULAY: Just to be clear then, insofar as complaints  
25          are concerned, are these complaints of abuse of some

1 kind or another at these establishments?

2 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, various types of abuse, and in  
3 some cases there's no -- they haven't -- in the  
4 complaint that's put in, there's no name for who the  
5 abuser may have been.

6 MR MacAULAY: Of course we have that in evidence as well,  
7 particularly the further back you go.

8 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: These complaints, are they made by a letter or  
10 email? What's the general -- how are they done?

11 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Generally, they come in in a letter and  
12 then we pass it on to our solicitors and insurers and to  
13 Police Scotland and to Catholic Safeguarding in  
14 Scotland.

15 MR MacAULAY: If we go back then to the response itself at  
16 NAZ.001.003.4883, in the second bullet point, you say  
17 there are 270 civil actions; is that correct?

18 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

19 MR MacAULAY: Were these the actions that were raised and  
20 were faced with the time bar issues?

21 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: As far as I remember, yes.

22 MR MacAULAY: Again, you provide us with a breakdown of  
23 these. For example, 117 concern Aberdeen.

24 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

25 MR MacAULAY: Just so I can be clear about this, and you may

1           have answered this on your previous occasion, but are  
2           the civil actions dealing with people quite separately  
3           from the complaints?

4       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes, they were, yes.

5       MR MacAULAY:  If we add them together then we get an  
6           understanding of the total number of people who have  
7           approached the order, if I can put it that way, one way  
8           or another?

9       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

10      MR MacAULAY:  When you mention 24 criminal proceedings,  
11           which is the next bullet point, that's perhaps somewhat  
12           misleading.  Does that, in the main, relate to  
13           Sister Alphonso?

14      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

15      MR MacAULAY:  So there weren't 24 quite separate criminal  
16           investigations into 24 separate people; that includes  
17           a number of the charges that involved Sister Alphonso?

18      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.  I'm sorry, it is a bit  
19           misleading.

20      MR MacAULAY:  It is misleading.  It looks worse than it is,  
21           if I can put it that way.

22           You also go on to say that:

23           "The organisation has records of 113 police  
24           investigations."

25           Is that a broader matter then?  Does that relate to



1 more individual sisters rather than just  
2 Sister Alphonso?

3 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: We've had correspondence from the  
4 police looking for various information, especially since  
5 the inquiry started, relating to -- on the whole,  
6 I think, it's sisters who are deceased that have been  
7 mentioned.

8 MR MacAULAY: Yes. If I can take you then, sister, to  
9 page 4885. Here you're being asked about the timing of  
10 disclosure of the complaint and, in particular, when  
11 were disclosures and complaints of abuse first made.  
12 What you say is:

13 "As far as we can tell, the earliest complaint was  
14 made against the congregation on 1 July 1997. The  
15 earliest court action was raised against the  
16 congregation on 14 October 1997."

17 We understand this from the evidence, that there is  
18 quite a significant gap in time between the closing of  
19 the children's units at the different houses and the  
20 first complaint being made.

21 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct, yes. Most of the  
22 houses were closed by the mid-1980s.

23 MR MacAULAY: Sister, you have been present for parts of the  
24 evidence and you've listened to applicants and you say  
25 you've read transcripts. Are you able to provide

1 a general reaction to the evidence that you've heard?  
2 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, it's been very painful listening  
3 to the evidence from the applicants and the alleged  
4 treatment that they got during their time in care with  
5 the sisters. I would like to take this opportunity to  
6 apologise to them very wholeheartedly that, if they did  
7 experience abuse or mistreatment during their time  
8 in the care of the sisters, I would certainly want to  
9 apologise for that. We wouldn't want any child to be  
10 treated badly or have bad memories of their time, which  
11 many of them seem to have.

12 MR MacAULAY: I think we know that -- sister, you may have  
13 been present, I can't remember -- Sister Alphonso in  
14 evidence did accept that she was correctly convicted.

15 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's correct.

16 MR MacAULAY: Were you present for that?

17 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I was, yes.

18 MR MacAULAY: The archbishop yesterday seemed to suggest  
19 that she had accepted that at the time. That wasn't my  
20 understanding. Was he right or wrong about that?

21 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, it wasn't my understanding either  
22 that she did at the time.

23 LADY SMITH: I couldn't understand how the prosecution  
24 proceeded to trial and verdict if she had accepted it  
25 at the time.

1           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.  It was my understanding that ...

2           LADY SMITH:  And that seemed to be her position in evidence.

3           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

4           LADY SMITH:  So at least when it comes to Sister Alphonso,

5                    the apology you offer is not a conditional one?  It's

6                    not if abuse happened, you're accepted that it happened;

7                    is that right?

8           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Oh yes, and in the case of the others,

9                    Joseph Duffy and I think Peter Blaney was another one.

10                   Certainly that was proven.

11          MR MacAULAY:  Is your apology -- to what extent is it

12                    conditional in relation to some of the evidence that has

13                    been provided to the inquiry?  You've heard witnesses

14                    being emotional at times when giving evidence and so on

15                    and you've heard what they had to say.  Are you

16                    apologising unreservedly without condition?  I just want

17                    to understand what your position is, sister.

18          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes, I'm apologising unreservedly that

19                    if any of those things did happen to them in our care

20                    because, as I said, we wouldn't want that to happen to

21                    any child.

22          MR MacAULAY:  Okay.

23          LADY SMITH:  So if one takes the witnesses you heard as

24                    opposed to the ones whose evidence you've only read

25                    in the transcripts, the ones you've heard and seen,

1           you are not able or willing to go as far as telling me  
2           whether or not you, having done that, accept that what  
3           they were saying is to be believed?

4       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, I'm not saying I disbelieve them.  
5           That's their record of their experience of their time in  
6           care with us. We wouldn't want them to have had that  
7           experience, certainly.

8       LADY SMITH: If you're not disbelieving them, are you  
9           telling them you believe them?

10      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, I believe what they told --  
11           I mean, they gave their evidence under oath, so I have  
12           no reason to disbelieve them.

13      LADY SMITH: Thank you.

14      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: And listening to the effect, you know,  
15           it's had on their lives afterwards as well. As I say,  
16           it's very painful for us to listen to that and to think  
17           that any of our sisters were the cause of that and  
18           didn't live up to our values.

19      LADY SMITH: Thank you.

20      MR MacAULAY: Can I come back to you, Christine, for  
21           a moment or two and just put some questions to you that  
22           I've been asked to raise with you.

23           You have described in your statement the role you  
24           played in preparing the response to the Section 21  
25           notice. Are you able to give us any understanding of

1           how much time you devoted to that work?

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES: All I can say is I have done no other  
3           work at all, so my contracted working hours are 21 hours  
4           a week, and I would say that I've exceeded those most  
5           weeks since this inquiry's been going on.

6           MR MacAULAY: For this inquiry?

7           CHRISTINE HUGHES: For this inquiry and related police  
8           investigations that have come up since this inquiry  
9           started.

10          MR MacAULAY: Have you endeavoured to provide this inquiry  
11          with as accurate and comprehensive information as  
12          possible?

13          CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, I have.

14          MR MacAULAY: Sister Anna, I now propose to put to you  
15          a number of documents that I have been asked to put to  
16          you. The first of these is at NAZ.001.003.9171.

17                 We're looking at the front cover of a book with the  
18          title "Victoire Larmenier: Spirit and vision". We can  
19          see that Peter Hughes, who I think is your father,  
20          Christine --

21          CHRISTINE HUGHES: That's right, yes.

22          MR MacAULAY: -- is one of the authors.

23                 Can you tell us a little bit about this work,  
24          sister?

25          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: This is a work Christine's father was

1           working on for quite a number of years and,  
2           unfortunately, he passed away last year before it was  
3           actually printed; he never saw it in print. It aims to  
4           give a history of our foundation and the early years of  
5           the congregation when our founders came over from France  
6           and set up the congregation in London.

7           MR MacAULAY: I have been provided with -- apart from having  
8           the book, I have been provided with a number of extracts  
9           that you considered might be helpful to provide the  
10          inquiry with an insight into.

11          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

12          MR MacAULAY: Are you able to do that for us? Would you  
13          need to have the document on the screen?

14          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, please.

15          MR MacAULAY: Can we start then at page 9172?

16          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Can I just say, we only got the book  
17          in April, so I've read it once.

18          MR MacAULAY: This extract, is it giving some historical  
19          background?

20          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that extract refers to when the  
21          sisters used to go out collecting, and I think we've  
22          heard some reference during the inquiry about that as  
23          well, that up to probably the 1970s, in Scotland, the  
24          sisters still went out collecting because the payments  
25          for both the residents and the children weren't enough

1 to cover the expenses of the houses.

2 MR MacAULAY: Certainly we've seen from the sisters'

3 employment registers that there were usually at least

4 two nuns out collecting locally.

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct, yes.

6 MR MacAULAY: And that was a full-time commitment?

7 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes. They also went round a diocese

8 and they had to have permission from the bishop to

9 collect in the diocese, but they would have gone to, you

10 know, faraway places and stayed away for a week.

11 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, it's nearly 1 o'clock. It may be

12 helpful to Sister Anna if she were to be given a copy of

13 the extracts.

14 Would that help you, sister, to remind you?

15 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

16 MR MacAULAY: Because there's quite a number of them and

17 we can get a copy to you of what's been sent to us.

18 LADY SMITH: Yes. Let's do that and we can return after the

19 lunch break. Thank you.

20 (12.57 pm)

21 (The lunch adjournment)

22 (2.00 pm)

23 LADY SMITH: Yes, Mr MacAulay.

24 MR MacAULAY: Good afternoon. Sister, I think before lunch

25 you were going to take us to the work by Peter Hughes

1           and Eileen Pickard on Victoire Larmenier and I think  
2           you have extracts of that in front of you.

3           NAZ.001.003.9172. I think we jump into the story at  
4           a point in time when Victoire was trying to set up her  
5           own order.

6       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's correct, yes. I think, having  
7           looked at this in the lunch break, you may have been  
8           sent too many pages of this mistakenly.

9       MR MacAULAY: That's good news.

10      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I don't think it has any reference to  
11           the inquiry apart from showing about the Aberdeen  
12           foundation and that was the first foundation outside of  
13           London after we were founded, and that was in 1862. And  
14           also it shows from the beginning we cared for elderly  
15           residents and children.

16      MR MacAULAY: Yes.

17      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: The rest of the pages really go on  
18           about more of the foundations and how that was carried  
19           out.

20      MR MacAULAY: There was some controversy about it when it  
21           was being set up, when the order was being set up,  
22           in that I think she was trying to break away from  
23           another order, the Little Sisters of the Poor?

24      SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, she had joined the Little Sisters  
25           of the Poor. Then they were a pious organisation. She



1           joined them in France. A group of them were sent to  
2           London to make a foundation for that organisation, but  
3           when she got to London, that's when the breakaway  
4           started. Some of the sisters went back to Rennes, and  
5           Victoire and a few other sisters stayed in London and  
6           then went through a long process of setting up the  
7           Sisters of Nazareth and breaking away from the other  
8           organisation, and from there then they set up the other  
9           houses around the world gradually.

10       MR MacAULAY: As you said, Aberdeen was --

11       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: The first one outside London.

12       MR MacAULAY: Is there anything else in particular you want  
13           to draw attention to, sister?

14       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No. Having looked through it now,  
15           there wasn't anything, I don't think, relevant to us  
16           here.

17       MR MacAULAY: One thing that struck me is this practice of  
18           removing somebody's heart for preservation.

19       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's a French custom.

20       MR MacAULAY: And that happened?

21       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: It did indeed. Victoire's heart is in  
22           Hammersmith, preserved.

23       MR MacAULAY: But by the time she died, I think we read from  
24           here, the congregation had established eight houses  
25           altogether. Was that in the UK or in a broader field?

1       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Somewhere in Ireland and I think ...

2       MR MacAULAY:  Cardiff as well, I think?

3       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.  Northampton and Belfast.

4       MR MacAULAY:  Perhaps then if there's nothing else in

5               particular that you want to draw attention to, you have

6               provided -- there's also provided an appendix which sets

7               out significant dates of the history.

8       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  That's right, yes.

9       MR MacAULAY:  The other thing, sister, that I've been asked

10              to raise with you relates to a number of letters or

11              testimonials that either you, or I think on some

12              occasions it might have been Archbishop Conti, received.

13              Perhaps I can begin by putting on the screen

14              NAZ.001.003.9210.

15              This is a letter addressed to one of the solicitors

16              at Clyde & Co dated 6 April this year.

17       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes, that's right.

18       MR MacAULAY:  This is someone who tells us that -- I think

19              it's a lady -- had been a class teacher from August 1961

20              to April 1963 in Edinburgh and that she moved to

21              Aberdeen and worked at St Peter's from September to the

22              end of 1963; is that right?

23       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  That's right, yes.

24       MR MacAULAY:  Essentially, what she's saying is that:

25              "During [her] three months [and it was only three

1 months that she was there] the Nazareth children  
2 appeared suitably dressed, clean and well groomed and  
3 [she] was never aware of any child having bruises or  
4 complaining about being hurt or sore."

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's correct.

6 MR MacAULAY: I have picked on that particular letter and  
7 it's a fairly lengthy letter. Is there any particular  
8 part of it you'd like to draw attention to?

9 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: She did say in the class that the  
10 children from Nazareth House played up, for want of  
11 a better word, and were hard to handle.

12 MR MacAULAY: She does say that the class was extremely  
13 disruptive.

14 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

15 MR MacAULAY: The next letter is at 9211. I'm not sure to  
16 whom this was addressed. Can you tell me? Do you know?  
17 It just says, "To whom it may concern". We can clarify  
18 that with Clyde & Co. It is dated, again, quite  
19 recently, even more recently, 8 May 2018.

20 Have you seen it before?

21 CHRISTINE HUGHES: I have a feeling I might have seen it  
22 before, in which case it was probably in the archive.  
23 I'm not sure.

24 MR MacAULAY: It wouldn't be; it's dated 8 May 2018.

25 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Oh no, sorry.

1 MR MacAULAY: Can we look at what's being said; again, it's  
2 a lady who's writing this. She says:

3 "[Her] interaction with the Sisters of Nazareth in  
4 Aberdeen began in 1966 when [she] joined the teaching  
5 staff at St Peter's School."

6 She goes on to talk about at least two of the  
7 sisters, that's Mother [REDACTED] LKM, who she had spent time  
8 with, and also Sister Alphonso. Do you see that in the  
9 third paragraph?

10 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

11 MR MacAULAY: She tells us that she offered to speak on her  
12 behalf at her trial.

13 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

14 MR MacAULAY: That's what she says, as a character witness.

15 In relation to her connection, she says in the third  
16 paragraph:

17 "I was unaware of anything untoward or inappropriate  
18 in the manner in which the children were looked after.  
19 Such is my relationship with sisters that when I was  
20 married in 1968, Sister [REDACTED] FAF brought a delegation  
21 of children to the church to see me as the bride."

22 Do you see that?

23 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

24 MR MacAULAY: Then there's some discussion about a child  
25 that was taken into foster care by her parents. Then

1 she talks in the last paragraph about someone who hasn't  
2 given evidence directly to the inquiry, but this person  
3 came to live -- he was at Nazareth House Aberdeen, came  
4 to live with her and her two children, staying for about  
5 a year or two. This person kept paying regular visits  
6 to Nazareth House to see Sister [REDACTED] LRY who had been  
7 the last sister in charge of his group and he seemed  
8 very fond of her.

9 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

10 MR MacAULAY: Is there anything else in that particular  
11 letter, sister, that you'd want to draw particular  
12 attention to? We will, of course, be reading these in  
13 any event.

14 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes. No, there's nothing further  
15 I want to add.

16 MR MacAULAY: Then the next one is at 9213. This is dated  
17 13 May 2018. This is a particularly long letter, five  
18 pages. Again, it's a lady. It begins by saying:

19 "Dear Isla ..."

20 And that's to one of the solicitors at Clyde & Co:

21 "Further to my telephone call in response to some of  
22 the recent stories in the news concerning the children  
23 of Nazareth House Cardonald and Aberdeen, I wish to  
24 respond and refute some of the information published by  
25 journalists."

1           She makes reference to a friend of hers and she goes  
2 on to say:

3           "However, [her friend] told me to let you know that  
4 some years ago she forwarded her comments to  
5 Cardinal Winning when the alleged abuses were first  
6 aired. She thinks her letter relating to that  
7 particular abuse enquiry will have been kept."

8           At the bottom:

9           "I certainly have no qualms in discussing my  
10 experiences and wish strongly to rebut some of things  
11 the press has reported happening during the 1940s and  
12 1950s when I was a child in the Cardonald  
13 Nazareth House.

14           "What I have to say about Aberdeen refers to the  
15 burials in the crypt there. The children in Cardonald  
16 changed places for a holiday period of two weeks a year  
17 with the girls residing in Aberdeen. This swap started  
18 in the 1950s."

19           She goes on to say that there were coffins in the  
20 crypt, but they could only be viewed through a grille  
21 and she doubts as to whether any child could have gained  
22 access to the crypt. Towards the bottom of that second  
23 page she says:

24           "Now, regarding the press' reporting of the  
25 Cardonald happenings by someone known as Margaret, there

1           were several girls known by that name there. I would  
2           know this particular Margaret as the period spoken about  
3           coincides with some of the time I spent there too."

4           And she goes on, at 9215, essentially, as  
5           I understand it, to refute evidence that was given about  
6           whether a nun took a girl to a [REDACTED] LVS [REDACTED] and that  
7           girl was sexually abused. She puts forward reasons why  
8           she does not consider that could have happened. I think  
9           that's the thrust of what she says.

10          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes. This lady actually rang me and  
11          I put her in touch with the solicitor.

12          MR MacAULAY: I see.

13          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Going back to the crypt at Aberdeen,  
14          I can confirm there was a crypt at Aberdeen where the  
15          sisters were buried. When the house was closed, the  
16          bodies were taken from there and buried in the local  
17          cemetery.

18          MR MacAULAY: Were you ever yourself at the crypt?

19          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: No, I was never in Aberdeen.

20          MR MacAULAY: Perhaps on page 9216, towards the top, she  
21          disputes the suggestion made that Margaret was made to  
22          stand for hours with her wet linen. That, she says, is  
23          disputed. Do you see that towards the top?

24          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I see that, yes.

25          MR MacAULAY: She also doubts the story about the boy having

1 to wipe the brow of a dead nun. That's another point  
2 she makes.

3 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

4 MR MacAULAY: She says in the next paragraph that the nuns  
5 did not visit the dormitories at night. That's her  
6 recollection.

7 I think after that -- I may be wrong, but I think  
8 the testimonial letters after that are more historical.  
9 If we look at page 9219, I think this is a letter that's  
10 dated 10 September 2016. It's not clear to whom it's  
11 addressed, but my understanding of it is that the writer  
12 is seeking to -- how shall I put it -- support one of  
13 the sisters.

14 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, I recognise that. It was one of  
15 the sisters. She actually didn't give evidence in the  
16 end; her statement was read out.

17 MR MacAULAY: Correct. I think the point the writer's  
18 making is this particular sister went to the  
19 Nazareth House in Sligo and really transformed her  
20 brother into a much more outgoing sort of child; is that  
21 the essence of it?

22 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: That's the thrust of it, yes.

23 MR MacAULAY: It's highly complimentary of the particular  
24 sister.

25 The next letter at 9220. Again, this writer, this



1 person -- and this is dated 18 March 2016 -- the writer  
2 is once again, I think, complimentary of that same  
3 sister. It's when he was in Nazareth House in  
4 Middlesbrough; is that your understanding here?

5 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, that's right.

6 MR MacAULAY: He says towards the bottom:

7 "From the outset I was acutely aware that this  
8 sister had a very clear vocation to work with children  
9 and was an individual that delighted in the challenge of  
10 creating a climate of stability and normality for the  
11 children that found themselves at Nazareth House and  
12 in the care system for whatever reason."

13 So again, it's complimentary and I think it's  
14 dealing with a time period of about 1978.

15 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes. Mm-hm.

16 MR MacAULAY: He goes on, on the second page, 9211, to say  
17 that:

18 "Sister Oliver ..."

19 I have mentioned the name but I don't think that  
20 matters very much:

21 "... never countenanced the use of corporal  
22 punishment, physical chastisement or methods of  
23 restraint."

24 Do you remember reading that?

25 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, I do, yes.

1 MR MacAULAY: He concludes by saying:

2 "I have numerous affectionate anecdotes of my time  
3 in care and, if the court wishes, I will be more than  
4 happy to provide additional information and testimony in  
5 order to assist the court in arriving at an informed and  
6 just outcome in this matter."

7 This is in 2016.

8 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: The next one is at 9315. This is a letter  
10 dated -- this is addressed to the sisters and it's dated  
11 13 March 1998. You can see that it begins by saying:

12 "As a former boy and proud member of Nazareth House  
13 Lasswade, I have fond memories of my time at  
14 Nazareth House, and I am sure I am not the only one.  
15 Therefore, I was very disappointed at recent remarks and  
16 comments made about us."

17 And he mentions in the final paragraph that he was  
18 in Nazareth House between the 1940s and 1960s;  
19 do you see that?

20 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes, I see that, yes.

21 MR MacAULAY: We then go on to 9321. It's dated  
22 17 June 1997 and it begins by saying:

23 "I write in response to your letter in the  
24 Evening Express of 17 June 197."

25 And we know that Archbishop Conti had a letter

1 published at that time, so this appears to have been in  
2 response to that.

3 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I heard yesterday about that, yes.

4 MR MacAULAY: The author goes on to say:

5 "I have been most disturbed by the series of  
6 allegations made in the Evening Express regarding the  
7 treatment of children at Nazareth House."

8 And then -- and I think this is a lady although it's  
9 not 100 per cent clear -- she goes on to say that she  
10 lived with her family in a location and had many  
11 acquaintances and friends who lived in Nazareth House.  
12 In the third paragraph she says:

13 "I have difficulty in reconciling many of the  
14 allegations with my experiences as a teacher in the  
15 early seventies, who taught children from Nazareth House  
16 at St Peter's Primary School."

17 Again, that's defending the order.

18 SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

19 MR MacAULAY: The next one is 3331, I think. This is  
20 addressed to a particular sister. It just says:

21 "I have never forgotten you or the kindness and care  
22 you showed to me and my sister and other children you  
23 looked after."

24 I think this was Nazareth House Cardonald, this  
25 particular person; is that right?

1           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

2           MR MacAULAY:  So you recognise the letter, do you?

3           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  I do, yes.

4           MR MacAULAY:  I'm looking for a date.  But in any event,

5                    you've seen it and it's praising the work of that

6                    particular sister and the care she gave.

7           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

8           MR MacAULAY:  Then we come to 9333.  Again, it's addressed,

9                    I think, to the same sister, in fact.  It begins by

10                   saying:

11                        "I met Cardinal Winning.  I mentioned you and

12                        Nazareth House, I miss you and I thank you.  You have

13                        been a great comfort to me these last couple of months

14                        since my dad passed away."

15                        Again, thanking the sister for what she had done.

16           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

17           MR MacAULAY:  Next is 9334.  I think this may be the same

18                    person that's writing to the same sister.

19           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  The same sister, yes.  I think so.

20           MR MacAULAY:  Again, it's someone who's keeping in touch

21                    with that particular sister.

22           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

23           MR MacAULAY:  Then perhaps the last one is 9336.  This is

24                    quite a long letter, but again it's to that same sister,

25                    this letter is being written; is that right?

1           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

2           MR MacAULAY:  And again, it's keeping in touch and bringing  
3           the sister up to date with what this particular person's  
4           doing.

5           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.  She kept in touch with her over  
6           a number of years and still is in touch maybe with her,  
7           I'm not sure.

8           MR MacAULAY:  I think that does cover the particular letters  
9           that I've been asked to give.  I have been giving  
10          evidence for the last 20 minutes!

11          Can I ask you just one further point, sister.  
12          In the folder in front of you, you'll get what we call  
13          a key.

14          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  At the front?

15          MR MacAULAY:  At the very front, yes.  You'll see, and  
16          you'll know this from the evidence, that pseudonyms have  
17          been given for the real names of the individuals;  
18          do you see that?

19          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes, I do.

20          MR MacAULAY:  That's the pseudonyms Jennifer and Trisha.  
21          This was an incident where these twin girls were at  
22          Cardonald and there was some dispute about -- there was  
23          some issue about who their parents were and, in  
24          particular, we saw evidence from records that suggested  
25          that their mother visited at Cardonald.  I think the

1           order was asked to look into this to see whether or not  
2           you could throw any light on that situation and also  
3           indeed why there was this separation and one of the  
4           sisters was sent to another place where there weren't  
5           any children.

6           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, to another part of the country,  
7           yes.

8           MR MacAULAY: Run by another order.

9           SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Yes.

10          MR MacAULAY: Can you help on that at all?

11          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: I'm afraid it's a bit of a mystery to  
12           all of us. I did contact a former staff member who did  
13           give evidence to the inquiry, but the person that was  
14           sent away wasn't actually in Glasgow when this person  
15           started work, so she couldn't throw any light on the  
16           subject.

17           Then there was a letter or an envelope with one of  
18           the sisters' names on, who's actually living where I am  
19           in London, and I asked her about that, but she didn't  
20           recognise and she said the handwriting wasn't hers.

21          MR MacAULAY: So have you effectively come to a dead end,  
22           have you?

23          SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Well, yes, it's all a bit of a mystery  
24           that there are records there somewhere saying her mother  
25           visited but the person concerned has no recollection of

1           that. I think Christine may have looked into that, too.

2           CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes, I've looked again at all the  
3           possible places in the records where there might be any  
4           additional information and I didn't find anything at all  
5           other than what was given in.

6           MR MacAULAY: I can perhaps put on the screen what we looked  
7           at. This is one case where there is -- it bears to be  
8           case conference material. That's NAZ.001.003.5014.

9           This, as we can see from the top, is headed:

10           "Childcare case conference held at Nazareth House  
11           Cardonald on 9 December 1964.

12           "The Reverend [REDACTED] opened the meeting ..."

13           And then apologies for the absence of Miss McQueen  
14           and a discussion about the outcome of recommendations  
15           made at the recent meeting.

16           The name that's being blanked out relates to  
17           Jennifer. Then at the bottom, if I move down the page  
18           a bit, there's a heading:

19           "Outcome of recommendations made at recent  
20           meetings."

21           And we've blanked out the name "Jennifer" and the  
22           note there is:

23           "Wrote to Mrs [and that's Jennifer's surname] and  
24           await reply."

25           So there's clearly correspondence between the home

1           and this lady who was perceived to be the mother of  
2           Jennifer.

3                     Christine, you can't help on that?

4   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  No.  I mean, there was, I think, if  
5           I remember correctly, a further comment about the mother  
6           as well.

7   MR MacAULAY:  Yes.

8   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  But everything that we found relating to  
9           the two applicants we gave in.  There was nothing  
10          further anywhere.

11   LADY SMITH:  Are there further comments?  Are you thinking  
12          about the ones that are just on the next page?  If  
13          we can go on to that at 5015.

14   MR MacAULAY:  Yes.

15   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  Yes.

16   SISTER ANNA DOOLAN:  Yes.

17   MR MacAULAY:  That is headed "Jennifer":

18                     "Miss [Jennifer's mother] visited.  She will not be  
19           able to have Jennifer home when she leaves school and  
20           made no objections to our having Jennifer fostered."

21                     So there has been a little bit of contact?

22   CHRISTINE HUGHES:  It sounds as if there was, yes.

23   MR MacAULAY:  And we've also looked at previous entries  
24          where visits by the mother have been recorded, and  
25          you'll have seen these as well.



1 CHRISTINE HUGHES: Yes.

2 MR MacAULAY: But notwithstanding all that information, you  
3 can't take us any further on this one?

4 CHRISTINE HUGHES: No, I'm afraid not.

5 MR MacAULAY: Very well, both of you, thank you very much  
6 indeed for giving your evidence and answering my  
7 questions.

8 I have sought to cover the questions that I have  
9 been asked to put to you, but if I have missed out any  
10 of the testimonials, no doubt my learned friend  
11 Mr Lindsay will point that out.

12 LADY SMITH: Can I check whether there are any outstanding  
13 applications for questions? No.

14 Sister Anna, Christine, thank you very much for  
15 engaging with the inquiry and so diligently --  
16 particularly for the hours that I can see have been put  
17 in in the archive. We do understand this is not an easy  
18 task but equally I'm sure you understand how important  
19 it is that we do all we can to uncover any relevant  
20 record for our work.

21 I'm now able to let you both go, I think -- for  
22 today, in your case, Sister Anna. Possibly, I don't  
23 know, whether child migrants are going to involve you as  
24 well, Christine, but certainly that will be another day  
25 later. In the meantime, thank you very much.

1           Sister Anna, can I also thank you. I have seen how  
2           often you've been in attendance and I'm sure that  
3           assists the order in understanding what's been happening  
4           here. It is plain that you have been working hard to  
5           assist and support the sisters who have come to give  
6           evidence. That must have been a tiring job for you to  
7           do, but I thank you for committing yourself to the  
8           inquiry in this way.

9       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: Thank you, and I'd just like to say  
10           thank you to you, Lady Smith, and Colin and all the team  
11           here at the inquiry -- especially the teams who came out  
12           to take the sisters' statements. They were so kind and  
13           understanding to them, so we appreciate that as well.

14       LADY SMITH: Thank you.

15       SISTER ANNA DOOLAN: And wish you all the best with the rest  
16           of the inquiry.

17       LADY SMITH: Thank you very much indeed.

18                               (The witnesses withdrew)

19       LADY SMITH: So where does that leave us now, Mr MacAulay?  
20           Next week?

21       MR MacAULAY: That leaves us to adjourn to next Tuesday for  
22           submissions.

23       LADY SMITH: Very well. I'll rise now and we are sitting  
24           again at 10 o'clock next Tuesday to hear the first of  
25           the series of closing submissions that will be presented

1           on Tuesday and probably into Wednesday as well next  
2           week.

3           MR MacAULAY: That's a possibility, my Lady.

4           LADY SMITH: We've got Wednesday pencilled in if necessary,  
5           but people don't need to feel they're required to fill  
6           those two days.

7           Thank you very much.

8           (2.32 pm)

9                           (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am  
10                           on Tuesday, 3 July 2018)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

INDEX

1

2       SISTER ANNA MARIE DOOLAN (sworn) .....1

3       CHRISTINE HUGHES (sworn) .....1

4       Questions from MR MacAULAY .....1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25