

1 Friday, 8 July 2022

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning.

4 We return today to a mix of witnesses in person,
5 oral witnesses, and read-in, and we start, Ms Rattray,
6 with?

7 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, we start with an oral witness this
8 morning and this is a witness who's an applicant and has
9 the pseudonym 'Christine'.

10 'Christine' was in the care of the burgh of
11 Motherwell and Wishaw, later Strathclyde Regional
12 Council. She was in two foster placements.

13 The first was with Mr and Mrs [REDACTED] from
14 [REDACTED] 1971 to [REDACTED] 1973.

15 The second was with Mr and Mrs FLS/FLT, from
16 [REDACTED] 1973 to [REDACTED] 1983 and the current
17 responsible authority is North Lanarkshire Council.

18 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

19 'Christine' (sworn)

20 LADY SMITH: We need you to speak into the microphone,
21 'Christine'. That should be a good position for it to
22 pick you up.

23 A. Yes.

24 LADY SMITH: There's a red folder there. That has your
25 written statement in it that you signed. You'll be

1 taken to that in a minute or two. You'll also see your
2 statement being brought up on the screen and it will
3 move to different parts of it as we show the parts we'd
4 like to discuss during your evidence. You might find it
5 helpful, it's up to you whether you use it or not.

6 But 'Christine', separately from that, I just want
7 to assure you that I do know how difficult it is to face
8 up to giving evidence in public, and not just any
9 evidence, it's evidence about yourself, about your life,
10 particularly your life as a child, including things in
11 your childhood that were really difficult and may be
12 very hard to talk about.

13 I do understand that and I do understand that it can
14 feel upsetting and distressing at times. So if you want
15 a break at any time or just to pause where you are,
16 that's absolutely fine. You just let me know what would
17 work for you. If you need us to help you in some way to
18 really give your best evidence, because that's what
19 you're here to try and do, I know that, and I want to
20 give you the best chance we can to explain to us
21 yourself what you want us to know. All right?

22 A. Okay.

23 LADY SMITH: So let me know. Whatever it is, if it works
24 for you, it will work for me, I promise. If you're
25 ready, I'll hand over to Ms Rattray and she'll take it

1 from there.

2 A. Yeah.

3 LADY SMITH: Okay?

4 Ms Rattray.

5 Questions from Ms Rattray

6 MS RATTRAY: Good morning, 'Christine'.

7 A. Morning.

8 Q. 'Christine', what I'm going to do is I'm going to ask

9 you some questions based upon your statement, and as

10 you're aware you have a hard copy there and a copy of

11 your statement will also appear on the screen before

12 you.

13 I'll start by just asking you a few questions about

14 your background before you went into care.

15 Then obviously the main focus of what we'll be

16 talking about or you'll be talking about are your

17 experiences in foster care.

18 Then, towards the end of your evidence, I'll perhaps

19 ask you to look at one or two pages of your children's

20 records and then I'll ask you about any lessons that we

21 can learn from you in relation to keeping children safe

22 in care.

23 A. (Witness nods)

24 Q. To start with, if I could ask you to actually look at

25 the hard copy of your statement, and if you could turn

1 to the back page of that, the last page of your
2 statement, which is page 18, and I just want you to
3 confirm that you've signed your statement.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. You'll see at paragraph 76 above your signature you say:
6 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
7 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
8 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
9 true."

10 Is that right?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. That's fine. If you put that to one side again.
13 We're going to start at the beginning of your
14 statement and what you tell us, 'Christine', is that you
15 were born in 1967 and that you're one of five
16 children --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- in your birth family. That you have two older
19 sisters and an older brother and also a younger brother?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You tell us that you have no memories of family life
22 before you were taken into care?

23 A. No.

24 Q. You were very young?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. You say that you have some vague memories of
2 a children's home, which you now know was Kirknowe
3 Children's Home, is that right?
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. You tell us also that you vaguely remember being in
6 foster care with the [REDACTED] in Newmains?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. What, if anything, do you remember about that?
9 A. Oh, it's silly things. Like I remember they had twins,
10 a boy and a girlfriend, and the boy used to play the
11 accordion and I remember sitting on his knee and playing
12 the accordion with him. That's basically about it, to
13 be honest.
14 Q. The memories you have of life with the [REDACTED],
15 although you don't have very many memories, are they
16 good memories?
17 A. Well, as far as I know, yeah. I was happy there.
18 Q. Okay. In relation to that placement, I think you know
19 that your foster father died there.
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. And following upon his death, you were moved again.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. I think you're aware, I don't know whether you remember
24 it, but I think you're aware from your records because
25 you've seen your records before that whilst you were

1 with the [REDACTED] with I think your younger brother at
2 that time, is that something you remember?
3 A. My younger brother being at the [REDACTED]'?
4 Q. Yes.
5 A. No.
6 Q. You don't recall that?
7 A. No. As far as I'm aware, it was just me.
8 Q. Okay. And you moved from the [REDACTED] to live with
9 the FLS/FLT ?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. I think we know they are FLS/FLT ?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. But FLS [REDACTED] was called by a different name?
14 A. FLS [REDACTED].
15 Q. At page 2 of your statement from paragraph 5 you tell us
16 a bit about the FLS/FLT [REDACTED]. Where did they live?
17 A. It was in Cambusnethan in Wishaw.
18 Q. Who all lived in the household there?
19 A. At the time, my two siblings, my two sisters were both
20 there, and they also had two girls who were both
21 fostered, who then went on to -- they went on to adopt
22 them. And there was a boy as well, a handicapped boy.
23 Q. And the boy, was he fostered too?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. You talk of living in two houses. What was the first

1 house like?

2 A. In what way? What do you mean, what was it like?

3 Q. Can you describe what it looked like, how many rooms it

4 had --

5 A. Oh, it was an end terrace, I think it had three

6 bedrooms.

7 Q. Where did everyone sleep?

8 A. Right, okay. My foster parents slept in the living room

9 on a sofa bed. [REDACTED], that was the foster boy, he had

10 a room to himself. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] had one room and

11 me and my two sisters were in another room.

12 Q. At paragraph 9, turning to page 3 of your statement, you

13 talk about what you called or didn't call your foster

14 parents. Can you tell us about that?

15 A. Yeah, I never knew what to call them. I mean,

16 I couldn't -- obviously I couldn't call them mum or dad.

17 I think I called her mum once and [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]

18 jumped right down my throat, "She's not your mum, she's

19 our mum". I couldn't call them by their first names,

20 because that was disrespectful. So if I had to speak to

21 them, I had to kind of try and attract their attention

22 in some way and then speak to them.

23 Q. The other children in the house who were adopted by

24 them, they didn't like you calling your foster mum

25 "mum"?

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. Do you remember how old your foster parents were, what
3 kind of age? Were they quite a young couple or were
4 they an older couple?

5 A. I think they were much older. I mean, they just died
6 a couple of years ago and they were both in their '90s,
7 I think.

8 Q. Right, okay. Did your foster parents have jobs?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What were their jobs?

11 A. He was a long-distance lorry driver, so he could be away
12 for days at a time, and she worked in the local cinema.

13 Q. At paragraph 10 you tell us a little about what you
14 remember in relation to arriving at the [REDACTED]'. What
15 are your first memories there?

16 A. I honestly don't know. I've no idea. I can't remember.

17 Q. Okay. I think you tell us you can't remember who took
18 you to the [REDACTED] house, but you just remember
19 arriving in a car?

20 A. I can vaguely remember arriving in the car and I was
21 wearing -- I mean it's stupid things I remember. I was
22 wearing a wee knitted poncho with a knitted beret to
23 match. But that's about it.

24 Q. Do you remember anyone explaining to you what was
25 happening, as to why you were --

1 A. No.

2 Q. -- leaving one place and going somewhere else?

3 A. No.

4 Q. In relation to daily life in the foster home, I think

5 you tell us at paragraph 12 a little about meal times

6 and food. Who was it in the house who did the cooking?

7 A. It was usually us. We did all the cooking, all the

8 cleaning.

9 Q. When you say "us", who do you mean?

10 A. Like me, my sisters. Sometimes the other -- the other

11 siblings.

12 Q. What about the foster mum, FLS ? Did she do much

13 cooking?

14 A. Occasionally, but it was mostly left to us.

15 Q. I think you tell us about one time when you were asked

16 to make some dinner and it was mince?

17 A. Oh, did I tell you about that one? I couldn't remember

18 telling you. Aye. I don't know what age I was. I was

19 at primary school, so I was young, and she asked me to

20 go and put the mince on. I didn't know anything about

21 cooking so I didn't know I had to brown the mince so

22 I just plopped it in water and put it on the stove.

23 Q. What happened when she realised you hadn't browned the

24 mince?

25 A. Well, I got beat up for it.

1 Q. Had she given you any directions --
2 A. No --
3 Q. -- on how to cook?
4 A. No.
5 Q. You tell us that in the first house -- because there was
6 a point at which the FLS/FLT moved house; is that right?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. That in the first house you used to have your meals at
9 a dining table with benches?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Did everyone sit around the table and have meals
12 together?
13 A. No, no. Not all the time. We usually just sat with it
14 on my knees, if I remember correctly. I mean,
15 occasionally we would sit at the bench.
16 Q. You say that the cupboards were always well stocked with
17 food.
18 A. Yes, yes.
19 Q. So there weren't any issues in relation to not having
20 enough to eat --
21 A. No, there was always food there.
22 Q. Moving on to your clothing, 'Christine', at paragraph 15
23 you tell us about the clothes you wore. What kind of
24 clothes were you wearing when you were a child?
25 A. Well, mostly it was hand-me-downs. But I do remember

1 like during the week when school was in I'd have my
2 school uniform on, but then I would also wear the school
3 uniform at the weekends because -- I don't even remember
4 why, to be honest, but I can remember wearing my school
5 uniform at weekends.

6 Q. You tell us in your statement that FLS would sometimes
7 go to charity shops and --

8 A. Oh, jumble sales, aye. She would go to jumble sales and
9 come back with bags and bags full of stuff and we used
10 to get excited because -- well, I did, because I was
11 getting new clothes.

12 Q. What about the girls who were adopted? Were they --

13 A. Oh, [REDACTED] and [REDACTED], oh, they were in the best gear
14 all the time. I mean, I would get two lots of
15 hand-me-downs.

16 Q. So you would get the clothes from the charity shop or
17 the jumble sale --

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. -- and if the other girls had outgrown certain clothes,
20 you were given them?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. What about new clothes? Did you ever get new clothes?

23 A. Christmas, usually Christmas. Or I remember like the
24 social workers taking me out, I think that was just for
25 school uniforms though, a social worker would come and

1 take me out to buy my uniform.

2 Q. Do you know why it was the social worker did that as

3 opposed to your foster mum?

4 A. I don't know. I know they had this slip thing that they

5 used to take into the shop, because I thought I was

6 getting it free.

7 Q. Right, okay. And you mention your shoes.

8 A. Oh.

9 Q. What can you tell us about the shoes you were wearing?

10 A. Well, I do remember having to cut cardboard to put it

11 into shoes because the soles had worn away and then

12 obviously when it was rainy it got all mushy.

13 Q. In relation to school, did you enjoy your time at

14 school?

15 A. Yes, to an extent, aye.

16 Q. Were there any problems at school?

17 A. Not at primary school, but high school I did get bullied

18 a bit.

19 Q. Was there any particular reason why you were the person

20 being bullied?

21 A. Oh, really? I was fostered, I had a black sister,

22 a handicapped brother, I wore glasses and I had

23 freckles. So.

24 Q. Right, okay. And the black sister you mentioned, that

25 was one of the --

1 A. Yeah, that was [REDACTED].

2 Q. She was one of the ones who was adopted?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you've already told us about the other foster boy in

5 the household.

6 In relation to school events, is that something the

7 [REDACTED] FLS/FLT attended, if you were doing something at school?

8 A. No.

9 Q. What about your homework? Did they help you with your

10 homework?

11 A. Not that I recall, no.

12 Q. I think in fairness you say in your statement as well is

13 that on saying that, you suppose that they did try and

14 encourage you to do well at school?

15 A. Well, yeah, they did. I mean, I remember -- I remember

16 getting an award at school for something, I can't

17 remember what it was, and I did get praise for that.

18 Q. Moving on to the subject of chores, you've already

19 mentioned you were doing the cooking and I think you

20 also mentioned that you were doing the housework. What

21 kind of chores did you have to do?

22 A. Everything. I mean, from hoovering, dusting to

23 painting. We painted the house as well. We did the

24 decorating. I mean, ironing, the washing. I mean, the

25 lot.

1 Q. Was it just yourself or were there others who were
2 doing --
3 A. No, we all did it.
4 Q. When you say you all did it, who was that?
5 A. All of us, but mostly it was [REDACTED] and myself and my
6 two biological sisters. I mean, the other ones did it
7 but not as much. They were allowed to go out more.
8 Q. When you say all of us and the other ones, are you
9 referring to the other children in the house?
10 A. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] aye.
11 Q. What about Mr and Mrs FLS/FLT, did they do housework?
12 A. Well, we did it all when they were at work mostly. It
13 had to be done for them coming home.
14 Q. I think in your statement you describe that through the
15 week you did all the normal housework like cleaning,
16 dusting, Hoovering and emptying bins, and on a Sunday
17 you did everything else, that you gutted the house?
18 A. Aye.
19 Q. Was the house always very clean then?
20 A. Oh, it was spotless.
21 Q. It was spotless because of the work that you and your --
22 A. Yeah. It had to be spotless. If it wasn't -- I mean,
23 I can remember once I was asked to clean the couch.
24 I mean, scrub it. And I didn't do it properly, it
25 wasn't clean enough, so I got a beating for that.

1 LADY SMITH: Sorry, can I just ask you a moment, how old
2 were you when you had to start doing these chores?
3 A. Oh, this was just primary school, we're talking maybe
4 five, six years old.
5 LADY SMITH: There was something every day you had to do?
6 A. Oh yeah, yeah.
7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
8 Ms Rattray.
9 MS RATTRAY: Did you ever get any praise or pocket money or
10 rewards for doing all those chores?
11 A. I didn't get pocket money off of her, but FLT had
12 greyhounds, he kept greyhounds, so I would also get up
13 at 6 o'clock in the morning to walk them before I went
14 to school and then at 6 o'clock at night I would also
15 take them out and walk them, so he would give me some
16 money.
17 Q. How many greyhounds were there?
18 A. Oh, it varied from one to five.
19 Q. So there might be a point at which you were walking five
20 dogs?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Those greyhounds, were they pets or did he breed them --
23 A. They were racing dogs. He would race them, yeah. And
24 I don't know if I actually put this in my statement, but
25 when a racing dog gets injured, it's no good to the

1 breeder then, so they would get them put down. So
2 rather than get a dog put down, we used to go behind
3 the -- behind the kennel and a couple of times I had to
4 hold the dog while he hit it over the head with
5 a shovel. And killed it. I mean, I could go to the
6 spot where the dogs are buried to this day.

7 Q. How old were you when you had to do that?

8 A. Again, primary school age.

9 LADY SMITH: Why did you have to be there?

10 A. Because someone had to hold the leash, had to hold the
11 dog in place.

12 LADY SMITH: Couldn't your foster mother have done that?

13 A. I don't know.

14 LADY SMITH: It sounds like you had no choice about --

15 A. I didn't. Oh no, I wouldn't choose to do that.

16 LADY SMITH: What did he do with the dogs' bodies after
17 that?

18 A. Buried them. Buried them there and then.

19 LADY SMITH: Did you have to stay while he did that?

20 A. No.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 A. But I mean to this day I still know the exact spot where
23 these dogs are buried.

24 MS RATTRAY: How did that make you feel?

25 A. Devastated. I love animals.

1 Q. Those were the dogs that you were walking twice a day?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. So were they more like pets to you?

4 A. Yeah. I would sit in the kennel with them and pet them.

5 Q. Moving on, 'Christine', to the kind of things you were
6 doing what you had any free time, did you get much free
7 time?

8 A. I got some, yeah.

9 Q. What were the kind of things you were able to do when
10 you had that free sort of leisure time?

11 A. Oh, I loved to read when I was a kid, I would read all
12 the time or listen to my records in the room or
13 sometimes just go out with my friends if I was allowed
14 out.

15 Q. You say if you were allowed out. Would there be
16 a reason you weren't allowed out?

17 A. Oh, I was grounded constantly. I was always getting
18 grounded for something. I mean, something and nothing.
19 To me it would be nothing, but ...

20 Q. Can you remember the kind of things you were grounded
21 for?

22 A. Well, not cleaning the house properly or a couple of
23 times I wasn't out with the dogs long enough, I wasn't
24 walking them long enough time or I was taking too long
25 with them. Things like that.

1 Q. You would get some kind of punishment or sanction for
2 either not walking the dogs long enough --
3 A. Or --
4 Q. -- or spending too long walking them?
5 A. Yeah.
6 Q. So you couldn't really win, could you?
7 A. No. I mean, breathe the wrong way and I got it. They
8 just hated me.
9 Q. This kind of treatment, and in relation to being
10 grounded for these kind of things, was that just you or
11 did it happen to any of the other children?
12 A. No, that was me. It happened to my two older sisters as
13 well, but they left. I think they left -- both of them
14 had left by the time I went to high school, so it got
15 worse for me when they left, because I was the only one.
16 Q. In relation to sort of holidays, I think you describe
17 going on a holiday perhaps once a year to Nairn?
18 A. Yeah.
19 Q. Was that something you enjoyed?
20 A. It was all right, I suppose. But it was not much
21 change. I mean I still got beatings up there too. But
22 once I wet the bed and I got beaten for it. With
23 a frying pan.
24 Q. With a frying pan?
25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. That happened when you were on holiday in Nairn?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. Whereabouts were you staying? Were you in a hotel or --

4 A. No, it was in the caravan park. And at the time there

5 were no toilets in caravans, so we'd take up during the

6 night and they used to put a bucket out, we'd use that,

7 or we had to walk to the toilet block.

8 So I remember that night vividly as well. I had

9 actually dreamt that I was at the toilet so I wet the

10 bed and I got beaten with a frying pan the next morning.

11 Q. Who was it who beat you with a frying pan?

12 A. That was FLS.

13 Q. You say she beat you with a frying pan. Whereabouts on

14 your body did she hit you with a frying pan?

15 A. All over. Mostly the head.

16 Q. Did you have any injuries?

17 A. Bruises, just ... I had bruises.

18 Q. I'm going to move on and ask you -- you've obviously

19 told us -- you've given us some insight into your

20 relationship with some of the people in the household,

21 but how would you describe your relationship with your

22 foster parents?

23 A. I really don't know how to describe that.

24 I mean, they hated me. And that's about -- I was

25 only there for the money, apparently. Well, that's what

1 I think.

2 Q. Were there any times that they showed you affection?

3 A. None that I can remember. I have one photograph,

4 I don't know how I got my hands on it, because I don't

5 have any photos of myself as a kid because they hid them

6 all and they wouldn't give me anything, but I remember

7 I've got one photo, I don't know how I got it, and it's

8 me with those two and they've got their arms around me,

9 but ... I don't know if that was just for the photo.

10 But I don't ever remember getting any affection.

11 Q. Did they show affection to any of the other children in

12 the household?

13 A. Oh, [REDACTED] and [REDACTED], aye, aye, definitely.

14 Q. How did they show them affection?

15 A. Well, they got lots of cuddles and kisses and things

16 like that.

17 Q. You and your siblings, your sisters, you didn't get any

18 cuddles or kisses?

19 A. No.

20 Q. What about the other boy?

21 A. I don't -- I know it was pretty tough for him as well,

22 because I remember he started seeing this girl and

23 I don't know what happened, they didn't like her,

24 I think they banned him from seeing her, I know he tried

25 to commit suicide while he was staying with them as

1 well. He [REDACTED] and it was me
2 that found him.

3 Q. How old were you when that happened?

4 A. Maybe about 12. 12/13 at the most.

5 Q. What about the other children in the household, your
6 sisters? Did you have a good relationship with your
7 sisters?

8 A. Yeah. As far as I recall, yeah.

9 Q. The other two girls, the adopted girls, what was your
10 relationship with them like?

11 A. Oh, they hated me as well. They would sit and laugh
12 when I was getting beatings.

13 Q. Were they ever beaten?

14 A. Not that I remember.

15 Q. What about contact with your birth family. You were
16 there with your two sisters. Did you ever see either
17 your birth mum and dad or your two brothers?

18 A. Apparently -- I don't remember it, but apparently I had
19 been taken to see my mum a couple of times, but I think
20 I was with the [REDACTED] for 11, 12 years, and I'm really
21 not sure. Maybe a handful of times I seen my mother.

22 Q. What about your brothers?

23 A. Never seen them at all.

24 Q. Were you aware you had brothers?

25 A. I must have been, but I don't remember.

1 Q. You've told us a little about what happened if your
2 foster parents thought you hadn't done something
3 properly or had misbehaved in some way and you've told
4 us a little about the kind of behaviour that would lead
5 to these kind of punishments, so you didn't really have
6 to do very much wrong, if anything?

7 A. No, not at all.

8 Q. If we move to page 9 of your statement, from
9 paragraph 33 you tell us in more detail about the things
10 that happened to you. At paragraph 33 you tell us, and
11 you have already mentioned this:

12 "I think we were just there to be skivvies and they
13 just wanted the money for fostering us."

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. At what stage did you discover that they were getting
16 money for fostering you?

17 A. I never knew that until I was an adult and I looked into
18 fostering myself and that was when I found out that they
19 actually got money.

20 Q. At paragraph 34 you tell us that they never showed you
21 any affection and you've told us about that. I think
22 you go on, if you ever had a problem or any issue that
23 you needed to talk over, were they people that you could
24 approach and --

25 A. No, not at all.

1 Q. Was there any adult in your life that you would have
2 been able to go to for help?

3 A. Well, there was actually one high school teacher, but
4 that was it.

5 Q. At paragraph 35 you tell us that with the foster parents
6 being away working, sometimes there wasn't an adult in
7 the house.

8 A. Mm-hmm.

9 Q. Were you left there on your own very often?

10 A. Always together, yeah. Not myself.

11 Q. But the children as a group were --

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. -- often in the house on their own?

14 A. (Witness nods)

15 Q. You talk about your foster parents would often berate
16 you?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. What kind of things did they say to berate you?

19 A. Just things like I was no good, I was just like my
20 mother. They'd say things like, "No wonder your mother
21 didn't want you", stuff like that. I would never amount
22 to anything.

23 Q. When they said these kind of things, how did that make
24 you feel?

25 A. I don't know. Sad, probably?

1 Q. You've told us that the adopted girls were treated very
2 differently --
3 A. Mm-hmm.
4 Q. -- from you and your sisters and that they could do no
5 wrong in the eyes of the FLS/FLT .
6 A. Yeah.
7 Q. And they got the new clothes and were given money. You
8 also say that they would do things that would cause you
9 a problem?
10 A. Oh, aye, they would do things and blame me. Like if
11 they broke something in the house, I would -- in fact,
12 they didn't even need to blame me, I'd just get the
13 blame anyway. I remember one incident, it was new bunk
14 beds and someone had ripped the handle off it, off the
15 mattress. She had lined us up, the six of us, I was the
16 last in the line of six, so she went through them all:
17 "Did you do it?"
18 "No."
19 "Did you do it?"
20 "No".
21 She got to me, she says, "Did you do it?" And
22 I said "no" and I got a slap.
23 So I knew if I said no again I'd get another slap,
24 so I just said, "Yes, I did it" and then I got
25 a beating.

1 Q. What form did that beating take?

2 A. Oh, you're talking kicks, punches, slaps.

3 Q. You've spoken before about a frying pan being used to

4 hit you with, did they ever use any other things to hit

5 you

6 A. Oh, aye, aye. Anything that came to hand. A hairbrush.

7 I can remember once, you know, the big glass ashtrays,

8 one of them. My hands were covered in bruises from

9 doing that to protect my head.

10 Q. Who was it who hit you with the glass ashtray?

11 A. That was FLS again.

12 Q. What about FLT

13 A. Oh, he dished them out as well. It was mainly her,

14 I think, but he dished them out as well. He had to wear

15 steel toecap boots for work and he would kick us with

16 them on.

17 Q. You also tell us about a time when you were doing the

18 ironing and you --

19 A. Yeah, I burnt my arm.

20 Q. Tell us about that.

21 A. Well, I was ironing curtains. Again, I was at primary

22 school, you don't know how to do these things properly.

23 So instead of going along the way I went up and down and

24 the iron caught and turned and burnt my wrist. And

25 I started crying, so I got a beating for crying.

1 Q. I think you tell us of another time that you were beaten
2 simply because you were upset because you'd hurt
3 yourself?
4 A. Yeah, caught my finger in the door. Was it that one?
5 Because I think there were more.
6 Q. Yes.
7 A. Yeah, I caught my finger in the door and I tried not to
8 cry, because I knew -- and she came over and she was
9 acting all like caring. She was all, "Oh, have you hurt
10 yourself? Let me see", so because of that wee bit of
11 affection which I got, I started crying. So then I got
12 a beating. She told me, "There's something to effing
13 cry for".
14 Q. Did you ever see the adopted girls treated in this way?
15 A. Oh no, no.
16 Q. This kind of thing, did it happen to your sisters as
17 well?
18 A. Yeah. My older sister. Not so much the middle one, she
19 didn't get as much as us, but my older sister, yeah.
20 Q. You tell us -- I think that this is the incident
21 involving the ashtray, that you had snuck out of the
22 house to go to a disco?
23 A. Yeah, I was grounded and I snuck out.
24 Q. I think that's the episode which gave rise to:
25 "She picked up a big thick heavy glass ashtray."

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. I think at one stage you do tell us that you became
3 an expert at hiding your bruises?

4 A. Yeah. I had to. Because if anyone found out, I knew
5 I would have got it again. I couldn't tell anybody
6 because I knew if I told them then they found out --
7 because I felt that my sister -- my sister had tried to
8 leave as soon as she turned 16 and they phoned the
9 police, the police found my sister and brought her back
10 to the house and my sister told the police that we were
11 getting beatings in there but nothing happened, they
12 still brought her back. So we couldn't tell anybody.

13 Q. At this part of your statement, 'Christine', you
14 couldn't remember whether you'd told us about the issue
15 with the greyhounds and having to hold them when they
16 were killed --

17 A. Aye.

18 Q. -- but you had done that and it is there in your
19 statement.

20 You also tell us in your statement about the
21 incident when one of the handles on the mattress broke
22 and you were all lined up. You have told us about it.

23 A. Oh right.

24 Q. I think you also said that you had the job of cutting
25 your foster father's hair?

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. What happened there?

3 A. I had to cut his hair and that included the hair on his
4 ears and obviously I had to be very careful not to cut
5 him, because if I did, I knew I would get a beating, but
6 sometimes I just did it anyway.

7 Q. If you cut him, did he do something?

8 A. Oh aye, I would get a punch.

9 Q. I think you describe as well that there were issues when
10 you got older and you were perhaps going out to see some
11 friends, and that friend happened to be a boy --

12 A. Oh, it was --

13 Q. -- they had some issues about that?

14 A. It was one of my female friends, in fact I think I was
15 grounded at this point as well. Anyway, I snuck out to
16 see my friend and we went and walked around round to the
17 shop where she happened to bump into her boyfriend, her
18 boyfriend, so we were talking, and just at that point
19 **FLS** came around the corner from work and she went
20 absolutely mental and started hitting me around the head
21 with her umbrella. It was raining at the time. And
22 dragged me, physically dragged me back round to the
23 house.

24 Q. You speak about another time as well, that this time it
25 was your foster father, when you were listening to

1 music --

2 A. Oh, right, aye. It was -- this was a male friend.

3 I mean, we were all kids, we ran about together, and he

4 had an album that I wanted to hear so we went over and

5 we were in his house listening to it. It was in his

6 room, it was completely innocent, I was only a kid, and

7 **FLT** came across and came into the room and

8 grabbed me by the hair, dragged me out the house. We

9 stayed right across the road. And kicked me all the way

10 across the road and all the way up the stairs and in my

11 room. In front of all my friends.

12 Q. You tell us about an incident that happened to one of

13 your sisters, and that you heard your sister screaming.

14 A. Oh, right. We knew there was something going on down

15 the stairs, because at the time she was pregnant.

16 Right, we knew there was something going on down the

17 stairs because there was a lot of whispering and we used

18 to sit along the stairs and earwig, as you do. And it

19 turned out that my sister was pregnant and they beat her

20 up when she was pregnant.

21 Q. At paragraph 48 you describe how unhappy you were living

22 there and you thought about bringing an end to your

23 life?

24 A. Yeah. I did it twice. Three times altogether. Twice

25 at primary school and once when I was at high school.

1 Q. Did anyone know about this?

2 A. Well, [REDACTED] had -- I do recall [REDACTED] saying something to
3 me the next day, like, "What was wrong with you, you
4 weren't right?" But I couldn't remember what happened
5 the next day, because -- the day before, because of the
6 [REDACTED]
7 [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED] She had noticed. But
9 she didn't know that I'd took [REDACTED]

10 Q. There was no one at all that you could possibly speak to
11 about your feelings?

12 A. No.

13 Q. You must have felt very desperate --

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. -- to do that. You've already mentioned this, but you
16 do say in your statement at paragraph 50 that when you
17 moved house with the foster parents, about that time
18 your sisters had left?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. How old were you when your sisters left?

21 A. I'm not sure, to be honest. Maybe 11/12, I think.
22 I was still at primary school when my oldest sister left
23 and got married. In fact, I think I was at primary
24 school when both of them left, so maybe in my last year
25 at primary. About 11 years old, 12 at the oldest.

1 Q. You said that this made it worse for you?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. Why did it make it worse?

4 A. Well, because all the attention was on me then. Because

5 like my sisters -- it was divided up between us when

6 they were both there, but then when they left it was

7 just all on me.

8 Q. By "the attention", you mean the berating --

9 A. The abuse, yeah.

10 Q. -- and the abuse? You tell us -- I think you say here:

11 "I can honestly say that I can't think of any happy

12 memories from my time in foster care with the FLS/FLT "

13 A. No.

14 Q. "I'm not saying that there weren't any, I just can't

15 remember any good times."

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. And that FLS called you names all the time, told you

18 you were no use and that you were "an ugly wee bastard".

19 A. Mm-hmm, yeah. And I wasn't allowed to speak to boys.

20 She said I was man daft, just like my mother. So if

21 I spoke to boys she thought there was something going

22 on, and there wasn't.

23 Q. As you got older and into your teenage years and moving

24 towards becoming a young adult, were there any things

25 that the FLS/FLT did to sort of teach you how to live on

1 your own after --

2 A. Nothing. No, nothing.

3 Q. Tell us about how you left the FLS/FLT '.

4 A. I'd contacted my sister, my middle sister, [REDACTED], and

5 asked if I could go and stay with her. She said yeah.

6 So I met up with her in Wishaw and she actually took me

7 down to my real mother, so went down there and my mum

8 had phoned the social work and it was Ron Hutchison

9 I think that came and got me. They took me down to the

10 [REDACTED] FLS/FLT to get some of my stuff they would give me.

11 They gave me nothing. Not even my school books. I left

12 the house in my school uniform and there was abuse that

13 day as well. Not physical, but they were -- they were

14 shouting at me. I don't remember much about it, but

15 I do know that there was abuse, and this was in front of

16 the social worker as well.

17 Q. How old were you when you left?

18 A. Well, I thought it was two days after my 16th birthday

19 but it turned out it was actually my 16th birthday,

20 because the social workers got my birthday wrong so --

21 my birthday's actually [REDACTED] and the social -- right

22 up until I was 16, I had my birthday on the [REDACTED],

23 because it was the wrong date.

24 Q. Throughout your time in care you've actually thought

25 your birthday was a different date than what it actually

1 is?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. But you thought you were leaving, you'd turned 16,
4 therefore you were able to leave?

5 A. Yeah. But I had actually -- the day I left I was
6 actually 16. I thought it was two days before.

7 Q. I mentioned to you, 'Christine', that we would look at
8 some of your records. If we could do that now.

9 A. Mm-hmm.

10 Q. A copy of some of your records will come on the screen.
11 The first one I want to look at is NLC-000000198. These
12 have been taken from children's records, which the
13 Inquiry has recovered from North Lanarkshire Council.
14 At 198, page 6, we'll look at this one first. What it
15 appears to be are notes of a case review on
16 17 September 1979. There's reference to you -- the copy
17 you'll have will have your name blacked out, but
18 paragraph 1 has your name at the top.

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. In fact you tell us quite clearly that you were told
21 throughout the particular date -- you've told us that
22 you were told your birthday was on [REDACTED]?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. And although it's blacked out, we, who can see the
25 non-blacked out version, see that in fact yes you're

1 correct, it says "Date of birth" and it says [REDACTED]
2 when in fact you were born on the [REDACTED]
3 A. The [REDACTED]. When I went back to stay with my mother, she
4 says to me, "Oh, it's your 16th birthday today", and
5 I went, "No, it was two days ago", and she had to get my
6 birth certificate out to show me.

7 Q. If we look a few lines down in that first paragraph, the
8 part of it I'm going to read is:

9 "The social worker feels that it is very difficult
10 to get close to 'Christine'. This could be due to the
11 amount of 'family' feeling there is in the placement
12 situation, but it could also be due to the fairly strong
13 feelings that the foster parents have towards social
14 workers."

15 Do you remember anything about your foster parents'
16 attitude towards or feelings about social workers?

17 A. No. Only on the day that I went to get my stuff, they
18 were abusive to me and the social worker, so.

19 Q. If we turn in this document back to page 1 of the notes
20 on this document, at page 1 we see that this is more
21 notes of a case review and on the left-hand side it
22 tells us that the case review is on 29 April 1981. If
23 we turn to page 3 on this document, in the middle of
24 page 3 it says something about:

25 "Relationship of child with foster parents and other

1 members of household."

2 The note says:

3 "Good in its own way. The FLS/FLT ' attitude to
4 fostering isn't really professional but then they
5 probably should have adopted the children. They are
6 more like adoptive parents in attitude."

7 What do you think about that?

8 A. That is saying that they should have adopted us? Oh
9 hell no. Sorry. I remember going -- they sent me to
10 a child psychologist, right, because I played up, okay,
11 quite a bit, and they sent me to a child psychologist
12 and while I was sitting in one chair at the
13 psychologist, FLS was sitting in the other
14 chair. Throughout the sessions. And that was
15 a question that they brought up. They were like -- they
16 were asking me, "Would you behave better basically if
17 you were adopted?" And she's sitting right there, so
18 I couldn't very well say "no", so I had to say "yes".
19 And then I'm pretty sure when we got back to the house
20 she's like to me, "Adopt you? Are you kidding?"
21 Basically. Maybe not in those words, but that was
22 pretty much what she meant. No, but I would -- no.
23 Q. Presumably during these sessions if your foster mother
24 was sitting right beside you throughout, there was never
25 an opportunity to --

1 A. Oh, I couldn't open up. No, definitely not. Not with
2 her sitting there.

3 Q. If we turn the page to the next page of this review on
4 page 4 of this document, we do see a reference, the
5 suggestion is:

6 "How often is the foster home visited?"

7 It says, "Three monthly" and it gives the date of
8 the last visit.

9 A. I never seen them three monthly, no chance.

10 Q. If they visited three monthly, perhaps you weren't there
11 at the time?

12 A. Well, I could have been at school, I don't know, but
13 I never seen them.

14 Q. But we see the next question:

15 "Is the child seen on his own?"

16 And the answer is:

17 "No."

18 And:

19 "How does the child see social worker?"

20 "As an official with no practical significance."

21 A. Well, how would they know that if they've not seen me on
22 my own?

23 Q. Perhaps even if there were times that they could have
24 seen you on your own or did see you on your own, whether
25 or not you remember that, it doesn't seem to indicate

1 that there was any kind of trusting relationship between
2 you and any social worker?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Then it says:

5 "How do foster parents see social worker?"

6 And the answer is:

7 "As a necessary evil. Though polite and friendly,
8 usually they'd rather be left to get on with things.
9 Mrs FLS occasionally needs support when the girls
10 associate with people they don't approve of."

11 A. That was almost anyone.

12 Q. I think we see from that it's certainly the perception
13 of the social workers that perhaps their visits and
14 attentions weren't very welcome by the FLS/FLT.

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. The next record I'm going to look at is at
17 NLC-000000197. We're going to turn to page 8 of this
18 particular document.

19 What this appears to be is once again social work
20 notes and we see that the social worker at the top, it
21 says "R Hutchison" and I think that's the person you've
22 mentioned?

23 A. Ron Hutchison.

24 Q. Yes. There seems to be a handwritten date of
25 February 1983 and there is reference to someone who

1 might be your birth mother "... and the boys", who may
2 well be your brothers, "... are delighted to have two
3 sisters back on speaking terms. They all feel
4 'Christine' will follow when she is 16".

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. "Both girls tell of unpleasant experiences at the
7 **FLS/FLT** (foster parents) and they say now that both are
8 away they will make 'Christine's' life very tough."

9 A. Yeah, I remember seeing this. My sister and I went to
10 ask for some files and I remember seeing that and that
11 made me particularly angry, because it was only a couple
12 of months after that I left, in fact just over a month.
13 I mean, they should have been out straight away. They
14 should have come out to check straight away when they
15 read that.

16 Q. If we move to the next entry on this page, which is
17 dated March 1983, it says:

18 "This month went without incident until the last
19 days ... [someone] came to tell that 'Christine' had
20 arrived at mum's."

21 Then it appears that the social worker visited your
22 mum's home and you were there and everyone had done
23 a lot of talking. It says:

24 "She [a reference to you, 'Christine'] is not going
25 back to the foster parents **FLS/FLT**. [Your mum] has

1 offered her a bed and all want to be reunited.

2 I explained that the idea was good, but should be

3 planned properly with the FLS/FLT and the social work

4 department. 'Christine' agreed but stated firmly that

5 she had only been waiting until she was 16 before

6 getting out of the FLS/FLT ."

7 He says:

8 "She was 16 two days ago."

9 Once again, that's a mistake about your date of

10 birth.

11 A. (Witness nods)

12 Q. "There was no way she was going back to the FLS/FLT .

13 I suggested that she came with me to see George Meikle

14 (her social worker). Together we spent a long session

15 trying to persuade 'Christine' to go back to the FLS/FLT

16 and allow us to plan for her return to her mother. She

17 would not go back under any circumstances because [and

18 this is underlined] for years the FLS/FLT had been

19 telling her that she was 'a no user', 'worthless',

20 'a bad person' and 'different from the other children in

21 their care'. [Someone] told her her mother was also

22 a 'worthless no user who drank her weans away'."

23 Was that the kind of things that the FLS/FLT said to

24 you?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. If we turn to page 7 of this record, which is actually
2 date wise a continuation of the last entry, and it says:
3 "It became clear that 'Christine' had been thinking
4 along these lines for a long time. She had talked to
5 her sisters about going to her mother's, but was afraid
6 to ask the FLS/FLT advice because they would be
7 aggressively against the idea."
8 A. (Witness nods)
9 Q. Is that right?
10 A. Yeah. I wouldn't even consider mentioning it to them.
11 I mean, it had to be done on the quiet. And once I was
12 out, there was no way I was going back.
13 LADY SMITH: Why did you think they would be against the
14 idea of you leaving and going to your mum's?
15 A. Because -- I don't know, I just knew that if I even
16 mentioned it I would get beat up, because they didn't
17 want us to go for some reason, but I didn't know it was
18 the money at the time. Because I know when both my
19 sisters said they were leaving, they both got beat up.
20 So I knew if I said, I would get the same treatment,
21 so which is why I didn't, I had to do it quietly.
22 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
23 MS RATTRAY: At the next paragraph in this note it says:
24 "Later visited the FLS/FLT with George and
25 'Christine'."

1 I think "George" is George Meikle, your social
2 worker?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. "All 'Christine's' fears came true -- the FLS/FLT became
5 verbally abusive towards 'Christine' (and all the
6 children in the family) and confirmed 'Christine's'
7 statement of earlier in the day. After an acrimonious
8 meeting we left. I asked the FLS/FLT if they would
9 allow her to take away some clothes and they said 'she
10 is getting nothing'. 'Christine' left in the clothes
11 she was wearing, her school uniform."

12 If we move to the next entry at the foot of the
13 page, which appears to be 4 April 1983:

14 "'Christine' moved to her mum's after the first
15 weekend. George Meikle (social worker) was unsuccessful
16 in getting the FLS/FLT to release any of her clothes or
17 personal belongings. Helped the mum and 'Christine' to
18 claim from DHSS, this department will supplement what
19 DHSS offer as the girl has absolutely nothing except her
20 uniform."

21 That meant, you said, leaving photographs behind as
22 well?

23 A. Yeah, I had nothing, I don't have any photographs of
24 myself when I was younger.

25 Q. Presumably --you talked about reading books and

1 listening to music, things like that --

2 A. Yeah, I got nothing. They sent my school books to the
3 school.

4 Q. If we turn now to the next record, which is at
5 NLC-000000199, at page 1 of that record, what this bears
6 to be is a letter from a consultant psychiatrist,
7 Nick Child, and I think this is the person you've told
8 us about?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. Who is at the department of family and child psychiatry
11 as part of Lanarkshire Health Board and it's a letter of
12 5 December 1983, which he's written to your social
13 worker Mr G Meikle.

14 "Dear George ..."

15 He's obviously raising the fact that you'd left on
16 your 16th birthday:

17 "Did you know that 'Christine' had taken the
18 opportunity of her 16th birthday to return herself to
19 her real mother? I know because 'Christine' brought her
20 mother and some members of her family because she was
21 having difficulty with one of her sons."

22 I think that must be a reference to one of your
23 mother's sons rather than you.

24 "I have put them off for a bit because I needed time
25 to think and because we are very busy. However, what do

1 you and your department make of 'Christine's'
2 declaration of loyalty to the person she was removed
3 from so many years ago?"

4 A. It wasn't a case of loyalty. It was somewhere to go.
5 It was my sisters I was wanting to move in with, but my
6 sister didn't have a room, she only had a two-bedroom
7 house, there was her, her man and her two kids, so she
8 said, "Would you go to mother's?" So I said, "Yes". At
9 that point I was already out the [REDACTED] house, so
10 I had to go somewhere. There was no way I was going
11 back there. So I went to my mother's.

12 Q. If we turn over to page 2 on this document, here we see
13 the reply to this letter from Nick Child and it's
14 a letter of 14 December 1983 from Strathclyde Regional
15 Council. On this occasion it's Ron Hutchison, social
16 worker, who's written this letter. If we move down to
17 the bigger paragraph in the middle of the page about
18 five paragraphs down, I'll read from there:

19 "I had extensive contact with both older girls and
20 it became apparent that they wanted to re-establish
21 contact with their mother many years previously but were
22 prevented from doing so by the foster parents and social
23 workers. It was therefore predictable that 'Christine'
24 retained the same feelings and by [REDACTED] 1983 all
25 concerned (except perhaps the foster parents) expected

1 that she would inaugurate contact after her 16th
2 birthday. The surprise was that she did so on the day
3 after her birthday and by her strong desire to stay with
4 her mother straight away."

5 I think from your evidence the strong desire was to
6 get out of the FLS/FLT's house?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. If you were going anywhere, it was your sister's?

9 A. Yeah, I had never thought about going to my mother's.
10 But it just -- that's just the way it happened, so.

11 LADY SMITH: 'Christine', was it simply that you knew you'd
12 had your 16th birthday that was the prompt for you to
13 leave?

14 A. Yeah, definitely.

15 LADY SMITH: Had anything else happened that was a last
16 straw?

17 A. No, that was it. I just -- I had always thought as soon
18 as I turned 16 I'm out of there. I had no thoughts of
19 where I was going or anything. I just had to leave.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

21 MS RATTRAY: Continuing to the next paragraph on this page
22 and from the second sentence of that paragraph:

23 "I have had some very interesting and useful
24 sessions with the family including interviews where all
25 were present. It is of great value to hear how each

1 child was counselled about what happened when they came
2 into care all those years ago and sadly neither of the
3 foster parents, the special school or the social workers
4 come out with much credibility."

5 If we turn over to the next page of the letter on
6 page 3, it continues:

7 "This department (or rather the old Children's
8 Department) adopted a rigid policy of convincing
9 everybody that their mother was a useless individual of
10 no real value, and certainly not a fit person to look
11 after the family. The foster parents conveyed this to
12 the girls and were still doing so the day George and
13 I moved 'Christine' back to her mother."

14 A. Well, they were right about my mother. I didn't stay
15 there long either.

16 Q. If we turn to the next document on this at page 4, we
17 see this is another letter from the social work
18 department, Strathclyde Regional Council, 7 April 1983,
19 and this is the application -- I think they were
20 assisting with the application to the DHSS for
21 a clothing grant?

22 A. Yes, I remember that day. Being taken out and getting
23 all these new clothes.

24 Q. It's saying:

25 "The child referred to above was in foster care for

1 some ten years. The child was reunited with her natural
2 mother. The move was objected to by the long-term
3 foster parents and as a result have refused to allow
4 this department to remove the child's clothing and
5 personal belongings."

6 Then there's a list of items that you would need,
7 which were essential items.

8 A. (Witness nods)

9 Q. 'Christine', in relation to reporting what happened to
10 you, you have explained to us that there was no one that
11 you would be able to report to at the time and you were
12 frightened of worse happening if you did.

13 A. Yeah, definitely.

14 Q. At paragraph 64 of your statement you say that you've
15 had some contact with the police since then?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. What happened there?

18 A. This was actually just a couple of years ago. In fact,
19 my sister and I -- going back about maybe 15/16 years,
20 we went to see a lawyer to see if there was anything
21 that could be done. The lawyer basically said, "You
22 can't do anything without any witnesses, you can't get
23 the police involved", so we thought okay, so we ended up
24 leaving it at that.

25 I think it was when I telephoned the Inquiry itself,

1 they asked me if I wanted them to contact the police for
2 me and I said yes. So the police came out, I gave them
3 a statement, both my sisters gave statements, and then
4 they had spoken to the [REDACTED] doctors to see if they
5 were fit, which they weren't, and they both died
6 a couple of months later, so that was it.

7 Q. Turning now to paragraph 73 on your statement at
8 page 18, you tell us something about lessons which can
9 be learned from your experience. I think you speak
10 about there should be better and more regular
11 monitoring --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- of foster placements, and that you feel that you were
14 put in there and forgotten about.

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. Is there anything that you would like to add to lessons
17 that we can possibly learn from your experiences?

18 A. Well, I know things are a lot different now than they
19 were back then anyway and back then they were allowed to
20 smack kids, whereas now you're not, so -- it's just to
21 keep a closer eye on things.

22 Q. I think that's true, smacking was allowed --

23 A. And let the kids know that they can speak to you in
24 confidence.

25 Q. I think you say smacking was allowed, but hitting

1 children with frying pans and glass ashtrays --

2 A. No, I know.

3 Q. -- was never allowed.

4 A. No, I know that.

5 LADY SMITH: Yes, 'Christine', perhaps another way of

6 thinking about it is that smacking wasn't prohibited,

7 however --

8 A. Yeah.

9 LADY SMITH: -- physical punishment of children could still

10 be abusive if it was excessive or if it was simply

11 unjustified.

12 A. (Witness nods)

13 LADY SMITH: So don't just say to yourself, "Well, I had to

14 take it, because it was allowed".

15 A. Oh no, I know that. There was a line and they went

16 right over the line. I always say this: it's just

17 a miracle they never killed me.

18 MS RATTRAY: I think at your statement at paragraph 74 you

19 provide another piece of information about the FLS/FLT

20 and attending [REDACTED].

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. Can you tell us about that?

23 A. Well, they got an award for foster parents of the year,

24 went to [REDACTED] I remember them coming in dressed up

25 to the nines, I can remember her dress to this day, and

1 a hat. Yeah, shocking.

2 MS RATTRAY: 'Christine', thank you for answering all my
3 questions. I don't have any more questions for you and
4 I'm not aware of there being any application for
5 questions, my Lady.

6 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
7 questions of this witness?

8 'Christine', that does complete all the questions we
9 have. I have no further questions to ask you, but I do
10 want to thank you very much for engaging with us in the
11 way you have done. We have your written statement,
12 which I've read carefully, and that's part of your
13 evidence, but we've had you here today to really help me
14 to understand what it was like and understand the
15 descriptions you want to offer of what your time in
16 foster care was like, which has been so helpful.

17 So please go away knowing that you've done something
18 very valuable this morning and I'm very grateful to you
19 for it.

20 A. Thank you.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 (The witness withdrew)

23 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.

24 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, I wonder if at this stage in the
25 morning it would be convenient to actually take an early

1 break and perhaps come back early, say about 11.30, and
2 then we would deal with a read-in before the next oral
3 witness gives evidence.

4 LADY SMITH: Yes, that would work for me. We'll do that.

5 Thank you.

6 (11.14 am)

7 (A short break)

8 (11.33 am)

9 LADY SMITH: Just before we move on, I should remind people
10 about my general restriction order, because of course we
11 used the names of the [REDACTED] and the FLS/FLT and
12 other children in the FLS/FLT foster care household
13 during the evidence of the last witness, and those names
14 can't be used outside this room.

15 Ms Rattray.

16 MS RATTRAY: Yes, my Lady.

17 'Jane' (read)

18 MS RATTRAY: We start after the break with a read-in and
19 this is a statement of an applicant who is anonymous and
20 has chosen the pseudonym 'Jane'. Her statement is at
21 WIT.001.003.0204. 'Jane' was boarded out by Edinburgh
22 Corporation with Mrs LXO [REDACTED] in Bonnyrigg from
23 [REDACTED] 1971 to [REDACTED] 1971. The current
24 responsible authority is the City of Edinburgh Council.
25 Although the period in foster care is just over six

1 months, it was a difficult and distressing experience
2 for 'Jane' and her siblings which impacted on them
3 throughout their lives.

4 LADY SMITH: Six months is a long time in the life of
5 a child, of course, Ms Rattray. We should never forget
6 that, should we?

7 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

8 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

9 MS RATTRAY: "My name is 'Jane'. I was born in 1965. My
10 contact details are known to the Inquiry.

11 I don't recall much of my time as a toddler. I was
12 born in Bootle, Liverpool, and over the period of my
13 early life we lived there as well as Edinburgh and maybe
14 Glasgow as well. There may have been other places but
15 I don't remember them. I do recall however that we
16 tended to move about a lot.

17 I have two older sisters and an older brother and
18 two younger sisters and a younger brother. I'm in the
19 middle of my siblings as far as age is concerned.

20 My mum was hospitalised on various occasions, mainly
21 as a result of my father being a brutal man who
22 assaulted her on many an occasion. It was for this
23 reason that me and my siblings were eventually taken
24 into care, often being taken for our own safety.

25 At the time the extended family were of the view

1 that my mother had made her bed and could lie in it. My
2 granny was willing to take my mum in but not us kids
3 because her husband wouldn't like that.

4 I only have fleeting memories of my dad and
5 strangely one of the memories I always had was of him
6 playing hide and seek with me. Years later, perhaps
7 when I was about 40, I learned that on that occasion he
8 was actually holding us all hostage and threatening to
9 kill us all with the police being outside. He
10 apparently released us one at a time and I was the last
11 to be released. The strange thing is that I don't
12 recall that as a traumatic experience. My memory was
13 that it was a game.

14 I have no memory of social workers being involved in
15 my early life, though that may be because of how young
16 I was. I do know that I was placed somewhere when I was
17 very young because I have a newspaper cutting that
18 contains a photo of me in a children's home, though
19 I don't recall it or where it was taken, perhaps
20 Morningside in Edinburgh. I have no memos of being
21 there.

22 The first memory I have of being in care was when
23 I stayed in Bonnyrigg with Mr and Mrs LXN-LXO who had
24 two teenage daughters. I don't recall how old the
25 LXN-LXO were or if either of them worked. I don't

1 recall the address, but I could probably point out the
2 house as it's not that big a place.

3 I was aged four or five when I moved into Bonnyrigg
4 and I was there for a few months, maybe as long as
5 a year. I know that I had been in other places but
6 I have no recollection of them. My older sister and
7 brother moved in with the LXN-LXO at the same time as
8 me, then my younger sister joined us after a while.

9 There was a bedroom downstairs with a single bed and
10 cot in it. I think there were two bedrooms upstairs so
11 it was quite cramped with the four of them and us three.
12 While we were there, the LXN-LXO also fostered another
13 boy, who always seemed to be treated better than us.
14 Of course, thereafter my younger sister also arrived.
15 Myself and my siblings would take turns in sharing the
16 bed upstairs with the LXN-LXO daughters.

17 I don't recall much else about the house other than
18 it had a living room and the kitchen was tiny.

19 I don't recall what the routine was about getting up
20 or what time it was we went to bed.

21 The only thing I remember about the food there was
22 that we got porridge. We would get porridge in the
23 morning and again at tea time. If we were at school we
24 would get a school lunch, but if we were at home we went
25 hungry. That's one of the things I recall most about

1 that house, we were always hungry. If we were out on
2 our own, we would scavenge for whatever we could get,
3 even picking up chewing gum off the ground and taking
4 shots each of chewing it.

5 If the LXN-LXO were eating, they normally shut us
6 outside the house so we were often freezing. I still
7 struggle to understand why the neighbours didn't say
8 anything. They must have seen the state we were in.

9 There was a couple who moved in nearby and their
10 garden was overflowing with rhubarb. The woman used to
11 give us the rhubarb with sugar because she felt sorry
12 for us. Years later I recall my mother-in-law, who
13 stayed in Bonnyrigg, recounting a story of how she used
14 to give such things to three hungry children. I think
15 it was us she was talking about but I never elaborated
16 it with her.

17 After my younger sister arrived, the LXN-LXO used
18 to give her bits of toast and would let us take her out
19 in her pram. We were so hungry that we would steal wee
20 bits of toast from her.

21 Sometimes we would go up to the local shops and one
22 of the shopkeepers used to give us some drinks for
23 nothing. It must have been obvious to him and others
24 that we were starving. We were all very thin and
25 clearly undernourished.

1 I don't really remember having a bath but nor do
2 I recall not having a bath. It's just something that
3 hasn't stuck in my memory.

4 Other than a really bright dress that I had, I don't
5 recall how we were dressed or who gave us our clothes.
6 The thing I recall about that dress was having some
7 chewing gum in my mouth and being scared the LXN-LXO
8 would see it so I put it in the pocket of my dress.
9 However, then I was terrified that it would stick to the
10 dress and I was frightened I would be punished.

11 I don't recall what school we went to, though I do
12 remember that the Protestant and Catholic school were
13 beside each other. We went to the Catholic school and
14 had to pass the Protestant school and I remember it was
15 like having to run the gauntlet every day. Another
16 thing I remember about school was that we used to
17 constantly steal the school milk. I have no memory of
18 who my teacher was or anybody asking us how we were.

19 I remember that on one occasion we went somewhere,
20 maybe a funfair, in Bonnyrigg where there were horses
21 because one of the daughters loved to ride them.
22 Mrs LXO put me up on one of the horses and I was
23 terrified. It was like sitting on a skyscraper. I was
24 screaming but she wouldn't let me off. One of the
25 daughters led me round on the horse with me screaming

1 all the time. It was awful. That's a memory that is
2 still clear to me to this day.

3 I have no recollection of how our birthdays or
4 Christmas were celebrated or if they even were. If they
5 were celebrated, they must have been pretty non-eventful
6 for me not to remember them.

7 My mum visited us on one occasion. The reason
8 I remember it so well was that not only were we
9 constantly starving but we were all incredibly thirsty.
10 My mum managed to get us onto the stainless steel sink
11 and allowed us to drink as much as we could. That water
12 tasted like nectar to us.

13 I have no recollection of social workers ever
14 visiting us except on our last day. It's possible that
15 social workers did come to the house and maybe we just
16 didn't get to see them.

17 I have no recollection of going to either a doctor
18 or a dentist other than being taken to the doctor on the
19 day the social workers took us from the LXN-LXO

20 I have no recollection of ever running away from the
21 LXN-LXO but, given how young I was, I think it's
22 unlikely that I would have. Then again, I wouldn't have
23 had anywhere to run to. We did go out and wander about
24 quite a lot, but I wouldn't count that as running away
25 as we always returned.

1 I don't recall being a bed-wetter, though my sisters
2 say that some of them wet the bed.

3 Living with the LXN-LXO was awful. We were always
4 hungry and cold, especially when they put us outside
5 when they were eating. They also smacked us on
6 a regular basis, the daughters as well. When we took
7 turns to sleep with the sisters, they would punch and
8 kick us if we moved while in bed.

9 The fact that the sisters used to assault me when
10 I was in their bed has stayed with me to this day and,
11 if I am in close proximity to somebody, I can't help but
12 fidget.

13 The LXN-LXO used to tie my brother's hand to the
14 cot when he was sleeping in it and if I shared the
15 single bed with my sister they would put pillows down
16 the middle of the bed and tell us not to touch each
17 other.

18 There was one occasion when my older sister was
19 about seven. She used to have to look after the rest of
20 us when the LXN-LXO went out. We were always hungry
21 and thirsty and I remember my older sister trying to
22 make us toast one time but she burnt it. When it burnt,
23 the toast went on fire, but my sister couldn't reach it.

24 We somehow got the toast out of the toaster and put
25 the flames out. I think my older brother lifted my

1 sister to get it out. However, the toast was like black
2 ash but we were so hungry that we put margarine on it
3 and ate it. When the LXN-LXO came back, we had ash
4 all over our mouths and teeth and Mrs LXO started
5 shouting at us calling us dirty.

6 I was terrified and ran into the bedroom and was so
7 scared I wet myself. Mrs LXO came in and smacked
8 me on the legs, which because my legs were wet from
9 having wet myself, was agony.

10 If we were in the living room, we were put behind
11 the couch. If we moved or made even the slightest
12 noise, either Mr or Mrs LXN-LXO or one of the daughters
13 would slap us.

14 On one occasion I was outside while the LXN-LXO
15 ate and it was freezing. I fell and cut my thigh and
16 was screaming. Mr and Mrs LXN-LXO put me in a shed
17 that the dog used and I was terrified because I had been
18 bitten by a dog only a few weeks previous.

19 The dog didn't bite me and I was so tired that
20 I actually fell asleep leaning on the dog. I don't
21 recall if the LXN-LXO locked the door of the hut or
22 not. Despite the fact I had a nasty cut on my thigh,
23 I received no medical treatment.

24 My whole memory of that house was being in fear and
25 having to stay out of the way of all the LXN-LXO We

1 learned to stay still, to stay out of the way, that way
2 we avoided getting any slaps.

3 Mr and Mrs LXN-LXO slapped us regularly, but the
4 daughters often punched and kicked us and shouted at us.
5 I think a lot of the daughters' aggression came from
6 having to share their bed with us.

7 I personally didn't report the abuse from the
8 LXN-LXO to anybody as I was too young, but the fact
9 that the social workers took us away at short notice and
10 given the condition we were in would suggest that
11 somebody had reported it.

12 One day social workers picked us all up and took us
13 to a doctor, we had lice, scabies and were malnourished,
14 underweight and dehydrated. I don't actually recall
15 this, but I have been told it by my mum and older
16 sister. When the social workers picked us up, they told
17 us not to tell the LXN-LXO that we wouldn't be going
18 back to them.

19 I'm sure we left not long after our mum had visited
20 us, so I suppose it's possible that we left because of
21 complaints that she had made. My recollection of
22 leaving the LXN-LXO was that we were sneaked out of
23 the house. After we went to the doctor, I don't know if
24 we went back to our mum's or went straight to
25 Quarriers."

1 From paragraphs 42 to 119, 'Jane' describes her
2 experiences at Quarriers, where she suffered physical,
3 sexual and emotional abuse. 'Jane's' housemother there
4 was QNZ [REDACTED] who was subsequently convicted of
5 abuse. 'Jane' later gave evidence at that trial.

6 From paragraphs 120 to 125, 'Jane' speaks of her
7 life after care. She was discharged to the care of her
8 mother with her older brother and sister. As her
9 younger sisters were still in care, although 'Jane'
10 hesitates to use that word as she says it certainly
11 wasn't care, social workers continued to be involved
12 with her mum. 'Jane' says that they lived in one room
13 in a homeless unit before moving to Pilton in Edinburgh,
14 where they were joined by 'Jane's' younger sisters.

15 'Jane' says that she didn't know what a good life
16 was, but was determined that she would have one. She
17 lied about her age and got two jobs while still at
18 secondary school, as she was determined to have money.

19 After leaving school, she worked as much as she
20 could. Her first full-time job was in the Civil Service
21 and she moved from there to the banking sector, where
22 she currently works. She married and had two daughters.

23 Moving to paragraph 127 on page 23:

24 "The impact of my time in the 'care system' has been
25 immense. It has been largely negative and has driven

1 many negative/destructive behaviours throughout all
2 aspects of my adult life. I will attempt to outline
3 them below.

4 This has to be the area that has suffered most -- as
5 an expectant mum, my life fell apart. What should have
6 been a time where I looked forward to bringing
7 a much-wanted child into this world turned out to be one
8 of the most catastrophic periods of my life (aside from
9 my time in 'care') and the life that I had built after
10 Quarriers became a thing of the past.

11 I suddenly started to fret about dying, about not
12 being around to care for this child that I was carrying.
13 To being fearful that something would happen to me,
14 rendering my unborn child without a mother. The fear
15 was indescribable. I couldn't articulate to anyone why
16 I was feeling the way I was because I had never divulged
17 the true horrors of my time in care to anyone. I was
18 trapped with my own thoughts and fears and started to
19 become unwell mentally.

20 Once my first daughter was born, I became a shadow
21 of who I had been prior to becoming pregnant, but I was
22 determined to be the best mum that I could, despite it
23 being a daily struggle. I became anxious that my
24 daughter would come to harm and rather than enjoy being
25 a new mum, I was terrified of something happening to

1 her, her being stolen from me by predators or by me
2 becoming unwell and her being taken off me.

3 I refused to go to any hospital because I was so
4 afraid of someone stating that I was mentally unwell and
5 unfit, so I basically battled every day to appear okay.
6 I lived each day fretting and worrying and became more
7 and more ill, only accepting antidepressants when she
8 was six months old because my mental health reached such
9 a peak that my doctor decided, with my permission, to
10 give me tablets.

11 I had my second daughter and felt stronger, using
12 some of the behavioural techniques that I had learnt and
13 put them into practice, and by then I had also been
14 honest with my husband so that he had a bit of
15 an understanding of the underlying issues and fears.
16 Regardless, I have spent every day of their lives
17 worrying about their safety. I still do that.

18 I have had first-hand experience of good people
19 being abusers so I am always looking out for the signs
20 and I trust no one, not one person. I only trust myself
21 with them. It's exhausting being this way. It has
22 impacted on my relationship with them as they don't
23 fully understand why I am so paranoid, they just don't
24 get it and they can't, as I haven't divulged my
25 childhood to them apart from knowing that I didn't have

1 a great time in 'care'."

2 Now to paragraph 139:

3 "Additionally, in terms of discipline, I have
4 struggled with that. I pride myself on bringing up two
5 hard-working, caring girls, but I accept that I could
6 have parented them better if I had the confidence to
7 reprimand without believing that they would feel the
8 same despair and misery that I felt when I was in
9 similar situations in my childhood where I was being
10 reprimanded. Those occasions for me were filled with
11 aggression, fear and isolation, so I erred on the side
12 of caution and shied away from anything that would make
13 them feel afraid. Now I know that they weren't living
14 my young life and it would never be the same experience
15 for them. You live and learn.

16 Work life has been another area of absolute
17 exhaustion. I always worked regardless of being ill.
18 I would still go to work so that I never ran the risk of
19 losing a job. I also worried that my girls would be
20 taken off me if I couldn't provide for them. The
21 feeling of mental exhaustion was immense. I struggled,
22 if I am honest, and that led to more periods of
23 heightened anxiety.

24 I trusted no one and probably still don't. The
25 abuse has left a mark on my life and I don't believe

1 that I will ever come to terms with that -- period.

2 I still suffer anxiety about being bad or being
3 perceived as being bad. This cripples me. It is
4 a trait that I still have to this day the. About always
5 having good behaviour even when I disagree with
6 someone's actions. My default is to be quiet, not to
7 rock the boat, be invisible so to speak."

8 Now to paragraph 145 on page 27:

9 "I won't let people walk over me but I know that
10 I have a long way to go to get to the point of not being
11 fearful of being a bad person by standing up for what I
12 believe in. This is one of the biggest fallouts from
13 being in 'care'.

14 No one ever supported me to tell me that I wasn't
15 bad or it wasn't my fault. I had no one's guidance and
16 I was always being told that I was bad. You start to
17 believe it and I guess that these fears and traits have
18 followed me into adulthood. I can't go back and undo
19 them. I can only move forward and hope that I can make
20 some peace with myself in the coming years.

21 One final thing, no child should have to suffer in
22 the way that me and my siblings did. To start your
23 childhood with the levels of abuse that we did was
24 avoidable. As a child, to feel the misery that I did
25 was shameful. It was my birthright to enjoy a childhood

1 filled with innocence and happy memories. That was
2 robbed from me by the very people put in place to
3 protect me and for that, I will always feel an element
4 of despair.

5 I have a good life now, and it is what I make and
6 I strive (and succeed!) to make it good for me and my
7 children so I am not beaten, I will not let the past
8 define me. However, I have to acknowledge the impact of
9 my own experiences in the hope that history does not
10 repeat itself for other children who find themselves in
11 a care environment."

12 Now to paragraph 166 on page 31:

13 "I would love to get hold of my records because
14 there are gaps in my life that I would like to fill in.
15 It's not about the detail that there would be in such
16 records as I doubt if they were truthfully filled in,
17 but I do have some trepidation about what they would
18 contain. However, it is the timeline I would be
19 interested in so I can understand where I was at certain
20 points of my young life and why I was where I was.

21 People should be able to read the warning signs
22 shown by children when something is upsetting them.
23 People shouldn't be scared to act on what they see and
24 shouldn't assume that somebody else will take care of
25 it. They shouldn't be scared to be wrong and should

1 investigate if they see something wrong with a child.

2 People shouldn't have to worry about the impact of
3 being wrong if they try to intercede on a child's
4 behalf. If it is being done in the right way and with
5 the child's best interests at heart, then it should be
6 understood as such.

7 Listen to children, be aware of what they are not
8 telling you. Look for the hidden signs. Silence can be
9 the loudest message. When I think of all the touch
10 points that I was going through in the care system and
11 not one person acted in my best interest, it fills me
12 with despair and anger.

13 Don't bury your head in the sand, listen to your
14 instincts and keep pushing in the most sensitive way to
15 fully understand that child. It's vital that you see
16 beyond the silence, see beyond the behaviours and
17 question why, always ask why a child is behaving in
18 a certain way and look to support them."

19 To paragraph 173 on page 32:

20 "Children should be listened to. They shouldn't be
21 put in isolation where they have nobody they trust to
22 speak to.

23 I have no objection to my witness statement being
24 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
25 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

1 true."

2 And 'Jane' signed her statement on 4 November 2019.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Ms Rattray.

4 So, now?

5 MS RATTRAY: Now, my Lady, we have an oral witness and

6 Ms Innes will take this witness.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

8 We'll move on to the oral evidence then.

9 Ms Innes.

10 MS INNES: My Lady, the next witness is Angela Harkins. She

11 has waived anonymity. When Angela was taken into care

12 initially she was in the care of Edinburgh Corporation,

13 which then became Lothian Regional Council.

14 Her first foster care placement was between

15 31 October 1975 and 11 January 1977 with a carer in

16 Edinburgh.

17 She had a later placement in foster care in

18 Edinburgh from 23 December 1982 until 16 October 1984,

19 so City of Edinburgh Council are the relevant successor.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

21 While she's being brought in, the LXN-LXO of

22 Bonnyrigg of course are protected by my general

23 restriction order and their identity is not to be

24 revealed outside this room.

25 The witness will be ready in a moment. Thank you.

1 (Pause)

2 Angela Harkins (sworn)

3 LADY SMITH: We do need you to use the microphone so your
4 voice comes through the sound system, if you can stay in
5 a good position for that it would be helpful.

6 A. Okay.

7 LADY SMITH: You'll see there's a red folder there. It has
8 a hard copy of your statement in it and you'll be taken
9 to that in a minute or two. Also, we'll bring your
10 statement up on the screen and go to the relevant parts
11 of it as we go through your evidence. You might find it
12 helpful. You don't have to use it, but if it helps it's
13 there.

14 A. (Witness nods)

15 LADY SMITH: Can you help me with one hopefully easy
16 question. What would you like me to call you? Your
17 first name, "Angela", or "Ms Harkins"? I'm happy with
18 either, what works for you?

19 A. I've always been known as "Angie".

20 LADY SMITH: Well, Angie, I'm very happy to call you Angie.
21 Angie, do be assured that I know it's not easy to
22 come into a public forum and give evidence, any evidence
23 at all, and that it's particularly challenging when the
24 evidence you're going to be asked to give is about
25 yourself, your own life, and particularly about your

1 childhood, including talking about difficult things
2 regarding your childhood.

3 Please understand that I know that and I want to do
4 anything we can do to enable you to give the best
5 evidence you can. So if you want a break at any time,
6 that's fine. If you want to just sit and pause at any
7 time, that's fine. Or if there's anything else,
8 anything you want to ask, please ask. Whatever works
9 for you will work for me, I promise. All right?

10 A. Thank you.

11 LADY SMITH: I'll hand over to Ms Innes if you're ready.

12 Ms Innes.

13 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

14 Questions from Ms Innes

15 MS INNES: Angie, we understand that you were born in 1967.

16 Is that right?

17 A. That's correct, yeah.

18 Q. I'm just going to refer to your statement. We give it
19 the reference WIT-1-000000906, and you'll see it coming
20 up on the screen there. If we go to the final page,
21 please, page 35, and paragraph 171, we see that it says
22 there:

23 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
24 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

25 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

1 true."

2 I think that you signed this statement on

3 10 February of this year, 2022. Is that right?

4 A. Yes, I did.

5 Q. Thank you.

6 I'm going to go back to the beginning of your

7 statement.

8 You tell us at paragraph 2 that you have [REDACTED]

9 [REDACTED] is that

10 right?

11 A. That's correct.

12 Q. It's been blanked out on the screen there, but

13 underneath what's blanked out, I think I can tell you

14 that what it says is [REDACTED]

15 [REDACTED],

16 [REDACTED]

17 [REDACTED]. Is that right?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. You tell us that you initially lived with your parents

20 [REDACTED], you can remember living with

21 them?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Then you remember that there were some difficulties and

24 you spent quite a lot of time with your grandmother?

25 A. That's correct, my nana.

1 Q. [REDACTED]
2 [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED]
4 A. [REDACTED]
5 Q. Then the next thing that you tell us about at
6 paragraph 4 is that you can remember being frightened in
7 the house and then you say you were in a nice dress and
8 you thought you were going on a holiday, but the holiday
9 was in fact to St Helen's Nursery and you were being
10 taken into care?
11 A. Yes, that's correct.
12 Q. Did [REDACTED] you go to St Helen's Nursery?
13 A. Yes, [REDACTED] got taken. My Nana [REDACTED] my father's
14 mother, and my father took [REDACTED] to St Helen's.
15 Q. Okay. I'm going to move over the time that you were at
16 St Helen's, and if we can move, please, to page 5 and
17 paragraph 22, you tell us that you left St Helen's
18 Nursery you think when you were about six?
19 A. Yes. It was round about that age.
20 Q. You went to live with a person called EQC [REDACTED]?
21 A. Yes, that's correct.
22 Q. She lived in Edinburgh, I think?
23 A. Yes, she lived at [REDACTED].
24 Q. You tell us at paragraph 22 that you have some memories
25 of going there for a visit before you went to stay, and

1 you have a memory of the dog and being frightened of the
2 dog?

3 A. Yes, that's correct.

4 Q. Did you know that you were visiting this lady with
5 a plan to staying with her or did you have any concept
6 of what was going on?

7 A. I don't think at the time I did, no. No -- I just
8 remember being in that house with the dog and being
9 absolutely terrified of it and running round and round
10 the room with the dog there.

11 Q. Then if we go over the page, please, to page 6 and
12 paragraph 23, you then tell us that you went to live
13 there permanently -- well, for a longer period of time?

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. You describe EQC [REDACTED] and you say she seemed like
16 an old lady to you?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Did you have any concept of how old she was?

19 A. Not at the time, apart from she had grey hair. But when
20 I look back, yeah, she was probably late 50s, maybe
21 a bit older.

22 Q. Was she living on her own at that point or not?

23 A. This is what I get confused about because she had a son
24 [REDACTED] that lived there as well, but I can't really
25 remember seeing him living there, but he was there.

1 Q. Okay. And the son [REDACTED], was he grown up, was he
2 an adult?

3 A. Yeah, he was an adult.

4 Q. You say that you were asked to call her Auntie EQC ,
5 I think that's what you were told to call her?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You say at the end of paragraph 23 that you didn't
8 understand what auntie meant at that point?

9 A. I don't think I did, because I was in care from the age
10 of three, so I didn't really obviously then know what
11 an auntie was. I didn't know my family. I only knew my
12 mother and father.

13 Q. Did you go there [REDACTED] ?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. In the house, what were the sleeping arrangements? Did
16 you have to share a room with anyone?

17 A. [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED].

19 Q. And then EQC would have had a room as well?

20 A. EQC lived down the stairs in the front room.

21 Q. When you say the front room, was that a bedroom?

22 A. It was a bedroom. EQC 's bed was in it so it was
23 a bedroom, but there was also a living room as well at
24 the back of the house.

25 Q. Her son [REDACTED], did he have a room in the house or can

1 you --

2 A. This is what I don't know. I cannot remember this.
3 I've been trying to put this sort of together. [REDACTED]
4 was there but I don't know if he lived there or was just
5 there. I can't really remember that part. But there
6 was only two rooms up the stairs and one was definitely
7 [REDACTED] and one was [REDACTED] myself.

8 Q. Okay. We'll come back to what you say at paragraph 25,
9 about the impact of your experience in foster care.
10 We'll come back to that.

11 At paragraph 26, you say that you can remember
12 foster care being different to St Helen's.

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. Can you describe how it was different, how it felt
15 different at the time?

16 A. Well, [REDACTED] lived in St Helen's for quite a long time. It
17 was a great big old house where there were dormitories
18 that [REDACTED] all lived in, so you were with your -- other
19 children all the time, great big rooms to run about and
20 scream and shout, a great big massive garden to run
21 around and shout and bawl and be a child.

22 Going into foster care with EQC [REDACTED] was absolutely
23 claustrophobic for me, being in that house and always
24 being told to be quiet and not being aware of -- you
25 know, that you're shouting and bawling, because that's

1 really what [REDACTED] were.

2 Q. Okay. You say in this paragraph that you said to EOC [REDACTED]

3 that you wanted to go back to St Helen's.

4 A. Yes, I remember that well. I always wanted to go back

5 to St Helen's.

6 Q. What was her reaction to you saying that?

7 A. Quite aggressive. EOC [REDACTED] was quite an aggressive woman.

8 Q. Aggressive in what way?

9 A. Her response to me or, you know, asking questions, a lot

10 of the time I was always told to shut up, be quiet, be

11 quiet. I mean I remember her voice so well always

12 telling me to be quiet or shut up. Go away was another

13 one.

14 Q. If we move on over the page, you tell us about some of

15 the other things about living in this house. You talk

16 at paragraph 27 about the dog that you'd been frightened

17 by the dog, but then you say ultimately he became your

18 best friend?

19 A. Yeah, he did.

20 Q. In the house, okay. You say your mum later told you

21 that you'd been attacked by a dog when you were a baby?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. So that might explain your fear of the dog initially?

24 A. Yeah. I mean can I just emphasise, I was literally

25 terrified of the dog and being in a room with a dog

1 would have me -- you know, I remember just being --
2 screaming, crying, not wanting to be in the house, just
3 constantly being obsessed with the dog and how
4 frightened I was of the dog.
5 Q. Can you remember if that carried on for a while after
6 you went to live with EQC ?
7 A. Yes, it did. It took a long time before I really became
8 friends with Rory.
9 Q. Did anyone help you to --
10 A. No.
11 Q. -- manage your fear?
12 A. No.
13 Q. At paragraph 28 you talk about bed-wetting and did you
14 wet the bed when you lived at EQC 's, can you remember?
15 A. Yes, I did.
16 Q. What was her reaction?
17 A. Anger. Upset that I was wetting the bed. Lazy, I was
18 lazy. She always told me I was lazy.
19 Q. You tell us here that sometimes she would pull you about
20 while she was hitting you as a result of this?
21 A. Yeah.
22 Q. You also say that sometimes she took the sheets off the
23 bed, put them in your face and flung the wet sheets over
24 you?
25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. Who washed the sheets?

2 A. I presume it must have been EQC .

3 Q. Okay. And you can remember having a rubber bed or

4 a rubber cover over the bed?

5 A. Yeah, it was a brown -- I remember it, a brown rubber --

6 I don't know if it was the whole mattress, I think it

7 was, but this brown rubber sheet. I don't know if it

8 was -- as I say, the whole mattress. I can't remember

9 quite clearly on that, but I remember the colour brown

10 rubber to stop ruining mattresses.

11 Q. You say that a lot of the time you were made to sleep on

12 the rubber bed with no sheets?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. You remember that, okay.

15 Then you go on to talk about the food in the house

16 in the next paragraph, paragraph 29, and you say you're

17 not sure whether you're mixed up between her house and

18 living with your mother, but you say you were always

19 hungry.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What was the food at EQC 's like? Do you have any

22 memories of that?

23 A. Yes, I do. The food was always horrible. It was not

24 food that obviously I liked. I was forced to eat food

25 that I didn't like. Or when [REDACTED] got back from school it

1 would be the same food from the night before but cold
2 or -- on the same plate and forced to eat it. She used
3 to get very, very angry and hit [REDACTED] if [REDACTED] gave the food
4 to Rory the dog, and Rory was always taken out the
5 kitchen when [REDACTED] were -- [REDACTED] sit there for hours with
6 the food in front of [REDACTED] until [REDACTED] ate it.

7 Q. You're saying that you either had to sit there until it
8 was finished, but if it wasn't finished would you get
9 the same food again the next day?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. You say at paragraph 31 that you went to the local
12 primary school. How did you find school?

13 A. When I remember back, I loved Roseburn Primary School.
14 That was the primary school I went to as a nursery and
15 first, second and -- primary 1, 2 and 3, and I loved
16 school. When I went to Drylaw school, I was bullied.
17 I was called smelly, obviously because I didn't always
18 have baths in the morning after wetting the bed.
19 I think I must have smelt. School was awful in Drylaw.

20 Q. Okay. What was the routine at EQC's about washing and
21 bathing? How often did you get a bath?

22 A. Well, I used to have to have a bath every day. [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED] didn't wet the bed, it was only me,
24 and I was the problem because of obviously my
25 bed-wetting, but I remember being in the bath a lot and

1 learning to run the bath myself, but there was a lot of
2 times I couldn't have a bath and I'd just put my clothes
3 on and go to school.

4 Q. When you say there were a lot of times you couldn't have
5 a bath, was that because there wasn't enough time or you
6 weren't allowed to?

7 A. I wasn't allowed to. I was just told to get dressed and
8 go to school.

9 Q. If we go on over the page to the top of page 8, please,
10 and paragraph 32, you tell us there that you had temper
11 tantrums that you couldn't control and you say that you
12 didn't sleep and were up all the time.

13 A. Yes, yeah.

14 Q. And you went to see a doctor?

15 A. Yes. I always knew I was a bit of a problem as a child,
16 [REDACTED]
17 [REDACTED], where I wouldn't sleep, I would have major,
18 major temper tantrums where I'd be lying on floors and
19 screaming and kicking and -- you know.

20 So I remember being taken to a doctor about this and
21 the word "manic" coming into my life then, because
22 she -- if I done anything, "Oh, you're manic, you're
23 manic", that's all I got told I was, and I didn't know
24 what that meant or understood that until much later on
25 in life.

1 Q. How did it make you feel at the time, can you remember?

2 A. I don't -- I just -- I don't know. I just knew that

3 this was a bad word, you know, and if I'd done anything

4 wrong I was manic.

5 Q. At paragraph 33 you say that you don't remember seeing

6 any social workers when you were at EQC s?

7 A. No, I don't. I don't remember ever seeing social

8 workers, no. I remember seeing a social worker that had

9 black bags when leaving, a man, but

10 never -- no.

11 The only person I ever remember seeing in EQC s

12 house is my nana.

13 Q. In terms of other adults that you knew coming into the

14 house, that was the only person that you could remember,

15 your nana?

16 A. The only person I can ever remember being in EQC s

17 house. And I remember where she was sitting, because it

18 was such a big thing.

19 Q. You talk about contact with your family in the next

20 section of your statement. You say that you can

21 remember that you wrote letters to your nana and got

22 letters from her?

23 A. Yes, that's correct.

24 Q. Then you started having weekends with your mum?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. How did that work out?

2 A. That was awful.

3 Q. How was it awful?

4 A. That's when all different trouble started coming to my

5 life as well, with EQC hating my mother, calling my

6 mother names. [REDACTED] allowed to speak to my mother

7 on the phone if she phoned. Not wanting to go back to

8 my mother's either, because there was a lot much

9 violence in my mother's life and watching -- and that

10 brought on different worry for me, worrying about my

11 mother when I was back at EQC's. I never wanted to

12 leave my mother's to go back to EQC's and then by the

13 time the weekend come, I'd probably adjusted to EQC's

14 and then I never want to go back to mum's, because

15 I [REDACTED] never get any food at mum's or -- the

16 violence.

17 Q. You describe in your evidence that on the one hand you

18 were worried about your mum and you wanted to reassure

19 yourself that she was okay and therefore see her?

20 A. (Witness nods)

21 Q. But then, on the other hand, you didn't want to see her

22 because of what you were exposed to --

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. -- when you were with her. I think also the transitions

25 between the two were difficult because, from what you're

1 saying, EQC would be angry with you and she was saying
2 negative things about your mother?

3 A. Yes, that's correct.

4 Q. Did these weekends carry on for the whole time that you
5 were at EQC's, can you remember?

6 A. I think they did, I think they did carry on.

7 Q. Can you remember seeing your father when you lived at
8 EQC's?

9 A. No. I never saw my father at EQC's that I can
10 remember of. That didn't start until [REDACTED] went back into
11 the children's home, then he started -- oh I'm not sure
12 if it was at EQC's or Haddington that he started
13 coming and taking [REDACTED] to the ice rink.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I'm a bit confused about all that. And when I spoke to
16 [REDACTED] about that, he can't remember either what --
17 if that was EQC's -- but I don't think it was EQC's,
18 I think it was maybe Haddington that he started coming
19 into my life again.

20 Q. Okay. Over the page at page 9, paragraph 37, you start
21 telling us about some of the abuse that you experienced
22 when you were living with EQC and you've already
23 described that she was aggressive and you say here you
24 were always frightened of her.

25 A. I was terrified of EQC.

1 Q. Do you know why that was?

2 A. Because she didn't like me. [REDACTED].

3 Q. How did you know that she didn't like you?

4 A. She told [REDACTED]. EQC [REDACTED] had other foster children and she

5 always said they were really well-behaved and they were

6 very good children. [REDACTED]

7 [REDACTED].

8 Q. Did she have other foster children when you were there

9 or are these foster children that she'd had before you

10 came?

11 A. These were foster children before [REDACTED] came. [REDACTED]

12 [REDACTED]

13 [REDACTED].

14 Q. Okay. You talk in this paragraph about her hitting you.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Did she hit you with her hands or with implements, can

17 you remember?

18 A. Pulling my hair was the main one. She'd always grab you

19 by the hair, EQC [REDACTED]. She'd hit you across the head.

20 Legs. Anywhere. Kick you.

21 Q. You say she always grabbed you by the hair when she

22 started. Would that be to drag you into another room or

23 not?

24 A. I remember she dragged me up the stairs once with the

25 hair and slapping me the whole time. I can't remember

1 what that was for, it could be for anything.

2 Q. You say that the beatings were a part of day-to-day

3 living.

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. You say you always wanted to please her?

6 A. Yes. I always tried to please EQC

7 Q. Can you explain the sorts --

8 A. I always wanted her to like me.

9

10 Q. Can you explain the ways in which you tried to please

11 her, can you remember?

12 A. I can't really remember now.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. I don't know if I probably could have done anything, but

15 I -- I just remember this feeling of always wanting her

16 to like me.

17

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. She certainly liked a lot more than she liked

20 me and I always used to put it down to my bed-wetting.

21 She hated my bed-wetting.

22 Q. EQC

23 ?

24 A. Very aggressively.

25 Q. what she did to you?

1 A. Yeah, probably a bit worse.

2 Q. What sort of things did you see happening [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED]?

4 A. Being hit, being kicked, being locked in the room, being
5 force fed.

6 Q. You tell us at paragraph 40 that there was a time when
7 [REDACTED] set fire to the room.

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. What did [REDACTED]? Can you tell us a bit about that?

10 A. I don't actually know what [REDACTED] done. [REDACTED]
11 [REDACTED]

12 [REDACTED]. It's just there was a fire in the room that
13 [REDACTED] set alight the room.

14 Q. You say:

15 "I thought [REDACTED] was going to die, not because of the
16 fire but because of EQC [REDACTED]."

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Can you explain that, please?

19 A. Well, [REDACTED] was beaten up really badly by EQC [REDACTED]
20 because of that, screaming and shouting, [REDACTED]
21 screaming, me being terrified that something really bad
22 was happening to [REDACTED] in the room, and just ...
23 a beating, a really severe beating [REDACTED] got.

24 Q. You say that you can remember EQC [REDACTED] putting food in [REDACTED]
25 [REDACTED]'s mouth and [REDACTED] was choking?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Can you --

3 A. I remember being beaten for that as well, for screaming
4 and shouting for her to leave [REDACTED] alone.

5 Q. Okay. Did this happen at a meal time?

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. If we go back up to paragraph 38, you talk about being
8 beaten up badly and you weren't allowed to go and see
9 your mum that weekend.

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. Can you remember what happened on that occasion?

12 A. I can't remember what I did for that. I think it was
13 when I was sent to the dentist. We were supposed meet
14 EOC [REDACTED] in Pilton and we didn't turn up, [REDACTED] and I,
15 because we were too scared to go into Pilton, and when
16 you live in [REDACTED], that sort of makes sense. It was
17 an area that you just didn't go into. And me and [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED] refusing to meet her and going back to the house
19 and her coming back to the house and [REDACTED] standing there.
20 And I remember being beaten -- I think it was definitely
21 the dentist that beating was, to do with the dentist and
22 not going to the dentist.

23 Q. You say that you were beaten so that your face and ear
24 were bleeding?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. Did you get to see a doctor or anything?

2 A. I can't remember if I saw a doctor or not, but I do
3 remember not being able to go and see my mum. That's
4 for sure. Because I used to shout at EQC that my mum
5 was going to batter her, because this is what my mum
6 used to tell . She was going to come to and
7 get and batter EQC, so I used to repeat that to
8 EQC.

9 Q. Did you tell your mum what was going on at EQC's?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Was that your mum's reaction?

12 A. Yes. My mum wasn't allowed to come and see at
13 EQC's at all. She wasn't allowed in the house or
14 anywhere near the house. Obviously now it must have
15 been because of her threats to EQC. And probably
16 filling heads with these threats to EQC as well,
17 because I used to repeat everything, tell her everything
18 my mum said to try and frighten her, I probably thought.

19 Q. At the bottom of this page at paragraph 42, you talk
20 about another person arriving called EQD

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. I think he's somebody who was EQC's partner and
23 ultimately married EQC; is that right?

24 A. Yes, that's what happened. He -- I can't remember -- he
25 wasn't there when first went there. He was not there

1 at all for quite a long time.

2 Q. What did he look like? How old was he, do you know?

3 A. He was really old because he had white hair, and he used

4 to wear sunglasses where you couldn't see his eyes.

5 Q. So like sort of sunglasses or tinted lenses or

6 something?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You say all of a sudden he was in the house all the

9 time?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So is it your memory that he wasn't around and then

12 suddenly he was?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. You say that he was somebody who lived nearby?

15 A. Yes, round the corner.

16 Q. And you say that you hated him. Are you able to tell us

17 why that was?

18 A. At the beginning or what it became?

19 Q. At the beginning.

20 A. Yeah, because he -- I didn't like him, I didn't like

21 EQC, I didn't like him. I can't remember why I didn't

22 like him. He -- I just didn't like him. I didn't like

23 his glasses.

24 Q. Was he somebody that you felt frightened of at the

25 beginning or not?

1 A. Yes. Straight away I was frightened of him.

2 Q. You say there that you didn't know what was going to
3 happen when you got in from school?

4 A. No, not when he was there, no.

5 Q. Why was that?

6 A. He was so strict.

7 Q. What sort of things would he do? How was he strict?

8 A. I can't really clarify on that. He was just very
9 strict. You always had to be quiet. You always had to
10 be quiet. So you didn't speak to him. He was just
11 there.

12 Q. Then you tell us about a day that he was in the house
13 and EQC wasn't, and he told you to change out of your
14 school uniform.

15 A. Yes. When [REDACTED] used to finish school, [REDACTED] used to just go
16 home and play out on the street right outside the house.
17 [REDACTED] were -- how the house was situated was right next to
18 an alleyway that led over to [REDACTED] a park, so [REDACTED]
19 were given the freedom, as soon as [REDACTED] got home from
20 school, [REDACTED] were allowed to -- well, she wanted [REDACTED] out
21 the house right away, so [REDACTED] be out the house playing
22 and up the alleyway and in the park.

23 And this day, I remember it as clear as day because
24 it was so confusing, he told me to come in and take my
25 clothes off, my school uniform off, because I wasn't

1 allowed to play in my school uniform, but [REDACTED] always did
2 play in [REDACTED] school uniform, whatever [REDACTED] had on [REDACTED] just
3 played in.

4 Q. You say that he stood and watched you getting changed?

5 A. Yes. Well, my room was up the stairs, so I went up the
6 stairs to take my school uniform off and he came right
7 into my room behind me and I think that must have been
8 the first time he ever came into my room, so that's why
9 I think I remember it so clearly and feeling quite
10 frightened of it -- well, I was frightened of him, but
11 feeling his big presence there must have -- this is why
12 I think I remember it so clearly.

13 Q. [REDACTED]?

14 A. No. No.

15 Q. Then at paragraph 43, you say that [REDACTED] had a dog as
16 well?

17 A. Yes, [REDACTED] had a dog called Sandy, who I was terrified
18 of. The only dog I wasn't scared of was Rory, and then
19 I became absolutely -- this dog arrived with [REDACTED] one
20 day and I was terrified of it. It was a lot bigger than
21 Rory. It was very hairy, like as in long hair, and
22 yeah, I was terrified of Sandy. It started happening
23 all over again.

24 Q. Then you tell us that [REDACTED] was going to help you and
25 started taking you to his house so that you would not be

1 scared of Sandy?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Who told you that that was going to happen?

4 A. I don't remember who told me that was going to happen.

5 It must have been EQD or EQC but that was what

6 happened. He took me round to his house in [REDACTED]

7 [REDACTED], which was a ground floor flat and very

8 dark inside, and he -- he -- that was the second time

9 I met Sandy, the dog, in that house.

10 Q. You tell us that EQD sexually abused you in the house?

11 A. Yes, he did.

12 Q. Do you feel able to tell us what happened?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I'll try my best.

16 Q. Please go on.

17 A. (Pause)

18 LADY SMITH: Do you want to just tell us in your own words

19 what you feel able to tell us, Angie?

20 A. Yes, yes.

21 LADY SMITH: Okay. Start at the beginning and see how you

22 get on.

23 A. Well, I went round to EQD's house with EQD from [REDACTED]

24 [REDACTED] to [REDACTED] to make friends

25 with Sandy, because EQD was going to come and live in

1 the house with us when he got married to EQC, and
2 I didn't want all this to happen because of Sandy the
3 dog and I was going round -- he was taking me to the
4 house, he told me, so I could make friends with Sandy
5 the same way I made friends with Rory.

6 I went into his house and I remember it being very
7 dark. I don't know if the -- I can't remember if the
8 curtains were shut or if it was just a dark house, but
9 it was dark. And then that's when he told me to take my
10 clothes off again. And that's when it happened. And it
11 happened quite a lot.

12 LADY SMITH: Can you tell me anything else about what it was
13 that happened? Are you able to do that or not?

14 A. Yeah. He touched me and it was very painful. I didn't
15 know what was going on. (Pause)

16 LADY SMITH: Had you taken your clothes off?

17 A. Yes. I was lying on a sofa with my clothes off. In the
18 dark. Where he sexually assaulted me, yeah, and it was
19 very painful.

20 LADY SMITH: Were you still at primary school at that stage?

21 A. Yes.

22 LADY SMITH: At Drylaw?

23 A. Yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: So you hadn't reached 11 years old, you were
25 younger than that then?

1 A. I was seven.

2 LADY SMITH: Still very young.

3 A. Yeah.

4 MS INNES: You say this happened more than once, Angie?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Did he tell you not to tell anyone about it?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. What did he say?

9 A. After the first time it happened, he told me to get

10 dressed and sit there and I sat there, then he took me

11 back round to EQC s, and on the way round he told me

12 if I ever told EQC or my

13 mother, he would kill me.

14 And I remember not even knowing what that word meant,

15 but I knew I was really frightened.

16 Q. Okay. This started, I think, before EQC and EQD got

17 married?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You tell us that they then got married?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You say that you weren't at

22 the wedding?

23 A. No.

24 Q. How did you feel about him coming to live in the house?

25 Was he going to come and live in the house full time

1 then?

2 A. I was terrified of him. I was terrified for myself [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED]

4 Q. Okay. You say at paragraph 47 that he was also angry,
5 aggressive and violent --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- towards you [REDACTED]? Did that start
8 happening after he and EQC [REDACTED] had got married or was that
9 happening before, can you remember?

10 A. He was very controlling before they got married, but
11 then when he moved into the house he became very --
12 I can't -- like he was silent, but he was aggressive.
13 You knew not to do anything wrong, not to say anything
14 wrong. He didn't always have to say aggressive things
15 to you to know to be frightened.

16 Q. You say that there was no warning, it was always sudden
17 and frightening.

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. That's your memory of it.

20 Again, you say that you never saw him be aggressive
21 to [REDACTED]?

22 A. No, I never saw him ever -- [REDACTED] was very quiet,
23 very well-behaved, very intelligent, very much
24 a bookworm. Myself [REDACTED] very different.

25 Q. You say that you would have temper tantrums and you

1 would try to fight back, [REDACTED]?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What sort of things would you do?

4 A. Try and -- try and save [REDACTED]. Try and grab [REDACTED],

5 try and get [REDACTED] away from him. I'd shout and scream,

6 hoping probably at the time -- hoping they would maybe

7 hit me. I don't know what I would think, why I'd start

8 behaving like that, but I just always remember feeling

9 that he was going to kill [REDACTED]

10 Q. Okay.

11 A. It was all very confusing and very, very difficult when

12 he was there. For me.

13 Q. After he moved into the house, did the sexual abuse

14 continue?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Did EQC see what was going on in terms of EQD's

17 behaviour towards [REDACTED] you?

18 A. Yes, I think so. I think she'd have to be blind not to.

19 Q. Do you think she was aware of the sexual abuse?

20 A. Yes, she was.

21 Q. Why do you say that?

22 A. Because I told her.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. Because I had blood on my underwear and she asked me

25 what that was and I said that's because of EQD what he

1 done. And she asked me and I told her. At his house.
2 And I also told my -- my nana as well.
3 Q. What was EQC's reaction to you telling her this?
4 A. Really angry. At me.
5 Q. Did she do anything about it in terms of reporting to
6 anybody or anything like that?
7 A. I don't know. I don't know.
8 Q. Was that before she and EQD got married, I think you
9 said that was when it had happened at his house?
10 A. Yes. That was -- no, it was still happening in [REDACTED]
11 [REDACTED]. He was still doing it to me in [REDACTED] as
12 well.
13 Q. Even after they got married --
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. -- he still had the other flat?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. You say that you also told your nana about the sexual
18 abuse?
19 A. Yes. About the blood, yeah.
20 Q. What did your nana say, can you remember?
21 A. I can't remember this. This is -- I can't remember what
22 happened.
23 Q. You say at paragraph 49 that after you told EQC, you
24 said you were slapped for it and the sexual abuse did
25 not stop.

1 A. That's correct, yeah.

2 Q. Then you remember telling your nana and you can't
3 remember how she reacted and you don't know what they
4 did, but then you [REDACTED] got moved out?

5 A. That's correct, yeah. [REDACTED] went to -- [REDACTED] got moved pretty
6 quickly after that to Haddington.

7 Q. I think you say at the next paragraph that you don't
8 know whether there was any connection between what you'd
9 said and the move.

10 A. No, I don't. I don't know and I can't remember if there
11 was or if there wasn't, and I think -- I think I would
12 have been aware, as an adult looking back, if that was
13 the case. I really don't know.

14 Q. Were you given any explanation for why you were leaving
15 EQC [REDACTED] s?

16 A. No. [REDACTED] -- a social worker turned up and [REDACTED] black
17 bags were there and [REDACTED] got moved to Haddington. And
18 I remember the car journey and feeling frightened and
19 feeling scared about leaving [REDACTED] friends and stuff like
20 that. But no, [REDACTED] didn't get told, no.

21 Q. When you say that all your black bags were there, what
22 was in the black bags?

23 A. [REDACTED] clothes.

24 Q. Okay. Those were all put into the car with the social
25 worker and you were taken to Haddington?

1 A. That's correct, yeah.

2 Q. You told us earlier that that was your first memory of
3 a social worker being at the house?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Other than the people that you've mentioned, was there
6 anybody -- so you weren't aware of seeing a social
7 worker that you could have told what was happening. Can
8 you remember having any feeling that you could tell
9 a teacher at school what was happening?

10 A. No. No. Not -- I -- the first time I ever got the belt
11 was at Drylaw Primary School, so I can't remember, but
12 I think I was quite a wayward child at school. I was
13 bullied a lot at school, but I was -- I think I must
14 have been quite naughty because I got the belt quite
15 a few times at Drylaw Primary School.

16 Q. Did that make you feel like you couldn't speak to the
17 teachers about what was going on at home?

18 A. I didn't like the teachers.

19 Q. You tell us that you moved to Haddington, and I think
20 you went to Templedean to begin with, and then you went
21 to Wallhouse Children's Home --

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. -- when you were about 13. And then you were in
24 Clerwood a bit?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. You tell us in your statement that you ran away from
2 there to London?
3 A. Yeah.
4 Q. And you were brought back from London and went back to
5 Wallhouse again, I think is what you tell us.
6 A. Yes, I went to Wallhouse when I came back from London,
7 then I went -- yeah, that's right, yeah, because I ...
8 (Witness nods)
9 Q. Then I think you were in hospital for a period, in West
10 Lothian?
11 A. In Wallhouse I was, yeah.
12 Q. Then you went to Dr Guthrie's in Edinburgh from I think
13 you say from when you were about 14 to 16?
14 A. Yeah.
15 Q. Then after you left Dr Guthrie's, you went into another
16 foster care placement. Is that right?
17 A. Yeah, community care I went to, yeah.
18 Q. I think it was called community care --
19 A. Would I be able to have just a small break?
20 MS INNES: Yes, that's absolutely fine.
21 LADY SMITH: You go and do that.
22 Ms Innes, I'll rise now and we'll work out what the
23 best way is to accommodate Angie. If it has to be that
24 we take the lunch break and we start again at 1.45, if
25 that works best for her, that's fine. If she wants to

1 come back in five minutes or whatever, we can do that.

2 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

3 (12.47 pm)

4 (A short break)

5 (1.45 pm)

6 LADY SMITH: Welcome back, Angie

7 A. Thank you.

8 LADY SMITH: Are you ready for us to carry on?

9 A. Yes, I am. Yeah.

10 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes, when you're ready.

11 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

12 Angie, I think that you're a bit concerned that

13 you've not been able to convey the atmosphere at

14 EQC 's and the full horror that you felt when

15 you were there.

16 A. Uh-huh.

17 Q. Do you want to say a little bit about that and what your

18 concerns are about how you've put that across?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Before we went for lunch, I started getting a bit --

21 am I able to explain the absolute horror and the

22 atmosphere that was in that house? So asking me

23 questions about how I was frightened of EQD, he didn't

24 have to do anything for me to be frightened or for him

25 to control that atmosphere of silence and fear. It was

1 just him being there.

2 LADY SMITH: Mm-hmm.

3 A. So I'm going back trying to explain a part of my -- what

4 happened from an adult point of view, but part of that

5 child is trying to talk as well and I'm getting -- and

6 I just want yous to try and understand the fear that

7 I felt. I don't know if I'm conveying that properly to

8 yous.

9 LADY SMITH: I do get it entirely. You've put it very well.

10 Let me assure you of this. This Inquiry has been

11 going for a long time and it has enabled me many times

12 to be helped to see things through the eyes of children

13 and to put myself into the shoes of the child that

14 a witness such as you is telling me about. I can see

15 that absolutely, and that's why I was checking with you

16 just how young you were.

17 A. (Witness nods)

18 LADY SMITH: I can remember when I was that age.

19 A. Yeah.

20 LADY SMITH: And it is very young. Seven, eight, whatever

21 it was. And of course there were adults whose very

22 presence could be frightening.

23 A. Yes.

24 LADY SMITH: Then when you add to that a description of what

25 you've described EQD to me, I get that. I can see

1 exactly what you mean.

2 A. Thank you.

3 LADY SMITH: If there's anything else you want to add, feel

4 free to do so, but I am following it and I am -- because

5 of the clarity with which you're describing what

6 happened, I am being helped to see the events through

7 your little girl's eyes. Does that help?

8 A. Thank you. Yeah, it does.

9 LADY SMITH: Good.

10 Ms Innes.

11 MS INNES: Thank you.

12 I think another thing, Angie, is that you think that

13 there's a stigma attached to being in care and it's

14 something that you've carried with you throughout your

15 life, I think you feel?

16 A. Yes. Well, obviously back then, not so much now, but

17 back then there was definitely a stigma of being in

18 care, of not being loved, not being wanted, not being

19 ever able to be yourself because you were basically

20 controlled and told what to do. There was no love and

21 there was no real care. So to have your personality

22 developed was very, very difficult, when I look back.

23 But yes, I was always ashamed of being in care,

24 especially as I got older.

25 And even as an adult, I've always run away from

1 myself until I got the chance to really explain who
2 I really was and what had actually happened to me and
3 understand that that shame is no longer my shame or that
4 it wasn't my fault. And it wasn't my mother's fault
5 either. So, yeah, there's a lot of stigma attached to
6 it and of course you don't have the input of developing
7 a life as an adult. You just don't have what your maybe
8 work colleagues have or your friends have. You don't
9 have the ingredients to developing a successful life as
10 maybe your peers do. So you're always aware and
11 covering up and hiding things and never really sort of
12 being able to be true to yourself until you're
13 confronted with it and you deal with it. And it's taken
14 me my whole life up until today to be able to do all
15 that.

16 Q. Okay. You talk there about being able to build
17 a successful life, and we were talking just before lunch
18 about the final placement that you were in before
19 leaving care.

20 A. Uh-huh.

21 Q. You were in care, I think, with people called [REDACTED] and
22 [REDACTED] --

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. -- who were community carers. Just in general terms,
25 what were they like to live with?

1 A. They were -- oh. Okay, I -- at this point in my young
2 life -- was coming from a remand school so anything was
3 amazing. I was locked up 24 hours a day in the remand
4 school and most of the people in the remand school all
5 had families to go home to. I didn't, so I was kept in
6 the remand school all the time. I didn't have a family
7 to go home to at weekends, because by this time the
8 relationship with my mother and her addictions -- my
9 relationship with my mother had deteriorated and my
10 mother's addiction had become full blown, where she was
11 actually homeless and I didn't even know where she lived
12 anyway. So I was never allowed out.

13 So moving into [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s was just a dream
14 come true for me. I got out of the remand school for
15 the first time in -- I think it was about a year and a
16 half and into a house, and I'd never ever been in
17 a house, apart from maybe the odd friend's house.
18 I don't know. I'd never been in a house since I'd been
19 in [REDACTED], because I was always in children's homes.

20 Q. How did that make you feel, suddenly being in a house
21 again with a family?

22 A. Enormous. I always felt in [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s that
23 I took up too much space, because I was so -- I was
24 a tiny wee thing back then, but it was in my head I was
25 massive -- I always felt I took up too much space in

1 their house. And it was a lovely, lovely house. I'd
2 never seen a house like this. It was so posh. It had
3 beautiful carpets. It was beautiful. It was a new
4 build house as well, so I think maybe that's -- I'd
5 never been in a house so new.

6 Q. What were [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] like?

7 A. I got on better with [REDACTED] than I did with [REDACTED]
8 They were nice. They were nice. They wouldn't -- they
9 were okay, they were nice. I was just so grateful that
10 I could go there at the time. I just ...

11 Q. I think you started working when you lived with [REDACTED] and
12 [REDACTED]?

13 A. Yes, I did, yeah.

14 Q. You tell us about this at paragraph 124 of your
15 statement on page 26. What happened with your wages
16 when you started work?

17 A. They went straight to [REDACTED] and [REDACTED].

18 Q. Did you get to keep any of them, can you remember?

19 A. No money, no money, no. I had -- I got my food at my
20 work and I got food at the house and no, I didn't have
21 any money.

22 Q. Do you know why it was that you had to give your money
23 to [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]?

24 A. For my upkeep, my board and lodgings and my rent.

25 Q. Do you know if that's something that they decided or was

1 it something that the Local Authority had decided?

2 A. I don't know. I just know that my social worker at the
3 time was shocked when she found out.

4 Q. I wonder if we might be able to look at a document
5 briefly, EDI-000002807, please, page 4.

6 This is a letter from Anne Owens, 1 July 1983.
7 Anne Owens was your social worker, is that right?

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 Q. There's bits blacked out but it's a letter about you and
10 it's saying that you're a 15-year-old girl who is in the
11 care of the department, and then there's reference to
12 you residing, in the next paragraph, with community
13 carers.

14 Then it talks about you having left school and
15 securing a job as a chambermaid at the Mount Royal
16 Hotel?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. That's where you were working?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You had foregone a holiday in France, I think, in order
21 to take the job?

22 A. Yes, that's correct.

23 Q. Then we see a paragraph that says:

24 "Angie's wages are 32.45 per week which will be
25 increased to approximately £39 when she is 16. She

1 works from 8.30 am to 4.30 pm. She is responsible for
2 16 rooms and she has to work very hard for her wages.
3 I have enclosed a breakdown of Angela's money, which
4 indicates exactly how much of her wages she is permitted
5 to keep after she has paid her part of the maintenance
6 allowance to her community carers."

7 Then the social worker says:

8 "You will see from this breakdown that Angela is
9 expected to pay the total of 20.49 maintenance part of
10 the fostering allowance. This leaves Angela with £2 per
11 week pocket money. This seems very unreasonable, given
12 that she is working such small hours. As Angela pointed
13 out, there is an anomaly with this responsibility for
14 payment of total maintenance by the child in care."

15 Then it goes on over the page to say in the first
16 paragraph that you're faced with the decision as to
17 whether to carry on working or not or to move out of
18 your community care family, a position which the social
19 worker says she's not happy with. Then she goes on to
20 say:

21 "Given the sacrifice that Angela made of foregoing
22 her holiday in France, it seems that the department is
23 now treating her rather shabbily. I can fully
24 understand the department expecting young people in
25 employment to pay their ways, but it does seem that the

1 amount of maintenance expected for a child in care is in
2 excess of that expected by a child staying with his or
3 her own family."

4 Then it goes on to talking about the department
5 having responsibility for your care and that was sent by
6 your social worker. I think she was asking that this be
7 reviewed --

8 A. Uh-huh.

9 Q. -- because it looks as though it was the Local Authority
10 rules that meant that your wages had to go to the foster
11 carers and that you weren't getting them and she didn't
12 think that was fair.

13 A. Uh-huh.

14 Q. I think you remember that she was upset about that and
15 tried to sort things out for you.

16 A. Yes, she did, yeah.

17 Q. I think this letter is her trying to do that.

18 A. Yeah, definitely, it looks like it, yeah.

19 LADY SMITH: It's also striking how much she wrote about how
20 impressed she was by your efforts to get the job in two
21 days and give up a holiday to do the job and you were
22 working really hard.

23 A. Yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: It's very clear.

25 A. I remember being extremely proud of myself.

1 LADY SMITH: You did well.

2 A. And not particularly liking the job, but just the fact
3 that I had a job. I think employment was quite bad back
4 then.

5 LADY SMITH: Yes.

6 MS INNES: I think it in fact said that in one of the lines
7 at the beginning of the letter, saying that it was
8 a time of high unemployment, so it was -- 1983, so it
9 was difficult to get a job then.

10 If we go back to your statement, please, and if we
11 can go back to page 27 and paragraph 131.

12 You say that you were told that you had to leave
13 [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s?

14 A. Yes, that's right.

15 Q. How did that come about, do you know?

16 A. I can't really remember. If was [REDACTED] that told me
17 I had to leave, that I had to find somewhere to live.
18 I didn't have a clue how to do that. I remember that.
19 And feeling really upset.

20 Q. Did you want to leave [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]s?

21 A. I don't think -- I can't really remember. I was scared,
22 because I was scared I'd lose my job, I remember that.
23 I didn't know where I'd go either. I didn't know what
24 to do. But I didn't -- I don't think I did want to
25 leave, because it's all I had.

1 Q. You say that Anne, I think your social worker, got you
2 shared accommodation in a flat?

3 A. Yes, that's correct.

4 Q. And that's where you moved to from there?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You say that was the end of your time in care?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You didn't see Anne again after that?

9 A. I did see Anne again quite a few times after leaving
10 care, because my shared accommodation was in Leith and
11 Anne lived in Leith and she'd often invite me to her
12 house for tea.

13 Q. Okay. Did you have quite a good relationship with this
14 social worker then?

15 A. Yes, I did. I had a very good relationship with her.

16 Q. Okay. But you couldn't remember her being around when
17 you were at the EQC '?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Did she come on the scene later?

20 A. No, Anne came much later. Anne came when we were in
21 Florabank Templedean. I suppose some people have very
22 good memories of having a special favourite teacher.
23 Mine is of a special favourite social worker, and that
24 was Anne.

25 Q. That was Anne, okay. What made her a good social

1 worker? What was she like?

2 A. She was caring. She took [REDACTED] out for meals, she took [REDACTED]
3 out in her car. She showed an interest in me. She
4 listened to me. She phoned me. She would take me out
5 [REDACTED]
6 [REDACTED]. I think she just
7 made [REDACTED] feel important and a bit special, and she always
8 stuck up for [REDACTED].

9 Q. Okay. If we move on, please, to page 32, paragraph 156.
10 You say there that what happened to you in foster care
11 destroyed your life and still does. I think you
12 mentioned that earlier in your statement where you say
13 the experience in foster care changed your life
14 completely [REDACTED]
15 [REDACTED].

16 A. Yes, it did. Obviously being at [REDACTED] was probably the
17 first time I felt violence in the way I did, fear in the
18 way I did, and that stayed with me all my life. Shame.

19

20

21

22 Q.

23

24 A.

25 Q. If we can move on a little again in your statement, if

1 that's okay, to talk about a couple of things that you
2 speak about towards the end.

3 A. Uh-huh.

4 Q. At page 33, paragraph 162 you talk about getting your
5 records.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. What did you find when you got your records? Did you
8 find what you wanted to?

9 A. No. No. When I got my records through -- I feel a bit
10 bad now because I did get a lot of records through, but
11 then my whole life was in care. But I remember finding
12 my Brownie badge and I forgot all about I was in the
13 Brownies.

14 I always looked back at my childhood with horror and
15 fear, and then I got my Brownie badge and I just
16 remember a happy -- I did have moments of happiness in
17 my childhood. It's now in a frame on my bedside table
18 because St Helen's and the Brownies were probably the
19 only innocent part of my childhood.

20 LADY SMITH: Was it a Roseburn Brownie pack you were in then
21 at St Helen's?

22 A. Yes.

23 LADY SMITH: What group within the Brownies were you in?

24 A. I can't remember. I'd forgotten I was even in the
25 Brownies until I got my records and I got a photocopy of

1 my Brownie badge.

2 LADY SMITH: Does it have something like a little fairy or
3 an elf or --

4 A. An elf. And I remember my Brownie uniform with my
5 badges. [REDACTED] And I loved
6 the little church. And I go back there often and just
7 look at it and remember I did have happy times in the
8 Brownies.

9 LADY SMITH: That was the church near Roseburn?

10 A. Yeah, St Helen's. Wester Coates.

11 LADY SMITH: Yes, I know exactly where you mean.
12 Ms Innes.

13 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

14 So that was a positive thing that you found from
15 your records. I think you also say over the page,
16 Angie, that at paragraph 163 you say there were an awful
17 lot of receipts for things and the records weren't
18 written as if it was talking about a person's life, let
19 alone your life?

20 A. Yes, that's correct. I was a bit shocked on how -- it
21 was a different era, obviously, and people wrote
22 differently and words were used differently, I suppose.
23 And I didn't really recognise who they were writing
24 about. I was quite shocked there were so many receipts
25 and there was no photographs. I don't even know what

1 I looked like as a little girl.

2 Yeah, it was ... as I say, I got my Brownie badge
3 and that made up for everything else.

4 I found it a bit difficult how it has blanked my
5 father and mother out of my records, because they do
6 belong to me and they're part of me and I would have
7 liked to have known a little bit more about my father.

8 Q. But those bits of your records were blanked out when you
9 received them?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. Right, I'd like to ask you about some lessons that you
12 have highlighted that we should learn from your
13 experience. If you can just tell us a little bit more
14 about each of them.

15 A. Uh-huh.

16 Q. First of all, you say at paragraph 165 that you think
17 that children in care should have an independent third
18 person who travels through care with them. Can you tell
19 us what you were thinking about?

20 A. I ... well, if you're in care it's usually because you
21 don't have anyone else to look after you. So I'm not
22 really sure what I meant there when I said that, but
23 I must have visualised someone there that would listen
24 to me, that could be on the outside looking in and
25 navigating your -- what's going on in your life,

1 I suppose. Just -- because I can't ever remember social
2 workers up until Anne Owens came into my life, so
3 I suppose I'm maybe thinking a social worker or --
4 I don't know, just someone to help you through and
5 understand and -- but then I suppose that's what the
6 foster carers were supposed to do, so I'm not really
7 sure what I meant there.

8 But I think just someone -- if there is abuse going
9 on, that they can see it.

10 Q. Yes, so you talk there about -- so an independent
11 person, so maybe somebody who isn't a social worker, who
12 can check to make sure that everything's going okay and
13 also check on the foster carer.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Or check that you're okay with the foster carer.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. So it's a person who gets alongside the child,

18 I think --

19 A. Yes, who's there for the child. Maybe not in a close
20 proximity, but someone that could monitor what is
21 actually really going on and not from the parent -- my
22 mother's side, like emotional or in it with you or just
23 coming every so often. Just someone who can check up
24 and the child can trust as well, who they can speak
25 honestly with.

1 Q. I think when you speak about somebody travelling through
2 care with you, that sounds like somebody that you'd
3 build up a relationship with --
4 A. Yeah.
5 Q. -- that you'd be able to trust.
6 A. Yeah, absolutely, because when you're in care, there are
7 so many people that come in and out of your life and you
8 don't know what's happened to them, where they've gone.
9 But when you're in the family setting, you have either
10 just your mother or your mother and father or your
11 grandparents, but we had so many people come in and out
12 of our lives that we don't know anything about or who
13 they were or what they were doing or what happened to
14 other children in care. It all just becomes ... you
15 know ... so confusing.
16 Q. Then in the next paragraph you talk about the perception
17 of children in care. You touched on this a little bit,
18 but I think here you're maybe talking about something
19 slightly different, which is:
20 "Society's perception that children in care are bad
21 has to change."
22 So perhaps you're meaning that children shouldn't be
23 seen as the problem?
24 A. That's correct. I always felt like I was a problem.
25 I always felt -- didn't matter where I had gone,

1 I always had this feeling that I was really big and
2 taking up too much space. I always felt like I was
3 a problem.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. And I think I got that from adults, because I can't
6 imagine another child making me feel like that.
7 I remember in Haddington certain children weren't
8 allowed to play with me because I was in a children's
9 home. Parents didn't want their children playing with
10 me because I came from the home. Or we got called the
11 hommies.

12 Q. That sort of thing?

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. Okay. So that's generally society has to change its
15 perception.

16 A. More information, maybe, of why a child ends up in care.
17 I suppose it was very different back then because there
18 just wasn't, you know, the amount of communication and
19 information we have available to us today. So I can
20 only talk from that -- from when I was in care and how
21 I was made to feel.

22 Q. Then you talk about foster carers needing monitoring and
23 there wasn't enough supervision when you were in [REDACTED].
24 And you say there weren't enough questions being asked
25 about your own behaviour [REDACTED].

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. In fact you say you were invisible.

3 A. [REDACTED]. [REDACTED] invisible. Nobody cared [REDACTED].

4 Not even my own -- I come from, believe it or not,

5 a very, very big family on my mother's side and nobody

6 cared. Nobody came to get [REDACTED]. No one noticed anything.

7 But how could [REDACTED] have gone from probably happy

8 [REDACTED] in St Helen's to the horror that I went through

9 in foster care without anyone noticing or saying or

10 helping [REDACTED]?

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. It was in the 1970s. It wasn't like it was back in the

13 Victorian times, it was in the 1970s.

14 Q. People should have more awareness of the signs and --

15 A. Even explaining to children is -- I think just the

16 constant confusing of not knowing of anything that's

17 going on or what's happening from day to day and why

18 people are coming in and out of your life and

19 disappearing and you're never seeing them again. You

20 know, explaining to children, obviously to be an age --

21 taking into consideration their age and what they could

22 probably understand is why there has been a breakdown in

23 your family and, you know, explaining to children it's

24 not your fault, it's -- you know, it's a breakdown in

25 the family and that's why you've had to be removed for

1 even your own safety, do you know, so children
2 understand what's happening with their natural family to
3 why they're in the situation they're in and how it's
4 going to pan out even.

5 Q. Then over the page on page 35 at paragraph 168 you talk
6 there about that families shouldn't be split up [REDACTED]
7 [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED]
9 [REDACTED]. Is that right?

10 A. Yeah, that's correct. From the age of 12, [REDACTED]
11 [REDACTED].

12 Q. You say that families shouldn't be split up. You also
13 say it's not okay to move a child around frequently.

14 A. No. You have no sense of stability, of where you come
15 from, building lasting and long friendships. It's like
16 I often -- the only way I can explain it is I often felt
17 like a leaf in the wind just floating about, having no
18 real friendships because I'd been moved about that much
19 and having nothing. That's what it always felt like.
20 There was nowhere to go. It was like being in a waiting
21 room that you were never going to get out of. You were
22 just waiting for something else to happen all the time.

23 Q. You then talk at paragraph 169 about children having
24 a memory bank with photographs and reminders of their
25 care experience and I think that reflects back on what

1 you were --

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. -- telling us about not having photographs of yourself,

4 so those things should be collated. There should be

5 photos and perhaps other things that should be kept.

6 A. Yeah. I remember when I was informed that I actually

7 could apply for my records in care and feeling really

8 excited that I was going to actually see a photograph of

9 what I looked like when I was a little girl and I was so

10 disappointed there wasn't anything like that in my

11 records. So hence why I was just so grateful for that

12 little photocopy of my Brownie badge.

13 Q. Then you talk about children needing guidance and love

14 to develop as human beings and that you didn't have

15 that. You say:

16 "If carers can't give love then they shouldn't be

17 doing the job."

18 A. Yes, that's right. Secondary Institutions - to be published later

19 Secondary Institutions I was so grateful to [REDACTED] and [REDACTED],

20 but when I look back now at what I felt at the time,

21 there was no love, there was no care. I was there and

22 I was grateful to be in a house Secondary Institutions - to b

23 Secondary Institution, but there was nothing there. Another

24 empty, cold, hard experience.

25 Q. What you're saying there I think is that that shouldn't

1 be the experience of a child in foster care.

2 A. No, no.

3 MS INNES: Okay. Well, thank you, Angie, I don't have any

4 more questions for you.

5 A. Thank you.

6 MS INNES: There are no applications, my Lady.

7 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for

8 questions of Angie?

9 Angie, those are all the questions we have for you.

10 A. Uh-huh.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you so much for engaging with us as you

12 have done, both in terms of your detailed written

13 statement and for coming to talk to us today, showing

14 such insight into describing your own past and how you

15 feel about it and phrases such as it being like in

16 a waiting room that you're never going to get out of

17 capture so vividly how you feel about your childhood.

18 I won't forget that.

19 A. Thank you.

20 LADY SMITH: I won't forget any of what you've told me, it's

21 very powerful.

22 Thank you so much and please go away being assured

23 you've done something very valuable and important to us

24 by engaging and by coming here.

25 A. Thank you.

1 LADY SMITH: Not at all.

2 (The witness withdrew)

3 LADY SMITH: My general restriction order and names, of
4 course we've had EQC [REDACTED]'s name and her partner
5 EQD [REDACTED] Sometimes Angie used [REDACTED] and
6 there was [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] Her name is not protected
7 by my order because she's chosen to disclose who she is,
8 but all these other identities are.

9 Ms Innes.

10 MS INNES: My Lady, I understand that the next witness is
11 here. However, I've not had an opportunity to meet him
12 yet and therefore I'd be grateful for a break now until
13 he's ready to start.

14 LADY SMITH: Short break now? Very well, you can check if
15 he's ready. Thank you very much.

16 (2.18 pm)

17 (A short break)

18 (2.40 pm)

19 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

20 MS INNES: My Lady, the next witness is Peter Kelbie. Peter
21 has waived anonymity and I understand that the GRO has
22 been disapplied in respect of his sister, Alexina.

23 Peter's sister Alexina was born on [REDACTED] 1957.

24 She was taken into care by Dundee Corporation. It's
25 understood that she was placed with foster parents in

1 Dundee in August 1959. She died on 31 August 1960.

2 Peter himself was taken into care. However, we have
3 had some difficulty, as has he, in finding any documents
4 relative to the time that he was in care. We do have
5 one document which indicates that Peter was subject to
6 a parental rights resolution of Aberdeen County Council
7 in early 1964. This document was in fact recovered from
8 Aberdeen City Council, although Aberdeenshire would be
9 the successor of Aberdeen County Council.

10 Peter was placed in foster care with foster parents
11 near Fraserburgh, again suggesting perhaps Aberdeenshire
12 is the relevant successor. However, no records were
13 recovered from Aberdeenshire and reorganisation of
14 course took place in 1975, when Peter was still, as we
15 understand it, in foster care.

16 We have recovered from Aberdeen City Council
17 an entry from Brimmond Children's Home's register,
18 indicating that Peter was admitted to Brimmond from
19 [REDACTED], Fraserburgh, which is the address
20 that he gives of his foster parent, on 17 February 1978.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

22 Peter Kelbie (sworn)

23 LADY SMITH: Easy question to start: would you like me to
24 call you "Peter" or "Mr Kelbie" or something else?

25 A. Ma'am, you can call me Peter, please.

1 LADY SMITH: Right, Peter. That red folder has your written
2 statement in it, you will be asked to look at it in
3 a minute or two.
4 A. Thank you, ma'am.
5 LADY SMITH: We'll also bring the statement up on the
6 screen, you might find that helpful. You don't have to
7 use it, but if it's helpful it will be there when we go
8 to different parts of it.
9 Other than that, Peter, can I just assure you,
10 I know it's not easy coming into public to talk about
11 your own life, personal matters, your own family and in
12 particular your childhood, and any distressing or
13 upsetting aspects of your childhood. I do understand
14 that, and if there's anything that we can do to help
15 smooth the passage for you, if you want a break, out of
16 the room, sitting in the room, or if you have any
17 questions, do speak up.
18 If it works for you, it will work for me. That's
19 the key. So let me know if there's anything that you
20 need.
21 A. Thank you, ma'am.
22 LADY SMITH: If you're ready I'll hand over to Ms Innes and
23 she will take it from there.
24 A. Thank you.
25 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

1 Questions from Ms Innes

2 MS INNES: Peter, I understand that you were born in 1963.

3 Is that correct?

4 A. I was, Ruth.

5 Q. Your statement for the Inquiry, we give it the reference
6 WIT.001.003.0871. If we can look at the final page of
7 that, page 20, to begin with and paragraph 85, it says
8 there:

9 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
10 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
11 I believe the facts stated in the witness statement are
12 true."

13 I understand that you signed this statement on
14 28 November 2019; is that right?

15 A. That's correct, Ruth, yes, thank you.

16 Q. If we can go back to the beginning of your statement,
17 please, Peter, and if we can -- I just want to ask you
18 a little bit about your family. You'll see that names
19 and things are blanked out on the screen but please use
20 names and that's okay.

21 We have a paragraph number 2 where you tell us a bit
22 about your mother and you tell us there that she was
23 born I think in 1934; is that right?

24 A. Indeed, Ruth.

25 Q. What was your mother called?

1 A. [REDACTED], but she was known by the name
2 of [REDACTED].

3 Q. You say she was born into a very large Scottish Romany
4 gypsy family; is that right?

5 A. More gypsy than Romany, Ruth.

6 Q. Okay. You then mention your father. What was his name?

7 A. [REDACTED]

8 Q. He was born in 1933?

9 A. On [REDACTED] 1933, yeah, in Tarland, Aboyne.

10 Q. He, you say, was born into a large Scottish Romany gypsy
11 family, so was he more Romany?

12 A. Our father? He would be Romany tinsmith rather than
13 gypsy. There is a distinction.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. Thank you, Ruth.

16 Q. You say that -- it's blanked out on the screen, but your
17 dad was known as [REDACTED]?

18 A. Yeah, an expression, Scottish expression.

19 Q. Your parents, I think you say they fell in love around
20 the age of 17 or 18, you think?

21 A. Maybe slightly over. Our mum would have been about
22 21 --

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. -- I think. But they knew each other prior before then,
25 in the 1950s.

1 Q. You go on to tell us that your parents had two daughters
2 together? This was before you were born. So [REDACTED]
3 and Alexina; is that right?
4 A. Our mum had two stepchildren.
5 Q. She had two older children, I think.
6 A. From a previous relationship.
7 Q. Yes. Who were they? What were their names?
8 A. What, the -- right, [REDACTED] and [REDACTED].
9 Q. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]?
10 A. Yeah.
11 Q. They were your mum's oldest children?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. Then there was [REDACTED] and Alexina?
14 A. (Witness nods)
15 Q. And were you next?
16 A. No, [REDACTED].
17 Q. [REDACTED] was next. And then you?
18 A. No.
19 Q. No?
20 A. Then [REDACTED].
21 Q. Okay.
22 A. Then [REDACTED]. I'm the last born.
23 Q. Okay.
24 A. I'm the youngest.
25 Q. You're the youngest of the family, okay.

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. If we move on, please, to paragraph 7, at that point
3 you're telling us that there came a time where the four
4 children -- so I think you mean [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]
5 and Alexina -- were taken into care. Is that right?

6 A. From number [REDACTED] in Dundee, there was
7 a police raid.

8 Q. I'm going to move on to ask you about Alexina in
9 particular in a moment, and I know, Peter, that you
10 brought a photograph of your mother and Alexina, which
11 I think you might want to show Lady Smith?

12 A. Yes.

13 LADY SMITH: If you're prepared to let me see it, I'd find
14 that very helpful. Don't worry, we can get it passed
15 across.

16 A. Alexina and the lady is our mum [REDACTED]. Thank you,
17 ma'am.

18 LADY SMITH: How old do you say Alexina was here?

19 A. Sorry, ma'am, Alexina would have been just been coming
20 up for about two years and six months. Our mum in that
21 photograph, she was roughly about 27 years old, ma'am.

22 LADY SMITH: She has a lovely smile.

23 A. She did have a lovely smile. She was a lovely woman,
24 actually. But the foster parent took that photograph,
25 my Lady. That photograph was redeveloped Christmas last

1 year in Aberdeen and it was in an old email that I don't
2 use any more, they recovered a photo reel so they had to
3 redevelop it because she was covered in cuts and
4 bruising so they had to redevelop it. But that's
5 Alexina. That's from CID in Dundee.

6 LADY SMITH: I see.

7 A. They kept the photographs of her.

8 LADY SMITH: It must be very precious to you. Thank you for
9 letting me see it.

10 A. Indeed, my Lady, you're absolutely correct. Thank you.

11 MS INNES: Thank you, Peter, for sharing that with us.

12 If we can just go back to the time when the four
13 children that you mentioned were taken into care, at
14 that time you've mentioned that your parents were living
15 in Dundee, so I think they were taken into care in
16 Dundee. Is that right?

17 A. That's correct, Ruth, yeah. There was an unofficial
18 police raid at flat number [REDACTED] in Dundee
19 and Alexina sustained a serious injury during the arrest
20 with our mother. They were both admitted into hospital.

21 Q. What injury did Alexina suffer, do you --

22 A. A broken wrist. The right wrist. During the arrest.

23 Q. Okay. How do you know that she sustained that during
24 the arrest? How have you found that out?

25 A. That information came from the arresting police officer

1 in Dundee in 1982.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. Because I interviewed him at his office on the old

4 Perth Road.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. I also interviewed the clerk of the court for Dundee

7 Sheriff Court, who was the clerk principal to the late

8 Sheriff, John Christie.

9 Q. If we go on over the page you mention Sheriff Christie

10 at paragraph 10 of your statement and you tell us there

11 that you understand that your mum had gone to court in

12 late 1959 or early 1960, and you understand that there

13 was a Family Court hearing.

14 A. There were criminal proceedings. She was arrested for

15 theft of a scrap car. There's an expression that's used

16 in the gypsy travellers I think community in Scotland is

17 that you can buy a car for scrap, but the car was stolen

18 and that's the reason why there was a raid.

19 Q. Okay.

20 A. And it turned out that the criminal case against our mum

21 for theft was dropped.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. It was discontinued because the sheriff John Christie

24 asked if she had a driving licence and she said no. She

25 couldn't drive. The other explanation to that was that

1 there was neglect.

2 Q. Right.

3 A. The police said there was neglect at number [REDACTED]

4 [REDACTED], but the officers, according to Sheriff

5 John Christie, they did not have a warrant signed by his

6 court --

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. -- and the case was discontinued.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. Then he issued Family Court proceedings.

11 Q. You tell us here at paragraph 10 that your understanding

12 was that I think essentially the Sheriff said that the

13 children should be returned to your parents?

14 A. Absolutely correct, Ruth, because I've also stated here

15 under paragraph 10:

16 "He said [this is Sheriff John Christie ... was

17 recorded in his statement saying] the police entered the

18 building without due regard for the safety of the

19 children."

20 That would have been the [REDACTED] children, because

21 I wasn't born yet, but Alexina was admitted to Maryfield

22 and so was our mum.

23 And even though -- I wouldn't like to say that that

24 stood in her favour, it was because the police had lied

25 in regards to the warrant in the first place for the

1 raid at number [REDACTED].

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. So the court case, the Family Court proceedings --

4 right, these proceedings are just as much complex

5 yesterday as what they are today. Everyone, the

6 parents, the mums, the dads, the uncles, everybody gets

7 vetted, and it was decided that there was no neglect at

8 number [REDACTED].

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. And he interviewed -- this is Sheriff John Christie --

11 came to the conclusion that Ruth Haring, the former

12 social worker who was a barrister, she had been sort of

13 discriminative, she'd discriminated the family because

14 she said they were tinkers.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. And she said that Mrs [REDACTED] was mentally ill and she

17 said that Mrs [REDACTED] was a troublemaker.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. And none of that was true. The sheriff came to the

20 conclusion that the children -- that the welfare -- the

21 paramount welfare of the children were best left with

22 the mother, Mrs [REDACTED] because she had no convictions

23 in that period.

24 Q. Okay. I think after that only three of the children

25 were returned to your parents and Alexina wasn't

1 returned?

2 A. No. The court order was for the [REDACTED] children to be
3 sent home to Aberdeen to Mrs [REDACTED], to number
4 [REDACTED]

5 Q. So your mum had moved by that point to Aberdeen?

6 A. Yeah, because after the police raid our mum didn't
7 really -- even though dad's got family in Dundee, our
8 mum, she ... she was very optimistic but she was waiting
9 on Alexina to come home and unfortunately she never
10 arrived.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. Unfortunately.

13 Q. The three oldest children at that time, they went back
14 to your mum and dad in Aberdeen?

15 A. In [REDACTED], yeah.

16 Q. And Alexina stayed in care?

17 A. (Witness nods)

18 Q. I think you tell us that Alexina was fostered with
19 foster parents in Dundee; is that right?

20 A. Foster parents, yeah.

21 LADY SMITH: At that time, from what you found out, she
22 would have been what, two or three years old?

23 A. Lady Smith, Alexina -- yes, she was two years old.

24 LADY SMITH: On the basis it went to the Sheriff Court --

25 A. Yeah, given time.

1 LADY SMITH: -- about 1959/1960, and bearing in mind her
2 date of birth.
3 A. Correct, Lady Smith, yeah.
4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
5 MS INNES: We know that Alexina tragically died on
6 31 August 1960 and that was at a time when she was still
7 living with the foster carers; is that right?
8 A. Indeed, Ruth, yeah.
9 Q. You say at paragraph 13 of your statement that you
10 understand that your parents were in Inverurie when they
11 were told that something had happened and that they had
12 to go to Dundee. Is this something that you found out
13 from your brothers and sisters or how did you -- or
14 maybe from your parents?
15 A. Unfortunately that's inconcrete information.
16 Q. Okay.
17 A. Our mum was working as a typist for [REDACTED] in
18 Aberdeen on 31 August 1960, she was working in the
19 offices of [REDACTED]. Our father, with [REDACTED],
20 [REDACTED] -- no, our father had the children at the time,
21 had [REDACTED], he had [REDACTED] and the others at Castlehill, and
22 she was in fact working as a secretary at [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED] and it was there that the police informed our mum
24 that there was an incident of sorts in Dundee and she
25 clicked, she knew exactly what it was about.

1 Q. Okay. Is your understanding that she was just told that
2 there had been an incident, she wasn't told that Alexina
3 had died?
4 A. No.
5 Q. No. I think you talk about your parents travelling to
6 Dundee. Were they told when they got to Dundee that
7 Alexina had died, do you know?
8 A. By the time she left the office at [REDACTED], by
9 the time that the specific police officer informed her
10 of the incident, they didn't get to Dundee until
11 about -- I think it was very late that night and they
12 had to stay with members of the family in Dundee till
13 the next day. And then, on 1 September 1960, she's not
14 told that she's dead, but she's told to get to Maryfield
15 Hospital.
16 Q. Then when she went to Maryfield Hospital, was she told
17 there?
18 A. By the matron.
19 Q. I see.
20 A. That Alexina was dead.
21 Q. You tell us in this paragraph that your father had
22 a mental collapse. Was that after he was told this
23 news?
24 A. Well, I agree that they hardly had no money. I would
25 have thought they would be entitled to a police escort.

1 Again I was -- it wasn't just our father who had the
2 mental health collapse, it was our mummy as well. It
3 was both mum and dad.

4 Q. And your dad.

5 A. I now have a witness who can confirm that.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. So they've seen Alexina at Maryfield Hospital. They're
8 in the morgue, they're in the mortuary department.
9 I don't know exactly what the correct procedure was at
10 that time, but for sure our mum saw Alexina. I don't
11 think our dad was allowed to see Alexina --

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. -- I think it was just our mum.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. So they both had a mental collapse.

16 Q. If we go on over the page please to page 4, do you know
17 if your parents were told at the time what had happened?

18 You say there that the social work department said
19 there'd been an accident and Alexina was dead and that
20 she'd died -- it was 31 August 1960. Do you know if
21 your parents were given an explanation at that time as
22 to what had happened?

23 A. Well, Ruth, I have made a mistake here, because it
24 actually says 1968.

25 Q. Yes --

1 A. So that's my mistake, Ruth.

2 Q. That's okay. It was 1960. It should be 1960.

3 A. Okay, okay, thanks, Ruth.

4 Q. That's fine.

5 A. Well, they were told a pack of lies. They said that

6 there was an accident at number [REDACTED] in Dundee

7 and that -- the social work explanation was that she was

8 hitting herself against or hitting her head against

9 walls, a television set and/or fire fender and/or both

10 and that her injury to the head, to the skull, was

11 classed as an accidental injury due to self-inflicting

12 injuries.

13 Q. Okay. Is that something that your parents later told

14 you that that's what they'd been told? Or did you learn

15 that from your sisters? Or did you find that out in

16 your researches?

17 A. I never knew mum and dad.

18 Q. So --

19 A. The family members, the older family members, my aunts,

20 my aunt [REDACTED] and Aunt [REDACTED] and other family

21 members, they all -- that was their understanding.

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. They said that they fed mum and dad full of lies, saying

24 that it was an accident and self-inflicted, but our mum

25 knew that was wrong. Our mum said that that would --

1 our mum, in a file, in London, it's either in Devon or
2 it's in London, I can't remember where it is, there are
3 files in London. Our mum said at the Mercat Cross in
4 Aberdeen she was demonstrating in 1961 to 1976 as
5 a pro-activist, if you like, that she said that her
6 children had been taken into care and she said that you
7 murdered them and then you raped them. She said you
8 raped them, then you murdered them, and she was always
9 arrested at that point.

10 Q. Okay.

11 A. But our mum said that she did not believe the
12 explanation, because when she left the mortuary at
13 Maryfield Hospital on the morning of 1 September 1960,
14 she collapsed and she said to [REDACTED], our father,
15 something about Alexina, "Someone has taken their first
16 to our baby, [REDACTED], and that this is not accidental.
17 She's been murdered, they've battered her, they've
18 battered her black and blue".

19 And then they reported to Ruth Haring, H-A-R-I-N-G,
20 the family social worker, who was the former barrister
21 at that point.

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. And Ruth said to my parents that if they didn't leave
24 the building, the police would be called and they would
25 be arrested for breach of the peace.

1 Q. We know, Peter, that you've made investigations to find
2 out what happened to Alexina and you've done that over
3 a number of years, I understand. I'm going to ask you
4 to look at a document that will come up on the screen.
5 It's WIT-3-000001219. This is a letter from I think
6 a Lorna Ferguson --
7 A. Superintendent Lorna Ferguson.
8 Q. -- at Police Scotland, dated 2 September 2021.
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. I think you have a copy in the file in front of you and
11 it's on the screen as well.
12 A. Yeah.
13 Q. I wonder if we can look first of all, please, at page 3.
14 A. Got it.
15 Q. We're sort of --
16 A. Thank you, Ruth.
17 Q. -- jumping into the middle of this, but what we're
18 looking at, if we go down we see:
19 "In 1993, legacy Tayside Police carried out
20 a further review into the circumstances of Alexina's
21 death."
22 What I'd like to do, if it's okay, is look at what
23 they say here about some of the people that they spoke
24 to who were around at the time that Alexina died.
25 We see there's reference to a statement being noted:

1 "During this review enquiry, a statement was noted
2 from Ms Patricia Turnbull, the assistant pathologist,
3 who carried out Alexina's post-mortem examination. She
4 was found to be the only surviving pathologist at this
5 time, as Mr Dorwood, pathologist, had died."

6 It looks like there were two pathologists that
7 carried out the post-mortem at the time Alexina died,
8 a Mr Dorwood and Ms Turnbull.

9 It then says:

10 "In her statement, Ms Turnbull recalled being spoken
11 to by Detective Sergeant Robertson in 1988. Although
12 her memory was somewhat vague she did have some
13 recollection of the events following Alexina's death.
14 She recalled attending a house in a housing estate in
15 Dundee where a girl had sustained a head injury from
16 which she had subsequently died. She remembered the
17 house had a fireplace in the front room and either the
18 fireplace or the sofa may have been articles involved in
19 causing an injury to Alexina."

20 I think you've already mentioned in your evidence,
21 Peter, that you were told that there was maybe
22 a fireplace or a fender or something --

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. -- that was involved. Then it goes on to say:

25 "Ms Turnbull recalls speaking with Alexina's foster

1 mother, learning Alexina's background and being aware of
2 a pre-existing injury to her arm, which from records was
3 believed to have occurred prior to Alexina being placed
4 in foster care."

5 Is it your understanding that what's being referred
6 to here is the injury to Alexina's wrist --

7 A. I am, Ruth.

8 Q. -- you mentioned earlier? Okay.

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. Then it says here:

11 "She recalls the question of physical abuse was
12 raised at the time of Alexina's death but advised the
13 post-mortem examination did not provide any evidence in
14 support of this."

15 From this it looks like Ms Turnbull, who was one of
16 the people who carried out the post-mortem, she is
17 saying in 1993 that the possibility of abuse was raised
18 but the post-mortem didn't provide any evidence about
19 that. That seemed to be her position at that time.
20 We'll come on to later developments in a moment.

21 A. Okay, thank you.

22 Q. Then we see that the next paragraph says:

23 "A statement was also noted from Detective Constable
24 Whitton, who recalled being instructed to carry out
25 investigation into the death of Alexina. He remembered

1 attending at the address in Dundee and making enquiry
2 with Alexina's foster carers (both deceased)."

3 I think they mean deceased at the time they were
4 carrying out this in 1993.

5 "He advised through enquiries with family and
6 neighbours, he learned that Alexina had been
7 an uncommunicative child who was prone to striking her
8 head against solid objects in the family home such as
9 the table and fireplace."

10 Again, is that something that is consistent with the
11 explanation that you understand that your parents had
12 been given?

13 A. You're absolutely spot on.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. Spot on, Ruth. Yes, technically speaking. But if you
16 want to continue.

17 Q. Okay, we'll continue.

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. "He advised he later learned this conduct was due to
20 Alexina at some stage in her life sustaining a break to
21 her left arm, which continued to cause her distress.
22 This led Alexina to strike her head against solid
23 objects as a method of 'release'."

24 Do you understand what he's saying there, that she
25 seemed to -- because she had the sore arm, she hit her

1 head off things?

2 A. Yeah, I've -- sorry, I was going to talk about me there
3 for a minute. Sorry. Ruth, yeah. Whatever the foster
4 mother said, we have to disregard it because the deed
5 has been done. She should never have been in care.
6 That we know. The -- I noticed that -- maybe you
7 haven't come across -- you've mentioned James Whitton,
8 the PC from [REDACTED] at the time. He used to live around
9 the corner from number [REDACTED]

10 Q. Okay.

11 LADY SMITH: Peter, is that Whitton, Detective Constable
12 Whitton?

13 A. Yes, ma'am, James. Scottish, it's a Scottish surname.

14 LADY SMITH: He's mentioned here as well, at the beginning
15 of the third paragraph.

16 A. Yeah. The problem that I have with him is that he -- is
17 that he's disobeyed the orders from a commanding higher
18 authority. He was given the job to investigate the
19 murder of a child. I wasn't born then, right? So we
20 forget about me. His order was to leave kind of no
21 stone unturned, because Alexina was seen. It was clear
22 that Alexina was assaulted at 11.30 am on the second
23 landing at number [REDACTED] on 31 August, and all
24 that -- all that was investigated, but James Whitton, he
25 didn't ... he didn't carry out any enquiry. He just

1 didn't. He was a total failure.

2 The reason why that is, it's come to light now that
3 even though I'm of the conclusion that the foster parent
4 was a police officer, the people that were in the
5 building at the time in the other flats, Ms Garland was
6 interviewed. It says in the statement that
7 Patricia Turnbull, the pathology expert at the time, the
8 junior pathologist, she stated that she interviewed
9 Mrs Garland. Well, that Mrs Garland is John Garland's
10 wife -- she's related to police officer John Garland.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. He was a police constable as well, and they -- so when
13 Alexina died, she goes to the neighbour. The neighbour
14 is Mrs Garland, but she's married to John,
15 PC John Garland. That's when there's a cover-up that
16 comes into force there. They've had to make up a story
17 and they made up a very good one.

18 If that was today, I don't think -- I don't think
19 CID in London would actually put up with that. But
20 Mrs Turnbull, she's related to Police Sergeant
21 William Turnbull, who was in CID at Bell Street at the
22 time.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. So that puts her in the frame.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. Fair and square. You have to be independent. You
2 cannot be related to someone in charge of that case in
3 case -- and this is the reason why, this is the reason
4 why.

5 So I'll let you continue, Ruth.

6 Q. Okay. So you were talking about Detective Constable
7 Whitton, and in the paragraph that we're looking at:

8 "Detective Constable Whitton further advised his
9 enquiries showed on 31 August 1960 that Alexina had been
10 at home with the foster mother and an adopted sibling
11 when she had struck her head on a fireplace causing
12 a head injury. The foster mother took Alexina to
13 Maryfield Hospital in Dundee, where she subsequently
14 died."

15 It then says:

16 "He advised his enquiries revealed no evidence or
17 history of abuse."

18 Sorry.

19 (Pause)

20 "He advised that he carried out a thorough
21 investigation but was unable to find any suspicious
22 circumstances."

23 I think you would disagree with that, Peter?

24 A. I do, Ruth.

25 Q. Then there's reference to the injury and the cause of

1 death was determined to be an intra-cranial haemorrhage,
2 and I think that's what's noted on Alexina's death
3 certificate. Is that right?

4 A. Indeed, Ruth.

5 Q. The next paragraph refers to the statement from the
6 neighbour that you've been referring to, where the
7 witness recalled that the foster mother ran into her
8 room, carrying Alexina who had been taken unwell, and
9 Alexina was taken to hospital. And this neighbour said
10 she'd never seen Alexina or her sibling being
11 ill-treated.

12 I think that is the summary that you were given of
13 what was uncovered during the 1993 review of the
14 investigation.

15 A. (Witness nods)

16 Q. So you were told about these -- that these things had
17 happened. There were reviews, it tells us at the bottom
18 of the page, in the final paragraph on this page:

19 " ... from initial investigation in 1960 and
20 subsequent reviews in 1988 and 1993, there was
21 a professional consensus of medical and pathological
22 opinion as well as statements provided by carers that
23 the injury to Alexina's arm and subsequent regular pain
24 trauma suffered by her, led her to strike her head
25 against solid objects, leading to a catastrophic head

1 injury and her death."

2 That's a sort of summary of where the investigations
3 had reached at that point.

4 I think if we go over the page, we can see that
5 there's records of further investigations that you had
6 made, that you'd made further enquiries with the police,
7 and there was a further review of matters in 2006.

8 I think in the middle of this page it tells us that
9 during this review in 2006, a file was found with black
10 and white photographs of Alexina. Is that correct?

11 A. That's correct, Ruth.

12 Q. It appears that these photos had -- well, nobody seemed
13 to know where they had been for the previous 46 years,
14 it says. It hadn't been possible to establish where the
15 photographs had been stored for the previous 46 years.

16 So that was something that had come to light in
17 2006.

18 Another thing that came to light in 2006 was
19 a Sergeant John Underwood was interviewed?

20 A. Yes, Ruth.

21 Q. If we go on over the page, please, we see some more
22 information about what Sergeant Underwood remembered.

23 He was shown the album of photos and it says:

24 "Having viewed the album of photographs he was able
25 to recall taking them but was unable to recall Alexina's

1 name. He recalled there was a suggestion at the time
2 that the wounds were self-inflicted, but when he saw
3 Alexina's body he was unhappy with this explanation due
4 to the number of wounds and injuries and in particular
5 an apparent bite mark to the outside of her left leg."

6 It looks from this as though Sergeant Underwood
7 remembered, when he was asked about this in 2006, he
8 remembered that in 1960 he'd had some concerns about the
9 injuries that Alexina had on her body.

10 A. (Witness nods)

11 Q. Then he says:

12 "He believes he raised his concerns at the time with
13 both the pathologists and the investigating officer."

14 Then in the 2006 review, I think I'm right in saying
15 that the photographs were given to
16 Professor Derrick Pounder to review. Is that right?

17 A. Correct, Ruth.

18 Q. There's then details of the injuries that
19 Professor Pounder observed. Peter, are you okay with me
20 reading this out or would you prefer me not to?

21 A. You carry on, Ruth. I don't want to read it, but
22 I think you should remind everybody here exactly --
23 including ma'am, that it's quite horrific.

24 LADY SMITH: Peter, if you can cope with it, it will go into
25 the transcript of your evidence if it's read out.

1 A. Thank you, ma'am.

2 LADY SMITH: Which will then go onto our website.

3 A. Thank you, ma'am.

4 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

5 MS INNES: "Professor Pounder provided a report in which he

6 advised that the photographs showed multiple bruises and

7 abrasions to the face, neck, upper chest and legs as

8 well as possibly the arms and right side of the abdomen.

9 The bruises to the head and neck were particularly

10 prominent. Since the photographs were black and white,

11 it was not possible to offer an opinion on the age of

12 the bruises. In his opinion, the overall pattern of

13 injuries was assaultive and could not be explained by

14 a simple fall or even a complex fall. The injuries to

15 the neck were suggestive of pressure applied through

16 clothing.

17 "There was an injury to the chin, nose and around

18 the mouth with what appeared to be blood in the mouth.

19 There were two distinct separate areas of impact to the

20 forehead. There was a further impact with prominent

21 bruising and abrasion to the left side of the face.

22 There was an abrasion below the right ear. The left arm

23 was misshapen, in keeping with the history of a fracture

24 of that arm. There was an injury on the outside of the

25 left knee which comprised two arcs of bruising and

1 abrasion, which raised the possibility of a bite mark.
2 There was no photograph with the scale of this mark, but
3 given the size of the child it appeared to be too small
4 to be an adult bite mark, if indeed it was a bite mark.

5 "Professor Pounder concluded that on the limited
6 evidence available from the information provided,
7 including the photographs, it was difficult, if not
8 impossible, to conceive of an explanation for the injury
9 pattern and death of Alexina other than an assault.
10 Whilst Professor Pounder was of the view that the
11 photographs indicated Alexina was assaulted, he is
12 unable to establish a causal link between the assault
13 and her death."

14 So that was the conclusion of Professor Pounder at
15 the time. I think that we can see from that that his
16 view from looking at the photographs was that it was
17 difficult, really, to come up with any other explanation
18 other than she was assaulted.

19 A. (Witness nods)

20 Q. Obviously because he wasn't there doing the post-mortem
21 at the time, he couldn't prove the causal link I think
22 is what I would understand that to mean.

23 Is that your understanding as well, Peter?

24 A. Correct, Ruth.

25 Q. In 2006, were you told that Professor Pounder had come

1 to these conclusions?

2 A. No.

3 Q. No, okay. I think you only became aware of this

4 information last year; is that right?

5 A. Last year.

6 Q. There's some other material in this letter about what

7 steps might have been taken at different times and the

8 police's response to the issues that you'd raised, but

9 just in terms of looking at the death of Alexina, as

10 we've seen even from looking at photographs it appeared

11 that what your parents had originally been told and what

12 you were originally told certainly didn't take into

13 account what was shown in those photographs?

14 A. Correct. Correct.

15 Q. At this time, as you know, that Alexina died, she was in

16 foster care.

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. You've obviously been asking the police about their

19 investigation and I know that's something that you

20 continue to pursue. Have you also asked Dundee City

21 Council, or previous to that Tayside, about what

22 happened to Alexina?

23 A. I have been back in contact with the head of legal

24 services at Dundee City Council. Maybe rather maybe the

25 week after, round about maybe 12 September or something

1 like that -- no, hang on a minute. This report is dated
2 2 September 2021.

3 Q. Yes.

4 A. Sorry, Ruth, I didn't receive this until the end of the
5 month. It must have been the 23rd-ish when I --

6 Q. I think it came to you through your solicitor. There's
7 maybe a --

8 A. No. I got it through Superintendent Lorna Ferguson.
9 This was in the Royal Mail. I think it was marked
10 as "Official", but it was recorded sent by delivery
11 courier or something.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. I didn't realise there was an email.

14 Q. Right.

15 A. A friend of the family believed that they had that in
16 London.

17 Q. Okay, so --

18 A. But I got it on the 23rd.

19 Q. So after you got this information, you're saying that
20 you contacted Dundee City Council, but I was really
21 wondering about earlier, you know, in the past have you
22 contacted Tayside Regional Council or now Dundee City
23 Council to ask them for any information about Alexina?

24 A. We've -- me personally, I've been in contact with Dundee
25 City Council since even before I came out of care.

1 The ... I was still in care in 1982 under Aberdeen, and
2 so it's from 1982 when I come on the scene in Dundee,
3 even though I hadn't been in Dundee before. My official
4 presence is from 1982 right up until this current date.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. And I got in contact with Dundee City Council legal
7 department, but they sent me an email I think just
8 before Christmas last year and although I was very
9 depressed reading or seeing some of the injuries, they
10 told me in an email that they've passed Alexina's death
11 on to, I quote -- now, I haven't got it with me.

12 Q. It's okay.

13 A. But there was an email and they said that the death has
14 been passed on to Lady Smith QC at the Scottish Child
15 Abuse Inquiry.

16 I said, "Well, how dare you, because you're dealing
17 with me and I'm not entitled to a human rights lawyer",
18 and I said, "You've got no right passing the buck to
19 Lady Smith QC because she cannot ..." It's not as if we
20 wanted Alexina exhumed.

21 I took legal advice and I got in contact with my
22 Right Honourable MP, Right Honourable MP David Mundell
23 from the House of Commons in London, and David -- the
24 Right Honourable David Mundell was the gentleman who got
25 our mum a memorial in 2017.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. And the advice and the instructions that I am given for
3 a full public enquiry into Alexina's murder is this:
4 that's a matter for the Institute of Government at
5 Whitehall and that I was told that Mr Roger Mann(?) and
6 the legal department had no ...

7 Q. Authority?

8 A. They should not have represented Lady Smith QC, because
9 Lady Smith QC cannot pursue an independent public
10 inquiry into the murder of Alexina. And they passed the
11 buck to Lady Smith QC, because I have got the email.
12 I'm sorry I haven't got it here.

13 Q. No, that's all okay.

14 A. But they passed on to Lady Smith QC. I wrote a nasty
15 email back to them and said:
16 "No, you're wrong, you're evading justice, you are
17 prolonging injustice. She's died in your care. She was
18 in your official care when she was murdered. You have
19 the duty, the obligation under the 1933 Children's Act
20 section 1 to section 13 applies to that Act, and under
21 the Children's Act (Scotland) Act 1933, my sister was
22 murdered in the care of Dundee City Council."

23 We take children into care to save them from being
24 abused. We don't take children into care so that they
25 can be raped and physically harmed. We take them into

1 care because they have to be protected by the state,
2 because there's a problem in family life.

3 So the law states is that we must apply it to the
4 rule on social work intervention. I don't want to go
5 into that. The social work intervention back then, even
6 in 1958, is so specific the judge himself has said,
7 Ruth, Sheriff Christie, issued the order. He's
8 interviewed both parents. I wasn't born back then.
9 He's interviewed mum for sure and he's interviewed
10 father. He's quite keen to make sure the [REDACTED]
11 children go back home.

12 Social work intervention's been applied therefore,
13 but the only problem is they've kept Alexina into care.
14 Regardless whether she was suffering from -- if she was
15 being abused by the foster parents and she was black and
16 blue and that's the reason why she didn't come out of
17 care in the first place, well they definitely sent her
18 to her grave. But technically speaking within the law,
19 I would have thought -- it's defeating the object.
20 There should have been a duty of care, Ruth, and I think
21 you've got a point, really good.

22 LADY SMITH: Peter, when you were doing your investigations
23 with the Sheriff, are you telling me you spoke to
24 Sheriff Christie yourself or you found out about what
25 happened through the court clerk?

1 A. Yes, ma'am. A couple of years ago or a few years ago
2 I went to the Sheriff Court in Dundee and it was closed
3 but I got in. And the sheriff clerk for the late
4 Sheriff John Christie introduced me to his court,
5 because I wanted to give a dedication.

6 LADY SMITH: Yes.

7 A. I don't have access to his -- I hate saying grave, but
8 I wanted to give him dedication, I wanted to show him or
9 show the court my admiration and my love. And it was
10 because of the court -- our mum kept in contact with
11 Sheriff John Christie because they met in 1961 and he
12 didn't know that Alexina had died.

13 LADY SMITH: Tell me this. Did you ever see or get a copy
14 of any of the court orders from the Sheriff Court that
15 related to Alexina?

16 A. Yes, one. One court order.

17 LADY SMITH: What did you do with it?

18 A. I haven't got it. It was dad's sister that's -- well,
19 she had it. It was given from dad or auntie -- it was
20 given to auntie [REDACTED], auntie [REDACTED] from mum, because
21 they died so young.

22 LADY SMITH: Yes.

23 A. I do have a legal document --

24 LADY SMITH: What is it?

25 A. -- from 19 April 1988, which is a rather old document,

1 and it states that there was no accidental enquiry
2 into --
3 LADY SMITH: No fatal accident enquiry?
4 A. Yes, there was no fatal accident enquiry, ma'am. And
5 I've got the document here from the Scottish Record
6 Office in Edinburgh. I've got one. But the original
7 court order, to answer your question, is that it's said
8 that Sheriff John Christie has decided -- his court had
9 decided to release all the [REDACTED] children on 25 May
10 back to their parents at number [REDACTED] in
11 Aberdeen.
12 LADY SMITH: Did you see the order yourself.
13 A. Yes, but I was so young. Auntie [REDACTED], she must have
14 died about ... I don't know, 1999/2000? I mean, I --
15 she was my dad's -- she's a senior family member and she
16 had documents as well, but I couldn't ask her. Back
17 then you didn't have a copying machine. We didn't have
18 mobile phones. So I totally relied on my auntie
19 [REDACTED] but I also relied on the evidence that was
20 coming from my two sisters in London, who said our
21 mother -- they remembered Sheriff John Christie because
22 someone took a photograph of Sheriff John Christie with
23 our mum, [REDACTED], with [REDACTED], my sister, with [REDACTED] and
24 also with [REDACTED], one other, because they were so happy
25 and so delighted in being reunited, but they were

1 reassured that Alexina was going home to
2 [REDACTED]. I know that.
3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
4 MS INNES: Peter. I will come back to ask you more
5 generally about lessons that we should learn, but
6 I don't know whether you want to talk about your own
7 experiences in care?
8 A. Yes, I do, actually.
9 Q. Okay. In your statement, if we go on to page 6, you
10 tell us that you were fostered in 1965 and you were
11 fostered --
12 A. No.
13 Q. -- by people called the FFL-FFN [REDACTED]?
14 A. Sorry, Ruth.
15 Q. Sorry?
16 LADY SMITH: Did you say it wasn't 1965?
17 A. No, it wasn't, ma'am. It was 1966.
18 MS INNES: 1966, okay.
19 A. Yeah.
20 LADY SMITH: So you were three?
21 A. Yes, ma'am.
22 MS INNES: Did you stay there until about 1978; is that
23 right?
24 A. 1977, Ruth.
25 Q. Okay. You stayed with a couple called the FFL-FFN [REDACTED]; is

1 that right?

2 A. Yes, it was a place near Fraserburgh, Aberdeenshire.

3 Q. Who else lived in the house with the FFL-FFN ?

4 A. Right, there was a massive family there. Foster family.

5 Let me have a look on my witness statement report.

6 Q. Okay --

7 A. There were a number of people. There was I think

8 a Mr FFK .

9 Q. If we go down to paragraph 24, I know it's blanked out

10 on the screen, but it is at paragraph 24. You say there

11 was a girl, ?

12 A. I was introduced to Mrs FFL like a bag of meat,

13 and then I was handed over to a young girl called

14

15 Q. Was she fostered by the --

16 A. Oh, I really haven't got a clue. I think maybe she was,

17 I don't know.

18 Q. Then there was a man there called --

19 A. Mr FFN . The foster father.

20 Q. That was the foster father?

21 A. I was then introduced to Mr FFN

22 when I arrived at the cottage.

23 Q. Okay. So there were the FFL-FFN themselves, there was

24 this girl called . You tell us that there was

25 a man called FFI who lived there?

1 A. Yes, but that was not his real name. FFI [REDACTED],
2 yes, he was a former social worker.
3 Q. You say he was in his 20s, but had he lived with the
4 FFL-FFN [REDACTED] for a while? Had he been fostered by them as
5 well?
6 A. Yes, I would think so, yeah.
7 Q. So the FFL-FFN [REDACTED] weren't his real parents?
8 A. No. Not that I'm aware.
9 Q. Then you say there was another person called
10 a [REDACTED]?
11 A. [REDACTED], yes.
12 Q. Was he there the whole time that you lived there?
13 A. No.
14 Q. Okay.
15 A. He was -- well, I can't -- he was there at the time, but
16 I understand from a family member he was sent somewhere
17 else.
18 Q. Okay. Then you say there was a FFK [REDACTED]?
19 A. Yes, I think I've mentioned his name.
20 Q. Who was in his 30s?
21 A. He definitely would have been at that point.
22 Q. You think he was a lodger?
23 A. He was a lodger, yeah.
24 Q. He worked on a pig farm --
25 A. He worked in a piggery, yeah.

1 Q. Are these all the people that lived in the house that
2 you can remember?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. And the foster mother, Mrs FFL .

6 Q. Yes.

7 What were Mr and Mrs FFL-FFN like? What kind of
8 people were they?

9 A. Well, what do you -- in general?

10 Q. Were they kind? Were they nice? Were they not?

11 A. Evil. Evil.

12 Q. Okay. Why do you say that they were evil?

13 A. (Pause)

14 Because my life was placed in danger many a time.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. I was assaulted. Raped. Beaten. I -- you've got to
17 remember about my birth. I was also premature. I was
18 very ill. I needed special medical care because
19 I couldn't breathe.

20 Q. Did you have health problems when you were a child
21 because of that, Peter?

22 A. I was born prematurely.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. Taken into care because of neglect, but I was taken into
25 care soon after birth, so you can try working that one

1 out. Born on [REDACTED] 1963, placed in the sick
2 children's unit because I couldn't breathe, so I'm three
3 months premature, 3 pound in weight.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. Everything's blank until 22 November 1963. I came back
6 to life only for an hour or so. I remember my medical
7 nurse. She was watching a television set at the time.
8 Even though I didn't know it was a TV set. I had got
9 out of the oxygen tent and climbed to the rails on the
10 medical crib. 22 November 1963. I only remember
11 an hour. And then I come back to life 1965. This is
12 where we get to 1965, correct, because I'm in a baby
13 unit then, and then everything goes dead. That's Arnha
14 Children's Home for sick children in Ellon,
15 Aberdeenshire.

16 Then I'm very much alive again in March 1966.

17 Q. That's when you went to the FFL-FFN [REDACTED] ?

18 A. The FFL-FFN [REDACTED], near Fraserburgh, which is just outside.
19 I think it's a city now. But this would have been in
20 the [REDACTED] area, maybe on [REDACTED] (?) area.

21 Q. Was it on a farm?

22 A. It was a [REDACTED] cottage, but the foster father, he was
23 a merchant seaman.

24 Q. Oh, right.

25 A. And when he was discharged from the Second World War,

1 I think he went to work on the farm and I think he was
2 a farmer and he -- he -- he tried to help the cows
3 there.

4 Q. Okay. You've mentioned the way in which you were
5 treated at the FFL-FFN, that you were abused
6 physically and sexually, and you tell us about that in
7 your statement. Is there anything that you feel able to
8 talk about in relation to the abuse that you suffered
9 more than you've just said or do you just want us to
10 look at your statement?

11 A. No, well, memory recall. I remember it quite well.
12 I remember being handed over to Mrs FFL like a bag
13 of meat. I remember a young girl, 15/16 years old,
14 called . Mrs FFL informed my foster father
15 that I was to go into the garden and meet my new daddy.
16 And I met , I remember, because he was about 15
17 or 16 as well, . And Mr FFN handed
18 me a hoe for weeding, but I'm down here, I'm only
19 a little baby, I'm not even three years old, I think.
20 Well, I'm yeah, three years old. And I thought, "No,
21 thank you, this is not my cup of tea".

22 And then there was 15 dogs that came galloping from
23 a kennel or something and I got trampled by 15 dogs and
24 I'd never seen a dog ever before in my complete life and
25 I remember two cocker spaniels who started to lick my

1 face, but from that day on, I had a horrible fear of
2 dogs.

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. And I remember my first night. I remember my first
5 night in Aberdeenshire. At the foster home.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. And I was basically told that I had to sleep in
8 a bedroom. It was cold. There was no central heating.
9 There was no hot water. I didn't have a toothbrush.

10 I remember Mrs FFL, she was trying to bathe me and
11 I didn't want her to touch my willy -- sorry, my penis.
12 And she started kissing me and she said -- I remember,
13 "I love you", or something, and, "You are mine now", and
14 I tell -- I tried to push her away and I remembered it
15 because she was so old that she is not my mum so
16 I remember pushing her away from my belly and the lower
17 part of my body, and she had no right to bathe me. It's
18 not because I didn't want to have -- be bathed. The
19 only person that was legally intended to bathe me was my
20 mum and no one else. My mum or my baby sisters or
21 something or my baby brothers or whatever, they should
22 have been the ones that were bathing me, not a stranger.

23 And she was old. She was in her 60s. And it was
24 obvious she wasn't my mum.

25 Q. And when --

1 A. And when she started interfering me with my penis and my
2 bum, that's when I knew, hey, this is going to be hell.
3 And I -- whether you have the ability to be
4 an intelligent baby.

5 I do not know. I just knew that there was
6 a distinctive smell of piggery, pigs, and I had to sleep
7 with this man who -- who stank of pigs. And I remember
8 something happening to my nose and it burst open wide
9 with lots of blood because my -- I have a scar on my
10 nose and my -- the blood went everywhere. And I'm three
11 years old, so I must have prevented him. And that night
12 I was raped by Mr FFK and it went on
13 for 15 years and I remember every incident. I remember
14 it now.

15 So I have to speak caution to the wind and I have --
16 must not get too emotional about it, but I am a victim
17 of rape. But apart from that, it wasn't just that.
18 Ruth, I took a piece of paper from a coffee table or
19 something and it was a £5 note, right? And I drew on
20 that -- I drew on that £5 note and I had no idea what
21 a £5 note was. Anyway, next day, Mrs FFL and the
22 whole family, they'd gone ballistic and I got in from
23 school and I went into the bedroom and Mrs FFL, she
24 took this leather belt and she says, "If you don't tell
25 me what you've done with this £5 note, you dirty little

1 tinker" -- and it was worse than that -- "I'm going to
2 make sure that you get the biggest beating of your
3 life", and that £5 note, I only drew on it. I didn't
4 mean any harm. I had no idea that it was money.
5 I didn't think anything about it. And she said, "Wait
6 until your dad comes home, he is going to beat the
7 daylights out of you". Anyway, did he come home, did he
8 take the belt off from round his buckles? Yes,
9 of course he did. And he picked up the pillow case and
10 he took one look at me and, "I can't do it", and he
11 started thrashing the hell out of the pillow on this
12 bed.

13 And Mrs FFL knew that he wasn't thrashing me to
14 bits, he was thrashing the pillow. He said, "You'd
15 better be a good actor, you'd better start crying or I'm
16 going to hit you". Anyway, I was a good actor,
17 I remember it, it was in 1960, summer 1960, and I saw
18 him hit the hell out of this pillow and there was --
19 there was white feather everywhere, and after the dirty
20 deed was done on this pillow, anyway, Mrs FFL comes
21 in. He walks out. And she took one look at me, she
22 took one look at me, she said, "You're a bad actor".

23 LADY SMITH: Peter, can I just say, you've referred to a lot
24 of detail there, thank you very much, that's very full
25 detail and I have got it all in your statement, which

1 of course I've read. But I think I'm right in hearing
2 elements of significant sexual abuse which are still
3 vivid in your mind, significant physical abuse which is
4 still vivid in your mind, and importantly, I recognise
5 emotional abuse in the derogatory terms that were used
6 towards you and about you. Do I have these elements
7 correctly --
8 A. Ma'am, you're absolutely spot on.
9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
10 A. Thank you, ma'am.
11 LADY SMITH: Thank you for reminding me of all the detail
12 about those elements, which are in your statement.
13 A. Thank you, ma'am.
14 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.
15 MS INNES: I just have a few more questions for you, Peter.
16 One in relation to your own experiences. Was there
17 anyone that you could tell about what was going on? Did
18 you have a social worker who you could speak to or
19 anybody that you trusted?
20 A. We all had the same social worker.
21 Q. Right.
22 A. And that would have been Margery Urquhart.
23 Q. From Aberdeen County Council?
24 A. Aberdeen, yes. But during that time she didn't keep in
25 contact. I remembered her when I was a baby boy, but

1 when I was fostered after 1966, we didn't meet, we
2 didn't make any contact again until we met in London at
3 Buckingham Palace when she had her OBE and we caught up
4 then and had lunch. I remember that. It was 2002 or
5 something. We talked about it and, yeah, it was
6 Margery.

7 Q. Okay, but you can't remember having any contact with her
8 during the time that you lived at the FFL-FFN ?

9 A. No, no. Not until I went to Mayfield Boys' Home in
10 Banff.

11 Q. Yes. You've told us about that in your statement.
12 I just wanted to be sure about that, Peter.

13 A. Okay.

14 Q. If it's okay, I would like to move on to just some final
15 thoughts about key things that we can take from your
16 experience. If we go on to page 19, you've highlighted
17 some issues already in your evidence. I think in this
18 part of your statement, Peter, if we go down to
19 paragraph 79, you talk there about victims of child
20 abuse being seen, and correct me if I'm wrong, are you
21 talking about health professionals properly recognising
22 injuries that children suffer and looking for the right
23 explanation as to why they have those injuries? Is that
24 the sort of thing that you're talking about?

25 A. Correct, and the need for medical treatment, because

1 you've got to remember an abuser such as the foster
2 parent who murdered Alexina, they will not tell the
3 truth. So any child -- it's called prolonged injuries.
4 Had Alexina lived, she would have had prolonged
5 injuries. I have prolonged injuries, but I'm alive.
6 There's -- she's deceased, I'm alive.

7 So the broken bone that I've got from my arm and my
8 lumbar spine and the post-traumatic stress disorder and
9 depression -- well, I'm nearly 60 now. My Christmas is
10 coming. And so depression, here I am, I'm nearly coming
11 up to my 60th birthday and this paragraph number 79
12 is -- it brings a number of issues into the medical
13 services in Scotland today, because I don't think people
14 are treating child abuse injuries serious enough.

15 Q. So people need to properly investigate and recognise the
16 impact in terms of physical health and in terms of
17 mental health that child abuse has?

18 A. Exactly, Ruth, but it's been -- it's still being denied.
19 I meet children today, 14/15. I meet 20-year-olds.
20 I meet 30-year-olds. And I have asked them many times,
21 "What would you like to be changed?" But I keep to
22 paragraph number 79 for the obvious reason.

23 Q. Then I think another issue that you've raised and you
24 mentioned a moment ago in response to when Lady Smith
25 was talking to you about emotional abuse that you

1 suffered, the names that you were called, I think you
2 highlight in your statement as well that you feel that
3 you were discriminated against because of -- your family
4 were discriminated against because of the heritage that
5 you told us that your parents had.

6 A. Well, Lady Smith's absolutely -- sorry, ma'am's
7 absolutely correct. But, yes, we are Romany gypsy.
8 I wouldn't even conclude that we were even tinsmith
9 period, because mum's family go back to well before the
10 16th century to the Isle of Lewis and she's gypsy, so we
11 have to -- why is she gypsy and why is there a Romany
12 connection?

13 Well, the Kelbies are a very old family as well and
14 back then I think during the late 1950s, I found
15 a document in Scotland the other day that states that
16 the Kelbie family, the Stewart family -- so the document
17 dated 6 September 1930 in Aberdeen states that there's
18 a problem with some very powerful gypsies in Aberdeen
19 and something has to be done.

20 And that report was published on that day in
21 question and the whole scenario that I found myself into
22 is a reflection of sheer racism, because I do believe
23 that Scotland is still racist against gypsies. I'm not
24 referring to the traveller community, I'm not qualified,
25 I'm not a traveller. Even -- even though my birthright

1 is gypsy, Romany, I came home to Scotland seven years
2 ago and I've noticed that either it's for my accent or
3 it's because of my surname that I am discriminated
4 still.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. Because of the -- Kelbie is a gypsy name in Scotland and
7 there was such a lot of racial abuse and physical and
8 sexual abuse -- they had to bring us down.

9 In one sense, taking a child into care for the
10 simple reason of being educated, that's what they did to
11 us. We became educated. We went to school. But my mum
12 went to school when she was young and she -- she wasn't
13 in care. She was taken straight to the children's
14 school at Aboyne Children's Home, because you could take
15 your children there.

16 So it's no excuse in our family that the children
17 couldn't be educated. But when I was in care, when my
18 sisters were in care, we were abused because we were
19 just looked upon as scum.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. Alexina was murdered not just -- it was evil. The
22 attack on Alexina was evil, but the attacks on every
23 child, whether they're gypsy or not, or ... regardless,
24 children should not have to be abused in that way to
25 such an extent that you have to rely on the Knights

1 Templar to rescue you. I'm not bringing in any secret
2 organisations here. Knights Templar for me is my
3 heroes, so I was hoping that they would come to Mayfield
4 Boys' Home.

5 But Lady Smith QC is absolutely correct. We were
6 punished because we were tinkers and they had to bring
7 us down. That's just discipline. They would have said,
8 "Oh, my sisters were wild, they were covered in muck or
9 soil, they had no shoes on maybe in the summer in the
10 berry fields of Blairgowrie" or wherever it was that
11 they were camping, but it was summer and it was a good
12 life and they were minding their own business and they
13 were carrying on with the work.

14 In the children's homes and in the foster parents'
15 homes, if you -- if you -- they didn't see you as
16 a gypsy, they saw you as tinker and that was
17 something -- Scotland still hates that today. They
18 really do.

19 Q. Okay, thank you for sharing that, Peter.

20 Another thing that you've already mentioned in your
21 evidence, I just want to highlight it as something that
22 I know you would say is a lesson to be learned, is that
23 when a court makes an order, it should be complied with.

24 A. (Witness nods)

25 Q. You've already talked about that in the context of the

1 court order that --

2 A. Yes, I have done.

3 Q. Because you say if that had been complied with, this

4 would never have happened.

5 A. (Witness nods)

6 Q. If --

7 A. Absolutely correct, Ruth. If, if, if Ruth Haring, the

8 late Ruth Haring, former barrister at law, who was

9 Alexina's social worker, if Ruth Haring had kept within

10 the law, because the judge has given you the direct

11 order, that's law, it's an act of court and so therefore

12 you have to apply to the ruling and you're absolutely

13 spot on. We would never have been taken into care had

14 it not been for Alexina's murder.

15 Q. Then finally, Peter, I just want to note something that

16 you said at the end of your statement in paragraph 84,

17 page 20. You say there:

18 "We must, without question, dedicate all the

19 children who died in care and we must not forget them."

20 A. I did, Ruth.

21 MS INNES: Thank you.

22 I don't have any more questions for you, Peter, and

23 there are no applications, my Lady.

24 A. Thank you, Ruth.

25 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for

1 questions?

2 Peter, that does complete all the questions we have
3 for you this afternoon. Can I just assure you, because
4 I heard you mention in passing one of the children's
5 homes you were in, we have that in your statement and
6 of course I've read it. It's not something we're
7 looking at in this section of our hearings' work, but it
8 is there and I'm very well aware of that.

9 But, as I said earlier, I've read the whole of your
10 statement in relation to foster care, in relation to
11 what you've told us about your investigations into
12 Alexina's death after she'd gone into foster care. I'm
13 really grateful to you for providing all the information
14 that's in your written statement and being able to come
15 here today and tell us in your own words what's really
16 important about what's there in the statement and
17 hearing from you yourself, your descriptions about your
18 earlier life, has made it come alive for me, made
19 Alexina's short life come alive for me as well.

20 Thank you very much for that.

21 A. (Witness nods).

22 LADY SMITH: So please go away that you've done something
23 extremely valuable by coming here today, it's certainly
24 valuable to us and it's enhanced my learning. I'm
25 really grateful to you and I'm able now to let you go

1 with my thanks.

2 A. Thank you, ma'am.

3 (The witness withdrew)

4 LADY SMITH: In the course of his evidence, Peter mentioned
5 names which aren't covered by my restriction order, such
6 as his own, such as his sister Alexina's, but there were
7 other names, the FFL-FFN and those in their foster
8 family and his own siblings other than Alexina, they are
9 covered by my restriction order and they can't be
10 identified outside this room.

11 I think that completes the evidence for this week,
12 Ms Innes. Is that right?

13 MS INNES: It does, my Lady. Next week we'll begin with
14 applicant evidence again on Tuesday and then for the
15 rest of the week there'll be evidence from other
16 witnesses.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

18 Until Tuesday at 10 o'clock, I wish you all a good
19 weekend and we'll see anybody who's coming back then.

20 Thank you.

21 (4.04 pm)

22 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on
23 Tuesday, 12 July 2022)

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

'Christine' (sworn)	1
Questions from Ms Rattray	3
'Jane' (read)	50
Angela Harkins (sworn)	68
Questions from Ms Innes	69
Peter Kelbie (sworn)	123
Questions from Ms Innes	125

