

1 Friday, 19 August 2022

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning to the last day this week of oral
4 evidence in our case study looking into the provision of
5 foster care and boarding out. As we said yesterday, we
6 have three oral witnesses to give evidence today and the
7 first one, Ms Rattray, you're going to lead,
8 I understand, and is ready?

9 MS RATTRAY: Yes, my Lady.

10 The first witness is an applicant who has the
11 pseudonym 'Sarah'. 'Sarah' was in the care of the City
12 of Aberdeen Corporation, then Grampian Regional Council.
13 She was in two foster placements in Aberdeen.

14 The first was with EYH-EYI from
15 1974 until 1981.

16 The second was with EYJ-EYK from
17 1981 to 1985, and that placement ended
18 when she was adopted by the EYJ-EYK

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

20 MS RATTRAY: The current responsible authority is Aberdeen
21 City Council.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

23 'Sarah' (affirmed)

24 LADY SMITH: I think that microphone may be slightly to the
25 side of 'Sarah'. We can maybe move it more centrally.

1 A. That's fine.

2 LADY SMITH: The microphone, 'Sarah', will help you but it
3 will also help us to hear you, particularly the
4 stenographers who listen to you through the sound
5 system. If you could keep in that good position that
6 you're in now for it, that would be great.

7 The red folder you'll be taken to in a moment, it
8 has the typed copy of your statement in it but we'll
9 also bring the statement up on screen and go to the
10 various parts of it that we're going to discuss with you
11 in evidence. You don't have to use it but you might
12 find that helpful as a guide.

13 A. (Witness nods)

14 LADY SMITH: 'Sarah', can I also say that I do understand
15 how nerve racking and difficult it is to come and do
16 what you agreed to do this morning, coming into public,
17 into a room of strangers, to talk about yourself, your
18 own life, and your life as a child in foster care for
19 many years. I know that you spent most of your
20 childhood in foster care. And that talking about it may
21 well be distressing and upsetting at times.

22 I fully understand that and if there's anything
23 I can do to help you give the best evidence that you
24 can, you must let me know.

25 A. All right.

1 LADY SMITH: Whether it's letting you have a break or just
2 a breather while you're sitting there or anything else
3 that I haven't thought of that might help you.
4 A. (Witness nods)
5 LADY SMITH: So please do remember that.
6 A. (Witness nods)
7 LADY SMITH: You can ask questions here. You may have found
8 it difficult to ask questions when you were a child, but
9 you're allowed to ask questions here, that's quite okay,
10 all right?
11 A. Thank you.
12 LADY SMITH: First question for you, do you have any
13 questions before we begin?
14 A. No, I haven't.
15 LADY SMITH: You okay? Right. If you're ready I'll hand
16 over to Ms Rattray and she'll take it from there.
17 A. I'm ready.
18 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.
19 Questions from Ms Rattray
20 MS RATTRAY: Good morning, 'Sarah'.
21 A. Good morning.
22 Q. What I'm going to do to start is to ask you to look at
23 the statement that you've given to the Inquiry and we've
24 given that statement a reference, which is
25 WIT-1-000000857 and I'm going to ask you to look at the

1 paper version in the red folder. If you could turn to
2 the back page of your statement, 'Sarah', simply to
3 confirm that you signed your statement?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. We see that above it, at paragraph 169, that you have no
6 objection to your witness statement being published as
7 part of the evidence to the Inquiry and you believe the
8 facts stated in your witness statement are true.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Is that right?

11 You can put that to one side now, thank you.

12 'Sarah', this morning in terms of giving your
13 evidence I'm going to go through things with you in
14 an order. We'll start with a very brief look at your
15 background before you went into care. Probably most of
16 our time will be spent hearing you in relation to your
17 experiences when you were with the EYH-EYI

18 I'll then take you to look at some records which are
19 in your children's file in relation to your time with
20 the EYH-EYI

21 I'll then ask you about what you remember when you
22 stayed as a foster child with the EYJ-EYK

23 After that, I'll ask you about some matters
24 following care such as the impact your experiences have
25 had upon you and also any lessons that you think we are

1 able to learn from your own experiences.

2 That's the kind of order that we'll do things in

3 today.

4 Starting with the first of those, 'Sarah', which is

5 your background. At your statement I think you say that

6 you were born in 1971 in Warwickshire; is that right?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You have a half-sister --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. -- who is three years younger than you?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. But you later learned that you may have had an older

13 sibling who was adopted at birth?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You say you have very few memories of your life at home,

16 which is not surprising because you went into care when

17 you were aged three.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. But you do say that you remember something about leaving

20 your mum?

21 A. Yeah, when I went to EYH-EYI Or before that, with my

22 nan.

23 Q. Well, both. What do you remember about leaving your mum

24 and then moving to the EYH-EYI ?

25 A. All I can remember is I think it was my grandmother's --

1 being with my mum and seeing my mum going out a lot at
2 night. That's the only memories I've got before I got
3 moved to foster care, so ...

4 Q. What do you remember about leaving your mum then first
5 moving to foster care?

6 A. My mum took me to EYH-EYI . I can remember hanging
7 onto her and not only wanting her to leave because my
8 sister got put on the sofa and I was hanging onto my
9 mum's leg and I got pulled off my mum's leg so she could
10 leave. And I was just screaming and everything, as any
11 child would.

12 Q. Yeah. The EYH-EYI what did you call your foster
13 parents? Was it mum and dad?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Was that something that you chose to do, to call them
16 mum and dad, or did you want --

17 A. It was just I think that's what we were told. It was
18 just everyone called them mum and dad.

19 Q. Did you feel all right about calling them mum and dad?

20 A. No, because I knew they weren't my mum and dad. I knew
21 who my mum was, because she left us there.

22 Q. Yeah.

23 The foster parents, did they have jobs at all?

24 A. Yes, the foster father, he was a coach driver, and the
25 foster mother, I know she did cleaning. And she also

1 had child-minding children as well as foster children.

2 Q. In the home that you were living with the EYH-EYI that

3 was in Aberdeen?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Who was all living in the home?

6 A. There was the EYH-EYI their children, they had two

7 boys and a daughter, and so we had her daughter and my

8 half-sister and a foster -- another foster girl in one

9 room, her two sons in another, and their bedroom.

10 Q. Okay. What kind of ages were her birth children, the

11 two sons and the daughter?

12 A. Her children were a lot older than us.

13 Q. Okay. You've mentioned that your foster mother did

14 child-minding as well.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Did that mean that there were other children in the

17 house sometimes?

18 A. Yeah. Different -- they were quite young, little boys

19 and girls. I don't know their names, but there was

20 quite a few that would come and go. Sort of daytime.

21 Q. Can you remember how many children she was looking after

22 at the one time in terms of childminding?

23 A. I can remember my half-sister and me, there was another

24 little boy. I would say about a baby-ish age because he

25 was still in nappies. I think there was another little

1 girl and I can't remember who else. There was quite
2 a few.

3 Q. There were a lot of children in the house, was it
4 a large house?

5 A. No, it was a three-bedroom maisonnette.

6 Q. Right, okay. You tell us, 'Sarah', at paragraph 15 of
7 your statement that you have some early memories?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. And that was in relation to brushing your foster
10 mother's hair?

11 A. Yeah. She had black short curly hair and I used to --
12 and she had an armchair by the fireplace that she'd
13 always sit in sort of opposite the TV in the corner and
14 I used to have to stand there and just comb her hair all
15 the time for hours on end and then put rollers in it.

16 Q. Was that something you liked to do?

17 A. No. It was what she wanted to do.

18 Q. Was that just a sort of one-off occasion or did that
19 happen a lot?

20 A. Quite a lot.

21 Q. You also tell us when we asked you about mornings and
22 bedtime, you tell us the kind of time that you were sent
23 to bed at the end of the day.

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. What time was that?

1 A. About 4 o'clock in the afternoon after school.

2 Q. What about the evening meal? Did you come back
3 downstairs for something to eat?

4 A. My meals were stood in the kitchen. It would usually be
5 fish fingers and beans or -- and that was it. And then
6 I'd wash up and then I'd go to bed.

7 Q. Okay, and the food --

8 LADY SMITH: Sorry, when you say your meals were stood in
9 the kitchen, you had to stand up to eat them, did you?

10 A. Yeah.

11 LADY SMITH: Was there a kitchen table?

12 A. No. It was one of those old 1960s kitchen storage units
13 where you drop the side down and I would stand there and
14 have my meals.

15 LADY SMITH: Was there a table anywhere that other people
16 ate?

17 A. No.

18 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

19 MS RATTRAY: You were standing in the kitchen having your
20 meals. What about the **EYH-EY!** or what about all the
21 other children?

22 A. They'd be out. The children would be outside playing.
23 If the mother wasn't there, there would be the foster
24 father. If he wasn't there, there would be one of the
25 eldest sons watching, so.

1 Q. So the other children, when they had their meals, did
2 they have it standing in the kitchen?

3 A. In the living room. In the living room on the sofa.

4 Q. Right, okay. Did you not have your meals in the living
5 room on the sofa as well?

6 A. No, we didn't eat together.

7 Q. The food itself, did you enjoy the food you were given?

8 A. No.

9 Q. And why was that?

10 A. It was very basic. It would be porridge in the morning
11 and whatever at teatime, like fish fingers and beans or
12 fish fingers and spaghetti, that was it. It was basic.

13 Q. What would happen if you didn't like the food you were
14 eating?

15 A. I would have to eat it no matter what. There was one
16 time I got caught stealing a drink, drinking from
17 a bottle of juice, because I didn't have many drinks,
18 and so she poured shandy into my porridge one morning
19 and I had to stand there and eat it before school
20 because I stole squash.

21 Q. When she made you eat it did you eat it or did anything
22 else happen?

23 A. I got beaten because I didn't want to eat it, but I was
24 made to eat it.

25 Q. When she beat you, how did she beat you?

1 A. Using her hands, fists. I got landed into a twin-tub
2 washing machine a lot that had a metal strip and it
3 would stick out in the corner because it wasn't screwed
4 in properly and I used to hit my head a lot on there and
5 I still have scars from it today.

6 Q. Do I take it from that when you hit your head the metal
7 strip cut your head?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. So you were bleeding?

10 A. Yeah. I used to bleed quite a lot.

11 Q. In relation to washing and bathing, was that something
12 you were given any privacy about as you got older?

13 A. (Witness shakes head)

14 We had a bath once a week on a Sunday with the girls
15 sharing a bath, all three foster kids sharing a bath,
16 and that was it.

17 Q. In relation to your clothes, what were your clothes like
18 when you were staying there?

19 A. Not very good. I used to always wear a purple woolly
20 jumper and dark trousers, all the time. I was poorly
21 dressed.

22 Q. What about the other children in the household? Were
23 they poorly dressed as well?

24 A. No. From what I could see they were in different
25 clothes all the time. They had more freedom than me as

1 well. They were always out playing and everything.

2 Q. When you say they had better clothes and they were out
3 playing, was that Mrs EYH birth children or did
4 that include your younger sister and the foster child?

5 A. It included my younger sister and foster child. And her
6 daughter, she had her -- did her own thing anyway
7 because she was a lot older than us. She -- I can
8 remember her wearing a blazer, so she would have been in
9 secondary school.

10 Q. So you were the only child --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- in the household who was poorly --

13 A. (Witness nods)

14 I knew how to wash up, I knew how to do washing,
15 I knew how to cut a hedge, I knew how to strip
16 wallpaper.

17 Q. These chores, how old were you when you were doing these
18 kind of chores?

19 A. Very young. Under the age of 10. I would Hoover every
20 day before I went to school and then after school I'd
21 wash up and everything. I would get told to dust as
22 well at weekends because they had wooden fireplace with
23 a metal fire with metal bars through it. I had to dust
24 all around that as well.

25 Q. The other children, were they helping out? Were they

1 doing chores?

2 A. No. No.

3 Q. What about Mrs EYH was she doing any cleaning?

4 A. No, she'd always sit in the armchair, all the time.

5 Q. So you --

6 A. I can remember a bottle of pills she used to keep on the

7 side of the fireplace, a brown bottle, and she'd have

8 her coffee cup and a picture of cigarettes there as

9 well.

10 Q. And at the time did you know what these pills were?

11 A. No, I didn't.

12 Q. Later in life, did you then hear about medication

13 perhaps she was taking?

14 A. I found out at 17 through a social worker that it was

15 Valium, she was on Valium.

16 Q. When you're talking about your clothes and being dressed

17 poorly compared to the other children in the household,

18 how did that make you feel?

19 A. I used to feel different all the time and jealous as

20 well, because I used to sleep in a top bunk and I could

21 see out the corner of the curtains out the window and

22 I could see them playing outside with everyone. And

23 I used to lie in bed and watch them playing.

24 Q. Do you know why you weren't allowed to join in or you

25 were treated differently?

1 A. I think it was because -- all my life I thought it was
2 because of the way I reacted when I got took off my mum
3 that first day there.

4 Q. Your mum, was she someone who remained in your thoughts?

5 A. Yeah. You build up this dream when you're in foster
6 care of a happy ending, that you'll be back with your
7 family and everything will be all right. But it's just
8 a dream. It doesn't turn out like that at all. But you
9 build that dream as a comfort to yourself, thinking your
10 mum will come and take you away and everything will be
11 all right. But it never happens.

12 Q. While you were in foster care, did you see your mum at
13 all?

14 A. I can only remember a couple of visits and that's it and
15 I don't know -- didn't see her again.

16 Q. Did you ever ask anyone whether you could see your mum?

17 A. When I was in trouble I used to always say, "I want my
18 mum", but ... nothing ever happened.

19 Q. What was your foster mother's response to that, when you
20 said you wanted your mum?

21 A. I used to get thrown in my face that I'd be like my mum:
22 unmarried and everything, with children. So it was like
23 my mum would get put down as well as me.

24 Q. I'm now going to ask you about school, 'Sarah', and at
25 paragraph 27 of your statement you tell us that you

1 started nursery --

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. -- not long after you arrived. Did you enjoy going to

4 nursery?

5 A. It's away from home, yeah. I used to like playing with

6 toys and everything.

7 Q. You also say that at school you weren't allowed to be

8 known by your surname --

9 A. No.

10 Q. -- and you had to be known by the foster carer's

11 surname?

12 A. EYH-EYI Everything was under EYH-EYI

13 Q. Did anyone ever ask you how you felt about that --

14 A. (Witness shakes head)

15 Q. -- or if you wanted a new surname?

16 A. No, no one asked. I was just known as "EYH-EYI".

17 Q. How did you feel about that, do you remember?

18 A. I always knew I had a different surname because I had

19 this bag and it had a different name in it, but I was

20 never called it. I think it was from -- a present from

21 my gran. I don't know.

22 Q. Right, okay. You tell us that you were bullied at

23 school?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. In what way were you bullied?

1 A. I wasn't the cleanest person. I used to get called
2 names. And also because I was a foster child as well,
3 didn't have real parents. I also had soiled myself at
4 school because of the way things were happening, so it
5 was more ammunition for children.

6 Q. What about friends, were you able to make friends with
7 anyone at school?

8 A. Didn't have friends.

9 Q. What about your education generally? Did your foster
10 parents encourage you with your education?

11 A. I can remember them trying to teach me to read. If
12 I got a word wrong, I'd get smacked and start again.
13 That's how I got taught to read at home with the
14 EYH-EYI But I loved reading at school. I did like
15 reading.

16 And drawing was my strong point at school as well.

17 Q. You tell us from paragraph 32 that you used to steal
18 money from Mrs EYH daughter's school blazer and go
19 and buy some sweets?

20 A. Yeah, before school, because I was hungry. Or I'd pick
21 food up off the ground outside and eat that.

22 Q. Were you not getting enough to eat at home?

23 A. No. I was very small. So it's like I'd go to a park
24 sometimes, I'd get sent to this park to play. I had no
25 stranger awareness and I'd sit with people who were

1 having picnics and everything and share their food. It
2 sounds awful now, but that's what I used to do.

3 Q. What about the other children in the household, were
4 they with you at the park?

5 A. (Witness shakes head)

6 I was on my own. No adults. Nothing. I used to
7 cross all the main roads myself.

8 Q. Talking about being hungry at school and trying to get
9 sweets and trying to share people's picnics when you
10 weren't at school, what about at school? Were you given
11 a sort of play-piece to take to school to have a snack
12 during the day?

13 A. I can't remember having a play-piece or anything.

14 Q. You tell us at paragraph 33 that one time you were
15 trying to steal from a shop --

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. -- when you were at school and you got caught?

18 A. I got caught stealing a packet, small packets of
19 shortbread, and that's what I got caught stealing.

20 Q. What happened after you were caught stealing?

21 A. I got told off by a shop, saying it was wrong and
22 everything and they phoned **EYH-EY!** as well because it
23 was local area so I got in trouble for that.

24 She -- whenever I was in trouble I used to get
25 a beating, quite a bad beating. I'd always be covered

1 in bruises and all sorts.

2 Q. You've spoken about being thrown against the washing
3 machine, the twin tub, and you've spoken about her
4 hitting you. Did she hit you with her hands or did she
5 use anything else?

6 A. Hands and she broke my arm once and I didn't know it was
7 broken.

8 Q. Tell us what happened when your arm was broken?

9 A. We went -- I think I had been in trouble, we were going
10 on holiday, all of us, and it was before we were on
11 holiday, we were going to Blackpool, we did a night
12 stopover in Perth. All of us in the car, we slept in
13 the car. And then we got to Blackpool and it was
14 Mrs EYH daughter that noticed my arm wasn't
15 moving, I wasn't moving my arm. So I got took to
16 a hospital in Blackpool and they X-rayed it and it was
17 broken. Because I had to drink this thick white stuff
18 before the X-ray and that's when they X-rayed it, saw it
19 was broken, it was all in plaster.

20 Q. Do you know how your arm came to be broken?

21 A. EYH used to twist my arms and everything, so I think
22 it was through that.

23 Q. That's your foster mother, her first name's EYH?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. She used to twist your arms?

1 A. Yeah. I mean I used to walk round with all sorts of
2 injuries.

3 Q. You've spoken about going on holiday to Blackpool and
4 what happened there.

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. When you weren't on holiday but were at home, what kind
7 of things were you able to do with your free time when
8 you weren't at school?

9 A. I sat on the floor in the living room. It was always
10 where they had their sofa, I'd be sat at the corner of
11 the sofa on the floor all the time near the windows,
12 just sitting there watching TV, and that was it.

13 Q. Were you able to sit on the sofa?

14 A. No, because I wet the bed.

15 Q. What about the other children, were they allowed to sit
16 on the sofa?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Was your younger sister allowed to sit on the sofa?

19 A. Yeah. I can remember my younger sister being quite
20 a big-ish girl, a bit bigger than me, build-wise.
21 Always in and out the house. Always wearing sort of
22 nice skirts and that.

23 Q. But the reason you were given was you couldn't sit on
24 the sofa because you wet the bed?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. But my understanding from having looked at your records,
2 and we'll have a reference to that later, is that your
3 little sister wet herself sometimes as well.

4 A. Yeah, which I didn't know.

5 Q. But she was allowed to sit on the sofa?

6 A. Yeah. It was like we lived different lives. They were
7 always out playing and everything and I'd be indoors.

8 Q. In relation to things like birthdays and Christmases, do
9 you remember Christmas being celebrated?

10 A. If you can call it celebrated. I can remember the
11 police coming out one Christmas. I think it was the
12 neighbours that rung them. There was some sort of
13 incident, don't know what happened to this day, but it
14 was because my sister's mouth was full of blood and
15 there was lots of screaming. I don't know if she
16 tripped over a mat or what happened, but the police were
17 called. But nothing was done and the police left.

18 But Christmas, I was just given like brown paper bag
19 with socks in it, same as my birthday and that. But
20 I found out years later that my birthday was on the
21 wrong day.

22 Q. You were led to believe your birthday was on one day,
23 but in fact you were born on a different day?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. You remember getting socks in a brown paper bag for

1 Christmas and indeed for your birthday?

2 A. Yeah. No -- there was no birthday parties or anything.

3 Q. What about the other children?

4 A. I can't remember what they got but I know they had like

5 dolls and that. I think one called Sindy dolls or

6 something?

7 LADY SMITH: Some girls liked Sindy dolls and others liked

8 Barbie, if I remember rightly. Is that right?

9 A. Yeah.

10 MS RATTRAY: Were you ever given dolls, a Sindy or a Barbie?

11 A. No. Not that I can remember, no. I just remember socks

12 all the time. And also being remembered my birthday

13 being three days earlier than my actual birth date was.

14 Q. In relation to contact with your family, you've already

15 spoken about that, that you maybe saw your mum a couple

16 of times and then didn't see her but you say in your

17 statement you were later told something about your nan

18 or you understood something about your nan?

19 A. Apparently my nan wanted to have me to herself when

20 I was younger, but I never got the full story about it.

21 It just fell through. But she didn't want me in foster

22 care.

23 Q. Do you remember seeing your nan whilst you were in

24 foster care?

25 A. A couple of times. Once at her flat window, because she

1 threw down a bracelet for me. It was like a charm
2 bracelet with different stones on it. I never saw it
3 again.

4 Q. In relation to social workers, do you remember ever
5 being visited by a social worker when you were in foster
6 care with the EYH-EYI ?

7 A. I can remember one, and that was -- I don't know if I'm
8 allowed to say her name.

9 Q. Yes, of course.

10 A. Sheila Maxwell.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 MS RATTRAY: When Sheila Maxwell came to visit, did you get
13 to speak to her?

14 A. I thought she took me to some sort of centre one night
15 wrapped in a coat, because someone took me out a bunk
16 bed, top bunk bed, I can remember it being dark and
17 being put in a car and taken to this -- I think it was
18 an assessment centre, I'm not sure. But it's a little
19 room with a table and there was a couple of chairs and
20 I was just sat there drawing. And then I got taken
21 back.

22 Q. You remember that occasion, do you remember any other
23 occasions about Sheila Maxwell coming to the house?

24 A. When she took me to a different family.

25 Q. Right, so other than the time she took you to the centre

1 and you were drawing pictures --

2 A. I can remember going to that centre again after school

3 a few times, just sit there and I was drawing. I can't

4 remember the conversations or anything. I just remember

5 being in that room and drawing.

6 Q. Mm-hmm.

7 A. And I don't know the name of the centre or anything.

8 I know it wasn't far from the EYH-EYI .

9 Q. Okay. Do you remember ever being able to tell

10 Sheila Maxwell about how you were being treated?

11 A. No, because I tried telling the foster mother and she

12 said I was a liar.

13 Q. What were you trying to tell the foster mother at that

14 stage?

15 A. That her husband was abusing me and she said I was lying

16 and she beat me.

17 Q. We'll come to that shortly, 'Sarah'. At paragraph 54,

18 at that stage you say again about the differences in

19 treatment --

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. -- between you and your younger sister and the other

22 foster girl and indeed the other children in the house.

23 A. (Witness nods)

24 Q. How did that affect your relationship with your sister?

25 A. We didn't get on. I mean, also she was a bigger girl

1 than me, but I think now it was just jealousy and
2 everything because she -- they all seemed happy, out
3 playing with friends and everything, and I just felt
4 an outcast all the time.

5 Q. You say in your statement that you never got on with the
6 other kids in the house, that you had different
7 lifestyles, and the EYH-EYI older children had nothing
8 to do with you, but one time one of the sons helped you?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. What happened then?

11 A. He took me off his mum and told me to go and clean
12 myself up because I was getting badly beaten. Because
13 her older son, he seemed to be a loner, he was always in
14 his room, and he had a motorbike. So that was the one
15 time I was safe, because he took me off of her.

16 Q. At paragraph 56 of your statement, 'Sarah', I think you
17 make the point that your little sister and the other
18 foster girl were only babies, young babies --

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. -- when they first started living with the EYH-EYI and
21 you say that she was all for babies.

22 A. Yeah, she was good with babies, but not ... not me.

23 Q. Not you. You were an older child, but you were still
24 a very young child.

25 A. I also made a lot of noise when my mum was leaving as

1 well, because I wouldn't let go.

2 Q. At paragraph 61 of your statement, 'Sarah' --

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. -- you say that you remember being thrown into

5 rosebushes and covered head to toe in scratches.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. What do you remember about that?

8 A. That was her daughter, and she thought it was funny.

9 Q. Oh right, okay. What was the EYH-EYI response to the

10 daughter throwing you in a rosebush?

11 A. There was no response. I was just told to stop

12 screaming.

13 Q. Was the daughter given a row?

14 A. Not that I can remember.

15 Q. You were covered head to toe in scratches. Did anyone

16 look at your scratches and heal them?

17 A. No. It's like if I had a head injury, I would sleep on

18 the floor till it stopped bleeding, then I'd be allowed

19 to sleep on the top bunk.

20 Q. So when you had a head injury, are these the cuts when

21 you were thrown against the washing machine?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. You weren't allowed to sleep in your bed?

24 A. No. I was to sleep on the floor.

25 Q. Were you sleeping straight on the ground or did you have

1 a mattress --

2 A. There was a mattress and a blanket and it was -- you

3 would have the bunk beds there, the mattress was on the

4 floor there, then you'd have her eldest daughter's bed

5 and then the other foster child's bed as well as a chest

6 of drawers, wardrobe and everything.

7 Q. Did Mrs EYH did EYH seek medical treatment for

8 these cuts in?

9 A. No. Sometimes Mrs EYH would sleep in the foster

10 child's bed in the same room as us.

11 Q. Right. Do you have any thoughts about why she was

12 sleeping in the children's room?

13 A. I think she knew what was going on with her husband.

14 Q. You tell us at paragraph 65, 'Sarah', that you remember

15 threatening to run away.

16 A. (Witness nods)

17 Yes.

18 Q. Tell us about how you felt that you thought you wanted

19 to run away?

20 A. I just wanted to go. It was -- I can remember screaming

21 and crying all the time saying, "I don't want to be

22 here, I want to be with my mum", and I would get to the

23 end of the road and their eldest daughter would bring me

24 back. Because I just didn't want to be there.

25 Q. What were the EYH-EYI response to when you tried to

1 run away?

2 A. I'd just get the usual beating from her and I was

3 ungrateful and everything.

4 Q. What would happen to the other children? Because

5 although, you know, they may have been happier children,

6 I'm sure there must be times where every child does

7 something wrong or is naughty. What would happen to the

8 other children if they were naughty?

9 A. They would get a smack. But then you were allowed to

10 smack children and everything. That --

11 Q. What form did the smack take of the other children?

12 A. Either on the side of their legs or -- EYH would

13 literally just grab you and then hit you.

14 Q. Was that different to how you were being --

15 A. Yeah, they didn't have head injuries or --

16 Q. What about bruises? Did they have lots of bruises?

17 A. Not that I could see. I would turn up at school with

18 bruises and everything.

19 Q. On the subject of bed-wetting, which you mention at

20 paragraph 66 of your statement, 'Sarah', you say that

21 you got into a lot of trouble for bed-wetting.

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. What would happen if you wet the bed?

24 A. I'd get smacks and everything. I'd have to -- didn't

25 clean up or anything. Didn't wash or anything. But I'd

1 put -- I'd wash my own bedding in the washing machine.
2 Twin-tub washing machine, where you put it in one bit,
3 wash it, then you put it in another bit, and you had
4 these big wooden tongs to do it.
5 Q. That's something you had to do yourself?
6 A. Yeah, I knew how to use it.
7 Q. But you weren't given the chance to have a bath or
8 no one cleaned you up?
9 A. No, I'd go to school like it. And that was more
10 ammunition for children at school.
11 LADY SMITH: How old were you when you had to wash your wet
12 sheets?
13 A. I would say six, seven? Quite young. I was really
14 young. Because I can also remember standing there
15 peeling potatoes at the sink and everything and then
16 nearly dropping a whole pile of plates after washing and
17 drying them, because my fingers cramped up and I was
18 having trouble carrying these plates to the sideboard,
19 but I still had to do it.
20 LADY SMITH: Did you have to stand on something at the sink?
21 A. (Witness nods)
22 LADY SMITH: So if you were young you were reaching up high
23 to do the jobs?
24 A. Yeah.
25 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

1 A. Because they had this really dark carpet on the kitchen
2 floor as well, like a really dark colour.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

4 MS RATTRAY: Looking back, how would you describe your
5 relationship with Mrs EYH your foster mother?

6 A. We shouldn't have been put together. I don't like the
7 word, but I hate her. I wish things were different.
8 I wish I had a normal childhood. But maybe she was ill
9 herself, I don't know.

10 Q. Did she ever show you affection, like give you a cuddle
11 or --

12 A. The day I left.

13 Q. Right, and that was the only time --

14 A. She cried. She was crying the day I left. And that was
15 the only time I saw affection.

16 Q. What about the other children? Did she show affection
17 to them?

18 A. She wasn't really an affectionate person, she had that
19 sort of strict-looking face.

20 Q. 'Sarah', I'm going to ask you about some of the abuse
21 that you experienced and you tell us about. You've told
22 us about a lot of abuse already, but I think here from
23 paragraph 67 of your statement --

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. -- you tell us that you were sexually abused by the

1 foster father from a young age.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. If you're able, what can you tell us about what happened

4 to you?

5 A. It was in his bedroom. It was always when the house was

6 empty. And it was full sex I had to do with him on

7 numerous occasions. Wasn't allowed to make a noise.

8 Wasn't allowed to tell anyone, but I did try. Because

9 he said no one would believe me. And they didn't. And

10 it was Saturdays as well, when everybody went shopping,

11 I'd be left in the house with him and it would start

12 then. I always knew when the house was empty and I was

13 with him what would happen.

14 LADY SMITH: Sorry, 'Sarah', how old were you when it

15 started? Can you remember?

16 A. I don't know my actual age, but I do remember nursery

17 putting cream on my private parts.

18 LADY SMITH: When you were at nursery school?

19 A. Yeah. And I don't know if it was to do with that or ...

20 but it was a regular occurrence.

21 LADY SMITH: Do you remember having soreness in your private

22 parts from when you were young?

23 A. Yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

25 MS RATTRAY: You tell us at paragraph 68 you have particular

1 memories of their bedroom.

2 A. Yeah. Because their walls was that colour, that lilacy

3 colour.

4 LADY SMITH: I'm sorry.

5 A. (Witness shakes head)

6 It was a sickly smell in their room, almost like

7 a Parma Violets smell. I don't know what the smell was,

8 but that smell was always there.

9 MS RATTRAY: I think you tell us much later in your

10 statement that that smell affects you now?

11 A. (Witness nods) Yeah.

12 Q. In what way does it affect you?

13 A. It's like I'm back in that bedroom, that sickly smell.

14 Q. You've told us already that you tried to tell your

15 foster mother what was happening.

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. And what was her response?

18 A. I was lying, and I got a beating.

19 Q. But I think you believe that she knew about it?

20 A. Because she slept in our room. And it's not normal for

21 foster parents to sleep in the same room, with a room

22 for all the children. So I think she knew, deep down.

23 Q. So she slept in the girls' room, with the four girls?

24 A. She shared a bed with the foster child, with the younger

25 one.

1 Q. Did she ever sleep in the boys' room?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Do you know whether any of the other children in the

4 household were abused by Mr EYI ?

5 A. Not that I know of.

6 Q. Was there anyone else that you tried to tell what was

7 happening at home?

8 A. School. I tried to tell school. They called

9 Mrs EYH in. (Witness nods)

10 Q. What happened then?

11 A. She said I was lying. Everything I said, I was told

12 I was lying. There was no -- felt that no one could

13 help me. But then I'd be turning up at school and

14 everything with bruises and injuries, but no one did

15 anything.

16 Q. What do you remember about leaving the EYH-EYI ?

17 A. Leaving. Mrs EYH was crying when I left, and then

18 I felt happy. As soon as I left I was happy. I felt --

19 I don't know. And then arrived at a new placement and

20 there was clothes I hadn't seen. To me it looked like

21 a lot of new clothes. I'd never seen them before,

22 because I was always in the jumper and trousers all the

23 time and there were skirts I'd never seen and things.

24 Q. Your younger sister, did she move with you?

25 A. No. I don't know -- she stayed there and I never saw

1 her again.

2 Q. At this stage, 'Sarah', before moving on and asking you
3 about your experiences at your new placement, I'm going
4 to take this opportunity to look at some records that
5 we've recovered which relate to your time with the
6 EYH-EYI . I know later in your statement you tell us
7 that you had been told when you were 17, a social worker
8 in England recovered some records and told you some
9 things that were in them, but you hadn't actually seen
10 them yourself.

11 A. (Witness nods)

12 Q. But you're okay today me putting some records on the
13 screen?

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. Okay. So the records are at ABN-000002445.

16 The first record I'm going to look at is --
17 actually, we might as well look at the first page there
18 which is in front of us. If we scroll up what we see
19 here is a file copy letter of 10 February 1976. What
20 that says, it seems to relate to you, 'Sarah', when you
21 were four years old, fostered by Mrs EYH :
22 "On Wednesday, 4 February, Mrs Selbie, who is the
23 social worker for the above-mentioned child ..."
24 'Sarah', I think these were social workers before
25 Sheila Maxwell became your social worker.

1 " ... called at Invardee Nursery School at the
2 request of the school. She was informed that 'Sarah'
3 had bruise marks a fortnight previously and that there
4 had been one other occasion when bruises were noted.
5 'Sarah' had also been absent from school on several
6 occasions.

7 "Mrs Selbie and I discussed this ... and felt that
8 we could do nothing about the bruising two weeks
9 previously. We decided that Mrs Selbie would make
10 a normal visit to Mrs EYH [REDACTED] to observe the situation
11 in the home and to see if 'Sarah' was happy and to see
12 if Mrs EYH [REDACTED] made any complaints about 'Sarah' and
13 that the school would be requested to notify us
14 immediately should there be any further bruising and to
15 advise the health visitor of the school's concern."

16 If we turn the page to number 2 in this bundle of
17 case papers.

18 That's an incident, it's slightly out of order,
19 that's in February 1976 but we see we now have a report
20 on a case conference which was held on 12 February 1976.
21 We see that there's lots of professionals at the case
22 conference, including your social worker, a social
23 worker Mrs P Hallett, who is going to be your social
24 worker soon, this again is before Sheila Maxwell,
25 a senior social worker, a headmistress of the school,

1 nursery teachers, school health visitor and another
2 health visitor who's attached to a GP practice.

3 I'm not going to read out all these records and I'm
4 not going to read them out in detail, but I think this
5 one really sets the scene so I will take some time
6 looking at this one, 'Sarah'. What it says is:

7 "The case conference was called because of reports
8 received by the social work department from the school
9 health visitor that this four-year-old child had
10 appeared at school on more than one occasion suffering
11 from injuries, eg bruising, which the school regarded
12 with suspicion. The report was not made until two weeks
13 after the most recent incident. In addition, about the
14 same time social work department were informed that
15 there was gossip in the Kincorth area regarding a foster
16 parent sending a child bruised to school."

17 Mrs Selbie then gives a report about some of your
18 background, of the circumstances in which you arrived in
19 care, and then further down the second paragraph says:

20 "Mrs Selbie has supervised the children and has not
21 found any cause for concern regarding their care. She
22 had noticed that Mrs EYH seemed to favour [your
23 little sister] to [you], which was the opposite to the
24 preference shown by their natural mother. Mrs Selbie
25 visited on 5 February and noticed a bruise mark on

1 'Sarah's' temple and was told 'Sarah' had fallen. She
2 also noticed a small red mark on her arm and Mrs EYH
3 had referred to a bracelet the child was allergic to.
4 Mr EYH said 'people will think we're battering the
5 child'."

6 Another person, a Mrs Harriot, who is at that stage
7 the headmistress of the nursery or the school you were
8 at at the time:

9 " ... reported that 'Sarah' started in the nursery
10 in 1975. Her attendance had been irregular. She
11 referred to three incidents when staff had brought to
12 her notice that 'Sarah' was suffering from some kind of
13 injury. Two of those occasions would, she thought, have
14 been about June 1975 -- on the first, the child was
15 brought back to school after lunch having suffered
16 a nosebleed, which Mrs EYH stated had resulted from
17 the child being sick. The child later said to a teacher
18 that she had been hit. Some short time later there had
19 been an occasion when a nursery nurse had taken 'Sarah'
20 to the toilet and had noted bruises on her back and
21 bottom. More recently, about 20 January, the child was
22 again seen to have injuries described as several
23 bruises, slight scratches on most parts of her face,
24 a bigger scratch which had been bleeding on her arm and
25 her right ear bleeding slightly inside. She also had

1 three or four bruises on the top of her back."

2 If we turn the page to page 3 of this document,
3 which is the second page of this case conference report,
4 it says:

5 "It was mentioned that when on holiday with the
6 EYH-EYI family last year, 'Sarah' had fallen and broken
7 her arm but the foster parents appeared to have taken
8 appropriate action at that time. There was in her
9 medical file a letter from the hospital pointing out
10 that this was a child who bruised easily and the school
11 had been made aware of this fact by Mrs EYH."

12 I think what we're seeing here, 'Sarah', is the
13 reference to your broken arm?

14 A. (Witness nods)

15 Q. But your recollection as to how you came to have
16 a broken arm was different?

17 A. (Witness nods)

18 Q. Do you remember anything about falling over or breaking
19 it that way?

20 A. No.

21 Q. I'll read on:

22 "Mrs Ellis, health visitor, who has just taken over
23 the case has only visited Mrs EYH once. She
24 referred to [I think a previous professional's] notes
25 that 'Sarah' was a pale, nervy child and always appeared

1 tired. [Another professional] mentioned that 'Sarah'
2 was a nervous child and got upset if she had any kind of
3 accident at school, for example spilling paint, but she
4 also said that 'Sarah' had blossomed while at nursery
5 and seemed happy there but would cling to a particular
6 teacher in an attention-seeking way. On her only visit
7 to the home, Mrs Ellis had been well received but gained
8 the impression that Mrs EYH was someone whose level
9 of tolerance at least at present was not high. She
10 described how [this is your little sister] had received
11 a slap for pulling Mrs EYH hair while sitting on
12 her lap and how Mrs EYH quickly pulled herself up
13 and remarked that she did not like to have to hit the
14 children. She found Mrs EYH more willing to speak
15 of [your little sister] than of [you, 'Sarah'], who she
16 described as a moody child, though good at times, and
17 that 'Sarah' would try to help by washing the dishes and
18 though she felt she was a bit of a nuisance, she just
19 let her. Mrs Ellis felt Mrs EYH was very conscious
20 of money, mentioned assistance received by other foster
21 carers which she had not got. Mrs Selbie said that this
22 had never been taken up with her. She had mentioned
23 always having the children in bed by 6 pm so she could
24 get more time to herself. Mrs Ellis was surprised that
25 when Mr EYI had come into the house [your little

1 sister] seemed reluctant to go to him, as Mrs EYH
2 had said all the children liked their 'father'."

3 A few lines down there's reference to Mrs EYH :

4 "... had been a foster mother for the department for
5 many years, taking children on a temporary basis. She
6 has three children of her own, aged 14, 11, and 9, and
7 at present has four foster children. In addition to
8 'Sarah' [and your little sister] there is a child aged
9 two and a baby. She has always expressed a preference
10 for younger children and babies and social workers have
11 always thought she coped best with that age of child and
12 have never questioned her standard of care. The only
13 concern has been the number of children she has had on
14 occasion. It was noted however that this foster mother
15 is one who expresses her need to have children and the
16 question was raised whether she saw fostering as meeting
17 her own and not the children's needs."

18 After the full discussion of the situation the
19 following was agreed:

20 "The situation was one which had aroused the anxiety
21 of all those involved with [you, 'Sarah']

22 "That though it might well be that this was a child
23 at risk there were insufficient grounds for the child's
24 immediate removal from the foster home and this would
25 not be in the child's interests at this stage.

1 "The meeting had highlighted the previous lack of
2 coordination between all those involved and in view of
3 the difficulties of acting in retrospect it was
4 emphasised that immediate action should be taken in the
5 event of any further incident involving a suspected
6 injury to the child."

7 A. But they didn't. They left me there.

8 Q. Yes, they did. They did indeed leave you there.

9 Over the page, which is the last page of this letter
10 on page 4 of this extract bundle, at paragraph 7, it
11 says:

12 "The social work department will look carefully at
13 this foster home and the number of children placed there
14 and in any event were to be considering whether in view
15 of 'Sarah's' age and the possibility that this was now
16 to be a long-term placement, it was appropriate for her
17 to remain with Mrs EYH "

18 A. But they left me there till I was ten.

19 Q. They did, 'Sarah'.

20 I'll make a brief reference to the next document,
21 which is on page 8. What this is is this is a letter of
22 23 August 1976 from your new social worker at that time,
23 a Mrs Hallett, and it's to a Dr Lowitt, who is
24 a consultant child psychiatrist.

25 This is a social worker referring you to the

1 problem -- not you being the problem, but the problem
2 that they're faced with, which includes the EYH-EYI and
3 what's going on, to the psychiatrist, and at the middle
4 paragraph she says:

5 "We are most unhappy with the children's present
6 foster placement and have contemplated their removal to
7 another long-term foster/adoptive home. However, we
8 were concerned whether more harm might be occasioned by
9 removing the children from the only stability they have
10 known by leaving them in their present, albeit
11 unsatisfactory, foster home, especially when their
12 present foster mother would not seem able to cooperate
13 in any gradual transition."

14 A. I didn't know this.

15 Q. This is not something you were aware of?

16 A. (Witness shakes head)

17 Q. If we move now to document number 9 in this bundle,
18 I won't read this out in full but what it is is it's
19 a letter from the social worker to the Deputy Director
20 of Social Work at Grampian Regional Council and it's
21 dated 22 September 1976 and it's referring to the case
22 conference and what was going on.

23 If we look at the third paragraph of this letter, he
24 makes reference to the psychiatrist:

25 " ... is currently arranging to see the

1 children ..."

2 What he says is -- the social worker says:

3 " ... meantime, I have tried to explain to

4 Mrs EYH as I have done all along, the serious

5 thought that we are giving to the long-term future of

6 these children. Mrs EYH has, however, reacted

7 extremely badly to this review of their situation to the

8 extent of becoming bitter and aggressive and allowing

9 her own anxieties to be conveyed to the children."

10 A. (Witness nods)

11 Q. I think what we're seeing here is someone who's not

12 perhaps taking on board the problem.

13 A. (Witness nods)

14 Q. Is reacting in a very angry way to that.

15 A. But there's still no excuse.

16 Q. Indeed. Indeed.

17 If we turn over the page to page 10, which is

18 a continuation of this letter.

19 It's referring before that, don't go back, but

20 essentially what appears to happen is Mrs EYH's been

21 speaking to your nana and has suggested to your nana

22 that you and your younger sister are going to be put up

23 for adoption, but that's not true?

24 A. (Witness nods)

25 Q. What it says here:

1 "The misinformation that the children are to be put
2 up for adoption has unfortunately been conveyed to [your
3 nana] by Mrs EYH in her rather hysterical reaction
4 to our review of the children's needs."

5 Certainly we're not seeing anything particularly
6 positive here. I don't think we need to look at it in
7 detail, but suffice to say that on 5 October 1976, the
8 child psychiatrist reported back having seen --

9 LADY SMITH: That was 5 October 1976?

10 MS RATTRAY: Yes, in fact we can look at it, it's at page 11
11 of this bundle.

12 In fact, we should be looking at it. It's
13 a three-page letter reporting back from the psychiatrist
14 meeting with the EYH-EYI and with you with the EYH-EYI
15 and a short period with you on your own. Essentially he
16 comes to the conclusion that there really isn't
17 a problem and if there's any issues with your behaviour
18 it's consistent with children who've been distressed
19 before they've entered care.

20 If we turn to the second page of this letter on
21 page 12 of this document and the final paragraph, he has
22 a view about what's happened so far. He says:

23 "There is little doubt that the non-accidental
24 injury alert raised by the nursery in relation to
25 'Sarah' played an important part in undermining the work

1 that is being done for these children, and it was
2 unfortunate that you had to start your work at this
3 juncture under the cloud of the unsubstantiated
4 allegations."

5 So he then concludes that the children shouldn't be
6 removed from the EYH-EYI

7 A. But we should have been.

8 Q. Yes, I hear that. But this is obviously in some way
9 has -- you know, the social work have gone to the
10 psychiatrist for some advice, the psychiatrist seems to
11 support the EYH-EYI and has even taken the view that to
12 investigate the injuries has in some way undermined good
13 work being done with you.

14 A. (Witness shakes head)

15 Q. The next document I'm going to look at is at page 17.

16 LADY SMITH: Can you remember me who that letter from the
17 child psychiatrist was addressed to? Or was it to the
18 child psychiatrist? Sorry, I've lost track.

19 MS RATTRAY: The previous one at 11?

20 LADY SMITH: The 5 October 1976 letter.

21 MS RATTRAY: Yes, that's a letter from the child
22 psychiatrist to Mrs P Hallett, who is the then social
23 worker.

24 LADY SMITH: Yes, thank you.

25 MS RATTRAY: Turning to page 17, what we have here is

1 a social work report and I can tell you at this stage
2 that it's signed by Sheila Maxwell and this is a report
3 dated 20 July 1978, so we've moved into 1978 and we now
4 have Sheila Maxwell and you're still in the placement.

5 It's a general report but I want to look at the
6 second paragraph of the substance of what she says
7 there, what Sheila Maxwell says is:

8 "Mrs EYH says she is still telling little white
9 lies [this is about you] as she puts it and she seems to
10 come off with some extraordinary stories like never
11 being fed at home and so on which is obviously untrue.
12 Mrs EYH has warned the new school about this so that
13 they realise what the problems might really be."

14 A. (Witness shakes head)

15 It did happen.

16 Q. It's your evidence that you were hungry.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. So if you weren't being fed properly at home, then that
19 was what was happening to you.

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. But here we have Mrs EYH saying that you're telling
22 lies and it would appear that Sheila Maxwell accepts
23 that?

24 A. But then Mrs EYH said she didn't beat us.

25 Q. Yes.

1 A. But yet nursery said we would have injuries and
2 everything.

3 Q. If we turn over the page to page 18, what we have here,
4 we're now in 1979 and it's a telephone message that's
5 been taken and it's not clear from the figures but it's
6 either 1 June or 1 August 1979 and it seems that
7 Mrs EYH has phoned the social work and said at the
8 bottom in handwriting:

9 "'Sarah' has been battered by three boys -- pretty
10 bad."

11 And she apparently gives the name of a boy.

12 In your statement you mention something about --

13 A. Having to lie to the headteacher, because she called
14 Mrs EYH in, because I said I got hit -- I turned up
15 school with bruises again and I said to the teacher it
16 was Mrs EYH. They called Mrs EYH in. She said
17 I was lying, so I said, "Oh, it was some boys on the way
18 to school".

19 Q. I think you say elsewhere that this became something
20 that you would say, you just accepted that you had to
21 say that when you had bruises you'd been hit on the way
22 to and from school?

23 A. Yeah, but I was badly beaten that day.

24 Q. Were you beaten by children on the way to and from
25 school?

1 A. No. No. Because the way I walked there wasn't many
2 children around, because it was a downhill walk all the
3 way to where I was living. Because there was always
4 a Yorkshire terrier that would come running out the gate
5 chasing me.

6 Q. The next record we have is on page 20 what this is is
7 a record of a case discussion on 9 October 1980 and once
8 again there are concerns being raised by professionals
9 in relation to your care and what once again we see:
10 Ms Maxwell's the social worker; a nursing officer's
11 there; the headteacher, and this time it's Ms Reid at
12 Kirkhill School; there's Mrs Grey, the class teacher;
13 Dr Brunton, a senior clinical medical officer; there's
14 a health assistant; and there's Mrs Inness, the school
15 health visitor and health visitor attached to the GP's
16 practice.

17 What we can take from this is that, it's quite
18 faint, the type:

19 "The purpose of the discussion was to learn of the
20 involvement of Ms Maxwell [your social worker] with
21 'Sarah', a child causing considerable concern to
22 a number of people, and to share professional ideas.

23 "Ms Maxwell informed the group that she had been
24 visiting 'Sarah's' home every two or three weeks for
25 a considerable period of time. The visits are usually

1 in the morning, giving Mrs EYH the opportunity to
2 speak freely as the children are in school. Ms Maxwell
3 agreed that 'Sarah' appears 'rather pathetic'."

4 So the social worker is engaging a lot with the
5 foster parent but not with you. You aren't there at the
6 time.

7 A. No.

8 Q. "Mrs Grey stated [that's your class teacher] that she
9 feels 'Sarah' to be a 'lonely' child, wandering from
10 group to group in class, not totally accepted, having no
11 close friends. After episodes of lying and stealing on
12 'Sarah's' part, classmates tended to reject her.

13 "Mrs Reid [the headteacher] remarked on her
14 appearance -- very thin, pale, and rather neglected
15 looking. Mrs EYH when discussing 'Sarah' with her,
16 had compared her with other children -- always
17 disparagingly. Both Mrs Reid and Mrs Grey agreed that
18 'Sarah' is not as well-dressed as her half-sister and
19 another schoolchild fostered by Mrs EYH. In several
20 ways she is treated rather differently, for example in
21 not receiving the same small gifts and not given the
22 opportunity to enjoy school outings, such as to the
23 pantomime. Mrs Grey remarked that 'Sarah' seldom had
24 a play-piece and was inordinately pleased when on rare
25 occasions she had one."

1 And then someone is querying whether it might have
2 been that you ate it on the way to school.

3 "Although 'Sarah' is markedly thin, Mrs Grey felt
4 'Sarah' did not lack energy in gym.

5 "Dr Brunton expressed concern at 'Sarah's' poor
6 weight gain and the fact that she had actually lost
7 weight recently. Mr Mowbray voiced this concern and
8 also informed the group that 'Sarah' was a regular
9 visitor to the medical room on her own accord. 'Sarah'
10 wasted little opportunity for close contact and was
11 anxious to sit close to her. This same need for close
12 physical contact had been noticed by Mrs Grey and even
13 remarked upon by the patrol lady at the crossing point
14 [outside the school]."

15 This is even the lollipop lady has noticed concerns.

16 A. (Witness nods)

17 Q. "Mrs Mowbray voiced concern that 'Sarah's' festered
18 earlobes had elicited little concern from Mrs EYH
19 and it required several home visits from the health
20 visitor before Mrs EYH had been prevailed upon to
21 take 'Sarah' to the GP. She also voiced concerns
22 stating that 'Sarah' had said that she went alone on
23 Saturday mornings to the Odeon picture house.

24 "Dr Brunton felt that the lack of reciprocity could
25 be a contributing factor to the difficulties in the

1 relationship between 'Sarah' and her foster mother and
2 queried Mrs EYH's insight and depth of knowledge on
3 the needs of children."

4 If we turn over the page here we see:

5 "Mrs Maxwell stated that 'Sarah's' early childhood
6 had been very unstable. Mr and Mrs EYH-EYI had cared
7 for her since she was three and a half years of age.
8 Ms Maxwell feels that there is a better relationship
9 than hitherto, Mrs EYH being encouraged to spank
10 'Sarah' for naughtiness in the same way as the other
11 children in the family might expect as a result of
12 misbehaviour. Ms Maxwell feels that 'Sarah' is afraid
13 of rejection rather than being afraid of Mrs EYH "

14 A. I was afraid. I was afraid.

15 Q. You were afraid of Mrs EYH?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. "Mrs Inness [this is the health visitor] remarked that
18 she found Mrs EYH to be very tense and queried
19 whether in fostering children Mrs EYH was meeting
20 her own needs rather than those of the children. The
21 group discussed the fact that Mrs EYH had
22 a part-time job from 6 pm to 8 pm and is also involved
23 in day fostering and could have little time to supervise
24 homework, prepare and serve a meal, far less sit down as
25 a family unit to that meal. Ms Maxwell said Mr EYI

1 presents as a warm, domesticated man interested in the
2 family. 'Sarah' speaks a lot about 'dad'.

3 "It was agreed that Mrs EYH should not be upset
4 and her confidence in any way shaken. No reference to
5 be made to her re the group discussion. It was felt,
6 however, that some tangible effort to be made in view of
7 'Sarah's' physical appearance and loss of weight."

8 And some referrals and we know from elsewhere in the
9 records that on several occasions you have been referred
10 to doctors and hospital about your weight and they've
11 come back and said that you are a low weight but they
12 didn't consider you to be undernourished and that was
13 their response.

14 I'm now going to turn to page 54 of this document.
15 These are case notes, these are the records of when
16 Mrs Maxwell, the social worker, was either visiting or
17 doing something. What we're looking at is an entry of
18 18 November 1980 and here it says:

19 "I received an urgent telephone call saying that
20 'Sarah' has been found with bruises and would have to be
21 inspected. This came from the Mastrick office because
22 I was elsewhere at the time. The nurse had been seeing
23 'Sarah' and noticed this bruise and had told her
24 superior and it went to the community health section,
25 who contacted [someone else]. The whole thing had

1 therefore gone to quite a senior level.

2 "I could not get hold of Ms Reid [I think that's the
3 headteacher] until 1.30 after her lunch hour but when
4 I spoke to her she said there was a bruise on her cheek
5 and there was grip marks on her arm but it did not sound
6 to me like battering. It's not the kind of bruises that
7 I would associate with NAI [that's a non-accidental
8 injury] or even any cause for anxiety but because of all
9 the background I said I would come and see 'Sarah'."

10 I think we see that whatever the other professionals
11 are worried about, that doesn't seem to be the approach
12 being taken by Sheila Maxwell. She goes on to describe
13 telephoning a Mr McKenzie, who was an acting senior, and
14 they then visit the foster placement. A couple of
15 paragraphs later it says:

16 "Concerning the marks she had apparently told the
17 nurse that she fell down the stairs and then said
18 something about [the birth daughter] and [her mum] and
19 stopped.

20 "However she told me that she had bumped her cheek
21 against the rail on her top bunk, which seemed quite
22 reasonable. It was a straight mark, that would tie in
23 and certainly not done with a hand or fist."

24 This is a social worker who is perhaps not fully
25 qualified in that kind of forensic assessment.

1 A. (Witness shakes head)

2 Q. "The grip mark was quite bad but 'Sarah' does bruise and
3 was quite consistent with somebody trying to keep her
4 under control."

5 Then later it says:

6 "Mr McKenzie was looking at the marks and making
7 notes but also did not attach undue significance to it.
8 Her story sounded reasonable enough."

9 If we turn over the page to later in these case
10 notes at page 55 of this set of documents, we see
11 there's an entry of 20 November 1980. A couple of days
12 later, if we go to the foot of the page and the last
13 paragraph there, this is Sheila Maxwell this time
14 calling on Mrs EYH :

15 "When I spoke about the grip marks I said I thought
16 it had probably been her daughter was having difficulty
17 getting 'Sarah' back in her bed and that would have
18 caused it, but she said that her daughter never touches
19 'Sarah' because of the background and complaints that
20 had been made in the past and she was quite sure it was
21 herself on Tuesday morning because she had dragged
22 'Sarah' through to the kitchen. Mrs EYH herself had
23 been angry with her and 'Sarah' always struggles very
24 fiercely. It was therefore not surprising that there
25 were grip marks. What I felt was although there was no

1 question whatever of any lack of care of 'Sarah' it was
2 disappointing that 'Sarah' herself had to be racking
3 about again and this was the real problem, not that had
4 been taking up the attention of all outsiders."

5 So it doesn't appear that you have a social worker
6 who's particularly on board --

7 A. (Witness shakes head)

8 Q. -- with the other professionals and seems to be more
9 supporting Mrs EYH .

10 A. (Witness nods)

11 But if all bruises were noted and everything, why
12 didn't anyone do anything above her?

13 Q. Well, it would appear -- I mean, if we go to document
14 number 22 in the list, what we have here is a social
15 work report for care discussion on 18 December 1980 and
16 whilst it's a lengthy report and it's part of the bundle
17 and we have read it in detail and can certainly do so
18 again, this is a report by Sheila Maxwell, and while
19 Sheila Maxwell accepts things aren't ideal, I think the
20 tenor of that report is excusing Mrs EYH --

21 A. But there's no excuse.

22 Q. -- and rather defending Mrs EYH and saying that you
23 ought to stay there, stay in the placement.

24 If we look at document number 27, this is then the
25 case conference of 18 December 1980 for which that

1 report had been prepared. I'll take parts of this out.

2 It's a few lines down:

3 "Ms Maxwell thought that 'Sarah' was improving but
4 there's no doubt to those who see her first she can only
5 be described as pathetic. She had the same appearance
6 when first going to Mrs EYH and has continued to
7 present a picture of a deprived child."

8 This is after years of being in foster care.

9 Then a few lines further down it says:

10 "There has also been less stealing at home but the
11 last incident of bruising related to 'Sarah's' fondness
12 for raking about at night looking to see what she could
13 appropriate from the other children. It is mainly her
14 appearance which is giving cause for concern and the
15 teachers and staff are concerned that she always has on
16 the same clothing. Dr Duthie [that's the local GP,
17 Mrs EYH's GP] told us that there has really been no
18 weight loss at all, there only appears to have been as
19 she is growing fast."

20 If we look further down the page:

21 "Mrs Inness [the health visitor] felt that it was
22 not just one aspect, for example her weight, at which we
23 were looking but several unhappy aspects of 'Sarah's'
24 life. She herself did not feel optimistic about
25 'Sarah's' happiness as the child still goes to total

1 outsiders looking for affection."

2 If we turn over the page, page 28 of this bundle but
3 a continuation of this, halfway down the first
4 paragraph:

5 "Mrs Grey [your class teacher] indicated that
6 'Sarah' had told a lot of different stories about the
7 last bruising episode, but everyone present was aware
8 there was a history of 'Sarah' telling a lot of fantasy.
9 Ms Maxwell told us that until recently Mrs EYH had
10 even been afraid to punish 'Sarah' normally as she does
11 the other children in the home and she has progressed
12 recently to being able to give her a smack, but the
13 smack hardly ever lands on 'Sarah', who struggles all
14 the time and makes a great noise. This is a different
15 picture from that she presents in class, as usually she
16 is very quiet and withdrawn."

17 We see in the next paragraph it says:

18 "Ms Maxwell and Dr Duthie tried to indicate to the
19 group that Mrs EYH is a bit neurotic and her views
20 can be distorted and she is ready to jump on the
21 defensive."

22 Then at the next paragraph:

23 "Mrs Inness was concerned that Mrs EYH said that
24 she had been asked about the adoption of 'Sarah' but she
25 was indignant about this, saying that she had only

1 applied to foster and could not afford to do so. She
2 also feels that other foster parents get extra money
3 that she does not.

4 "On the school side Mrs EYH had gone to the
5 younger children's school for the Christmas festivities
6 but neither she nor 'Sarah' had appeared at carol
7 singing on 17 December and it was felt to be important
8 that Mrs EYH realises how hurtful this must have
9 been to 'Sarah'.

10 "Dr Brunton stated that 'Sarah' had obviously come
11 from a deprived background and needs a lot of love and
12 this was bad placement in the past and will be in the
13 future. Dr Duthie commented that if he were asked now
14 for a recommendation about Mr and Mrs EYH-EYI as foster
15 parents he would not recommend them, but certainly as
16 the children have been there some time this makes the
17 consideration of them as foster parents for 'Sarah'
18 rather different. Indeed, Dr Lowitt [that's the child
19 psychiatrist] had given specific advice that 'Sarah' was
20 to continue to live with them."

21 That essentially is the tenor of what we have. On
22 page 30, we can look at it very briefly, we see a letter
23 of 6 April 1981 to Mrs EYH from the pre-school day
24 care adviser and this is essentially raising a concern
25 about the number of children she is looking after in

1 a day care setting:

2 "I felt you may have misunderstood the regulations
3 and wondered if you realised that you only care for
4 three children under five years at any one time,
5 irrespective of whether they were temporary, friends'
6 children or children for whom you are not receiving
7 payment."

8 Moving into 1981 at page 33, this is a report for
9 a case conference, another report by Sheila Maxwell of
10 a case conference on 17 June 1981. There are ongoing
11 concerns but Sheila Maxwell emphasises that there was
12 unanimous feelings that 'Sarah' would be better to stay
13 where she is, that a doctor regarded her as a very
14 healthy child, well nourished. She does concede the
15 emotional side has been more difficult.

16 "Mrs EYH's confidence has been thoroughly
17 undermined by the visit of myself and Mr McKenzie to
18 'Sarah' to look at the bruises, by 'Sarah's' own raking
19 about in the bedroom which had caused the bruises in the
20 first place and then by the knowledge that there was to
21 be a meeting, which is not something that could be kept
22 from her."

23 She goes on at the bottom of the page to say:

24 "Problems started again when Mrs EYH learned
25 from Ms Reid that 'Sarah' had not been doing her

1 homework. There must have been a certain lack of
2 supervision but apparently 'Sarah' had been sitting down
3 with her books, along with [her little sister and the
4 other foster child] looking as if she was doing her
5 homework and I think it was this deceit that infuriated
6 Mrs EYH as much as anything. She made 'Sarah' do
7 a large number of lines as a punishment, which seriously
8 disturbed Ms Reid [the headteacher] when she saw them.
9 At the same time 'Sarah' had apparently told Ms Reid
10 that she could not do her homework because she had to
11 spend the evenings Hoovering and washing up, and I think
12 this is typical of the kind of lies and exaggeration
13 'Sarah' tells to get sympathy."

14 Over the page Sheila Maxwell reports at page 34 of
15 this bundle:

16 "And for a while Mrs EYH hardly felt able to
17 speak to 'Sarah'."

18 Then it appears that Sheila Maxwell's gone direct to
19 Dr Lowitt to get his perspective and says that he was of
20 the opinion that we should not remove 'Sarah', there's
21 no guarantee she would do better elsewhere and it would
22 seriously upset her to remove her from the place she
23 knows as home."

24 If we could move to document 35 and I'll refer to
25 this briefly and this is the case conference of

1 17 June 1981 for which the previous report has been
2 prepared and there's reference to all these concerns.
3 But it's also added at the foot of this page that
4 another nursing officer said that your little sister and
5 the foster child are:

6 " ... enuretic and are smelly at school. Normally
7 the health visitor would contact the family but
8 tactfully this is done through Ms Maxwell. Ms Maxwell
9 discussed this was Mrs EYH who said that [your
10 little sister] did not wet the bed but sometimes wet her
11 pants. Mrs EYH seems to think that the children
12 should be able to clean themselves and this is not
13 really appropriate for their age."

14 There's reference further on in this report about
15 concerns that Mrs EYH has no more insight than she
16 has had before in relation to your problems:

17 "... and it's thought by some that removal would
18 solve the problem, whereas if the child was in her own
19 home no one would be thinking of removing her. This is
20 more or less stating what was said at the last case
21 conference, and that one would not remove a child from
22 a foster home where she had been for such a long time
23 unless there was some grounds for removal from the
24 natural parents."

25 So at that stage they're still not moving you and

1 that's in 1981.

2 But suffice to say what then happens is that in the
3 course of the next few weeks it's suggested that
4 Mrs EYH [REDACTED] can't cope and then she says she wants you
5 to leave.

6 A. (Witness nods)

7 Q. It's that and support from the GP, who says that
8 Mrs EYH [REDACTED] simply can't cope and is back on the
9 tablets -- there's reference to being back on the
10 tablets and perhaps these are the tablets that you
11 remember, 'Sarah' --

12 A. (Witness nods)

13 Q. -- and ultimately you are then moved to the EYJ-EYK [REDACTED]
14 on [REDACTED] 1981.

15 A final look at this record on the EYH-EYI [REDACTED] is at
16 page 71 and this is back to the case notes and it's
17 an entry of [REDACTED] 1981 and this is after you've
18 left the placement and Mrs Maxwell is back with
19 Mrs EYH [REDACTED]:

20 "She said that she'd been working hard over the
21 weekend and then they'd gone out together and that had
22 really been the worst day."

23 I think that was in relation to you.

24 "She was back on tablets and she wasn't really able
25 to cry at the moment she said and I'm not sure this was

1 a good thing because a lot of anger was coming out
2 largely at the school and everyone for interfering. She
3 [Mrs EYH] seemed to be determined to blame the
4 interference for the breakdown of the fostering. There
5 was no suggestion today that she had anything to do with
6 it, but I did not think it was a good time to try and
7 help her to understand anything. I thought she just
8 needed to express herself."

9 And so even after leaving, Mrs EYH seems to
10 think it's all everyone else's fault for interfering and
11 it's nothing to do with her.

12 A. But it was her.

13 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, perhaps this is a time to take a break
14 and then we will resume.

15 LADY SMITH: I think we ought to.

16 'Sarah', we normally take a break at about this time
17 in the morning, just a short break. If that would work
18 for you, we could do that now. Would that be all right?

19 A. Yeah.

20 LADY SMITH: Very well.

21 (11.38 am)

22 (A short break)

23 (11.52 am)

24 LADY SMITH: 'Sarah', are you okay for us to carry on?

25 A. Yes.

1 LADY SMITH: I don't think we're going to need to ask you to
2 stay for very much longer, if that helps. I do realise
3 that we've been questioning you for quite a while
4 already today.
5 A. (Witness nods)
6 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.
7 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.
8 'Sarah', at this stage I'm going to ask you about
9 some of your memories of living with your next foster
10 family, who were EYJ-EYK in Aberdeen.
11 I think by way of background you tell us that your
12 foster parents were teachers, who had worked in
13 Australia and had adopted two girls there.
14 A. Yeah.
15 Q. One who was about the same age as you --
16 A. Yeah.
17 Q. -- and the other two years younger. Then they'd moved
18 to Aberdeen and your first impressions were that they
19 were a nice family?
20 A. Yeah, first impression.
21 Q. It was quite positive. I think in general terms you
22 tell us that for the first couple of years life was all
23 right with the EYJ-EYK --
24 A. Yeah.
25 Q. -- but then things changed?

1 A. (Witness nods)

2 Q. In what general ways was life different with the

3 EYJ-EYK ?

4 A. It was more of a family atmosphere. They were quite

5 a well-off family compared to the EYH-EYI so it's

6 a different lifestyle completely. They liked their

7 holiday abroad, they would go away six weeks at a time

8 every year abroad, never in England. They had a couple

9 of properties as well that they bought. They also had

10 their own boat at the time as well. So they were quite,

11 I'd say, well off compared to EYH-EYI. And it's only

12 us three girls that were living there as well.

13 Different diets as well compared to EYH-EYI. EYK

14 was very much into high fibre, high calorie food. When

15 I was there I was put on Complian to gain weight and

16 I had Complian with every meal. They also taught me to

17 speak properly, because I didn't speak properly like

18 they would, if that --

19 Q. When you say "speak properly", I think you say in your

20 statement that you had an Aberdonian accent.

21 A. Yeah, very broad.

22 Q. Very broad. And they were far more middle class?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. And so they were speaking --

25 A. Very clear, very eloquent compared to me.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. I was quite, I'd say, common. Compared to them.

3 Q. You say in your statement initially it was much better

4 place to be than at the EYH-EY! --

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. -- and that lasted for about a year or two years, but

7 then things started to change?

8 A. I clashed with their eldest daughter. Because we were

9 so close in age. She liked to throw in my face about my

10 mum, that my mum didn't want me and everything and it

11 would cause fights in school between me --

12 LADY SMITH: 'Sarah', can I just ask you to get closer to

13 that microphone again?

14 A. Sorry. It would --

15 LADY SMITH: That's so much better, thank you.

16 A. Sorry.

17 It would cause fights between me and their daughter,

18 because we were the same age, so we clashed badly and we

19 did share a bedroom together so we had to be separated

20 because it was that bad. We also had to be put in

21 separate schools as well because we just didn't get on

22 at all.

23 And I think, looking back now, it's because we were

24 the same age, totally brought up in different

25 lifestyles. I was quite common compared to her. They

1 had like the rich lifestyle, they were brought up to
2 speak proper English, properly educated, and I wasn't.

3 MS RATTRAY: Did you feel that you fitted in with this
4 family?

5 A. At first I did, but I think what didn't help ... I know
6 they weren't my parents. I'd already been in another
7 placement before this one. I lived a different way.
8 And I think some habits it was hard for them to deal
9 with.

10 I didn't agree with their rules. We weren't allowed
11 out to play. They were very strict. They were very
12 strict with things like homework. If it wasn't right we
13 had to keep redoing it until it was done properly. If
14 we did something wrong, we had to write an essay, we had
15 punishment books, red spiral-bound books with lined
16 paper about that size, school-size jotters type things.
17 We had to write down why we did it, how we did it, who
18 was there, when and did we learn anything from it. And
19 every time we did something wrong we had to write in
20 these books.

21 They also had this punishment exercise, they called
22 it bobbing up and down, where we had to stand up, then
23 crouch down cross legged, then stand up again, and they
24 would tell us when to stop.

25 Meals, manners were very strict. We had to put our

1 hands on our lap every time we had a mouthful, cutlery
2 down, everything. It was quite a different lifestyle.

3 Q. I think you say in your statement, you give the
4 impression that there was a high level of supervision --

5 A. (Witness nods)

6 Q. -- and very little choice?

7 A. Yeah. Very high level of supervision. We were told
8 what to wear. We weren't allowed to wear make-up like
9 teenagers do. With the EYH-EYI I had my ears pierced,
10 hence the festered earlobes. They took them out when
11 I moved there. Also resulted in a day surgery operation
12 in one of the lobes, because it had caused quite bad
13 scar tissue or something. So I was told not to wear
14 earrings ever again because of it. So.

15 Q. You speak in your statement about abuse --

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. -- when you were with the EYJ-EYK Can you tell us
18 about that?

19 A. As well as the punishment books and the bobbing up and
20 down exercises we used to get spanked by a table tennis
21 bat. One time -- yes, I was in the wrong because I was
22 smoking, I think I was about 13. I got caught smoking
23 and EYJ, the adoptive father, he took
24 a strap to me and I had PE the next day and I had
25 an argument with the PE teacher that I didn't want to

1 get changed for PE because I had belt marks all down my
2 legs, but I still had to, but I don't remember Social
3 Services being called in.

4 The PE teacher saw the marks, asked what happened,
5 I told her what happened, that I got caught smoking and
6 I got the belt to me. She went off and I don't know ...

7 Q. We know from the records, and I don't think you knew
8 this particular date before today, that you were adopted
9 by the EYJ-EYK on 1985.

10 A. I thought it was a lot earlier.

11 Q. But it was then -- I think by that stage you'd actually
12 left Aberdeen --

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. -- and moved to England?

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. So in effect, from a legal point of view, you left care
17 on 1985, but I think in your statement you speak
18 about leaving care when you left the EYJ-EYK ?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. It wasn't a successful adoption?

21 A. No.

22 Q. And you moved out of the EYJ-EYK when you were 16?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. Why did you leave them at that age?

25 A. They gave me an ultimatum: resit my exams or leave. In

1 my books, I passed all my CSEs and O-level, but it
2 wasn't straight As in their opinion so they wanted me to
3 redo them. If I didn't redo them then I had to leave.
4 So I left and never spoke to them again.

5 LADY SMITH: You've referred there to different exams than
6 you'd have done in Scotland. So you'd moved out of
7 Scotland by then, I think, hadn't you?

8 A. Yeah, into England. But we had no social work
9 involvement at all. There was no social workers in
10 England.

11 MS RATTRAY: So essentially following adoption or moving to
12 England you -- although you'd had a life of social work
13 input of some description, although one must question
14 how successful that was, but you didn't have any social
15 worker that you could have turned to at that stage.

16 A. No. As soon as we left Scotland there was no social
17 workers. The last social worker I saw was
18 Sheila Maxwell.

19 Q. Do you recall being consulted about whether you wanted
20 to be adopted?

21 A. No. I don't even remember going to court about it.
22 Because I thought you'd -- you would have to go to court
23 for --

24 Q. I think there were court proceedings in Aberdeen for the
25 adoption but it didn't involve anyone actually turning

1 up at court, it would appear.

2 A. (Witness nods)

3 Q. What I'm going to ask you now, 'Sarah', is at page 30 of
4 your statement you speak about impact. What are you
5 telling us here? In what way have your childhood
6 experiences in care had an impact upon you?

7 A. I have a number of health conditions. One of them
8 mainly being Functional Neurological Disorder. In the
9 last couple of years hospital doctors have said it's
10 caused by childhood trauma. They said I'll never get
11 better from it, it will last forever, because I'm at
12 that stage where I'm past getting better from it.

13 I also have fibromyalgia, I have osteoarthritis.
14 I also now have, it's been cited, I have CPTSD, complex
15 post-traumatic stress disorder. It's affected -- it's
16 affected how my relationships with people, I either
17 trust or I don't trust at all. I'd rather be at home on
18 my own now because that's my safe place.

19 Q. Finally, the final questions I'd like to ask you about
20 are not so much questions but to hear you and if we turn
21 to page 33 of your statement you say something about
22 lessons that we can learn from your experiences but
23 I understand you may wish to add to this. What lessons
24 do you think we ought to learn from you?

25 A. All children have a reason they act out the way they do.

1 Sometimes it's not obvious until you start talking to
2 them, but a child has to gain that trust from that
3 person. And a lot of things children get said gets
4 brushed under the carpet. That's what I found in my
5 life. You're lying, or anything. No child lies about
6 sexual abuse. They don't know about that sort of thing
7 at a young age. The same with physical abuse. They've
8 got no reason to lie about it.

9 Me personally, I think laws need changing.
10 Everything gets put down to lack of resources. I don't
11 understand why there isn't some sort of hub where people
12 are trained for this sort of thing and police, Social
13 Services and education can all work together in this
14 hub, who are trained to deal with all aspects of
15 childhood abuse, and then social workers can do their
16 own jobs, which frees up resources at the same time.

17 I don't think any child should suffer like that.
18 And it's still going on today with children being abused
19 and nothing being done. So I think there should be more
20 time listening to a child, not just trusting the adults
21 all the time, because adults are good at hiding things
22 and making things sound perfect when they're not.

23 But I think we should have some sort of hub in each
24 area to deal with this sort of thing. Just to free up
25 some resources instead of using the excuse we've got

1 a lack of resources all the time. Because if it was
2 your own child, you wouldn't treat them like that.
3 You'd do everything in your power to get justice for
4 your own child. So why's it different for children in
5 care?

6 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, 'Sarah'. Thank you for that.
7 'Sarah', I have no further questions for you.
8 I appreciate it's been a long morning, and thank you
9 very much for helping me with the questions I've asked.

10 A. (Witness nods)

11 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, I'm not aware of there being any
12 applications for questions.

13 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
14 questions of 'Sarah'?

15 'Sarah', that does complete all we have to ask you
16 today, but before I let you go, I just want to repeat
17 the thanks I've already given you for coming here to
18 talk about your experiences in childhood and adding that
19 to your written statement, which of course of itself is
20 detailed and valuable evidence for the work that we're
21 doing here.

22 From the list of the health problems you've had and
23 have, it's very clear that it has taken a monumental
24 effort to get you here on your part. I recognise that
25 and I can see also the likelihood that when you leave

1 here you're going to be exhausted.

2 A. (Witness nods)

3 LADY SMITH: But I hope you realise that you've been able to

4 speak not just for yourself but for all the work we're

5 doing here, which is for the benefit of all children,

6 past, present and future --

7 A. (Witness nods)

8 LADY SMITH: -- and that that helps you move forward with

9 perhaps a little bit more strength than you came in here

10 this morning.

11 A. (Witness nods)

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you so much and I'm able to let you go

13 now.

14 A. Thank you.

15 (The witness withdrew)

16 LADY SMITH: During 'Sarah's' evidence we used the names of

17 two sets of foster parents, the EYH-EYI and the

18 EYJ-EYK, their identities are protected by my general

19 restriction order and can't be disclosed outside this

20 room.

21 If I rise for a couple of minutes while we get

22 organised for the next witness, would that help?

23 MS RATTRAY: Yes indeed, my Lady, thank you.

24 LADY SMITH: Very well, I'll do that.

25 (12.13 pm)

1 (A short break)

2 (12.17 pm)

3 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

4 MS INNES: My Lady, the next witness has chosen to remain
5 anonymous and has chosen the pseudonym 'Jenny'. 'Jenny'
6 was initially in the care of Lothian Regional Council
7 and at the start of her statement she talks about being
8 in care in various places there. However, in
9 [REDACTED] 1981 she was placed for adoption with a couple
10 who lived in Elgin in Morayshire. An adoption order was
11 granted in [REDACTED] 1982.

12 The adoption then broke down and she was taken into
13 care by Grampian Regional Council on [REDACTED] 1983. On
14 that date she was placed in foster care with a Mr and
15 Mrs [REDACTED] in Keith and she was removed from there on
16 [REDACTED] 1984, so Moray Council is the relevant successor
17 in respect of the foster care placement that we'll focus
18 on.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

20 'Jenny' (affirmed)

21 LADY SMITH: 'Jenny', it will help you and help us if you
22 stay in a good position for that microphone so that we
23 can all hear you --

24 A. Okay.

25 LADY SMITH: -- and particularly the stenographers who

1 listen to you through the sound system. Also then you
2 don't have to shout --

3 A. Okay.

4 LADY SMITH: -- if you use the microphone, if you could bear
5 that in mind. The red folder has a typed copy of your
6 statement in it and we'll take you to that in a moment,
7 but we'll also put the statement on the screen and go to
8 the different parts of it as we discuss it with you,
9 that might be helpful.

10 'Jenny' can I also please assure you that I do
11 understand that what you've agreed to do today isn't
12 easy. You've come along to a strange place, where there
13 are strange people that you don't know and never met
14 before, and we're about to ask you to talk about your
15 childhood, including things in your childhood that may
16 be upsetting as you're going through them and your
17 emotions may take you quite by surprise.

18 I know about all of that, I do understand, and if
19 there's anything I can do to help you give the best
20 evidence that you can, you must let me know, whether
21 it's taking a break, just sitting there or leaving the
22 room or anything else. So will you do that?

23 A. Okay, thank you.

24 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Ms Innes and
25 she'll take it from there. All right?

1 A. Okay.

2 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

3 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

4 Questions from Ms Innes

5 MS INNES: 'Jenny', we understand you were born in 1974. Is

6 that right.

7 A. That's right, yes.

8 Q. If you can look at your statement first, we give it the

9 reference WIT-1-000000805 and we're just going to go to

10 the final page of that and paragraph 131. It says

11 there -- there's a paper copy there as well for you if

12 you want it look at that:

13 "I have no objection to my witness statement being

14 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

15 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

16 true."

17 I think you signed the statement electronically --

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. -- on 10 September 2021; is that right?

20 A. That's correct.

21 Q. Okay, thank you. Can I go back to the beginning of your

22 statement, so you can look at it in the folder or on the

23 screen, whichever suits you best.

24 A. I think the screen would be easier.

25 Q. Okay, that's fine, just look at the screen. There'll be

1 some things blanked out on the screen but don't worry
2 about that, that's just names of -- your name, for
3 example. But it will come up on the screen as I refer
4 to different paragraphs.

5 You tell us at paragraph 2 that you were born in
6 Edinburgh and initially I think you lived with your mum
7 and dad and you have a twin brother?

8 A. That's right.

9 Q. You also mentioned two older half-brothers?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. So were they your mum's sons or your --

12 A. My mum's sons, yeah.

13 Q. Can you remember living at home with your twin brother
14 and these older half-brothers?

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. You can remember all being in the same house together?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. You tell us that your half-brothers, one of them is two
19 years older and another five or six years older?

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. At paragraph 3 you explain that your mum and dad had
22 difficulties with heroin and they had a drug addiction
23 issue.

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. Did that mean that they weren't really able to look

1 after you?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. You say that your brothers and you were taken into care

4 at the same time but then I think you got split up from

5 your older half-brothers?

6 A. Yeah. From when we were, like, six weeks old we were in

7 and out of care. I can't remember us all being in care

8 together, but me and -- my twin brother and I were

9 together in Clerwood and Polwarth.

10 Q. Okay. We'll just mention those in a moment. I think

11 you tell us in your statement that you were in and out

12 of care quite a bit --

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. -- before you moved up to Moray?

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. But you were always with your twin brother; is that

17 right?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. You mention that the brother -- the half-brother that's

20 a couple of years older than you, you remember that he

21 or you know that he went back to your parents?

22 A. Yes, [REDACTED] -- oh --

23 Q. Yeah, that's fine. Did he stay with them then or did he

24 go into care anywhere else?

25 A. I think he did go into care, because I remember

1 a newspaper article saying "██████ needs a home", so it is
2 like from the social work had published this.

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. So, yeah. But then I think as a -- I think for a while
5 he was in care and I think when he was maybe about 12 or
6 something, I don't know if he went back to my parents
7 or -- I think I'm sure he did.

8 Q. Okay. Do you know what happened to your oldest brother?

9 A. No. No. He just basically vanished and then when my
10 mum died we tried to get in touch with him and he didn't
11 want to have anything to do with us because it was too
12 hurtful for him.

13 Q. Okay. You tell us at paragraph 4 that what you know
14 about the chronology of the places that you were in
15 before you were about five is from the records that your
16 twin brother has in a book?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. You say you both got a book when you got adopted?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. Did you keep that book or --

21 A. My brother's got his.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. I think mine's in my loft, yeah, I think, but I did,
24 I kept it till I was an adult.

25 Q. Okay. And what sort of things are in that book?

1 A. There was little -- there was some photos of us as
2 babies and then another couple of photos of us as like
3 maybe five years old. Secondary Institutions - to be published later
4 Secondary Institutions - to be published later
5
6 Q.
7 A. Secondary Institutions - to be published later And
8 there was like cartoon sort of drawings --
9 Q. Okay.
10 A. -- like mimicking my mum and dad fighting and things.
11 It's really strange.
12 Q. Okay. Was that maybe to try to explain why you were in
13 care?
14 A. Yes. I think that's what they were trying to explain,
15 why we were in care.
16 Q. Did it tell you the dates that you were in various
17 places?
18 A. Yes, yeah.
19 Q. Okay. Now if --
20 A. The reason I got those dates was because my brother
21 showed me his book when I went to see him, because I'm
22 100 per cent sure mine's up in the loft somewhere safe,
23 but he showed me the dates and things.
24 Q. Okay. Then you tell us in your statement that you're
25 aware that you were in Clerwood, as you've mentioned --

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. -- and you think that you were very young when you were
3 there?

4 A. (Witness nods)

5 Q. Then you went to the Lord and Lady Polwarth Children's
6 Home?

7 A. Mm.

8 Q. I think you were there more than once, is that right?
9 You maybe were there and then back to your mum and dad
10 and then back into the home?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. Do you have a memory of being in that home with your
13 twin brother?

14 A. Secondary Institutions - to be published later
15
16
17
18
19
20

21 Q. That's okay. I think you tell us in your statement, as
22 you've just mentioned there, that you remember being in
23 a home, wherever it was, and -- so it's paragraph 7 in
24 the statement that you have, the paper statement -- it's
25 redacted on the screen -- Secondary Institutions - to be published later

1 Secondary Institutions - to be published later

2

3 A.

4 Q. Is that right? You also say in that paragraph that you
5 were always the one who protected him?

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. And you were the boss?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. So even although you were twins and the same age --

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. -- you were the boss?

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. If we can move on from there in your statement, at
14 page 4 you say that you think you must have gone back to
15 your mum and dad, because you remember starting school
16 in Livingston.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. You think you were there for a few months, maybe?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. Then you think you went back to the Lord and Lady
21 Polwarth home again?

22 A. Yeah. I don't know if it was in between with me being
23 three to five months -- I know there was a long time
24 that I did stay at Lady Polwarth, but it was in and out,
25 you know, back and forth, back and forth.

1 Q. Okay. At the bottom of page 4 you tell us that you and
2 your twin brother were fostered in Dalkeith --
3 A. That's right.
4 Q. -- at paragraph 17.
5 A. Yeah.
6 Q. Can you remember anything about the foster carers there?
7 A. Yeah, I remember them having their daughter that was
8 unwell with eczema and I remember I used to choke on my
9 food a lot and I'd like spit it out and put it in my
10 pockets. But yeah, that's kind of all I really remember
11 much. The -- you know.
12 LADY SMITH: You'd have been very young at that stage.
13 A. Yeah. I do remember like in the morning times when
14 I used to have to be told to eat my toast and I wouldn't
15 be able to eat it, because I thought I was going to
16 choke so I would just spit it -- it was like the old
17 plain bread, you know the stuff I mean?
18 MS INNES: The white bread.
19 A. The white bread, like the pan bread, you know the
20 old-fashioned bread, so I just used to be spitting that
21 out and sticking it in my pocket.
22 MS INNES: You say at paragraph 18 that your memory of the
23 foster parents themselves is that they were nice family
24 people.
25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. That was the impression that you had of them?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. If we move on to page 5, you tell us at paragraph 22

4 that you first met your prospective adoptive parents in

5 Dalkeith?

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. So you were introduced to this couple who were going to

8 adopt you; is that right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You say there were two social workers that you met and

11 did you have a visit with them before you went to stay

12 longer term?

13 A. Yeah, I think it was round about the time where I had my

14 eye operation. I remember meeting them for the first

15 time then.

16 Q. And then you went up to visit them?

17 A. To visit, to stay, yeah.

18 Q. What was your impression of them when you went there?

19 A. I think it was good. It felt good. My brother was

20 unsure. I was more the one that said, oh, you know,

21 they've got a dog and we're having a mum and dad, we're

22 going to have a mum and dad, you know, it's going to be

23 good and the -- obviously it's strange, but I -- yeah.

24 Q. Okay. You talk about that at paragraph 23, that you

25 remember being asked if you wanted to go and stay with

1 these people and your brother wasn't keen?

2 A. Mm-hmm.

3 Q. But you said -- you mention the dog there, and they also

4 lived near a beach?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Had you gone to the beach when you'd gone to visit them?

7 A. Yeah, I think the beach was Lossiemouth beach.

8 Q. Okay. You describe again yourself as being the boss and

9 you feel that your brother agreed with you?

10 A. Yeah. Yeah, I think so, yeah.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. I was the more dominant twin.

13 Q. You say that the social work painted a pretty picture of

14 what it was going to be like?

15 A. Yeah, they did.

16 Q. So what sort of things were they saying?

17 A. Basically, you know, they've got a dog, there's a beach,

18 it's just going to be a mum and dad for you and -- well,

19 Julian his name was at the time, and ... you know, sort

20 of giving us all the positives and -- I believe it was

21 rushed too much and I do believe that they -- in

22 hindsight they shouldn't really adopt children that are

23 quite damaged, traumatised, and if they do they need to

24 have -- like the adoption parents obviously need

25 training for that.

1 And I had spoken to my adoptive father, not recently
2 but about a year or so ago, I'd met him and he'd said
3 that although I was struggling and was severely
4 traumatised, I kept everything together to keep my
5 brother safe and protect him all the time, and he
6 believed that they didn't get much training or support
7 to deal with children like us, you know, so yeah.

8 Q. Because, as you've described, you'd been in and out of
9 care a lot, you'd been back to your parents' care on
10 a number of occasions I think and it hadn't worked out
11 because of the difficulties that your parents had?

12 A. Yeah, **Secondary Institutions - to be published later**

Secondary Institutions - to be published later

15 Q. Okay. So you moved up to live with this couple and you
16 know that -- you say at paragraph 24 that the adoption
17 order was granted in 1982 when you were eight.

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. You say that you didn't stay with them for much longer
20 than two years, as it turned out.

21 A. Mm-hmm.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. You tell us at the top of this page, page 6, that they
25 were only 26 when they adopted you?

1 A. Yeah, it's really young.

2 Q. And they didn't have children of their own at the time

3 that you were adopted?

4 A. Yeah, they didn't have children of their own, no.

5 Q. Okay. Then did they have children after you arrived?

6 A. Yeah, that's when it started to go wrong.

7 Q. Okay. You tell us on page 6 that things started to go

8 wrong.

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. And at paragraph 26 you say that your adopted dad was

11 really nice but you didn't get on with your adoptive

12 mum; is that right?

13 A. That's right.

14 Q. And you were moved not long after she had a baby?

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. At paragraph 27 you tell us that when you were moved

17 from your adoptive parents, your twin brother wasn't

18 moved?

19 A. He got to stay.

20 Q. Do you know why that was?

21 A. (Witness shakes head)

22 I have no idea who made that decision and the worst

23 decision. I don't know. I always felt that maybe they

24 thought that I was the troublesome one so maybe if they

25 removed me, then their sort of family unit would be

1 stable. You know, because I was like more outgoing and
2 more, you know, outspoken and -- do you know what
3 I mean? I don't know.

4 Q. Can you remember anyone explaining to you at the time
5 that you were going to be leaving --

6 A. (Witness shakes head)

7 Q. -- and why you would be leaving?

8 A. I mean they basically just said it broke down and there
9 was no explanation why I was taken away and my brother
10 wasn't. And I believe that they couldn't really --
11 I don't know. I mean they knew that there was -- it was
12 documented in my notes that she was very hostile towards
13 me, so I don't understand why if I was in danger, they
14 must have just thought that it was my mine and her
15 relationship together that was a problem. But if she
16 was harming one child, why not say, well, you can't take
17 any chances with the second child or even her own child?
18 Do you know what I mean? They must have just thought
19 that it was me that was the problem, which I think is
20 really, really wrong. Extremely wrong. Especially
21 twins, you know, you don't -- you don't separate them.

22 Q. As you said, you and your brother, wherever you had
23 gone --

24 A. We were together.

25 Q. -- you had always been together?

1 A. Always.

2 Q. And you talked even when you were separated in rooms in
3 the dormitory you would seek him out --

4 A. I would be running to his room.

5 Q. -- looking for him?

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. You tell us at paragraph 27 that -- so you left the
8 adoptive home and you went to foster care in Keith?

9 A. That's right.

10 Q. You say that your twin brother was still in Elgin and
11 a social worker from Moray social work, Anne Brown, took
12 you to see him. How much -- sorry, just to be clear
13 about this, first of all, did you have to change schools
14 when you went to the foster care in Keith?

15 A. Yeah, I had to go to Keith Primary School.

16 Q. Okay. So your brother was still at primary school in
17 Elgin?

18 A. In Elgin, yeah.

19 Q. How often, do you know, were you able to see him after
20 you moved to Keith?

21 A. I believe it was only once. I believe. I remember it
22 being once. Maybe ... I say in here I saw him twice.
23 Possibly. No more than twice. There was one specific
24 occasion I just remember seeing him once, and that was
25 because he was in his bedroom during the day and it

1 sticks out in my head, because that's what she used to
2 do to me, just make me -- like if I was naughty or
3 whatever, I would be stuck in my bedroom and that's why
4 that one occasion sticks in my head.

5 Q. Okay, so you can remember being back in the house with
6 the adoptive parents and your twin brother in his
7 bedroom?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. You maybe had the impression that he was --

10 A. Maybe they were -- he was getting the same treatment as
11 me. But I don't know. I don't know. He could have
12 just been wanting to play in his room or whatever,
13 but ... yeah.

14 Q. Do you have any memory of ever staying over again at the
15 adoptive parents' house after you left?

16 A. No.

17 Q. You don't have a memory of seeing him every weekend or
18 anything like that?

19 A. No way. No way.

20 Q. Okay. You tell us at paragraph 28 that about six months
21 after you left the adoptive parents moved to Hong Kong?

22 A. Mm-hmm.

23 Q. Did they move straight away to Hong Kong or did they
24 move to England, do you know?

25 A. They could have moved to England first. I -- I know

1 they had -- well, just his adoptive mum had family down
2 there, so quite possibly they could have got posted
3 there first. But no, I just -- Hong Kong's all
4 I remember.

5 Q. You mentioned "posted" there, so was the adoptive father
6 maybe in the RAF?

7 A. Yes, he was in the RAF, yes, he was at [REDACTED] RAF
8 and then --

9 Q. Okay. So they moved away, wherever it was?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. And did you know in advance that they were going to
12 move?

13 A. (Witness shakes head)

14 I don't think so.

15 Q. What were the arrangements after that for you having
16 contact with your brother?

17 A. There was not -- I don't believe there was any formal
18 arrangements, but what I do remember is my brother
19 telling me that, you know, when we were adults, I would
20 be writing him letters and he would be writing me
21 letters, but he would have to sneak downstairs before
22 the postman came to get his letters, so that sort of
23 tells me that he was possibly not permitted to keep in
24 touch. Maybe he was not allowed to and he was trying to
25 hide it. And I think that's when he was living with

1 them.

2 But then when he moved to the boarding school, which

3 I didn't know about until later on, that we were writing

4 more regularly then.

5 Q. Do you have a memory of keeping in touch with him by

6 letters?

7 A. Yeah, I've still got the letters.

8 Q. How regular were they?

9 A. I mean ... I wouldn't say there would be one every week.

10 I think maybe ... maybe I got four or five letters in

11 total? But I remember him sending me a parasol, and ...

12 so, yes, but maybe that was when he was in Hong Kong for

13 holidays. I'm guessing he went there in the school

14 holidays.

15 Q. You told us that when his adoptive parents went to

16 Hong Kong, he actually stayed in England and went to

17 a boarding school there?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. You say you found that out later?

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. When did you find that out? Was that as an adult or was

22 that when you were a child?

23 A. Adult.

24 Q. Okay. Did you ever see your brother again --

25 A. Never.

1 Q. -- until you were an adult?

2 A. Until I was an adult. Until I had gotten in touch --

3 I had saw him before I got in touch with my birth mum --

4 or was it the same time? Oh, my memory's --

5 Q. It doesn't matter.

6 A. But yeah, I was an adult.

7 Q. You were an adult?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. Okay. So you -- if you go back to the point where you

10 moved to Keith and he was still in Elgin, can you

11 remember how you felt about your brother not being with

12 you?

13 A. I was heartbroken. I was ... probably ... I was just so

14 upset and he was just like my shadow, you know, we were

15 there together all the time. It was like half of me had

16 gone kind of thing.

17 Q. Can you remember if there was anybody that you were able

18 to talk to about that, your foster parents or the social

19 worker?

20 A. I remember saying to Anne Brown a lot that I want to see

21 him, I want to see him, I want to see him, and

22 I probably did say to [REDACTED] my foster mum, about it.

23 Q. What was the social worker's response when you were

24 saying that you want to see him? Can you remember?

25 A. I can't remember.

1 Q. That's okay.

2 A. It was probably, "We'll try hard, we'll try hard for you
3 to go and see him".

4 I don't know, I just get the impression they wanted
5 it to be closed off. I don't know if that was from the
6 adoptive parents' instructions or -- I don't know.

7 Q. You don't know whether it was the social work that
8 wanted it to be closed off or your adoptive parents?

9 A. I mean, in my -- what I believe in now the social work
10 should have kept us -- obviously kept us together, but
11 they also should have been more adamant even to let us
12 see each other on a regular, regular basis.

13 Q. Okay. You tell us a little bit about the [REDACTED] who
14 you went to live with in Keith, and you tell us that
15 they had two sons, one who was about 16 or 17, you
16 think, and the other one was about 14 or 15 you think?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. That's your impression of their ages at the time?

19 A. I think so. I mean they could have been younger, but,
20 you know, when you're a child everyone seems older,
21 don't they?

22 LADY SMITH: By then you'd have been, what, about ten?

23 A. Sorry?

24 LADY SMITH: You'd have been, what, about ten years old
25 then?

1 A. Yeah.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

3 MS INNES: How did you get on, first of all, with

4 Mrs [REDACTED]?

5 A. Really well. Really, really, really got on really well

6 with her. It was actually a bit ... I think because

7 my -- because Mr [REDACTED] was quiet and quite stern,

8 I was -- not scared of him, but I was a bit like

9 I didn't really speak to him a lot. I was more towards

10 Mrs [REDACTED].

11 Q. You tell us that there was a time that Mrs [REDACTED] was in

12 hospital for a while?

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. You describe it as being she was in hospital for ages

15 because she'd slipped a disc.

16 A. Mm-hmm.

17 Q. Who looked after you when she was in hospital?

18 A. Mr [REDACTED].

19 Q. How did you feel about that? About Mrs [REDACTED] being in

20 hospital and away?

21 A. I was upset and worried and I remember seeing her lying

22 straight, you know, like on those -- in the bed they had

23 like -- what do you call them? Like a traction thing to

24 keep her straight.

25 Q. Yes.

1 A. I remember that. And I remember getting quite a shock
2 thinking, "Oh my God".

3 Q. At paragraph 32 you say that you'd moved to Keith
4 Primary School. You're not sure how you were getting on
5 there. Do you have many memories of being at primary
6 school there or not?

7 A. I remember going to the school and I remember one of my
8 friends was called [REDACTED] and I remember the great big
9 long walk to the school. It was at least 2, 3 miles,
10 I mean even when I drive through Keith I always think,
11 "How did I walk that distance?" So I remember that.

12 Q. At paragraph 32 you say you don't remember any visits
13 from social workers at that time --

14 A. No.

15 Q. -- you don't remember speaking to the Anne Brown that
16 you mentioned?

17 A. I don't remember it. But I'm not saying it didn't
18 happen, but I don't remember.

19 Q. I think you said that when your brother was still in
20 Elgin, she was the one that would take you to see him.
21 Is that right?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Then in the next section you tell us about the abuse
24 that you suffered when you were with the [REDACTED] and you
25 tell us at paragraph 33 about an incident with the older

1 son?

2 A. Mm-hmm.

3 Q. Are you able to tell us what happened?

4 A. Yeah. It was -- we were in the living room, I remember

5 the telly being on and I remember him trying to get me

6 to do some sexual thing with him and I remember him

7 touching me and I remember watching the telly and

8 I remember thinking to myself -- it was actually the

9 news that was on and I remember thinking to myself:

10 I just wish this lady would help me or get him to stop.

11 You know, I was thinking that they could -- not that

12 they could see what was -- I was thinking all this.

13 I knew it was wrong what was happening, and I remember

14 thinking, you know, I just wish that they would --

15 I wish that he would stop doing what he was doing.

16 Q. Were you able to tell anyone what had happened?

17 A. I didn't say anything to anybody.

18 Q. Did it happen again, can you remember, or not?

19 A. It happened with his brother, the younger son. He got

20 caught in my bedroom, he was trying to undo my pyjamas.

21 He got caught by Mr [REDACTED].

22 Q. What did Mr [REDACTED] do?

23 A. He just gave him a row and told him -- got him out of

24 the bedroom, told him to leave. I believe that he ...

25 I don't -- blamed -- you know, he shouted at me.

1 Q. Right.

2 A. And I believe that he maybe -- he was angry -- I don't

3 know if he was angry at both of us or just -- or just --

4 you know, he really, really shouted at me, you know.

5 Q. Can you remember what he shouted or not?

6 A. I can't remember.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. What did you think after that? You know, you say there

10 that you were thinking --

11 A. I was like thinking they're both doing that to me and do

12 they both know that, that they're both doing it? It

13 didn't feel like they did. I thought why are they doing

14 this to me? And then I felt that I was to blame

15 because, you know, I think especially when Mr [REDACTED] got

16 angry at me I felt like he was blaming me more than his

17 own kids kind of thing, it felt like I was the one at

18 wrong.

19 Q. Were you able to speak to anyone about that?

20 A. (Witness shakes head)

21 Q. What about Mrs [REDACTED] was she there at the time?

22 A. I don't think -- maybe she was there, but she wasn't

23 still fully well, I don't know.

24 Q. Okay. You say that you didn't tell anyone about it when

25 you went to the children's home later on --

1 A. (Witness shakes head)

2 Q. -- you spoke about it when you were an adult?

3 A. Yeah. And I think that's why there was a kind of --

4 like a domino effect of things leading up to when I --

5 I think I had a mental breakdown, you know, because

6 I was put into hospital in Aberdeen and I think it was

7 my brother, then the abuse happening and obviously I was

8 just -- I was just a young child but I kept everything

9 together, you know, I sort of was really strong and

10 then -- and then all of a sudden it just ... so ...

11 Q. You tell us later in your statement that you spent some

12 time in the psychiatric hospital in Aberdeen --

13 A. Mm-hmm.

14 Q. -- when you were a child, when you were quite a young

15 child still.

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. At the top of page 8, paragraph 36, do you know if what

18 happened had anything to do with you leaving or is it

19 just that these things happened and then not that long

20 afterwards you left the [REDACTED]?

21 A. Sorry, say that again?

22 Q. Do you know if what happened with the son that Mr [REDACTED]

23 discovered, do you know if that led to you leaving the

24 [REDACTED]?

25 A. I believe it was. I don't know for sure. I honestly

1 don't know for sure. I think when I got my notes it was
2 documented that I was too close to Mrs [REDACTED] and not
3 close to Mr [REDACTED] and maybe -- I believe they blamed me
4 and thought that I was maybe too troublesome for them.
5 Q. You tell us about that at paragraph 37 --
6 A. Yeah.
7 Q. -- where you say that you were under the impression that
8 the foster parents couldn't handle you again and that
9 you were the problem?
10 A. Yeah.
11 Q. So that was the impression that you had at that time and
12 I think maybe from other things --
13 A. From what had happened --
14 Q. -- that had happened before?
15 A. Yeah.
16 Q. You talk in the next paragraph about you were adopted
17 but then it was you that was sent away and your brother
18 stayed?
19 A. Mm-hmm.
20 Q. Again when we talked about that move, I think you said
21 that again you thought you were the problem?
22 A. Yeah. And that's probably one of the reasons why
23 I didn't tell anybody, because I thought it was my
24 fault, you know, the abuse, and I would have blamed
25 myself and just thought nobody would believe me anyway.

1 Q. You remember being really upset when you had to leave
2 the [REDACTED]?
3 A. Mm-hmm.
4 Q. And you say that Mrs [REDACTED] was upset as well, I think?
5 A. She was.
6 Q. Can you remember if you ever saw them again after you
7 left?
8 A. Never.
9 Q. Then you tell us that you moved to a place in Rhynie,
10 I think Nicoll Lodge it was called?
11 A. That's right.
12 Q. You then went, as you've already mentioned, to the
13 hospital for -- I think you think you were there for
14 about a year and a half?
15 A. Mm-hmm.
16 Q. Then later you went to a children's home in Forres?
17 A. Mm-hmm.
18 Q. You're smiling at that, was that a positive experience?
19 A. Really positive, yeah.
20 Q. I think you went there maybe when you were about 11 or
21 12?
22 A. That's right.
23 Q. Did you stay there for the rest of your childhood?
24 A. I stayed there until I was about 15 and a half, and then
25 I went to work on a live-in stables, but I was still --

1 I still had my bedroom there and everything there until
2 I was about ... 17/18. Well, 18 I was discharged then,
3 but I wasn't actually living there all the time.
4 Q. What was good about that experience, living there?
5 A. It was a small -- smaller unit, but the staff that
6 worked there were really good and obviously it took me
7 a bit of a time to adjust to being there, but yeah, it
8 was -- they were all really good and, yeah, really
9 like -- I felt like they had my back and they were
10 fighting my corner and they'd sort of -- [REDACTED] that
11 owned -- that ran the place, she was determined not to
12 give up on me kind of thing, you know, and she saw the
13 good person in me and -- yeah.
14 Q. Good.
15 LADY SMITH: Is that also where you made a good friend?
16 A. Sorry?
17 LADY SMITH: Is that also where you made a good friend?
18 A. Yes. Yeah.
19 LADY SMITH: Did that help?
20 A. With [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] yeah. And [REDACTED]'s daughter,
21 we're the same age. We still -- we're still really good
22 friends.
23 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.
24 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.
25 If we just move on, please, to page 22 and to

1 paragraph 112 and you've already mentioned this in your
2 evidence, I think we see this here in your statement,
3 that not long before you signed your statement last year
4 you met your adoptive father --
5 A. Yeah.
6 Q. -- again.
7 A. I did.
8 Q. You say there about your traumatised background, you
9 were the one struggling the most, you stood strong and
10 protected your brother, and he said that he and his wife
11 were too young, he felt.
12 A. Mm.
13 Q. And they had no training and felt let down?
14 A. Yeah. And they were -- they felt the adoption was
15 rushed.
16 Q. Okay. If we just go over the page, at paragraph 114 you
17 talk there about the lack of any attempt to maintain
18 a relationship between yourself and your twin brother,
19 and the thing you've already told us about, about him
20 running to get letters from you.
21 A. Yeah.
22 Q. If we can just move on, please, to page 25, you got
23 a section headed, "Records".
24 A. Yeah.
25 Q. I understand from this that you got some social work

1 records from maybe Moray Council?

2 A. Mm-hmm, I did.

3 Q. Can you tell us what your experience of getting your

4 records was like? Did you try to read them?

5 A. I was wanting to get some explanation why -- with my mum

6 and dad, and I wanted to -- I wanted to also get

7 an explanation why if -- I wanted to -- it's really

8 strange. I wanted to, like, know if anybody knew

9 about -- like fully knew about the abuse at the adoptive

10 place and the foster place. I wanted to know if

11 anybody -- any professionals actually knew that that was

12 happening to me. Because [REDACTED] knew that something had

13 happened to me when I was in the children's home and

14 I wanted to know that if anybody did like know.

15 Then when I was reading it, it was like some of the

16 stuff like I said that I was a very disturbed child and

17 wrote that I'd put weight on and I was looking like

18 a young woman -- why would you write something like that

19 in a report, you know? A professional writing that?

20 And I also wanted to know -- I know why I was in the

21 hospital, but I wanted to know if I was diagnosed with

22 anything, you know, in that hospital in Aberdeen. And

23 I just wanted to know more information, really, about

24 myself.

25 Q. Did you want to know about why you were separated from

1 your brother? Was that one of the things that you
2 wanted to find out about?

3 A. Yeah. I wanted to know -- like that's what I mean.
4 I wanted to know if they knew that she was doing that to
5 me and why did they leave him there and -- you know, why
6 didn't they just keep us together still?

7 Q. Did you get any answers to that from reading the file?

8 A. Yeah -- well, I did get an answer when it said that she
9 was quite hostile towards me and they were taking me
10 away for my own safety, and that kind of made it worse
11 because I was like, "Oh my God, you know, why take me
12 and not take him as well?" Why do that? It's wrong.

13 Q. And --

14 A. And this is why I'm here today, because I don't want
15 this happening to any other kids or siblings or, you
16 know. I really don't.

17 Q. You say at paragraph 124 that you received the records
18 electronically, I think they were emailed to you, and
19 you say a lot of them were handwritten and they were
20 difficult to read.

21 A. Mm-hmm.

22 Q. How did you feel about that?

23 A. Quite frustrated. You know, at the time I was using my
24 phone and I was trying to zoom into them. Obviously
25 I read them on the computer as well, and I keep having

1 to put them away, I haven't read them for a long time,
2 or for a while, but yeah.

3 Q. Have you been able to read all of them or --

4 A. I haven't read them all, I've sort of read them in bits
5 to connect little bits.

6 Q. You talk about that you feel that records should be sent
7 in a readable format when they're sent out.

8 A. They should.

9 Q. Have you had any support from anybody in helping you to
10 go through your records?

11 A. No. Just got emailed them, there's the password, there
12 you go, have a good day.

13 Q. Are there any things blanked out in your records?

14 A. Yeah, there's names blanked out.

15 Q. Okay. How did you feel about that?

16 A. I understood it for the data protection, I do understand
17 that. Because at the time I got them my mum hadn't died
18 so ... yeah. And I think they were blanking out my
19 brother's name as well.

20 Q. Okay. You talk about trying to get some other records,
21 I think, from other periods when you were in the home,
22 for example.

23 A. Mm-hmm.

24 Q. You move on in the next and final part of your statement
25 to lessons to be learned and I think you mentioned some

1 of these things already.

2 You say at paragraph 126 that essentially you were

3 too old to have been adopted?

4 A. Maybe not too old but maybe too -- too traumatised. Too

5 traumatised. If it was maybe an older couple with more

6 life experience, with more experience with children that

7 are -- suffered trauma, maybe it would have worked out

8 better.

9 Q. Then you talk about, as you've said, one of the most

10 important things is children shouldn't be -- you

11 shouldn't have been split up from your twin brother.

12 A. No way, yeah.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. Even like brother and sister siblings should never be

15 split up.

16 Q. Then I think, as you said earlier in your evidence, you

17 talked about even if you were, you should have been able

18 to maintain a --

19 A. Contact.

20 Q. -- a relationship, okay.

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. Then at paragraph 127 you talk about I think again the

23 fact that you were back and forth to your parents and

24 the impact that that then had on you --

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. -- and on the later period. You say:
2 "If kids are in care for too long it's hard to
3 transition them to a family environment."
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. Is that what you felt?
6 A. Yeah.
7 Q. You found it difficult to be in a family setting?
8 A. Especially if you've been through in care homes and then
9 obviously in foster in Dalkeith and, you know, you have
10 like a lot of -- yeah, the older you get, the more you
11 maybe have like trust issues, abandonment issues, you
12 know, all that sort of stuff.
13 They should have maybe adopted us when we were three
14 years old, you know. Why just keep pushing us back and
15 forth, you know, I saw my house getting raided,
16 I remember that happening, and getting taken away, my
17 mum and dad not there. You know, why put children
18 through all that stuff?
19 Q. You say at paragraph 128 that you were in a lot of
20 places and you say that's due to a lack of training and
21 a lack of knowing how that it can impact people in
22 adulthood.
23 A. Mm-hmm.
24 Q. Can I take from that that you think it would be
25 important for social workers to understand the impact --

1 A. The impact, definitely.

2 Q. -- that it has later in life?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. At paragraph 129 you talk about that there should be

5 better understanding and better training of trauma?

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. And the things that you've described that you had gone

8 through and how that can impact I guess during

9 childhood --

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. -- so that a person can look after you and keep you

12 safe?

13 A. Yeah. For sure.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. Definitely.

16 MS INNES: 'Jenny', thank you for your evidence. I don't

17 have any more questions for you.

18 A. Okay.

19 MS INNES: There are no applications, my Lady.

20 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for

21 questions?

22 'Jenny', that does complete all the questions we

23 have to ask you today. Thank you so much for engaging

24 with us.

25 A. Thank you.

1 LADY SMITH: Both by providing your written statement and
2 coming here today, and I appreciate -- telling you our
3 primary interest at the moment is foster care can't have
4 been easy for you to address, because you've been in so
5 many different care settings, I understand that. But
6 what you've told me about foster care, your experience
7 of what it was like to be separated from your twin
8 brother, the importance for you of that twin bond --
9 A. Yes.

10 LADY SMITH: -- and also your thoughts in retrospect about
11 how it might all have been better are really valuable.
12 Thank you so much for that.

13 A. Thank you.

14 LADY SMITH: I'm able to let you go and hopefully relax for
15 the rest of the day.

16 A. Thank you. I hope this makes a difference in future for
17 other children.

18 LADY SMITH: It does help them.

19 A. Thank you.

20 (The witness withdrew)

21 LADY SMITH: The names of one set of foster carers, the
22 [REDACTED] were used during that evidence. Their identity
23 is protected by my general restriction order and can't
24 be disclosed outside this room.

25 I think it's time for the lunch break, Ms Innes.

1 MS INNES: Yes, my Lady.

2 LADY SMITH: We'll sit again at about 2 o'clock.

3 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

4 (1.14 pm)

5 (The luncheon adjournment)

6 (2.00 pm)

7 LADY SMITH: Good afternoon.

8 Ms Innes.

9 MS INNES: My Lady, the next witness has chosen to remain

10 anonymous and is using the pseudonym 'Janet'. 'Janet'

11 was in the care of Strathclyde Regional Council. She

12 was placed in foster care with a Mr and Mrs EQI-EQJ on

13 [REDACTED] 1982 and remained there until she was 18 in

14 [REDACTED] 1986.

15 At the time of the placement, the Clydebank office

16 was dealing with this case and then it was transferred

17 to the Vale of Leven office. It's our understanding

18 that the relevant successor would be West Dunbartonshire

19 Council.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

21 'Janet' (affirmed)

22 LADY SMITH: 'Janet', that sounded as though you were in

23 a good position there. It will help you and it will

24 help us if you can try and stay in line with the

25 microphone.

1 A. Okay.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

3 The red folder has your statement in it, we'll take
4 you to that in a moment, but we'll also put it up on the
5 screen in front of you to look at the particular parts
6 we'd like to discuss.

7 Before I hand you over to Ms Innes can I just say,
8 'Janet', that I know it can be difficult to talk about
9 things in your childhood, particularly doing it in
10 public in front of people that you've never met before,
11 and that there are times it can become distressing, your
12 emotions can take you by surprise.

13 A. (Witness nods)

14 LADY SMITH: If there's anything I can do to help you give
15 the best evidence you can, do let me know, whether it's
16 having a break or just a pause where you are. If it
17 works for you it works for me, that's the key, all
18 right?

19 A. Okay, thank you.

20 LADY SMITH: If you're ready I'll hand over to Ms Innes now
21 and she'll take it from there.

22 A. Thank you.

23 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

24 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

25 Questions from Ms Innes

1 MS INNES: 'Janet', we understand that you were born in
2 1968. Is that right?
3 A. Yes, that's correct.
4 Q. Your statement, we give it the reference
5 WIT.001.001.5861. If we can look at the final page of
6 this, please, at paragraph 81 you say there:
7 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
8 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
9 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
10 true."
11 I believe you signed your statement on 17 July 2017;
12 is that right?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. If we can go back to the beginning of your statement,
15 please, at paragraph 2 you tell us a bit about your
16 family. We understand from that that you're one of
17 a family of seven children; is that right?
18 A. Yeah, that's correct.
19 Q. You say two brothers and four sisters?
20 A. Yeah.
21 Q. At paragraph 3 you tell us that you tell us that your
22 father died quite suddenly when you were about seven?
23 A. I think I may have been a bit older. I don't know where
24 I got the seven.
25 Q. Okay.

1 A. Because I got put into the Bloomhill and I was nine, so
2 it might have been eight, the year before it, or ...
3 I really can't remember the exact age. I would say
4 seven or eight, but I'd say more maybe eight.

5 Q. Until your father died, were you all living together
6 without any social work involvement?

7 A. Yeah. Nothing.

8 Q. Then your father died and you tell us that you don't
9 think that your mum could cope then?

10 A. Yeah, I think things just spiralled out of control and
11 I just think like after my dad's -- I don't know if it
12 was the funeral, but one of my uncles had said to my mum
13 go for a wee drink or something and I think whatever --
14 quite a lot of people just got a hold of her and I think
15 probably seven kids, it's -- I think it just got too
16 much and I think it was just -- that was the way
17 forward. And I just remember snippets of being in the
18 house and things, but, as I say, I know I've got a lot
19 of older sisters so they can maybe know more than what
20 me and my younger sister did.

21 Q. Yes, of what was happening?

22 A. What was happening.

23 Q. You say at paragraph 3 that there was a time when you
24 remember the social work department got involved and you
25 remember your mum telling you that you were being put

1 into a home.

2 A. Yeah. I remember that day I went home and I think

3 I remember -- I don't know if she was on the couch or

4 the floor and she said that we were going into a home

5 and I said, "No, I'm never", and I ran away to meet my

6 other two sisters and I told them what was happening.

7 We were probably not even away that long but to us it

8 probably felt long. And then when we came back we hid

9 behind the sink and then we seen a car taking the

10 younger sister, [REDACTED] into the car, I think it was

11 social work, and then we just went into the house and we

12 got told off our older brother and sister that we were

13 for it, because we didn't stay there for the social work

14 coming.

15 Q. Because you had run away?

16 A. We'd run away, but.

17 Q. Okay. And then you say that -- so your youngest sister

18 had been taken away and are you the second youngest?

19 A. Yeah, I'm up from [REDACTED] yes, I'm the next one.

20 Q. You say that the next day that you went to school as

21 normal but then a social worker came, Graham Beattie?

22 A. Yeah, I remember the teacher shouted me out and said

23 that there was a gentleman waiting and then when I went

24 down with him to a car there was already my other two

25 sisters were in the car and at that point we still

1 didn't really know what was happening and that's where
2 we got taken to the first care home, Bloomhill
3 Children's Home in Cardross.

4 Q. Then you went to Bloomhill and did you go there with all
5 of your sisters?

6 A. Just me and my two older ones. My wee sister was
7 already there from the night before.

8 Q. What about your brothers? Where did they go?

9 A. My older brother was already -- he was -- he got brought
10 up with my granny and granda so he didn't really stay in
11 the family home.

12 Q. I see.

13 A. The other brother, he was still there but I don't think
14 he was at school. Because I don't think he'd went into
15 the army at that time. I think he was still about the
16 house whatever. But I think because he was older
17 again --

18 Q. Okay, so it was you and your sisters that --

19 A. Yeah, it was just the four sisters that went into
20 Bloomhill.

21 Q. Okay. Then you tell us in your statement obviously that
22 you spent some time in Bloomhill and at page 6,
23 paragraph 28 you tell us there that you think you were
24 in Bloomhill for about a year and then again your social
25 worker, Graham Beattie, came and took you to Hill Park

1 Children's Home.

2 A. Yeah, that's correct.

3 Q. You say that you've been told that you were moved
4 because you asked to be put closer to home?

5 A. Home.

6 Q. Who told you that? Was that your sisters or is that
7 something that you knew at the time?

8 A. I don't know. I think maybe just because it was nearer
9 home and because Graham Beattie was based in Clydebank
10 at the time and I think that that's maybe the reason
11 when a place came up there, I think -- I don't know if
12 that's why we were moved back to there, but I don't
13 think it was anything to do because we were closer to
14 our family home, because we never really went back to
15 the family home. So I don't know why we got moved back.
16 Maybe it was because it was nearer for him to travel.

17 Q. Did you and all of your sisters go to Hill Park?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. Okay. You then spent some time at Hill Park and if we
20 move past there and on to page 12 of your statement,
21 paragraph 54. You say that you were in Hill Park for
22 three years from when you were in Primary 6 until your
23 first year at secondary school.

24 A. Yeah. It might have even been going into the second
25 year, starting second year, because I think I still did

1 some of second year in the Vale Academy. But I would
2 probably say maybe it could have been about three years.
3 I know I was definitely in Primary 6 when I went into
4 the primary beside the home. Yeah.

5 Q. From what you say you'd spent a year in Bloomhill and
6 then about three years in Hill Park?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. So four years altogether in children's homes?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. You tell us in this paragraph that you and your sisters
11 all left the home at different times and in respect --
12 we'll come to you and your younger sister in a moment,
13 but your older sisters, where did they go when they
14 left?

15 A. Well, I think [REDACTED] when she first left she went to
16 work as a -- I can't remember what the name is, like
17 a nanny sort of thing over Motherwell for a couple. And
18 then [REDACTED] she left -- she went to another children's
19 home but then she'd been in an assessment centre and
20 then she got put into Craigellachie Home, which is still
21 in Clydebank, so she was at that one, and me and
22 [REDACTED] were still in Hill Park. I think we were the
23 last two that were left --

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. -- in there.

1 Q. You say that maybe it was a year after they left,
2 roughly, that you and your younger sister were taken to
3 foster carers, and you say you think there were two
4 children's panels:
5 "My mum wanted to take us back. The first time she
6 didn't turn up and the second time she was drunk."
7 Were you at those panels or --
8 A. No, that's what they've just documented and said that.
9 Q. Is that from your records, when you say it's documented?
10 A. Well, obviously they'd redacted quite a lot but I think
11 the way they put it, I seen, "[blank] didn't turn up,
12 [blank] didn't phone, [blank] was meant to visit", and
13 I know that it was my mum they were talking about. But
14 then I think sometimes even in the home they would say
15 your mum was meant to come or phone and she's not kept
16 it, and then she was meant to come or phone and she's
17 not kept and she was meant to go to panels and they said
18 at one of the panels that she'd turned up and she was
19 under the influence at one of the panels, and that's why
20 they said, "You'll not be going back to the family
21 home".
22 Q. Then at paragraph 55 you say you didn't go to any
23 children's panel and you think it was Mr Beattie's
24 decision that you should go to these foster carers?
25 A. Yeah, I think it was proposed by him about the foster

1 care. I don't know much influence Alan Carter would
2 have had, because he was the officer in charge but
3 I don't know if it was the both that was trying to get
4 us to engage with that foster care.

5 Q. So Alan Carter, who was he?

6 A. He was the officer in charge in Hill Park. He was
7 the --

8 Q. In the home?

9 A. In the home, yeah.

10 Q. You don't know whether it was him or he was involved
11 together with your social worker --

12 A. Yes, about the foster carers, like saying that there's
13 some family interested and they'll keep the two of you
14 together, whatever, and I just -- obviously when I read
15 back there is something in my statements, my oldest two
16 sisters, they kind of tried to tell us no, don't go, but
17 I don't think we had a choice. I don't think it was
18 that they were asking you to go to foster care. I don't
19 think if you said no ... I don't know.

20 Q. Do you think it would have made a difference if you'd
21 said you didn't want to go to foster care or not?

22 A. I don't know. I think they just wanted us out one by
23 one, so they did, and then we were the last two and they
24 just thought this family's came forward or -- I don't
25 know how they found the family or how that -- because

1 I'd have been too young anyway to know how that came
2 about.

3 Q. Okay. You tell us that you and your sister went to
4 visit [REDACTED] family?

5 A. Yeah, I think probably got taken for a visit but I can't
6 really remember the visit.

7 Q. What was your impression of [REDACTED] when you met
8 them?

9 A. I thought, "Oh Jesus, they're old. People are not going
10 to buy this, that they're my parents", know what I mean?
11 Oh. And then when I found out they had older kids that
12 were married and had their own kids, I thought ... they
13 did a scrapbook for us when we were in the home and we
14 were to do one for them to tell us a bit about each
15 other, but they put that we would have our own room,
16 we'd have this and that, but when we got there we didn't
17 have our own room, because the son had split up with his
18 wife and he was allowed to move back in, so we had to
19 share a bed and I thought, "This scrapbook's not looking
20 the same as it was put". It says it's whatever, but
21 even when I got there ... they didn't even ask you how
22 you were or just general questions about my family, like
23 how I got to be in that position. About any of my
24 family life or any of the care homes I was in. They
25 didn't really speak to you. I mean in general they

1 didn't speak to you.

2 Q. Did they not show much interest in your life before you

3 had come into their care?

4 A. Not even my life before it or even when I was there.

5 Never showed any ... anything at all.

6 Q. We'll come onto that a bit more in a moment. You talk

7 about their age and you think that they were in their

8 50s?

9 A. Well, to me I'd have probably -- when I first went there

10 I would have said they looked more in their 70s, but

11 they probably were about 50, whatever, but I just --

12 I don't know, you can't help your face, know what

13 I mean, but as I say, just ...

14 Q. They maybe looked older --

15 A. They looked older, I think, maybe than what -- I mean

16 the husband was okay. He would speak to you, but only

17 if she spoke to you, but if she wasn't speaking to you

18 he wouldn't speak to you. I think it was obviously she

19 wore the trousers, know what I mean, so I thought ...

20 but ...

21 Q. Okay. You say that all of their children were older and

22 married?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. So all of them had moved out but then this son in fact

25 had moved back home because he'd split up with his wife?

1 A. Yeah, his wife.

2 Q. You say that you were living in one address and then
3 after about a year you moved to another house in
4 Bonhill?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Is that right? Okay. It was that address in Bonhill
7 that the son came to live in; is that right?

8 A. No, he came to live in both, he came to live in the one
9 in [REDACTED], that's why we didn't get our
10 own room, because he had split up with his wife, and
11 then when we moved up to the other house it was a four
12 apartment and I thought, right, we're getting our own
13 room now and we did and it was great. Because if I took
14 a friend in it was good to go in the room. Then that
15 was short lived, he split up again with somebody else
16 and he came back. So we were put into a room again.
17 Sometimes -- we may be sisters, we're different -- like
18 I like my music, I liked -- I mean I was older and
19 sometimes it kind of got us to squabbling and fighting,
20 whatever, because I just thought, oh, here we go again.

21 Q. You mentioned that sometimes you might want to have
22 a friend to the house and have a bit of privacy without
23 your wee sister being there --

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. -- as well. Okay. On page 13, paragraph 58 you go on

1 to talk about some of the things that you did in the
2 house and you say that you washed all of your clothes
3 and did your own ironing.

4 A. Yeah. Once a week, because it took you so long, it took
5 you nearly the whole day to do your clothes because it
6 was like the twin tub and then I had to do my room,
7 clean and polish their house and keep the rooms tidy and
8 whatever, then she would send you up to a farm one time
9 to get eggs and I told her to go herself and I remember
10 shouting and bawling, I can't remember, I must have just
11 rebelled that day and thought don't speak to me in any
12 other times and then you just, when you want something,
13 you're -- I don't know.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I think we clashed quite a lot. She was quite funny
16 because see if she spoke to me, she wasn't speaking to
17 my wee sister. And then she'd go through periods vice
18 versa and I'm like why are you doing that, trying to
19 play us off one another? Because you'll never do that.
20 I mean, I just think ... I don't know why.

21 Q. Did Mrs EQI not do any of the washing herself?

22 A. She probably done her own. I'm surprised she never got
23 me to do her own, but she probably done her own but
24 I had to do my own. She probably done my wee sister's,
25 but I know I had to do my whole week's probably myself.

1 Q. You talk in the next paragraph, paragraph 59, about
2 clean and polishing the house, which you've just
3 mentioned, doing the dishes and keeping your own rooms
4 clean and tidy. Did Mrs **EQI** do any of the cleaning
5 in the house?

6 A. No, I don't remember her with a Hoover.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. Or the polish or -- I don't remember.

9 Q. Did your sister have to do these things as well?

10 A. Yeah, I think she gave me a hand. I think the Saturday,
11 it was like kind of a bigger clean. So if they went
12 shopping we would be doing the kind of stuff ourselves.

13 Q. Okay. If we can move on down to paragraph 63, you talk
14 there about one of your sisters coming to visit you.
15 Other than that single visit, were your sisters able to
16 come to the house and see you there? Your older
17 sisters?

18 A. I think they could have if they wanted but I think it
19 was just because of the distance.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. I remember one of my older sisters coming and I remember
22 her walking kind of halfway down, it was quite a good
23 bit to the train station. She came, I don't remember
24 how long, but that was the first house we were at. And
25 then I think I just left it, because we had a wee job in

1 the YTS on a Friday, I went straight to my sister
2 [REDACTED]'s after work and my wee sister used to meet me
3 and we would go and get the train and we would stay
4 there for Friday and come home sometimes on the Sunday.
5 Q. So you would see your sister [REDACTED] at the weekends?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. You say that you've only one memory of your social
8 worker Graham Beattie coming to see you there --
9 A. Yeah.
10 Q. -- when you were at EQI-EQJ [REDACTED]?
11 A. Uh-huh.
12 Q. Can you tell us about your memory of that visit?
13 A. I remember -- I don't know how I managed to get his
14 number or how I phoned or if she phoned, but I remember
15 him coming out and taking me up to the room with
16 Alan Carter and I says -- he says, "What's happening?"
17 And I just told him I wasn't happy and I just didn't
18 like it and I wanted to go back to the home and him and
19 Alan Carter were saying, "No, no, you've not gave it
20 long enough, you need to just give it a wee try", and
21 I says, "I don't like it" and that was basically what
22 they were saying as if no, you need to give it a bit
23 longer as if -- so nothing's happening, like basically
24 you're staying here sort of thing.
25 So I just had to get on with it.

1 Q. Was that visit at the house, can you remember?

2 A. That was at the first house we stayed with [REDACTED]

3 in [REDACTED]

4 Q. From what you're saying, was it shortly after you went

5 to live there?

6 A. It was very quick after I went there to live, yeah.

7 Q. Mr Carter was there as well as Mr Beattie?

8 A. I think he came out with him. I think he came out to

9 the house and he was trying to say as well that you need

10 to give it time, you need to give it time. I says well

11 I know we've been here for whatever period, I don't like

12 it.

13 Q. Did you ever see Mr Beattie again after that?

14 A. Don't think so. I think it went on to Jim Dempster

15 after that.

16 Q. So you had another social worker I think called

17 Jim Dempster?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. Did you speak to Mr Dempster about not feeling happy

20 with [REDACTED]?

21 A. I can't remember. I remember seeing him a few times but

22 I don't remember what we spoke about or anything,

23 I can't remember --

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. -- what I told him.

1 Q. Right. If we go on to the next page, please, page 14,
2 you talk at paragraph 64 about the arrangement with the
3 rooms that you thought you would have from scrapbook
4 that you saw before and how things turned out.

5 Then you say at paragraph 65 that when you got home
6 from school or from work one of the things that you had
7 to do was take the dogs out. That was one of your jobs?

8 A. Yeah. And she's the one that wanted the dogs but she'd
9 never take them out. Never. But the only reason why
10 I took them out was because I knew that I would be able
11 to have a cigarette while taking them out.

12 Q. You say if you didn't take them out she would make your
13 life hell. In what way?

14 A. Just I don't know, it was just the way she would blank
15 you and sit and moan and just ... wouldn't speak to you
16 at all and it was like -- you just felt as if you were
17 sitting in somebody's house that was just like
18 a stranger, like you could have been sitting ... and
19 then I used to just end up going to my room, because
20 I thought there was no point sitting here because
21 there's nobody even speaking to you. So I would just
22 probably take the dogs out at night if I was coming in
23 from seeing my friends. Then after that I would just
24 probably go to my room, just play my music.

25 Q. You say there she wouldn't speak to you and the

1 atmosphere would be terrible, so from what you're
2 saying, there seems to have been periods of time where
3 she just didn't speak to you at all?

4 A. Most of the time. I don't even remember having a long
5 conversation with her about anything.

6 Q. Did she behave the same way to your sister?

7 A. Sometimes, but other times, no, she could be the same.
8 I remember one time she came up to the room and I was
9 playing music, but me and my wee sister were already
10 arguing because I was playing -- I didn't think it was
11 loud but anyway, we were squabbling, but she was
12 smoking, so when she came up to the room my wee sister
13 threw the cigarette behind the wardrobe and a jumper --
14 sorry, I don't mean to laugh, a jumper went on fire and
15 then she's tried to spray stuff to get rid of the smell
16 and she said to [REDACTED] something like, "Did you not
17 go to that meeting today with the social work?" And
18 then I just remember them two starting fighting and
19 I couldn't do anything for laughing. I don't know if it
20 was nerves, but -- my wee sister could handle herself
21 anyway, do you know what I mean, so -- but she didn't
22 even notice the cigarette behind the wardrobe. Because
23 we tried to get her out of the room as fast as she came
24 into it. But that was them. They two were ... mm.

25 Q. So they were arguing on that occasion, your sister and

1 Mrs EQI ?

2 A. Mm-hmm.

3 Q. You say at paragraph 66 that you needed some new shoes
4 for school, one of them kept falling off, and did you
5 try to speak to Mrs EQI about that?

6 A. I told her, I says I need to put toilet paper in them to
7 keep that shoe on. I says when I'm running for the bus
8 for school, it was a good bit to get the bus, if you
9 missed the bus to go home for lunch then that was you
10 and I just thought I can't even run fast and I was
11 a fast runner, because I did every sport and I could run
12 fast, but with that one shoe I was like -- and I kept
13 saying to her -- but, no. I had to wait until I got
14 a job myself to buy stuff.

15 Later on I thought to myself, do you know what, she
16 was getting an allowance for us, so why wasn't it being
17 spent on us? When you are sitting there every night
18 with a whisky and half a shandy and the dogs had
19 a chocolate treats, I thought, "God, even the dogs are
20 treated better" and she wouldn't even get me a pair of
21 shoes. But she didn't realise that was a new school I'd
22 went to and I'd joined them during second year. So it
23 was quite hard to fit into a new school. You actually
24 had to kind of try and work out -- you'd try and curl
25 your toes to see if that would keep the shoe even more,

1 and you know, having to walk about the whole day like
2 that.

3 Q. Did Mrs EQI or Mr EQJ take any interest in the
4 school or --

5 A. No.

6 Q. -- speak to the teachers about how you were getting on?

7 A. Never asked me how school was when I came home at the
8 end of the day. Maybe it was -- I don't know, maybe it
9 was a good thing but I just -- I was constantly in
10 trouble in school. But I don't ever remember them
11 saying: how was school today? What did you learn? What
12 did -- they just didn't really bother.

13 Q. Then you say at paragraph 67 you tell us about this
14 argument about the eggs when you said:

15 "I hold her to go and get them herself."

16 You say she started shouting at you and you told her
17 that you didn't want to stay there any more.

18 A. Mm-hmm.

19 Q. Then I think you link that to Graham Beattie coming and
20 visiting you?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. Is that the occasion that you told us about?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. Okay. You say at paragraph 68 that you were never shown
25 any love or affection by the EQI-EQJ .

1 A. Mm. Never. No.

2 Q. Over the page at the top of the next page you describe
3 her as being always grumpy and moody --

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. -- and that you have no good memories of them?

6 A. (Witness shakes head) No.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. That's why when I left, I didn't look back, didn't
9 phone, visit. Nothing. If they were a nice couple and
10 caring I would have gone back and I'd have even kept
11 going back with my kids, grand kids, whatever, but
12 I never looked back.

13 Q. When you left was your little sister still living there?

14 A. I felt rotten the night I left, I left my wee sister
15 there, but she wasn't really there that long because
16 I think she went to move in with one of my sisters and
17 it wasn't that long, but I don't really know how long
18 she was still in the foster care. But I don't think it
19 was really long. A few months maybe.

20 Q. Okay. Can we look on, please, to some of your records.
21 If we can look at GLA-000001871. If we can go to
22 page 11 first of all, please, we see at the top of this
23 page "J Dempster". Is that the Jim Dempster that you
24 spoke about?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. If we look at the first entry, this is [REDACTED] 1982,
2 so we know that you'd moved to the EQI-EQJ [REDACTED] in
3 [REDACTED] 1982, so this is later that same year. It says
4 there that the case -- it's a:
5 "Case transferred from the Clydebank area
6 office ..."
7 I think that's maybe consistent with your memory of
8 having Mr Beattie as your social worker when you were at
9 Clydebank and then you were moved to Mr Dempster.
10 A. Yeah.
11 Q. Then it talks about you and your sister being placed
12 with foster parents in [REDACTED] 1982 and it says:
13 "There have been no major difficulties during this
14 period although [you] took a little time to settle in at
15 Vale of Leven Academy. I do not anticipate a great deal
16 of work in this case."
17 A. Mm.
18 Q. As far as you're concerned, is it correct that over that
19 period there were no major difficulties?
20 A. At the start -- maybe right at the start, but I think it
21 wasn't long before I was getting into a lot of bother in
22 school.
23 Q. Okay.
24 A. I was --
25 Q. So that was the position at school, but what about the

1 foster placement? You told us that you'd spoken to
2 Mr Beattie quite early on in the placement about not
3 being happy. But that doesn't seem to be covered here.
4 A. I think when I spoke -- I don't think I spoke about --
5 it wasn't -- I think -- "I don't like that school I want
6 to go back to my old school", I think it was more about
7 the foster care surroundings and them, that I didn't
8 want to stay in the house with them.
9 Q. Yeah.
10 A. That's when they said you need to give it longer, you've
11 not given it enough time.
12 Q. Mr Dempster seems to be saying that everything looks
13 fine, he doesn't anticipate a great deal of work in the
14 case.
15 A. So he must have not been told then by Graham Beattie
16 that I'd asked to go back to the home.
17 Q. Can you remember seeing Mr Dempster much when you lived
18 at the --
19 A. A couple of times.
20 Q. If we scroll down a little, please, and we see an entry
21 [REDACTED] 1983, and this is a reference to a home
22 visit:
23 "This had originally been planned as a joint visit
24 with Mr Adam, senior social worker, but on the day he
25 was unable to accompany me. Both girls were present

1 with the [REDACTED] and as far as everyone is concerned
2 there are no problems."

3 Can you remember speaking to the social worker,
4 Mr Dempster, with Mrs [REDACTED] and your sister?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Okay. Then there's another paragraph which begins
7 "advised" and then the next paragraph says:

8 "Apart from occasional minor difficulties at school
9 I do not see that there is a need for close
10 supervision."

11 That seems to have been Mr Dempster's view at the
12 time?

13 A. He obviously must have not known then exactly what was
14 happening then, whatever we've said that they've just
15 not took it on board. And she probably wouldn't have
16 wanted us to be put back in the home because she'd have
17 lost her allowance for the both of us, so she's probably
18 thought, no, there's not any problems in here, but as
19 I say, we were only children, as I say, so who were we
20 to say?

21 Q. I want to have a look at a couple of forms. If we go
22 back to page 1, please, these are forms that Mr and
23 Mrs [REDACTED] had to submit to the Local Authority for
24 reviews of your placement, so they would have given
25 these forms to the social work department and I think

1 you've seen some things that are in your records, but
2 I don't think you've seen these forms until today. Is
3 that right?
4 A. That's right.
5 Q. We see that there's a date of a review, [REDACTED] 1986
6 so I think this would be probably close to the time that
7 you were maybe about leaving the placement, so you
8 turned 18 in 1986, I think.
9 A. Yeah.
10 Q. If we scroll down a little there's reference to contacts
11 with natural family and it says:
12 "Visit sisters every weekend."
13 Then there's leisure activities and I think it's got
14 you and it says "discos", is that something that you
15 did, can you remember?
16 A. I probably went to the odd disco, but I don't see it was
17 an activity. It was -- maybe I'd been to an odd school
18 disco, but then they'd only have been about once year.
19 And all of the discos you would have went to would have
20 been underage, I mean I wasn't supposed to go there.
21 Q. Okay, so that's what she says about you and then about
22 your sister she says that she was playing pool.
23 A. Sorry, I didn't mean so laugh. I just don't know where
24 she played pool.
25 Q. Is that something your sister did?

1 A. But I don't remember.

2 Q. If we go to the top of the next page, page 2, if we look
3 at the question, it's:

4 "Details of incidents of importance since last
5 review/placement including any significant behaviour."
6 Then it's you that's first there and it says:
7 "No change."

8 A. But then that could mean a lot of things. No change as
9 in she's still being misbehaved or no change -- it could
10 be reference to a few things.

11 LADY SMITH: It all depends what the then status quo was as
12 far as you're concerned.

13 A. Yeah, no change --

14 LADY SMITH: If, as you said, you weren't happy, that would
15 have meant you're still not happy.

16 A. Yeah.

17 MS INNES: If we scroll down to the next question, it says:
18 "Report of progress since last review (including
19 reactions and attitude to family contact), relationships
20 with foster home, progress at school/employment,
21 et cetera."
22 Then it says about you:
23 "Working well."

24 A. But who's that with? School? Her? Social work?
25 Working well ... I don't get it.

1 Q. In the next section:
2 "How do you see child's future?"
3 You're the first person mentioned here and it says
4 about you:
5 "I think she will do all right."
6 A. Mm.
7 Q. Any thoughts about that?
8 A. But she didn't really elaborate and say all right at
9 what or "I think" -- I mean because obviously that is to
10 me she didn't really know me. To say, "I think she will
11 do all right", that ... if she'd put, "She will do all
12 right", then ... I just ... mm.
13 Q. Yeah, that might have more meaning perhaps than --
14 A. "I think ..."
15 Q. -- that. As I said a moment ago, I think this is the
16 year that you turned 18, so you might expect something
17 in there perhaps about what were you going to go on to
18 do when you turned 18?
19 A. Yeah.
20 Q. What were you working at, or whatever.
21 A. She never really bothered about what I was wanting to do
22 as a career or what I had in mind or what I was
23 interested in and stuff.
24 Q. Okay. If we go on to page 3, please, this is an earlier
25 one, so a similar type of form and it's [REDACTED] 1984

1 and if we go down a little to "Leisure activities",
2 again it's a bit faint but you're the first person
3 mentioned and it says "discos" and your sister's name is
4 there but there's no reference to any activities that
5 she might be doing.

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. If we go on to the next page, page 4, we see here
8 against you:
9 "Nothing changed."
10 So pretty similar to what we saw --

11 A. Before.

12 Q. -- in 1986. Okay.

13 A. So nothing changed from 1986 until --

14 Q. 1984 to 1986.

15 A. Nothing's changed.

16 Q. Then the next section again, the report of progress
17 since last review, I think we see the answer there is:
18 "Reasonable."
19 Do you think that tells the social work department
20 or other people involved in your care very much about
21 how you're getting on?

22 A. No, you wouldn't get anything from that.

23 Q. Then, "How do you see child's future?"
24 And the answer is:
25 "Don't know."

1 Any thoughts about that?

2 A. Well, she didn't know and neither did I. I don't know.

3 That's what I'm saying. So it just puts the whole

4 picture in place that she just wasn't interested. She

5 just -- just didn't know. Didn't know much.

6 Q. If the social work department were getting forms like

7 that --

8 A. Why did they not ask them to try and break it down a wee

9 bit. What do you mean, "Don't know"? But just to write

10 that ... how do you see my future?

11 (Witness shakes head)

12 Q. I think this is a form, it seems to be for you and your

13 sister, it's about both of you.

14 A. Mm.

15 Q. Can you remember going to any reviews or meetings at the

16 social work department?

17 A. I think I remember going to the Vale one with

18 Jim Dempster, but it says in a lot of my statements that

19 we went for like medicals and stuff, but for reviews and

20 panels I don't recall anything like that.

21 Q. If we can look back at your statement and on page 15 at

22 paragraph 70 you tell us that when you were still at the

23 EQI-EQJ you can remember somebody helping to get

24 supported accommodation for you.

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. Is that where you moved out to when you were 18?

2 A. Yeah, back to Clydebank.

3 Q. Other than the help with getting the accommodation, did

4 you get other support from the Local Authority?

5 A. I just remember a lady was working with me and she'd got

6 a grant and it was to get like stuff for the -- the

7 room. It was like a shared accommodation. And it was

8 just to get like the kind of basic stuff to live and she

9 kind of took me out and kind of got me the bits and bobs

10 and stuff. But she'd be in control of the money,

11 obviously, it was her that got the grant for it.

12 Q. You say that you didn't cope very well on your own?

13 A. (Witness shakes head)

14 I thought I could, but my sister [REDACTED] she was

15 coming up sometimes, because it was right at the

16 shopping centre, so she'd be there doing her shopping

17 and come up at 5 at night and I'd still be sleeping.

18 I had a wee job, I wasn't making it and I think I got

19 a P45. I just turned night into day and I was just ...

20 I think taking drugs and drinking and stuff. So

21 I just -- surviving, but:

22 Q. Other than the contact with your older sister, did you

23 have anybody to turn to for help or support once you'd

24 moved out?

25 A. Kind of really only my sisters, really. Just kind of --

1 as I say, [REDACTED] stayed not far along the road where my
2 flat was, so I just used to go back and forward to her
3 house and then back to the flat.

4 Q. Okay.

5 If we go on to page 16, paragraph 76 you talk about
6 the impact that your experiences have had on you, and in
7 particular your -- thinking of your time with the
8 EQI-EQJ [REDACTED] what effect do you think that had on you?

9 A. I don't know, you wonder why they put their self forward
10 in the first place to take a couple of sisters in.
11 I don't know if that's where maybe the affection thing
12 comes in or -- like we are the kind of family where if
13 somebody comes to try and hug you, we're kind of like
14 a bit -- kind of funny with that. Try to -- I mean
15 I can do stuff, anything for somebody, but I think when
16 it comes to just affection and stuff or saying that
17 I love you or whatever it's hard, because if it's
18 something you're not shown then it's -- how do you kind
19 of carry that on sort of thing? Same as for the care
20 homes. Because if we'd left our mum for nine year olds,
21 then all of the years you have kind out missed out
22 living in a family place and you feel as if you kind of
23 lost your identity along the road somewhere. We were
24 referred to as -- in a lot of the case notes as "the
25 [REDACTED] children". Why not put in our first names?

1 Do you know what I mean? They just ...

2 Q. You were just all grouped together, you weren't

3 individuals?

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. If we move on finally to lessons to be learned, at

6 paragraph 79, what sort of things do you think that we

7 should learn from your experiences, again thinking

8 particularly of your time with the EQI-EQJ ?

9 A. I think obviously the communication was a big part of

10 it. Like when it's stuff getting reviewed or panels,

11 things getting documented, that the way they've

12 documented stuff, like, "Don't know" or -- like

13 obviously I know you've got the disclosures and vetting

14 and all that now, but I mean way back then I don't even

15 know if that was a thing or what. But just so they know

16 they're doing it for the right reasons rather than just

17 looking at it as pound signs, you know what I mean,

18 because it annoys me because it's like when you go by

19 children's homes and people say, oh, that's that place

20 where their kids are, I'm like but their kids didn't ask

21 to be there. Some of their kids are there because

22 there's like a breakdown in the family and that, I mean,

23 because we were just like any normal family in the

24 street until that happened.

25 Q. Yeah.

1 A. We didn't ask to get put into authority. We just --
2 probably a lot more vetting. And I know it is a lot
3 harder now -- you cannot just foster probably the way
4 back then.

5 Q. I think you talk there about there needs to be better
6 training of foster parents perhaps --

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. -- in the way that they deal with children?

9 A. The way they deal with children. I mean when you see
10 these things like Children in Need and you see the
11 foster carers with the children and like that's a nice
12 picture, but I hope it's true because I even tried to
13 lie in the school, I says -- where do you stay in
14 [REDACTED]? I says, "I stay in [REDACTED]", whereabouts?
15 I says, "[REDACTED]". What number? I says, "Number [REDACTED]".
16 She says, "No, you don't". I says, "Aye, I do". She
17 went, "No, you don't". I says, "I just moved in there",
18 and she went, "No, because that's an old couple that is
19 staying there and they always stayed there."

20 And I just thought I need to come clean, don't I?
21 I didn't want to tell anybody. I don't know if it was
22 embarrassment, but I just didn't want to say to anybody
23 I was fostered, because I thought I don't know any of
24 yous in school, so it was like not knowing people, then
25 having to go through all that, and then I think that's

1 probably why at school I was quite always rebellious,
2 I think.

3 I mean she would never pull me up about things at
4 school, because I don't know how much if she cared or
5 she just didn't know. So I thought well do you know
6 what if nobody else is bothering I'm not bothering, so
7 I don't care, that was my attitude.

8 Q. There was an impact then on your education and how you
9 got on at school?

10 A. I think so, aye, I think so. I do regret it now with
11 school. Because I'm the opposite now, I do want to
12 learn and I would like to look -- if I'm interested in
13 something. But school just to me was you went or you
14 didn't and if you didn't want to learn then that was
15 that. But.

16 MS INNES: Well, 'Janet', I've come to the end of my
17 questions for you.

18 There are no applications, my Lady.

19 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
20 questions of 'Janet'?

21 'Janet', that completes all the questions we have
22 for you this afternoon. Thank you so much for engaging
23 with the Inquiry as you have done, both through your
24 written statement, which I'm very conscious of it
25 providing details of your own experiences in care as

1 well and I hope you understand that just at the moment
2 we're focusing on foster care and I know that a lot of
3 your time in childhood was spent elsewhere and it wasn't
4 exactly always happy.

5 A. (Witness nods)

6 LADY SMITH: But thank you for explaining today yourself
7 what we wanted to hear from you in person. It's
8 improved my learning considerably. I'm also sorry
9 you've had to wait five years to come here, but I hope
10 you understand that we have to schedule the subject
11 matters that we're taking in turn through our case
12 studies and we've only this year arrived at foster care.

13 A. Yeah.

14 LADY SMITH: Thank you, and I'm able to let you go and
15 hopefully the sun may still be shining when you get
16 outside.

17 A. Thank you.

18 (The witness withdrew)

19 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes, we could take the afternoon break
20 just now and you have some read-ins ready for after the
21 afternoon break?

22 MS INNES: We do, my Lady, yes.

23 LADY SMITH: Very well, let's do that.

24 (3.00 pm)

25 (A short break))

1 (3.13 pm)

2 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.

3 'Paul' (read)

4 MS RATTRAY: This is a read-in. It's a statement of

5 an applicant who wishes to remain anonymous and has

6 chosen the pseudonym 'Paul'. 'Paul's' statement is at

7 WIT.001.002.5079.

8 'Paul' was in the care of Strathclyde Regional

9 Council. He was in a foster placement with

10 Mrs [REDACTED] in Wishaw from [REDACTED] 1979 until he

11 left care at the age of 19 in 1990.

12 Initially it was the Hamilton social work office of

13 Strathclyde Regional Council who had responsibility for

14 the placement. The case was then transferred to the

15 Wishaw office in 1986. Accordingly, in terms of

16 successor authorities, both South Lanarkshire Council

17 and North Lanarkshire Council have an interest. Records

18 were recovered from North Lanarkshire Council.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

20 MS RATTRAY: "My name is 'Paul'. I was born in 1972. My

21 contact details are known to the Inquiry.

22 I know now that I was born in Bellshill but all

23 I can remember of that time is standing beside an old

24 cabinet with my twin sister. I'm not even sure if

25 that's an actual memory, it's maybe just from seeing

1 an old photo.

2 I have five sisters, one who is about six years
3 older than me, one who is five years older than me, one
4 who is four years older than me, one who is about two
5 years older and then one who is my twin. I also had
6 a brother but he was killed after being run over by
7 a council truck right outside our house when he was five
8 years old.

9 As far as I'm now aware, I don't think my mum and
10 dad could tolerate the pain of my brother being killed.
11 They split up and my father went with another woman not
12 long after. When that happened my sisters and I were
13 put into care and other than my twin I never met my
14 sisters again until I was 18 years old.

15 I think my older sisters were put in a care home in
16 Hamilton somewhere and then went to stay with different
17 aunts. My twin sister and I were sent to Nazareth House
18 at Lasswade near Edinburgh. That was 1975 and we were
19 three years old."

20 From paragraphs 5 to 44, 'Paul' speaks of his
21 experiences in Nazareth House where he suffered abuse.

22 Moving now to paragraph 45 on page 8:

23 "I think I was seven or eight when I left Nazareth
24 House. All I can remember is my twin sister and
25 I getting put in a car by a lady, who I take it was

1 a social worker, I had no idea where we were going or
2 what was happening.

3 All I remember of the journey is meeting a big hay
4 bale lorry on the road somewhere and then arriving at
5 a house. It was only when we arrived that I realised we
6 were getting fostered, although I thought it was only
7 going to be temporary. I have no recollection of being
8 told before that we were going to be fostered or of
9 meeting the foster parents, Mr and Mrs MTD/SPO

10 When we arrived my sister and I were introduced to
11 the MTD/SPO family by the lady that had driven us there.
12 All their children were there and it seemed fine at the
13 time. It felt good to be away from Lasswade.

14 Mr and Mrs MTD/SPO names were MTD and
15 but they wanted my sister and I to call them mum and
16 dad. They a house at in Wishaw along with
17 their own five children.

18 It was a big semi-detached house with a front and
19 back door and four bedrooms. Downstairs was the living
20 room and kitchen and one of the bedrooms where Mr and
21 Mrs MTD/SPO slept. Upstairs was a bathroom and three
22 bedrooms. Outside there was a big garden at the back
23 and front and a fence between the neighbours.

24 was like a war zone. Every Saturday
25 morning an Orange Walk would go by the front of the

1 house and bricks and bottles would get chunked at the
2 house because we were Catholic. There was never any
3 serious damage but it was like a little Ireland.

4 Mr MTD was an alcoholic and yet Mrs was
5 a full-time foster carer. She would be given kids that
6 the social work needed looked after, sometimes newborn
7 babies would be brought to her at midnight.

8 Mr MTD was in and out of prison at Barlinnie
9 a lot of the time. I don't remember him being at home
10 much of the time, but when he was, he was a nasty drunk.
11 He was an alcoholic bully. He was so bad that he would
12 drink methylated spirits and aftershave and hide the
13 bottles around the house. He was never there as
14 a foster parent, it was always Mrs who took care
15 of business.

16 One time Mr MTD pulled a gun on two old women
17 while he was in the front garden and was sent to jail
18 for a long time after that. I'm not sure how long I'd
19 been living there when that happened.

20 While her husband was in jail, Mrs started
21 a relationship with another man and they were together
22 for the rest of the time I stayed at . He was
23 married with children and I'm sure his wife must have
24 known what was going on with Mrs

25 The MTD/SPO MTD John, who was about

1 five years older than me, two other [REDACTED] who were four
2 years older and one year older, and also two daughters
3 who were three years younger and nine years younger.
4 The youngest daughter's dad was Mrs [REDACTED] boyfriend.
5 When my sister and I arrived there was also another
6 foster kid, a boy who was about two years younger than
7 me. He left after about a year, although I don't know
8 why, and then another lad came in to take his place. He
9 was also about two years younger than me.

10 I can't really fault Mrs [REDACTED] for a lot of things,
11 she treated my sister and me pretty much the same as her
12 own children. I would never be able to say that she was
13 a bad foster parent. She must have known that [REDACTED]
14 John and her second older son were abusing my twin
15 sister and me though and she did nothing about it. I'm
16 not sure about the younger son. He was okay with me,
17 but he might have had a part in the abuse of my sister.

18 All the kids slept upstairs. At the top of the
19 stairs was the older boys' room, which was the biggest
20 room. The girls were in one of the other two rooms on
21 the right which were smaller and the younger son and
22 I were in the other on the left.

23 Every day Mrs [REDACTED] woke each of us up and we all
24 had to go straight into the bathroom before breakfast.
25 Then we'd go to school.

1 I had stopped wetting the bed by the time I got to
2 the MTD/SPO , but the lad that was being fostered when
3 my sister and I arrived there was a bed-wetter. He used
4 to get hit by Mr MTD with a leather belt across his
5 bare backside whenever he wet the bed. That just made
6 him wet the bed even more.

7 Eventually they got him a plastic mat with a buzzer
8 on it so that he would wake up if he started to wet the
9 bed and could run to the toilet. Unfortunately this
10 poor boy could sleep through everything and he even
11 slept through the buzzer.

12 Every time he wet the bed, Mr MTD would get us
13 all up and tell us to go downstairs. He would make the
14 boy stand on a wee stool and sing 'I'm a dirty wee stink
15 bag'. After that Mr MTD would slap him across the
16 head and body in front of us all. I felt so bad about
17 it every time I saw his poor wee face.

18 There was only one bathroom and it was hellish with
19 so many of us. Mrs made sure we were clean and
20 we all had to wash at the sink with a flannel and clean
21 our teeth every morning. There was no shower, only
22 a bath, and there were so many of us in there that there
23 were strict times for having a bath.

24 We had to wear a uniform to school and every holiday
25 we'd get a new one. Mrs always bought our

1 clothes at the market in Wishaw but we never got to
2 choose them. She also bought a lot of stuff at charity
3 shops.

4 Often the clothes Mrs [REDACTED] bought us were the
5 ugliest of things that the other kids at school would
6 tease me about. When I was 12 and started working
7 I bought my own clothes rather than wear what Mrs [REDACTED]
8 got for me.

9 We all had to iron our own clothes. I was ironing
10 clothes at seven years old after Mrs [REDACTED] showed me
11 how to do it. I was quite happy to do my own because
12 I could do it better than anyone else anyway.

13 Mrs [REDACTED] fed us well, although because we were
14 kids we were always starving. Breakfast was healthy,
15 we'd have grapefruit and porridge, and for lunch there
16 were always big pots of soup on the go. Most of the
17 meals were healthy. There was always a pantry full of
18 food.

19 After Mr [REDACTED] disappeared to jail we built
20 a breakfast bar where we'd all sit for our meals. We
21 all took turns at setting the table or preparing the
22 vegetables, big bags of tatties or sprouts or whatever.

23 There were strict rules about eating. We were never
24 actually punished, but no matter what was put down we'd
25 have to eat it or it would be put down in front of us

1 for the next meal. At times the soup had been sitting
2 on the stove for three or four days and we had to put
3 vinegar in it to be able to eat it. Sometimes the soup
4 was absolutely disgusting but everybody had to eat it.
5 Mrs [REDACTED] was forever giving us laxatives if we had
6 an upset stomach.

7 We went to the local Catholic schools while we
8 stayed at the MTD/SPO [REDACTED], primary in [REDACTED] and high
9 school in Motherwell after that. I think my sister and
10 I went into primary 4 when we arrived and I remember
11 getting introduced to the teacher, Mrs Jackson.

12 I loved school, I had lots of pals although I was
13 a bit of a ruffian and was always at the rector's office
14 for something I'd done wrong. Every time I got in
15 trouble I had to write a story about what I'd done and
16 why, which was a pretty good punishment. It got me into
17 creative writing.

18 Right across the road from the house was the local
19 Protestant school so whenever we came home there would
20 be fights and bricks and bottles would be thrown at us.

21 When I got into fourth year at the high school
22 I started skipping classes. I'd been to all the classes
23 in the years up to then but I'd had enough by then and
24 by that time I was working. I got my O grade English,
25 but that was it and I left after fourth year. I don't

1 know if I actually had a choice. I think I was expected
2 to leave and go and make money for Mrs [REDACTED]
3 boyfriend.

4 One time Mrs [REDACTED] was brought into the school by
5 the teacher, Mr Dougan. In front of the whole class he
6 said that my sister and I were no longer called by our
7 surname, we were now MTD/SPO because Mrs [REDACTED] had
8 adopted us.

9 I just took that as a fact. Nobody had ever spoken
10 to me about adoption and changing my name and I was
11 embarrassed at the time. I still don't know for sure if
12 I actually was adopted. I don't have any documentation
13 saying that I was."

14 My Lady, just to confirm for the avoidance of doubt
15 in the records there was no adoption.

16 LADY SMITH: No adoption.

17 MS RATTRAY: "Whatever the weather we'd be put outside by
18 Mrs [REDACTED] and told not to come back in until the
19 streetlights were on. It could be pouring with rain and
20 we would be soaked to the skin but we'd still have to
21 stay out. If we were allowed to play inside I spent
22 a lot of my time in the attic playing with my cars.

23 Every Sunday all us kids used to go and visit a man
24 who we knew as grandad. I'm not sure whether he was Mr
25 or Mrs MTD/SPO father. He was a nice man and I would

1 do his garden. He would give me big bags of Woolworths'
2 pick-and-mix sweets.

3 We all had lots of our own toys. I had hundreds of
4 wee matchbox cars that I played with up in the loft.
5 I loved music as well. I'd go to Wishaw market and buy
6 tape cassettes and record music from the radio that I'd
7 play on my Walkman.

8 Birthdays were celebrated but the only one
9 I remember is when I was 15. Mrs [REDACTED] went away on
10 holiday somewhere and left me, the youngest child and
11 the three brothers to stay on our own. I'd asked for
12 a black leather jacket and when she came back from
13 wherever she'd been she gave me this horrible big grey
14 thing.

15 Christmas was all right, we got a lot of presents.
16 It was a traditional Christmas with a big meal and
17 afterwards we'd get to sit round with fat bellies. New
18 Year was good too. We were allowed to stay up for the
19 bells, watch 'Scotch and Wry' and drink a non-alcoholic
20 fruit drink that we'd made.

21 I remember one Christmas when I no longer believed
22 in Santa. I'd wanted a castle and the one I got had
23 a broken turret. It was clearly from a charity shop and
24 there was a letter with it from Santa apologising for
25 the damage. I didn't think much of that.

1 We went for a few holidays while we were at the
2 MTD/SPO I think Mr MTD came on a couple of them too
3 but we never saw him, he was always away drinking.
4 There were two wee caravans in the garden that we would
5 go touring in. I remember going to Tayport and Lake
6 Windermere in those two caravans.

7 We also went to two static caravans in Lanarkshire
8 Caravan Park, which may have been after Mrs
9 became involved with her boyfriend.

10 I don't remember anything much happening when we
11 were away on holiday. We all just spent the time
12 walking and playing in the rain.

13 Healthcare was by the book. We went to the dentist
14 at the school and we got regular injections and blood
15 tests. I had a habit of swallowing buttons and eating
16 paper at primary school, just showing off. I think
17 I was attention seeking, seeing how many buttons I could
18 swallow. I was constantly at the doctor getting seen to
19 for that.

20 The MTD/SPO were staunch Catholics and we had to go
21 to church every Sunday. The MTD/SPO boys were all altar
22 boys and I was asked to be one too but I refused.

23 Mrs went with us at first until she started
24 her relationship with her boyfriend and then she sent us
25 on our own. When that happened we never actually went.

1 We'd spend the money for the collection in the sweet
2 shop and go and play in the swing park for an hour.
3 That went on for a long time.

4 My sister and I have always been close and have
5 always looked out for each other. I've always been very
6 protective of her and she of me. I never saw my other
7 sisters in all the time I was in care and I hardly even
8 knew they existed.

9 My dad was supposed to visit us every Sunday but
10 I think I saw him twice in all the time I was at the
11 MTD/SPO . I think Mrs [REDACTED] put a stop to it around
12 the time she was wanting to adopt us. The next I heard
13 of my dad was when I was 15 and a social worker told me
14 that he had died.

15 Mrs [REDACTED] handed me the phone one day and the
16 social worker just told me straight out that he was
17 dead. I sunk to my knees at the back of the couch and
18 burst out crying. Mrs [REDACTED]'s reaction was to make me
19 pair up a massive basket of socks. I don't know if she
20 was trying to take my mind off what had happened but
21 that was like a punishment to me.

22 Grandad, Mr or Mrs MTD/SPO's father, would come and
23 visit us every so often. Whenever he came I remember
24 him being so angry at Mr and Mrs MTD/SPO although
25 I didn't know why at the time.

1 I remember going to the social work department for
2 panel meetings when I was still at primary school. My
3 sister and I would be taken out of school and always had
4 to sit in the waiting room while there were meetings in
5 the office. Mrs [REDACTED] was there and we'd sit and play
6 with toys while the panel met.

7 I think I was actually in a meeting once or twice,
8 but I don't remember what it was about. I think I'd
9 been badly behaved and they were maybe talking about
10 that. I don't think there were any meetings when I was
11 at high school because I liked it there.

12 The social work never came to see us at home. The
13 only time I would ever see a social worker at home was
14 when they were dropping off a child who Mrs [REDACTED] was
15 to be looking after as an emergency placement. They
16 never spoke to me or asked me how I was.

17 We'd all have chores to do every day. Each of us
18 would take a turn at doing the dishes or peeling the
19 potatoes or whatever. My job was looking after the
20 garden and it was big. At first it was a punishment
21 that Mrs [REDACTED] gave me but I enjoyed it and I took to
22 it. Even at ten years old, I was out digging that
23 garden, planting vegetables. I just wanted to work,
24 anything to be out of the house. I even made a driveway
25 in the back garden when I was just 11 or 12.

1 Every Sunday the bedrooms got torn apart. The
2 wardrobes were emptied and everything had to be folded
3 back and tidied away. Mrs [REDACTED] would tell us that we
4 weren't getting our Sunday breakfast until our room was
5 done.

6 I started working for Mrs [REDACTED]'s boyfriend when
7 I was 12 years old. At first he was doing door-to-door
8 sales until he bought [REDACTED]
9 company. That became [REDACTED] and then he
10 branched out into weddings after he bought
11 a Rolls-Royce. He was a 'Del Boy' character and he
12 taught me a lot.

13 After school I would go round people's doors selling
14 household products. After about six months I started
15 doing quite well but all I got for it was about £40. At
16 the end of the week, if I still had stuff to sell,
17 Mrs [REDACTED] boyfriend would make me go out on
18 a Saturday and a Sunday to get rid of it. Any money
19 I did earn I had to give to Mrs [REDACTED] for digs, even
20 when I was only 13 years old.

21 I was about 16 when Mrs [REDACTED] boyfriend got the
22 [REDACTED] and my sister and I both got jobs [REDACTED]
23 them. I also got involved in the mechanics and helped
24 fix any buses that needed it.

25 I always called Mr and Mrs [REDACTED] MTD/SPO by their first

1 names but I would get a leathering from Mr MTD for
2 not calling them dad and mum. After he was sent to
3 prison I just called her auntie [REDACTED] unless I wanted
4 something. I would call her mum then.

5 When he punished me, Mr MTD would tell me to drop
6 my trousers and hit me several times across the bare
7 backside with a leather waist belt. As I got older
8 I would refuse and tell him where to go when he was
9 drunk. Mrs [REDACTED] never hit us.

10 There were baby alarms in every room so that Mr and
11 Mrs MTD/SPO could hear every word we were saying. One
12 day I said the word 'shitty' and I got such a leathering
13 for that. The younger son always refused to drop his
14 trousers when he was getting a beating so I decided to
15 refuse this time as well. It didn't make any
16 difference, I still got the belt across my backside.

17 When Mr MTD went to jail and Mrs [REDACTED] started
18 her relationship with her boyfriend it was like they
19 were having sex all the time. We children were fully
20 aware of it. They'd have sex during the day while we
21 were all looking through the keyhole.

22 Mrs [REDACTED] would disappear for long periods of time
23 leaving us kids alone to look after ourselves and that's
24 when the abuse from John Deeney, [REDACTED]
25 MTD/SPO [REDACTED] started.

1 John Deeney started anally penetrating me when I was
2 nine years old. It happened four or five times at
3 least, up in the loft of the house. At first he started
4 bribing me with sweets and cigarettes before it
5 progressed and he took me up into the loft.

6 The loft was my play area, my only safe space. The
7 first time it happened I wasn't sure what was going on
8 but I remember being on my hands and knees with my
9 trousers around my knees and I remember the pain.

10 One day he was so forceful that my foot actually
11 went through the ceiling into my sister's bedroom. John
12 took the blame and told his mother that he had done it.
13 He said he'd slipped when he was up in the loft and
14 after that happened Mrs [REDACTED] got flooring put down in
15 the loft.

16 The last time I remember it happening was in the
17 bedroom when I was about 12 or 13. He tied my wrists to
18 both sides of the bottom bunk of the bunk beds and my
19 twin sister walked in on us. John was on his knees
20 behind me and he told her we were playing cowboys and
21 Indians. I don't recall it ever happening after that
22 because by that time I was out working, chapping doors
23 and selling stuff, so I was never in the house.

24 I know now after my sister told me that while this
25 was happening to me with John, every night the [REDACTED]

1 oldest brother was lying in bed beside her. This
2 started when she was nine years old as well, he was
3 touching her up and abusing her. I didn't realise what
4 was happening with her at the time, it was only later as
5 an adult that I found out.

6 I also didn't know until recently that John Deeney
7 had taken my sister's virginity. She told me it
8 happened at the back of one of the [REDACTED] that we were
9 working on. She had just turned 16 at the time and John
10 groomed her into having sex with him.

11 My twin sister actually went to Mrs [REDACTED] and told
12 her about [REDACTED] abusing her but
13 Mrs [REDACTED] didn't believe her. I don't remember my
14 sister telling me at the time that she had reported it
15 to Mrs [REDACTED]. It was only recently that she did.

16 I knew what was happening to me wasn't right but
17 I never felt I could report it. Mrs [REDACTED] must have
18 known what was going on though. There were so many of
19 us in that house that somebody must have known what John
20 and [REDACTED] were doing.

21 Thinking about it now, I believe grandad knew about
22 the abuse, because he was always so angry when he came
23 round. He was always fine with me and I loved going
24 round to his house. John Deeney never went round to his
25 house and I don't remember John being about when grandad

1 came to visit us either. He was always up in his room
2 and I couldn't really say what grandad was like with
3 him.

4 I left when I had just turned 18 and went to stay
5 with grandad. By that time, Mrs [REDACTED] oldest
6 daughter was 14 and pregnant and had left home. My
7 sister was covering up for her and so Mrs [REDACTED] kicked
8 my sister out.

9 When she did, my sister and I were both working on
10 the [REDACTED] and she became friendly with one of the
11 drivers. I think she told this [REDACTED] driver about the
12 abuse that had been going on and he and his wife took
13 her in to live with them.

14 I refused to tell Mrs [REDACTED] where my sister was so
15 she booted me out as well. We had an argument and she
16 ended up hitting me over the head with a mug, cracking
17 it. I'm sure that was on my 18th birthday and I only
18 had contact with Mrs [REDACTED] once after that, to get my
19 savings and my clothes. I never actually saw her then,
20 she just sent it to me.

21 I knew that Mrs [REDACTED] would have been getting paid
22 by the social work department to look after us but it
23 didn't occur to me that the money would have stopped
24 when I turned 18.

25 While I was staying with grandad the younger son got

1 out of jail and came around one day."

2 Sorry, I don't think that's the younger son, I think

3 that's probably a reference to Mr MTD

4 LADY SMITH: Yes, it must be.

5 MS RATTRAY: "I don't know how long I'd been there by then.

6 In front of me and grandad, he pulled out a gun again.

7 My dad had left some money in trust for each of his

8 kids that we were to get when we were 18. The social

9 workers put it in a bank somewhere and I got it as soon

10 as I turned 18. I think it was about £1,500.

11 My sister and I asked the social workers if we could

12 meet our sisters and they got in touch with them. The

13 social workers didn't have much more to do with it, they

14 just gave my sister and I the addresses and phone

15 numbers. One of my older sisters welcomed us with open

16 arms and told us a bit about our family. She told us

17 that dad had been an alcoholic and died of sclerosis of

18 the liver.

19 When we met our older sister, our mum happened to be

20 walking up the street and she was drunk. Our older

21 sister told her who we were and she turned and ran off.

22 After a while I managed to build up a bit of

23 a relationship with my mum and I ended up staying with

24 her for about six months."

25 From paragraphs 121 to 129 'Paul' speaks of his life

1 after care. He worked in various jobs, he drank and
2 took drugs, he became involved in crime and served four
3 prison sentences.

4 Then, when working for Scottish Borders Council,
5 'Paul' decided to tell his boss that he had had
6 a problem with alcohol, which he says was his road to
7 recovery. He was given 12 months off work and went to
8 a rehabilitation clinic. He says he hasn't drunk or
9 taken drugs since.

10 Moving now to paragraph 130 on page 22:

11 "In all aspects I can say that being in care has
12 ruined both my life and my sister's life. I have
13 attempted suicide a couple of times over the years and
14 I still struggle with the thoughts.

15 I hated my mum and dad for a lot of years. I blamed
16 them for me going into care.

17 Being in care changed me drastically. It turned me
18 to addiction. I never touched alcohol until I was 18
19 and the moment I did I was hooked on it. At 21 I knew
20 I was an addict. I was drawn into a life of crime.

21 The minute I got a bit of freedom I turned into
22 a hooligan. I enjoyed being in a group when I became
23 a football casual and I felt that at last I belonged.
24 While I was in care I never felt that I belonged
25 anywhere.

1 I believe that being in care affected my education
2 and my ability to study. I wanted to be a businessman
3 and went to Motherwell College when I was 19 to study
4 bookkeeping and management. I was only there for six
5 months because it was too hard and I couldn't
6 concentrate. I was drinking and smoking all the time
7 and I wasn't able to settle down and study.

8 I've never been able to trust anybody's word and all
9 the relationships I have had have been absolutely toxic.

10 I have never been a practising Catholic since I left
11 care, but I still pray every night and every morning.
12 I think my religion has been the only thing that's kept
13 me going but I just can't face going into a church.

14 I still think about being in care every day. I have
15 nightmares where all I see is John Deeney's face. I can
16 never get that picture out of my mind. I have lived
17 with that for all these years and have learned to deal
18 with it in my own ways.

19 I had to stay strong for my twin sister and that's
20 why I got sober. I couldn't have her living life
21 without me. Years ago when we left care we made a pact
22 that if she goes I go. We were both troubled although
23 we never spoke about [REDACTED] until recently.

24 A few years ago I went to Victim Support and spoke
25 to them about being in care but I came out of that with

1 nothing. I could never have taken the step of speaking
2 to the police.

3 A few months ago I was contacted by the police who
4 told me that my name had come up as staying at Nazareth
5 House in Lasswade. They came round to speak to me and
6 as well as telling them about Nazareth House I told them
7 about my time in foster care. I told them everything
8 about what had happened to me and to my sister and all
9 about John Deeney.

10 My sister and I both gave statements to the police
11 although my sister can't remember much about what
12 happened to her at all. I also told them about the wee
13 boy who had been at the MTD/SPO's when I arrived there
14 but I don't think they managed to find them.

15 Since then I have also been speaking to a liaison
16 person in the Procurator Fiscal's office and I believe
17 it's all going through the courts now. I'm still in
18 contact with a DC Paden from Livingston. I believe that
19 John Deeney has been arrested and is out on bail at the
20 moment and I've been asked to attend a video
21 identification parade.

22 Over the past 17 years I have been getting help from
23 my local mental health and addiction teams, trying to
24 get sober. I have been in about nine detox places over
25 the years.

1 I have attended counselling sessions organised
2 through my GP. I've already had some sessions and still
3 have three more to attend. My counsellor knows
4 everything and it has been very helpful. I don't know
5 if there is any diagnosis of an illness but I'm going to
6 get some trauma therapy next.

7 I have tried to contact the social workers that sent
8 me into care and I have tried to get my records but I've
9 still never got them. Years ago I phoned Wishaw social
10 work department and they phoned back and left a message
11 on my answer machine. I was drinking at the time and
12 I forgot all about it.

13 Not long after I was contacted by the police
14 I contacted Wishaw social work to try again to get my
15 records. They told me to write a letter and send them
16 £10 but instead I used that money to get my birth
17 certificate and a provisional driving licence.

18 More recently I've contacted Birthlink through
19 Future Pathways and they've told me they'll help me get
20 my records.

21 I don't think Mrs [REDACTED] should ever have been
22 allowed to be a foster parent. She had an alcoholic
23 husband and abusive sons.

24 I have since been told by the police and Procurator
25 Fiscal that John Deeney had abused someone that was

1 being fostered by Mrs [REDACTED] before me and that this
2 earlier abuse had been reported. I was told that
3 although it was documented, John Deeney was too young at
4 the time to be prosecuted. If that was the case I don't
5 understand why the social workers let Mrs [REDACTED] foster
6 my sister and me.

7 I think social work should do more and look into
8 foster carers' backgrounds in more detail.

9 I hope all the sufferers of abuse in care get
10 justice. I know from reading the papers that there were
11 many.

12 Even though I thought Mrs [REDACTED] adopted me I never
13 used her surname. I was always my surname from the
14 minute I left the house.

15 My sister and I are still close and live near each
16 other. We still have contact with our other sisters
17 over Facebook but we don't see them much. It is
18 difficult for me to visit them because they drink and
19 they don't understand how hard it is for me. They don't
20 make an effort to come and see my sister or I.

21 The [REDACTED] oldest son of the [REDACTED] MTD/SPO died in
22 a motorbike accident when he was 18.

23 I have no objection to my witness statement being
24 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
25 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

1 true."

2 'Paul' signed his statement on 9 April 2019, I think

3 his statement might suggest it was 2014 but it was in

4 fact 2019.

5 LADY SMITH: 2019?

6 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

7 LADY SMITH: I did wonder.

8 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, I'll finish this read-in with a short

9 reference to records.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

11 MS RATTRAY: Firstly to say that on 19 November 2020 at

12 Glasgow High Court John Deeney was convicted of the

13 indecent assault of 'Paul' on various occasions between

14 23 July 1981 and 21 August 1984. He was sentenced to

15 four years imprisonment. An appeal against conviction

16 was refused on 23 June 2021.

17 In the course of the trial, evidence was led that on

18 various occasions between 22 April 1977 and 13 July 1978

19 John Deeney indecently assaulted another boy who was not

20 a complainer in the trial. That boy was also a foster

21 child in the MTD/SPO household.

22 My Lady, I don't think we need it on the screen but

23 the references for that information is in the bundle at

24 JUS-000000095, which has the details of the charges and

25 the conviction and so forth.

1 The next record which if we could perhaps look at is
2 at CFS-000011318.

3 My Lady, what this document is, I appreciate it
4 appears heavily redacted, but in documents which the
5 Inquiry recovered from Crown Office in relation to the
6 John Deeney prosecution and investigation, there is
7 a list of children which I think was taken from social
8 work records and it's a list of children fostered by the
9 MTD/SPO compiled as at 3 July 1980. That list comprises
10 25 children between 23 December 1976 and 3 July 1980.

11 The list includes 'Paul' and his twin sister. The name
12 of the other boy referred to in the criminal proceedings
13 as having been indecently assaulted also appears on this
14 list.

15 LADY SMITH: How many children in total then over that
16 period, did you say 25?

17 MS RATTRAY: 25 children, and that was up until 3 July 1980
18 and at the time of that list, on 3 July 1980, there were
19 still children in the care of Mrs [REDACTED]

20 LADY SMITH: Gosh. And that was over a four-year -- oh,
21 less, three-and-a-half-year period, 25 children had been
22 fostered by the MTD/SPO Is that right? You said 25
23 children between December 1976 and July 1980?

24 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: Sorry, one last question. Both of the MTD/SPO

1 not just Mrs [REDACTED] were named as being the fosterers,
2 were they, in the records?

3 MS RATTRAY: The records that we have suggest -- sometimes
4 there is reference to Mr and Mrs MTD/SPO but at other
5 times it says simply Mrs [REDACTED]. It's not entirely
6 clear. It would appear that certainly Mrs [REDACTED] was if
7 we were to say the main foster carer.

8 LADY SMITH: Well, from the evidence that you've read so
9 far, sometimes Mr MTD [REDACTED] would be in prison.

10 MS RATTRAY: Yes. And at other times he was in the home.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 MS RATTRAY: Looking at one more record and that's at
13 CFS-000011317, and it's at page 18 of this document.
14 This document is another social work record. It didn't
15 appear in the social work records that we recovered
16 directly from North Lanarkshire Council, but it did
17 appear in social work records which had been recovered
18 at some point in the past by the Crown Office.

19 What this essentially is is that it would appear
20 that this is an investigation that was carried out by
21 the social work department at the time in relation to
22 an anonymous allegation of neglect and abuse of foster
23 children living with Mrs [REDACTED]. It was an allegation
24 that was received by the council on 29 August 1986. So
25 it was during the period that 'Paul' was living there.

1 The allegation -- we won't look at it in huge
2 detail, but the allegation was that foster children were
3 being ill-treated, left unattended, generally received
4 poor quality of care and were regularly and violently
5 chastised by a man -- this is the man referred to in
6 'Paul's' statement as the foster mother's boyfriend --
7 with whom the foster parent was having an affair. It
8 was also alleged that the foster parent has an alcohol
9 problem and was frequently drunk and that the man -- the
10 boyfriend -- subjected her to violence.

11 In response to this, the social work department
12 started first with their investigations at the school
13 and they took the steps of interviewing the children at
14 school before they shared the details of the complaint
15 with Mrs [REDACTED] and so the children, including 'Paul',
16 were interviewed at school. It appears that the
17 children didn't support the allegations -- well,
18 whatever they said -- and what we do know from the date,
19 that this would have been about two years after he
20 stopped being abused by John Deeney. He says in his
21 statement there was a point when he reached about 12 or
22 13 that he stopped being abused by him and that ties in
23 as well with the dates in the charges and in the
24 conviction.

25 LADY SMITH: This allegation is 1986 --

1 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: -- he was born 1972, he remembered the
3 cessation being around then 1982/1983?

4 MS RATTRAY: He said he thought he was about 12 or 13.

5 LADY SMITH: Oh, 12 or 13.

6 MS RATTRAY: In relation to the conviction, the dates in the
7 conviction from when various offences were committed was
8 between July 1981 and August 1984. So by this time he
9 is no longer being abused by John Deeney.

10 But suffice to say that the children didn't say
11 anything that was considered to support the allegations.
12 The allegations were denied by Mrs [REDACTED] and they were
13 denied by the man, who is referred to as the boyfriend
14 in 'Paul's' statement, and it was concluded that there
15 was no evidence to support the allegations and that the
16 letter was essentially malicious.

17 However, social workers did express some concerns
18 about the aspect of the foster parenting and business
19 dealings of the man and they are referred to, their
20 conclusion at page 27 of this document. If we can
21 perhaps just look at page 27.

22 Suffice to say that the full details of the
23 investigation, including the interviews with the
24 children, are set out in this report.

25 If we scroll --

1 LADY SMITH: Sorry, just thinking of anything 'Paul' might
2 have had to say about Mr MTD by 1986 he was that bit
3 older, he'd be 14, and he said in his statement that it
4 got to the stage that he would refuse to cooperate with
5 Mr MTD's beatings.

6 MS RATTRAY: Yes. I think this is the period when Mr MTD
7 was out the house --

8 LADY SMITH: Yes.

9 MS RATTRAY: -- whether in Barlinnie or elsewhere. This is
10 the period during which 'Paul' says that Mrs had
11 taken up with this other man.

12 LADY SMITH: Of course, yes.

13 MS RATTRAY: It's the other man that's being referred to
14 here.

15 LADY SMITH: Mm-hmm.

16 MS RATTRAY: If we scroll to the foot of the page, the
17 bottom half of this page, 8, we can see the conclusion
18 saying that there was no evidence to support any of the
19 allegations made in the letter and we see the letter as
20 being essentially malicious."

21 They go on and discuss various issues but it was
22 suggested that Mrs responded to the allegations
23 by essentially an attack and that was an attack in
24 relation to her perception of social work failings. The
25 social workers say:

1 "We were left with the feeling [which they
2 underline] that Mrs [REDACTED] was trying to hide something
3 and was afraid that the children had divulged the
4 secret. When she realised what the allegations were she
5 was less tense and not as voluble and excitable.
6 Perhaps her secret -- always supposing there is
7 a secret -- is to do with the man's business dealings,
8 fear that the housing department will find out he is
9 operating a business from a Local Authority house, maybe
10 benefits being claimed in addition to ..."

11 In fact reference actually maybe John is claiming
12 benefits in addition to working for this boyfriend,
13 I think that's John Deeney, or avoiding VAT or something
14 to do with the legality of the business.

15 They go on to say:

16 "We saw our remit as an investigation of a child
17 abuse allegation but feel that we should offer some
18 recommendations for the future arising from our brief
19 contact with Mrs [REDACTED] and the foster children.

20 "It may be that the man's status in the house is
21 exactly what he and Mrs [REDACTED] claim ..."

22 And they denied being in a relationship, he was just
23 a friend.

24 "However, he is frequently about the house when the
25 children are present and we feel it would be prudent to

1 check out his character with the Scottish Criminal
2 Records as soon as possible. Perhaps this has already
3 been done.

4 "2. There would be obvious advantages in
5 transferring the case to one social worker as soon as
6 possible. At present Mrs [REDACTED] is able to put up
7 a very skilful smokescreen and play the offices against
8 one another."

9 If we turn over the page these comments continue:

10 "The children seem very settled with Mrs [REDACTED] and
11 it would clearly be in their interest to remain with
12 this family. There were, however, hints that the
13 children may be experiencing difficulties in having the
14 freedom to express their views or challenge
15 Mrs [REDACTED]. While many of the rules set are
16 compatible with good childcare practice and with the
17 welfare of the children, it could be considered that the
18 development of individual personalities and identities
19 takes second place to the concept of family. It came
20 across strongly that Mrs [REDACTED] word is law and that
21 negotiation within this is very limited."

22 There's reference to a child here, and that is
23 'Paul's' twin sister:

24 "... appears to be experiencing some difficulty in
25 this area and perhaps this should be looked at

1 sensitively and in more depth.

2 "The children could perhaps be interviewed on their
3 own more often. It could well be that Mrs [REDACTED]
4 prevents this as far as possible.

5 "Given the new foster care regulations, perhaps
6 Mrs [REDACTED] annual foster parent review should be held
7 as soon as possible. This would be an opportunity to
8 remind her formally of what is required of her as
9 a foster parent. We discussed the foster parent review
10 with Mrs [REDACTED] and suggested that since from now on all
11 foster parents would be reviewed annually it would not
12 be too long before it would be her turn. We also put it
13 to her that the review would be her opportunity to
14 register any complaints she might have about the
15 department.

16 "Although the allegations did not allude to any
17 child having a specific injury, nor there being any
18 indication in the investigation that the children were
19 in anything other than good health, we think it would be
20 prudent to medically examine the foster children in the
21 near future. If the cases are transferred to one worker
22 in the future, this could be done at the point of
23 transfer.

24 "We recommend a meeting between all the social work
25 offices involved with the family as soon as possible."

1 That has been signed off on 8 September 1986. So
2 whatever it was, it was a speedy inquiry following upon
3 the receipt of the letter at the end of August.

4 LADY SMITH: Indeed, yes.

5 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, and that concludes this read-in and
6 the evidence for this week.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

8 On Tuesday we turn to other evidence; is that right?

9 MS RATTRAY: Yes. On Tuesday we will return with oral
10 witnesses and I think the majority are not applicants.

11 LADY SMITH: Yes. Thank you very much indeed.

12 Before I rise for the day, this afternoon and before
13 actually we've had references to foster parents, the
14 EQI-EQJ family, the original surname of the applicant and
15 the MTD/SPO and their children. They're all covered by
16 my general restriction order and can't be identified
17 outside this room.

18 But other than that, I just wish those of you who
19 are still here or still listening a good weekend and
20 I will, as I've said, be back on Tuesday morning.

21 Thank you.

22 (3.57 pm)

23 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on
24 Tuesday, 23 August 2022)

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

'Sarah' (affirmed)	1
Questions from Ms Rattray	3
'Jenny' (affirmed)	74
Questions from Ms Innes	76
'Janet' (affirmed)	111
Questions from Ms Innes	112
'Paul' (read)	147

