

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Wednesday, 24 November 2021

(10.00 am)

LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome to the second day of
our evidential hearings in relation to the Fettes part
of our boarding schools case study. We have a witness
in person, I think, ready to give evidence; is that
right, Mr Brown?

MR BROWN: My Lady, yes, the live witness this morning is
'Robert'.

LADY SMITH: Thank you.

'Robert' (sworn)

LADY SMITH: You'll see that in that red folder there's
a copy of your statement, 'Robert', that I think you'll
be taken to shortly. Your statement will also come up
on the screen in front of you and you might find it
helpful to use that or use the hard copy or use neither,
whatever suits you.

A. Thank you, ma'am.

LADY SMITH: Please make use of it if it's going to be of
some use.

As we go through your evidence, if you have any
questions or queries please do not hesitate to ask
because it's really important that you're comfortable
and don't feel in any difficulty at any time. If you
need a break, that's absolutely fine with me. If it

1 works for you, it works for me, okay?

2 A. Yes, ma'am, thank you.

3 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Mr Brown,

4 he'll take it from there.

5 Mr Brown.

6 Questions from Mr Brown

7 MR BROWN: 'Robert', good morning.

8 A. Morning, sir.

9 Q. Her Ladyship just made reference to the statement and

10 obviously we'll be touching on some of the materials in

11 that statement. Forgive me for a moment, there's

12 a formality we have to go through, which is the

13 reference number of the statement has to be read in,

14 it's WIT.001.001.1232.

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. This is a statement that you gave five years ago

17 in November 2016, as we see from the final page, which

18 is page 18, and you signed on that date and confirmed,

19 as we see from the last paragraph on page 17, that you

20 have no objection to your witness statement being

21 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry and you

22 believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

23 true.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And we would understand that you would have read through

1 the statement before you signed it --

2 A. (Witness nods).

3 Q. -- to ensure it was accurate.

4 A. (Witness nods).

5 Q. That is something I think it's fair to say that you have

6 previous experience of because you were a policeman for

7 a full career?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. In London?

10 A. Yes, ma'am.

11 Q. With the Met?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. So you have dealt with a lot of statements in your time?

14 A. Sadly, yes.

15 Q. Right. One of the things that's striking, because this

16 was five years ago when you were 56, you're now 61,

17 I think we would understand, because obviously we've

18 been dealing with a lot of statements from a lot of

19 different people from different schools, is that I think

20 you were one of the first people to contact the Inquiry

21 going back to 2016. When you became aware that the

22 Inquiry was in existence and was looking for

23 information, was that something that you felt driven to

24 do, there seems to be little hesitation?

25 A. I thought I was probably one of the last because sadly

1 down there we don't get much Scottish news, but I take
2 an interest in matters Scotland and I saw it. I thought
3 that the request had been made quite a long time ago, so
4 I'm quite surprised that you say I was one of the first.

5 Q. Well, for this phase.

6 A. And I did think very carefully before making contact and
7 I thought I might have something useful to contribute,
8 ma'am.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you for doing that.

10 MR BROWN: But I think you set out in paragraph 3 -- or if
11 we start at paragraph 2, you were concerned that what
12 you had to say might be seen as trivial.

13 A. Yes. I don't know verbatim what's been said before
14 today, but from what's been reported in the press, which
15 is clearly not -- it couldn't possibly be the full
16 picture of what happened, I think that I'm probably in
17 division 2 compared to some of the religious
18 establishments that you've looked at and I thought the
19 Inquiry was more steering towards that horrendous side
20 of -- I'll call it schooling or, you know, being brought
21 up in orphanages and so on, rather than a fee-paying
22 prep school originally and then public school.

23 Q. Did you think you were somehow less --

24 A. No, no, no. Not at all. But the -- if I -- just from
25 the top of my head, those poor children suffered abuse;

1 I suffered more mistreatment, I think. You know, you
2 may -- that's how I see it, ma'am.

3 LADY SMITH: 'Robert', it doesn't mean that you're not
4 a valuable witness in this Inquiry.

5 A. No, I understand that.

6 LADY SMITH: And the terms of reference cover all forms of
7 care of children that's residential care, specifically
8 including boarding schools.

9 A. Yes.

10 MR BROWN: Thank you. But you explain a number of reasons
11 why you thought it would be appropriate for you to come
12 forward, and that's in paragraph 3, because what
13 happened to you had, to use your words, "such a profound
14 effect" on you, both as a child but also as an adult.

15 A. Mm-hmm.

16 Q. You also wanted to make clear that you weren't beaten
17 because -- we're going to talk about beatings, plus
18 other things -- because you weren't --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- that didn't happen because you were a bad child or
21 misbehaved a lot --

22 A. No.

23 Q. -- it just happened?

24 A. The main reason that it happened was because we were
25 given homework, which was called prep, and at Duncan

1 House we had to do prep before breakfast and then after
2 tea again and you might have to learn a list of [REDACTED] or
3 [REDACTED] and the teachers who taught us those
4 subjects were prolific beaters of boys, really.

5 Q. Yeah.

6 A. So you only had to get -- I can't give you a precise
7 figure, but let's say less than 60 per cent and you were
8 sent to the -- in the SNR [REDACTED] case, for [REDACTED] to
9 the study, or in the [REDACTED] master's case, to the
10 changing room.

11 Q. Yes, we'll come onto that. But it was to make the point
12 that you weren't --

13 A. Oh no, I -- I think there were very few naughty boys at
14 that school who were beaten for misbehaviour or bad
15 behaviour. It was all to do with whether you had done
16 your prep sufficiently well enough for the teacher
17 concerned.

18 Q. So boys like you who tried to do the right thing and
19 worked hard --

20 A. Still --

21 Q. -- you were still beaten?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Let's go back even further. Your parents were from
24 Scotland originally?

25 A. Yes, yes.

1 Q. But moved to Africa?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. When you were, I think, three? Or almost three?

4 A. Almost three, yes.

5 Q. And the description you give is schooling out in Africa

6 was fine, but your parents obviously wanted the best for

7 you?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And as far as they saw things, the best would be sending

10 you back to Scotland to boarding school?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. You're going to talk about two schools. One is Duncan

13 House, which was a prep school in Moffat and I think may

14 have been known as St Ninian's beforehand and after?

15 A. Yes, yes, that's correct. I think it had a spell being

16 known as Warriston as well. Not to be confused with

17 a completely different school also in Moffat.

18 Q. Okay. But from what you say, the name depended on who

19 owned the school?

20 A. Yes, very much so.

21 Q. But when you were there, it was known as Duncan House?

22 A. Yes, from start to finish, yes.

23 Q. And you went there when you were nine?

24 A. Just short of nine. I think we started on the Friday,

25 always went on the Friday, and I think I was nine on the

1 Tuesday.

2 Q. Did you have any choice in going to Moffat or was it

3 just that's where you were sent?

4 A. No. I don't actually recall us visiting any other

5 schools. There was a very thick book of -- I can't

6 remember if it was British or Scottish boarding schools

7 and public schools and I think that was picked out,

8 I went down to Moffat with my mum, met the delightful

9 headmaster and his wife, and I was there a few weeks

10 later.

11 Q. Tell us about the delightful headmaster and his wife on

12 that first meeting.

13 A. Yes, yes.

14 Q. Your mum was there. Was it all very pleasant?

15 A. Oh, we couldn't have been made more welcome, and

16 I include me in that. We could not have been made more

17 welcome.

18 Q. And did you feel excited as a result, as well as

19 apprehensive?

20 A. Yes. It was going to be a new adventure.

21 Q. When you got there to start proper on the Friday, did

22 your mum travel with you or were you on your own?

23 A. Yes, she took me down and I got into bother on the

24 Saturday morning for talking before lights on. I was

25 just -- it said in the brochure that we were allowed

1 into town, Moffat, and I'd forgotten the -- I'd
2 forgotten something. So I asked, but we weren't, it
3 turned out, allowed into town.

4 Q. Okay. Are you okay?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. We've heard about other boys starting school and there
7 being some effort at induction.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Was there any welcome for new boys and recognition that
10 this might be a pretty profound experience for a small
11 boy leaving home?

12 A. Somebody was appointed to -- I can't quite remember the
13 word, it might come to me later. Somebody was appointed
14 as my guardian, another boy, and the headmaster's wife
15 dismissed him fairly quickly because I think I was
16 found, you know, wandering about a bit lost. It was
17 kind of a bit higgledy-piggledy, the building, so you
18 really needed a guide. So I was like a rudderless ship
19 for a while after he was sacked by the headmaster's
20 wife.

21 Q. All right. So was it really just a process of you
22 finding out --

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. -- as you went along how things operated?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And as you say, it was a bit higgledy-piggledy. I think
2 it had two buildings joined by a bridge --
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. -- and was there constant to and fro between the
5 buildings?
6 A. Yeah, depending on what lesson you were having or the
7 time or ...
8 Q. You set out on page 3 the routine that was carried out
9 at Duncan House. A pretty regulated existence?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Bells ringing which would mark when you had to go
12 somewhere else?
13 A. Yeah, yeah.
14 Q. All right. Sundays, we see in paragraph 19 on page 4,
15 you could write your letter home but they were censored?
16 A. Yes. It wasn't that you could; you did. We had
17 a period after chapel for letter writing. So we wrote.
18 Q. But if the letter wasn't appropriate, it was ripped up,
19 you said?
20 A. Yes. In front of you. And it might be ripped up twice
21 because my form teacher taught [REDACTED] and then they all
22 went to the headmaster for review, let's call it, so
23 I might get past the [REDACTED] master but not make it past
24 the headmaster.
25 Q. So it was a two-stage --

1 A. Yes, a two-stage censorship, and I remember one time
2 I think I put -- I'd been sleeping quite well and that
3 was torn up because my parents might have been worried
4 that previous to that I hadn't been sleeping well.
5 I had to fill -- I was sending a bluey, the airmail
6 letters, I had to fill that, and it was another sentence
7 to put in, so -- you know. And sorry, I didn't write
8 the bluey straight away, I had to do a rough copy first
9 and then I could redo it onto the bluey. Sorry, all
10 a bit --
11 MR BROWN: No, no.
12 LADY SMITH: I remember blue airmail letters. Difficult
13 paper to write on as well, yes.
14 A. Very, with a fountain pen as well.
15 LADY SMITH: Easy to make a mess.
16 MR BROWN: You go on in paragraph 19, finishing:
17 "This of course meant that you simply could not
18 report what was happening in respect of the beatings and
19 how bad things were."
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. Did you ever try to?
22 A. Well, it was pointless.
23 Q. You learnt that very quickly?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. It wouldn't get out?

1 A. No.

2 Q. You then talk, I'm just interested about this, there was
3 a [REDACTED] who was not sympathetic, as you say in
4 paragraph 20:
5 "As far as [REDACTED] was concerned, and whilst it
6 didn't happen to me, it was often the case that she
7 would slap the boys around the face."

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. "On one occasion she gave a boy ... several slaps in
10 quick succession and when ..."

11 Was this a new boy?

12 A. Yes, and this is -- the incident I'm talking about is
13 perhaps in my -- when I'd been already there a year and
14 he'd come in as a slightly older boy.

15 Q. That's what I was going to ask. You've been there
16 a year, you know the system.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. But he was new and went to [REDACTED]?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Do you remember what he went to [REDACTED] about?

21 A. I'm not sure that he -- I don't think he actually went
22 to her. She supervised us washing in the evening before
23 bedtime in a communal washroom and I think there were
24 two baths and she supervised the bath when you were on
25 the rota to have a bath and he must have said something

1 or done something that she didn't like, so he got
2 slapped around the face and head. And she --
3 repeatedly, as was her way. Not just one crack, but
4 many, many slaps.

5 Q. All right. And I think, as you go on to say, this boy
6 immediately -- his immediate response was to go and
7 complain to SNR [REDACTED].

8 A. Yes. Wrong.

9 Q. Wrong?

10 A. Wrong. He was caned.

11 Q. For --

12 A. For complaining about being -- let's talk properly. He
13 complained about being assaulted by [REDACTED] and then was
14 assaulted again, even more severely.

15 Q. Yes. The other thing you say about [REDACTED] is, given her
16 role in bathing the children, she would have seen
17 injuries?

18 A. Yes. There was no -- amongst us, there was no shame in
19 being naked, amongst friends and going from the
20 dormitory into the bathroom, for example, or taking your
21 dressing gown off to go into the bath, so she couldn't
22 have failed to see any bruised buttocks, black -- not
23 black and blue, but black buttocks, because we knew
24 that, you know, person A had clearly been caned that day
25 while it was still red and weals and the next day or two

1 it went black. And the weals -- canes in sections. The
2 weals were such that you could see the joins in the
3 sections of the cane which kind of slightly protrude, if
4 you understand.

5 Q. Yes, the markings were obviously distinct?

6 A. Yes, so you would know whether someone had had the sand
7 shoe, precursor to trainers, or the cane or the whistle.

8 Q. Yeah, we'll come onto that.

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. Because in terms of your statement -- and we don't have
11 to go -- we've read it and we'll read it again -- abuse
12 in the sense of physical violence seems to have been
13 absolutely commonplace.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. From SNR [REDACTED] through the teaching staff --

16 A. (Witness nods).

17 Q. -- and onto the [REDACTED]?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. But also, as we see in paragraph 30, even the
20 [REDACTED] would get involved.

21 A. Yeah. I'm laughing; she didn't have a wheelchair -- her
22 chairs didn't have wheels on it, but she seemed to be
23 capable of retreating from her desk and grabbing you.
24 I'm not looking at my statement. She would spank you as
25 many times as she could whilst saying, "You are a very

1 naughty, naughty little boy", a little quicker than
2 that. You know, there might be seven naughties in the
3 phrase or two or 102. You know, there wasn't ...
4 but ...

5 Q. What role did she have at the school?

6 A. She taught [REDACTED] -- she was the sort of form teacher for
7 the very young boys, which I think were from let's say
8 six and seven, and she did the -- she kind of did the
9 [REDACTED] and ran the [REDACTED], and I used to go to her for
10 [REDACTED]. My [REDACTED] wasn't great -- it's still
11 not great, absolutely pointless going to her [REDACTED]
12 lessons -- and I don't think this is in my statement.
13 My auntie dropped me off at the start of one term and my
14 auntie said to my grandfather, "We're not going to leave
15 [REDACTED] with that alky, are we?" So she was probably the
16 school's consumer of brandy or whisky as well, which may
17 have not helped with her behaviour.

18 Q. Was that something that the boys knew about, she --

19 A. No, I don't -- my cousin told me that that had been said
20 a couple of years ago. They were having a discussion
21 amongst our own family as to whether it would have been
22 better that I'd gone to the local school in Glasgow
23 where they lived and I could have stayed with them, or
24 if I should have gone to Duncan House, but they said
25 that that's what their mum, my auntie, had said: "We're

1 not going to leave CBQ with that alky, are we?"
2 Because she would [REDACTED] on the first day
3 of term [REDACTED] "Oh, come in, how lovely
4 to see you", and ...
5 Q. That was the veneer?
6 A. Yeah, great word, great word.
7 LADY SMITH: Trying to work out this woman's role in the
8 school, was she the same as, say, somebody who taught
9 a class regularly or are you telling me she helped out
10 here and there with, for example, a child who needed
11 some extra [REDACTED] tuition or some extra help in
12 [REDACTED]?
13 A. No, she -- sorry, I'm interrupting you.
14 LADY SMITH: No, go on.
15 A. She was the class teacher and taught the very young boys
16 everything, but she also -- she took me for [REDACTED] as
17 a younger pupil, more simple [REDACTED] and then there was
18 a proper [REDACTED] teacher as your [REDACTED] developed, and she
19 did extra [REDACTED]. But her role was also, if she
20 wasn't in the classroom -- and I think she was almost in
21 the class -- in her classroom full time, but in the
22 evenings or on a Sunday she would do [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED] within the [REDACTED].
24 LADY SMITH: Thank you, I've got the picture.
25 A. As the [REDACTED]

1 MR BROWN: Thank you. And just to understand, I think, as
2 your statement makes plain, when you started, the age
3 range of Duncan House was eight to 13.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. But presumably to drive up numbers, from what you say,
6 the entrance age was lowered to six and that boosted the
7 numbers?

8 A. It did. It seemed to me that somebody within the school
9 discovered bunk beds and some of the dormitories for
10 older boys, let's say 11 upwards, were then fitted out
11 with bunk beds and those single beds could go into much
12 smaller dormitories in the other building for the new --
13 newly recruited much younger boys of six and seven,
14 let's say.

15 Q. And we should understand from what you've said, [REDACTED]
16 [REDACTED] was responsible for the youngest
17 children?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. So the six-year-olds onwards?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And were they treated any differently in terms of
22 punishment?

23 A. No, because when we -- when I went to her for -- when my
24 lower class went to her for [REDACTED], her new even younger
25 boys would be in there and they -- they would also have

1 as previously described for -- I'm going to say for no
2 apparent reason, but to her they'd done something that
3 needed them to be --

4 Q. Spanked.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Repeatedly?

7 A. Yes. Yes.

8 Q. Okay. But talking more generally and thinking about
9 male teachers, I think you obviously mention the
10 SNR [REDACTED], who was the [REDACTED]
11 teacher.

12 A. (Witness nods).

13 Q. And for him, as you've already said, testing was
14 frequent?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And failure of tests, if you didn't achieve a good
17 enough result, would lead to a penalty?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Which in his case could be the cane?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Could be the slipper?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Tennis shoe?

24 A. Tennis shoe, suede shoe, I think at one time he'd run
25 out of canes and he was using a broken hockey stick.

1 And the suede shoe had a leather sole.

2 Q. And in terms of which implement he chose to use, was
3 that just arbitrary or were there different implements
4 used to mark different levels of punishment?

5 A. Perhaps if I could give an example. Fairly early on,
6 I failed my [REDACTED] test, as did another boy, whose name
7 I can tell you but I'll just keep it to myself, and
8 I was number two in the queue and I heard him -- because
9 I was outside the SNR [REDACTED] study door, he got four
10 of the cane. And to make it more kinder on the ears, he
11 would say that he was going to "swish" you, you know, as
12 if that was some sort of lessening of what was going on.

13 Anyway, the poor boy got four and then I was --
14 I was called in and because it was my first time in his
15 study, I got the slipper. And then I had to stand up
16 afterwards and shake hands with him. I don't think we
17 had to say thank you, but this was clearly some kind
18 of -- meant to be some appeasement from us to him for --
19 for what had he just done.

20 If I may just carry on from that story, we were
21 allowed out originally on a couple of Sundays outside of
22 half term and my mum came down, my grandparents, and
23 I was -- I was trying to show my mum that my -- that the
24 laundry was such that my cuffs weren't even ironed
25 properly, and then I said, "And you even get swished

1 with a cane for not knowing your [REDACTED]', and my
2 granny's hair went up at the back, she wore a hat,
3 a lady of that era, her hat almost took off.

4 When they took me back in the afternoon, my mum went
5 to see SNR [REDACTED] and asked about this and he said
6 to her that boys never get swished for not knowing their
7 [REDACTED] and that -- that stayed with my mum
8 because SNR [REDACTED] would never tell
9 a lie.

10 Q. Authority counted?

11 A. Indeed.

12 Q. And wouldn't be dishonest?

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. How did you feel about that?

15 A. The word starts with a B and ends with a D, sir.

16 Q. I think we don't need to go through all the detail,
17 because, as I say, it's there. The [REDACTED] teacher, you
18 mentioned him, was similarly inclined to beat for
19 inadequate performance as he saw it. Not misbehaviour,
20 but just because you weren't meeting the mark as he saw
21 that was required.

22 A. Yes, yes. He favoured the tennis shoe or his hand.

23 Q. And again, just to be clear, thinking of him but then
24 going back briefly to SNR [REDACTED] how many blows
25 would be the norm?

1 A. Blows?

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. So when I first went to the school, his [REDACTED] classroom
4 was in one building and his living accommodation was in
5 the other, so that's why he used the changing room.
6 I can't give you a number because let's say six of us
7 hadn't reached a satisfactory mark, we would be marched
8 down to the changing room and then all made to bend over
9 in kind of an L shape around the -- there were sort of
10 benches and hooks where we hung our games kit, so we
11 would be down the one -- you know, down that side and
12 then along in front of you, ma'am, and he would just go
13 from the front to the back and the back to the front and
14 you knew that your time was ending because rather than
15 getting one or two, you would maybe get six or seven and
16 then told to go upstairs, so we all arrived together and
17 then you all departed when -- when he was -- when he'd
18 satisfied himself. And I suppose if he wasn't
19 particularly keen on an individual -- I'm not saying
20 that would be me -- that poor boy would probably finish
21 up with far more than anyone else.

22 Q. I think you say at paragraph 37 on page 6, the [REDACTED]
23 teacher on one occasion you heard giving about 32 blows
24 with his green flash sand shoe.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And you'd have been about ten at the time, it goes on,
2 over the next page.

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. You once got about 24 of his hand.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You're quite clear it was that level of --

7 A. Yeah, I counted them. On that -- for some reason. You
8 know, if you said to me, "Give me another occasion",
9 I really couldn't tell you the number, but that -- that
10 one stuck in my head. That was a little more excessive
11 than normal.

12 Q. A little more excessive?

13 A. (Witness nods).

14 Q. I think you make it plain that both SNR [REDACTED] and
15 the [REDACTED] master never hit a child on their naked
16 buttocks, it was always over clothes. You say that at
17 paragraph 48.

18 A. Yes, yes.

19 Q. But nonetheless, you saw injured children in the
20 bathrooms?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And when you were changing?

23 A. And the showers and so on.

24 Q. One of the things that comes across from your statement
25 is there were other teachers who didn't beat.

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. But they would have known?

3 A. They -- they couldn't have failed not -- not to know.

4 One -- one, from hearing about it, and two, from seeing

5 it. And I've just -- I don't know if this is in my

6 statement, it's come to me before but it's just come to

7 me now. The [REDACTED] teacher, who also was not such

8 a profuse beater but was one of those people who did,

9 I remember him asking a boy in the showers what had

10 happened to him because his buttocks were in poor --

11 poor condition, and the boy said -- I don't know if it

12 was SNR [REDACTED] or the [REDACTED] master that had done it.

13 So he saw it and -- and chose not to do anything about

14 it. Whether that was to go to the police or speak to

15 SNR [REDACTED] I can't say, but it didn't -- you know,

16 if he did go to SNR [REDACTED] and say, "For goodness

17 sake, boy B's been, you know, severely beaten", it

18 didn't -- it didn't stop, if he did that at all. You

19 know, you would think if somebody said, "No, come on,

20 SNR [REDACTED] that's a bit much", then it would have toned

21 down, but no.

22 Q. So over your school career it was the same?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. I think you give an example, which we don't need to go

25 into because the full details are in the statement, of

1 another teacher coming into a dorm because there was so
2 much noise but the noise was because another teacher had
3 just been beating a pupil?

4 A. Yeah, me.

5 Q. Yes.

6 A. That was the -- the [REDACTED] master was on the third or
7 fourth floor, we were on the third floor, and the
8 ceilings were, you know, very high indeed, and the
9 English master was woken up from the floor underneath by
10 the sound of me being spanked through my pyjamas on the
11 dormitory level and wanted to know what the noise was.
12 "Oh, it was CBV beating CBQ, sir", and that was fine.

13 Q. He just went away?

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. I mean, amongst the boys, what was -- what was the
16 attitude to this discipline?

17 A. I think it was just -- it was the norm, and therefore it
18 sadly wasn't unusual and there was nothing extraordinary
19 about, you know, four of you getting changed in the
20 corner of the changing room or in the dormitory with red
21 or black or welts on your backside. And nobody cried.
22 You -- you sort of -- I'm clearly not a medical person,
23 but I don't know if your nerves can become numb to
24 persistent pain. But we -- nobody, nobody ever cried,
25 that I can remember, during any of these sessions. Now,

1 I could say to you that we didn't want to let them know
2 how much they were hurting us, or maybe we -- I'm sure
3 if you -- maybe you'd cried out, you might have got
4 more. But I would say I became hardened to it and --
5 and didn't cry, probably just to -- not to let them know
6 how much they were -- they were hurting me.

7 MR BROWN: You brought with you a number of items today
8 because obviously you've been thinking about your school
9 career, and I think, my Lady, 'Robert' has brought three
10 photographs and an implement, which I think it might be
11 appropriate to show you the photographs, if I can do
12 that? If I can simply pass them up to you.

13 LADY SMITH: If I could see the photographs, that would be
14 helpful. Thank you. (Handed).

15 Thank you very much.

16 MR BROWN: I think these are classic school photographs of
17 a time where pupils are shiny and clean and smiling for
18 the cameras, blazers, and the staff are there in the
19 front row; is that pretty much it?

20 A. Yes.

21 LADY SMITH: And these are both from Moffat House?

22 A. From Duncan House in Moffat.

23 LADY SMITH: Sorry, Duncan House in Moffat.

24 A. I think the black and white one is from the summer of
25 1969.

1 LADY SMITH: How old were you then?
2 A. Nine and a half. And I think I'm in the -- in the --
3 that's the one where I'm in the shadow.
4 MR BROWN: I think back right.
5 LADY SMITH: Back right.
6 A. Second back row, I think, ma'am, towards the right,
7 there's a boy just behind two boys. That's me.
8 LADY SMITH: I see that. With dark hair?
9 A. Yeah. Yes.
10 LADY SMITH: And a fringe. Yes.
11 A. And the SNR [REDACTED] obviously in the front with [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED] next to him. He's got -- a large man with gown.
13 And to me he seemed a giant of a man. And then
14 slightly, I think, to his right there's a younger
15 teacher in a -- in a dark suit with glasses. That's the
16 [REDACTED] master. [REDACTED] is further beyond him, I think.
17 LADY SMITH: The last adult on that row to his right
18 perhaps?
19 A. I think so, an older lady.
20 LADY SMITH: There? (Indicates).
21 A. Yeah.
22 LADY SMITH: In the centre next to the head, is that [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED]
24 A. [REDACTED] yeah.
25 LADY SMITH: So that would be your third year at the --

1 A. No, first.

2 LADY SMITH: That's your first year at the school, oh, yes,
3 you went there having been elsewhere first.

4 A. The other photo is ...

5 LADY SMITH: And this one with the boys in red blazers?

6 A. Yeah, that's the same school, just from a different
7 angle. I think that's the summer of 1972, so I was 12
8 and a half. The [REDACTED] master has gone, he's been
9 replaced by an older man with a beard.

10 LADY SMITH: Yes.

11 A. Who could actually teach us [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] and not beat
12 it into us.

13 LADY SMITH: Same [REDACTED]?

14 A. Same, same [REDACTED]

15 LADY SMITH: Same SNR [REDACTED] same [REDACTED]

16 A. Yeah.

17 LADY SMITH: Where are you?

18 A. I think as you look at it, I'm on the left standing --
19 row three just behind the seated boys. I've got a --

20 LADY SMITH: Oh yes. Yes. Unsurprisingly, an older version
21 of the boy in the black and white photograph, I can see
22 that. Thank you for sharing those. That helps to put
23 me in the picture, literally in the picture, very much.

24 MR BROWN: There's another photograph, which we'll come to
25 in a moment, but you've also brought, which you and

1 I would understand from previous lives, production.

2 A. Yes.

3 MR BROWN: Which is a thing, and what is the thing you've

4 brought?

5 A. This is my police whistle, ma'am, with a lanyard from

6 the -- I got a job in a prep school. That's my lanyard.

7 SNR at Duncan House had a whistle like this

8 for rugby and if you weren't trying hard enough at

9 rugby, bearing in mind we had no coaching whatsoever,

10 had he a bootlace on his whistle and you would often

11 come back from the games field with that very imprint,

12 at least one imprint, on your buttocks. And for some

13 reason, we weren't allowed to wear underwear with our

14 games shorts, so it was sort of soft canvas material

15 that our shorts were made of, and that was almost

16 against your bare skin then because you had no

17 underpants to give added protection from it. I'm

18 laughing; it's not funny, ma'am.

19 LADY SMITH: Are you telling me that he would use that as

20 an implement for beating?

21 A. Yeah.

22 LADY SMITH: And by having it on a bootlace, he would swing

23 it at boys?

24 A. Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

1 A. I learnt to play rugby at university when somebody
2 started to coach me and tell me how to play rugby, and
3 therefore when I went to this school, just until very
4 recently, I was able to teach boys and girls who
5 couldn't catch or kick or play rugby the technique to do
6 it. But we just, you know ...

7 LADY SMITH: I suppose you used your whistle for a different
8 purpose.

9 A. Yes. This was my -- I used to say this was my loudest
10 whistle, so they knew I was not best pleased. But there
11 was no -- no violence whatsoever, ma'am.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Thank you for showing me that.
13 Mr Brown.

14 MR BROWN: Thank you, my Lady.

15 We've talked just about physical violence from the
16 teachers.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. I think at paragraph 45 you do mention the [REDACTED] teacher
19 on one occasion, after beating you in his bedroom,
20 cuddling you, which at the time you thought was odd.

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. And putting your head close to and just below his
23 midriff.

24 A. So we -- if I may, the background to this is we got
25 holiday work to do and if you didn't do your holiday

1 work, more fool me for not doing it, you had to do it in
2 the term time. But no one was ever punished for not
3 doing their homework because it really fell to your
4 parents during the holidays to kind of make sure that
5 you did and a sheet came out with your school report to
6 say what the holiday work was.

7 But for some reason, for some reason this man
8 decided to beat me on this occasion for not doing my
9 holiday homework, and he said that I wasn't to tell my
10 parents about that particular session, for want of
11 a better word. And then, as you said, he -- he cuddled
12 me or hugged me. He used to wear a kind of a mustard
13 coloured waistcoat all the time and I just remember --
14 I think I actually wept that time, I think, and he took
15 it upon himself to do what I've said in that paragraph.

16 Q. All right. At the time did you think there was
17 anything --

18 A. I was -- I was only ten, you know. On reflection,
19 totally, totally, totally inappropriate is the least
20 offensive word I can think of at the minute. Not -- not
21 right for a grown man to -- your dad can do that to
22 you -- in a non-sexual way, obviously, but nobody else.

23 Q. I think, in fairness to you, and I appreciate we're
24 going back a long way and, as I said to you yesterday,
25 this is not a memory test, you explain on the previous

1 page of your statement, page 7, in fact your mother had
2 written saying, "He hasn't done his holiday homework
3 because we've been in Africa, the President was shot and
4 the army held us up at gunpoint for several hours" and
5 you were rather traumatised by that?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. But notwithstanding that background, he took it upon
8 himself to punish you and then hug you?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. I appreciate you gave this statement five years ago and
11 it would be fair to say over the ensuing five years
12 things have been going round your head and you've found
13 it possible to open up about some other things --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- that happened at Duncan House?

16 A. (Witness nods).

17 Q. Again, I don't wish to in any sense labour it, but put
18 shortly, you've revealed to the Inquiry that from 1970,
19 when you'd be ten, to mid 1972, when you'd be 12, you
20 were regularly sexually abused by three boys, and when
21 you say sexually abused, to use your word, you were
22 bugged?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. They were older boys? Or were they not?

25 A. Yes. All older. What -- I'm not saying what prompted

1 it, but a boy -- an older and bigger boy arrived out of
2 the blue and that's when it started, and there was him
3 and the head of school and another boy who was older
4 than me who was particularly good at -- particularly
5 good at games. You know, had -- was a natural. I don't
6 think they were -- I don't think they were a group, as
7 such, but those -- the three of them would do what we
8 said.

9 Q. And the trigger, from what you just said, was this new
10 bigger boy coming in. Prior to that there'd been no
11 such --

12 A. No. No, I didn't know -- I didn't know that -- that
13 that act was possible prior to that. And the boy who
14 appeared mysteriously disappeared as mysteriously as he
15 had arrived.

16 Q. Where was this taking place? Within the dormitory
17 or ...?

18 A. The dormitory, one particular lavatory which was like
19 a bigger bathroom, just -- just those two places,
20 really, sir.

21 Q. And did it happen often?

22 A. Yeah. Yes.

23 Q. Can you say how often?

24 A. No.

25 Q. No, okay.

1 A. Too -- too often.

2 Q. Too often, all right. Were you the only person that you
3 were aware of that suffered this?

4 A. I -- yes. Or else -- I mean -- and it was -- if we
5 wouldn't talk about being beaten, nobody would certainly
6 talk about that, so I can't -- I can't answer it,
7 really, in all honesty.

8 Q. But I think you've made the point, no one would talk
9 about being beaten, so there was a culture of --

10 A. Nobody's going to say that.

11 Q. No. Do you think the other boys would have been aware
12 of what was being done to you?

13 A. I don't know.

14 Q. But once this boy, to use your words, disappeared, did
15 it stop?

16 A. I think it happened a couple more times and then the
17 head boy told me that he'd kind of reported himself to
18 SNR [REDACTED] for -- for this thing that -- he kind of
19 implied that he was not able to control. But he -- he
20 remained at the school and left me alone. But I was
21 never called to see SNR [REDACTED] to see if I was okay
22 or how I felt about it or -- or anything. It was just
23 never -- it was never mentioned by -- there was no
24 aftercare.

25 Q. No, but you understood from the head boy that he had --

1 A. Confessed.

2 Q. -- confessed to it?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. And whatever else --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- it stopped after that?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. That would be when you were 10 to 12?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. And then I think you had one more year, effectively, you

11 left --

12 A. I left at 13 and a half, yes.

13 Q. In terms of sexualised behaviours between boys, was

14 that -- we've heard, obviously, in boys' schools boys

15 discovering their sexuality, there was no other outlet.

16 Was there any --

17 A. No. We were -- I think we were rather naive. That may

18 just be that -- that may have been that era, that

19 children now are somewhat more aware than we would like,

20 perhaps, but I didn't know what reproduction was at that

21 time.

22 LADY SMITH: Childhood lasted longer.

23 A. Yes.

24 LADY SMITH: There was no internet.

25 A. No.

1 LADY SMITH: And no mobile phones.
2 A. Nothing. Just blueys, ma'am.
3 LADY SMITH: Very little exposure to television.
4 A. (Witness nods).
5 LADY SMITH: And if you did get to watch television, there
6 were very few channels.
7 A. Yeah, and we --
8 LADY SMITH: And quite straightforward things to watch on
9 television, that's all.
10 A. We -- we didn't -- it said in the brochure that we could
11 go into town, we could watch the television. We were
12 allowed to watch War and Peace which starred at the time
13 Anthony Hopkins before he was -- we watched the Prince
14 of Wales investiture and the rugby. But other than
15 that, there was no -- there was a television in the
16 library to show the parents that the boys could --
17 prospective parents that the boys could watch
18 television. Haha.
19 LADY SMITH: And with no disrespect to Moffat, it was
20 probably not a hotbed of excitement.
21 A. No.
22 LADY SMITH: Which may be one of its charms even to this
23 day.
24 A. I'm sure it's a lovely place to live there.
25 MR BROWN: Two more things -- or three more things about

1 Duncan House. Firstly, from what you say, going back to
2 the beatings, they would stop for the last two weeks of
3 term.

4 A. Yes, because when I would get to Africa, we just -- the
5 only thing -- not the only thing to do, that's not
6 correct. You know, swimming was the activity. So at
7 the golf club when we were getting changed, other boys
8 from different schools or -- who'd remain -- been
9 educated locally, would have seen the marks. And, you
10 know, I'd go swimming with my dad in the holidays and
11 latterly down -- down to the beach and just get changed
12 on the beach because it was so quiet in Mombasa that
13 they would have seen -- it's just come to me, towards
14 the end of term we had exams and then we would go
15 through the exam papers. So for about a fortnight
16 before the holidays, there was no -- there was no
17 testing, there was no -- I know an exam's a test, but
18 there was none of the daily tests, so the beatings, for
19 lessons, anyway, there was no -- there was no
20 opportunity for them to -- to beat us because we weren't
21 doing that sort of work. Somebody who perhaps was
22 naughty, yes. But I had -- I could have, you know, got
23 off the plane at Entebbe and whipped my shorts down and
24 said, "Mum and dad, look as this", and there would be
25 nothing to show them, they would have said, "What on

1 earth are you talking about?"

2 Q. The tramlines, to use your words, would have

3 disappeared?

4 A. Had gone, yes.

5 Q. Do you think that was deliberate, or was that just the

6 way the school operated, with exams there would be no

7 need?

8 A. Well, it's an amazing coincidence.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. You know.

11 Q. The second thing is that I think you talked about Moffat

12 with Her Ladyship. You have been back to Duncan House?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Which I think is no longer a school?

15 A. No.

16 Q. What is it now? Is it the Royal Air Force Association

17 home --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Is it Douglas Bader House?

20 A. Yes. I've actually been twice, I'd forgotten. I was

21 driving down and I don't know if something made me go

22 there. The school was left empty for some time, and

23 then I'd heard that the Royal Air Force Association had

24 bought the buildings and I stopped and the warden showed

25 me around and there was -- there was a visitors' book in

1 the dining room, or what had been the dining room, and
2 I was -- I was so excited that the place was being put
3 to good use. But some person had clearly visited before
4 me and he'd written, "You've ruined my childhood", by
5 converting it into flats for retired Air Force
6 personnel, which I'm afraid I found laughable. I was so
7 overjoyed.

8 Q. Did you put your own entry in?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What did you say?

11 A. I think just roughly what I said a couple of minutes
12 ago, "I'm delighted to see the place being put to good
13 use."

14 Q. Yes.

15 A. During Covid we drove up to see my mum as often as we
16 could and I ... I took my son to see it.

17 Q. That must have been hard?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. I think in relation to your son, who's now the same age
20 you would have been when you were there?

21 A. Yeah, he's -- he's just over 12 now.

22 Q. And I think we discussed yesterday when he turned nine,
23 the same age that you were when you went to Duncan
24 House, you found that difficult?

25 A. Yeah, it was a -- it was -- for some reason I had

1 a really -- a really rough time with myself. I guess it
2 was a bit of a flashback to that's when I started. And
3 I expect the same to happen fairly shortly when it's the
4 anniversary of the Fettes --

5 Q. When your son is 13?

6 A. Yes. Yeah.

7 Q. We're almost at Fettes, but you brought a final
8 photograph.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And if I can show Her Ladyship that. This is
11 a photograph of you getting a prize?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. From a gentleman in dark glasses?

14 A. Yes.

15 LADY SMITH: What was the prize?

16 A. I think it was for diligence.

17 LADY SMITH: Well done.

18 A. Thank you, my Lady.

19 LADY SMITH: How old are you?

20 A. 12 and a half.

21 LADY SMITH: Was this coming to the end of your time at
22 Duncan House?

23 A. Yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: Who's presenting the prize?

25 A. The headmaster of Fettes College.

1 LADY SMITH: Who was?
2 A. Anthony Chenevix-Trench.
3 LADY SMITH: Had he given a speech at the end of term
4 prize-giving?
5 A. Yes. It was just -- I recall the prize-giving was
6 towards the end of term, but certainly not the last day,
7 and he was invited down to -- as happened every summer
8 term, a headmaster of the public schools that we were
9 trying to send boys to would come down and present the
10 prizes and make a speech.
11 LADY SMITH: I see.
12 MR BROWN: He's wearing dark glasses. Did you understand
13 why?
14 A. I might be completely wrong, but I understand or
15 I understood that he was a prisoner of war and tortured
16 by the Japanese and they did something awful to -- to
17 one of his eyes, and I think that's why. The -- his
18 glasses -- remembering this is years ago -- had a kind
19 of a yellow tint to them as I remember, but clearly
20 bright lights had a bad effect on his eyesight. Which,
21 you know, I quite understand. That's not --
22 Q. Yeah.
23 LADY SMITH: Thank you for that.
24 MR BROWN: Let's move on to Fettes then.
25 We see on page 11 that you got into Fettes by

1 sitting an exam and having an interview.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Was Fettes a feeder from Duncan House or was there
4 an expectation you'd go to Fettes or was it just one of
5 a number of schools?

6 A. No, I think most boys probably came from Scotland.
7 I did sit an exam to try to go to Oakham School in
8 Rutland, which I did get into, but the logistics of the
9 travel from Glasgow to Rutland weren't so great, so
10 I tried Fettes. We used to -- most people sat the --
11 I don't know if it still exists, the Common Entrance
12 exam, that was a public school exam, but the headmaster,
13 I think, tried to match the type of character you were
14 to any of the Scottish public schools.

15 Q. What did you know of Fettes before you went?

16 A. Nothing. I think my mum and dad had come home from
17 Africa. I think -- I think SNR of Duncan
18 House had -- had a chat with my dad in the dreaded study
19 and recommended Fettes as being the sort of -- the sort
20 of place for me. Bearing in mind he probably thought
21 I was rather wet, weary and wimpy because I was not
22 a rugger star or, you know, all those things. And there
23 I went.

24 Q. Duncan House, as we know from your statement, had
25 perhaps between 60 and 80 boys?

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. And suddenly going into an enormous school by
3 comparison --

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. -- in terms of 400 plus.

6 A. I think so, yes.

7 Q. You went into one of the houses, we would understand.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. There's a house system in operation. Which house did
10 you go into?

11 A. Carrington.

12 Q. Where was that physically, thinking of the main building
13 and buildings around it?

14 A. If I kind of draw a picture for you, as you walk towards
15 the school, the main towered building is across the
16 centre. Carrington is to the left, immediately to the
17 left of the main path -- it's not a drive, the main
18 pathway. There was our house. Two houses to the left
19 of there and two to the right and then one over the back
20 and the main building also had -- it varied from time to
21 time. Sometimes it was one house or sometimes it was
22 an east house and a west house, it just depended on --

23 LADY SMITH: So did Carrington House face north, facing
24 Carrington Road?

25 A. Yes, Carrington Road ran along the front of it, yes.

1 MR BROWN: Was there any element of choice or was that just
2 where you were posted, effectively?

3 A. No, you -- I'm guessing a little bit now, but if, you
4 know, 18 boys left one house to go off to university or
5 whatever they were going to do, they replaced them with
6 18. You know, if only -- sorry, that's not a good
7 example. But you were -- as people left, they were
8 replaced. If you had a brother at the time in
9 a particular house, I think you might have gone to the
10 same house, or if your father or grandfather had been in
11 that particular house, because there's an awful lot of
12 children and grandchildren and great grandchildren --

13 Q. Family tradition is continued?

14 A. Yes, yes.

15 Q. All right. Fettes, as we know, contained a number of
16 houses. Thinking back to you going there in nineteen
17 seventy ...

18 A. Three. September 1973.

19 Q. September 1973. Should we understand houses were pretty
20 autonomous?

21 A. Yes, I -- just before I started, definitely the
22 housemaster, I'm guessing, would have issued guidance to
23 the prefects on -- or they would already know what that
24 particular individual's stance was on things or
25 behaviour or dress codes and so on and so forth. So

1 before I started, the prefects -- let's say the prefects
2 ran the house, with the housemaster as the manager. Not
3 a good word, but if you can follow that.

4 LADY SMITH: So you're talking about the house prefects?

5 A. Yes. And you would have house prefects and two of those
6 house prefects would also be school prefects.

7 MR BROWN: Yes.

8 A. If you were a house prefect, you only had power, with
9 a small P, over your own housemates. If you were
10 a school prefect, you had quite a lot of power over
11 anybody in the school.

12 Q. And you said manager.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Day to day, would it be fair to say you would live your
15 life in the house?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And you would leave the house for chapel?

18 A. Games.

19 Q. Games, lessons, but then you would come back. What
20 about food?

21 A. Food was in the -- food was in the communal dining room,
22 which was a lovely new-ish building, but we also had
23 facilities in the house to make snacks. Toasters and --
24 not toasters, under the grill kind of toast, not
25 electric toasters.

1 Q. So would the house and the way it was managed turn on
2 the individual housemaster, how they wanted it to run,
3 rather than some overall control by the school?

4 A. Yes. And bear in mind that the housemasters were
5 offered that position by the headmaster who surely gave
6 them some sort of pre-post briefing or he'd seen how
7 that particular master would perform and think, oh, he
8 would be a good choice for house X or house Y.

9 Q. But were you aware of distinctions as between houses and
10 how they ran?

11 A. Yes, but for example, we -- we -- the uniform was
12 a house-coloured tie, a sports jacket, I think a grey
13 shirt, I can't quite remember. So we stayed in the
14 school uniform, albeit everybody didn't look the same,
15 whereas in School House, after tea, they could dress how
16 they wanted. That's a kind of poor example.

17 So I suppose the -- each housemaster had his own
18 personality and how he -- sorry, I'm laughing because
19 the term pastoral care came into my head there. That
20 individual would be responsible for our pastoral care,
21 or lack of it.

22 Q. Well, let's look at that, since you've mentioned it.
23 How many housemasters did you have?

24 A. I had two. When I started there was Mr A, and he --
25 I think he'd done it for quite a long time and

1 natural -- nothing untoward, nothing nasty, a new
2 housemaster was appointed. That's a -- if you were
3 doing the job properly, and I'm not suggesting that he
4 wasn't, it's a -- you know, that is a full-on role and
5 they were also teachers of subjects in the day.

6 Q. So it was a heavy burden?

7 A. Oh yeah.

8 Q. But did things change with the second housemaster?

9 A. Yes. Yes, sorry. So Mr A was rather hands-off and
10 I rarely saw him. Mr B was -- and indeed his wife were
11 terribly kind people and not -- not distant at all, and
12 they were interested and they would pick up on if you
13 weren't looking as jolly or as sad as you -- as was your
14 general appearance.

15 Q. All right.

16 A. If you follow.

17 Q. Were they looking out for that, was your feeling?

18 A. I don't think they looked out for it; I think they were
19 just such kind people that they would --

20 Q. They would spot it?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. All right. So in that sense, did the character of the
23 house change significantly?

24 A. Yes. It became more -- became more of a house -- became
25 more of a home than a house.

1 Q. Prior to that, pastoral care, from what you've said,
2 wasn't really high --
3 A. No, no.
4 Q. -- on the agenda?
5 A. I don't ever recall anybody saying, "And how are you
6 today, 'Robert'?" or --
7 Q. Okay.
8 A. "What on earth, has something happened?"
9 Q. Taking on something you said, that you rarely saw the
10 first housemaster, who managed the house day to day
11 then?
12 A. The house prefects, as I said earlier, there were -- two
13 of them would be school prefects. So the head of house
14 and the deputy head of house were generally school
15 prefects as well. And they would also perhaps be
16 influenced by the school prefects from other houses. So
17 the school prefects had a room called the Carlton Club,
18 from the Tory Party, and that was their -- their common
19 room, for want of a better word. So there was clearly
20 ideas being ...
21 Q. Discussed?
22 A. Discussed.
23 Q. Okay. Were you excited to be there and getting away
24 from Duncan House?
25 A. I -- I -- two things, if I may. When the [REDACTED] master

1 left Duncan House, who was the profuse beater, I cried.
2 It may be that people are attracted to their abusers in
3 a sort of odd -- an odd way, I don't know. But I was so
4 glad to leave the place when I did and it didn't really
5 matter to me where I was going. I was just so glad to
6 be leaving Moffat.

7 Q. But having got to Fettes --

8 A. Ha, yeah.

9 Q. -- did that joy last?

10 A. I think I was a bit overwhelmed in the first term. As
11 you've alluded to, the number of people, the enormity of
12 the place. It was a little bit distant with people
13 because we're all new and we kind of really didn't know
14 where that games pitch was or -- you know, there was so
15 much -- it was a village, almost. And there was so much
16 to learn about it. And you weren't to walk on this
17 grass and -- strange, sorry, strange traditional things
18 that now you would say, "Why is that?"

19 Q. Did you feel you fitted in?

20 A. Not then. Not then. I think as I got much older.

21 Q. Why didn't you fit in?

22 A. Well, we -- we come back to the -- we kind of come
23 always, I think, back to the games thing. If somebody
24 had just coached me, I would have -- I would have fitted
25 in, because it kind of revolved around sport and how --

1 what your prowess was at those sort of things, your
2 size, your looks. It was a very -- it was a very
3 critical place.

4 Q. Thinking of you, were you sporty?

5 A. I -- I don't find sport easy. I have to concentrate
6 very hard. But now that I have had coaching, instead of
7 making up the numbers, I could give most people at most
8 things a run for their money. Not brilliant, I was
9 never going to go to the Olympics or anything like that,
10 but with the coaching I got at university from rugby,
11 somebody showed me how to play squash properly a few
12 years ago, I can -- somebody missed an opportunity, if
13 I can blow my own trumpet just for two seconds.

14 Q. Okay. But for all that good, when you were at Fettes,
15 can we take it you weren't sporty --

16 A. No.

17 Q. -- because you didn't know how to play?

18 A. No.

19 Q. You weren't one of the rugby types?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Physically?

22 A. Very slight. Very slight. I remember my mum and dad
23 bought me a new suit, I think it was a 36-inch chest,
24 and the comments were, "You'll never grow into that",
25 and I think now I couldn't even get my arm down the

1 sleeve. It was -- it was -- instead of -- instead of
2 people being kind and looking for a positive, it was
3 like they always had to look for something negative to
4 say.

5 Q. And thinking of you as the pupil who's just joined
6 Fettes, you're tall?

7 A. A bit lanky. One is -- my face wasn't as fat as it is
8 now, I had hair which was probably too long, or -- you
9 know, there'd be something not quite right about it.
10 Just anything to -- we're going down the road of the
11 mocking word?

12 Q. You've mentioned the mocking word. Mocking, obviously,
13 is a word in general use.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. One mocks.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. At Fettes was mocking a term of art that was understood?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. What did it mean?

20 A. It meant repeatedly denigrating somebody for any
21 feature, any feature of their self.

22 Q. That made them different?

23 A. Well, yes and no. Everybody's nose is different, but
24 some noses were open to abuse and others weren't.
25 I just pick that as a feature.

1 Q. And you?

2 A. I had a fairly prominent lower jaw, so any -- any word
3 that you could use the word "chin" within was -- was
4 frequently used. And my -- I was -- I was a very
5 slim -- my mum would say I was a very slim boy, but
6 that's --

7 LADY SMITH: That's evident from the photograph.

8 A. But that became that I was skinny, and skinny kind of
9 suggests malnourished rather than lightly built.

10 LADY SMITH: Thinking of the photograph in which you were
11 receiving your cup at Duncan House shows that you're
12 tall but slim.

13 A. Yes. And one is, as a young person, male or female, if
14 you're tall when you're young, you're generally slim.
15 Just -- that's just how it goes.

16 MR BROWN: But from what you're saying, if there was
17 something you could be denigrated for, you would be.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Can I just be clear, mocking was understood. Did
20 everyone mock everyone else or was it just some were
21 mocked?

22 A. I think some -- some were mocked and some boys were --
23 some boys were good enough to try and -- and they did.
24 Some boys provided me with reassurance. I was kind of
25 trapped in the middle of knowing how awful you felt when

1 you were mocked, and therefore not -- trying not to --
2 I'm not saying I didn't say some things, but
3 certainly --
4 Q. Was there a hierarchy?
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. Where those at the top of the hierarchy were more likely
7 to be doing the mocking?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. Because they were, to use a cliché, an alpha male, might
10 be in the First XV?
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. They had kudos in the school and they would mock?
13 A. Or if you were -- you just needed to be in the A team
14 for your year or your age group. So -- yeah. So what
15 happened was if you -- within your year or your age
16 group, if you were good at rugby, you played in that
17 team. If you weren't, you just did house games. So we
18 had two -- a sort of two-tier system, if I can put it
19 that way. Whereas at the school where I -- the prep
20 school where I was, everybody has -- had and has
21 an equal chance to excel at every sport, if we're going
22 to use the sport thing.
23 Q. So there's a first division and a second division at
24 Fettes?
25 A. Exactly.

1 Q. And if you were in the second division?

2 A. Tough.

3 Q. Were you mocked more?

4 A. Yes, yes.

5 Q. Did that get to a stage -- and, sorry, again, just so we

6 understand, was this regular?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Daily?

9 A. All -- yes. Yes.

10 Q. And did you ever think, "Enough"?

11 A. I did, on two occasions, ma'am, and I regret them. The

12 first was a sporty type who went too far and I finished

13 up punching him in the temple. I was standing and he

14 was sitting on a green sofa, I can remember, and we were

15 allowed to watch the television. I think he was in my

16 seat. And then, in inverted commas, I wasn't allowed to

17 complain or make an adverse comment, so I dealt with

18 that myself. The prefects did nothing. Didn't speak to

19 me, didn't speak to him, didn't make any enquiries as to

20 why.

21 And then later on, another -- I don't think it was

22 the same term, somebody who was particularly large

23 compared to me and sporty, it was a Saturday and he

24 drove me insane, and I mean that because at tea it

25 continued and I hit him in the jaw with a bottle of

1 tomato sauce and he fainted at the sight of his own
2 blood. And again, there was no enquiry as to what had
3 driven a fairly docile individual to resort to doing
4 something as disgusting as that and that's how I feel
5 about that sort of thing.

6 LADY SMITH: Is it right that on neither occasion were you
7 punished?

8 A. No. And how can you use violence to correct somebody
9 who's used violence?

10 LADY SMITH: Do you think you should have been punished?

11 A. I was surprised I didn't get expelled. I had to tell my
12 parents. They spoke to the housemaster about it. And
13 I wasn't -- I wasn't party to what was said, but I think
14 the housemaster understood the two characters. But
15 nobody -- nobody from the school spoke to me about it at
16 all.

17 MR BROWN: These are, by the sounds of it, one would be in
18 the house.

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. But one would be --

21 A. In the school dining room.

22 Q. -- in the school dining room. Were teachers present
23 when these things happened?

24 A. No, because at tea -- the teachers only sat with us at
25 lunchtime in the dining room. They had their own sort

1 LADY SMITH: Are you okay for us to carry on now?

2 A. Yes, of course, ma'am.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

4 Mr Brown, when you're ready.

5 MR BROWN: Thank you, my Lady.

6 I'm sorry, we finished for the break and I said I'd

7 be moving on to teachers but having had time to think

8 about it there's a couple more things I want to talk

9 about in relation to pupils.

10 The first of those is when you arrived at Fettes

11 I think you discovered about fagging?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Did you know fagging took place before you went?

14 A. I think I'd heard of it, but I didn't think it existed

15 there.

16 Q. But would I be right in saying it existed?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And was a significant part of perhaps the first two

19 years of your life at Fettes?

20 A. Yes, certainly the -- I can't quite remember. Certainly

21 the whole of the first year, and perhaps some of the

22 second, I'm not certain.

23 Q. Again, thinking back to what we were talking about

24 before the break about a first division, second

25 division, were the people you were fagging for prefects,

1 first division boys?

2 A. They were in their last year at Fettes, so the upper
3 sixth, I think it was called, so they would all be
4 either a school prefect, a house prefect, or sort of
5 deputy prefects were called backbenchers, as in in the
6 House of Commons, but still had a certain amount of
7 powers as regards discipline within the house. I don't
8 mean disciplining, necessarily, but within house
9 discipline.

10 Q. Yes, being sixth formers --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- they would have some control --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. -- whether official or not?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Backbenchers, political, backbenchers seem to -- or
17 political comment seems to be part of Fettes. We've
18 heard about toilets were known as the House of Commons,
19 House of Lords. Does that ring bells with you?

20 A. Not with me. That might have been another peculiarity
21 to --

22 Q. Another decade?

23 A. -- a different house, but certainly, as I said earlier,
24 the Carlton Club for the school prefects and
25 backbenchers.

1 Q. Right. Just thinking about discipline, and we'll come
2 back to teachers, but pupil-on-pupil discipline, you
3 talked about the house, certainly under the first
4 housemaster being day to day run by the boys. Equally
5 the prefects, you've said that when you transgressed
6 nothing happened. I take it there was discipline by
7 boys, senior boys --

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. -- on younger boys?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Tell us about that.

12 A. So the first thing that comes to mind, so you had to be
13 at breakfast at quarter to eight, I think, on a weekday
14 and a Saturday, so if you left the house late, there was
15 a fine of -- compared to now, a nominal amount. I don't
16 know what happened to the fine money at the end of term.
17 They could give you lines. If a school prefect gave you
18 lines, you had to go to the school office and buy
19 a special sheet of paper and use that rather than if it
20 was a house prefect, it would just be a normal piece of
21 A4 from a folder. If you deliberately wrote with larger
22 writing, so you then managed to get three words on one
23 line rather than the normal person's eight, that would
24 be picked up and so on, and then they could refer you to
25 the housemaster, I guess, if you'd particularly

1 transgressed.

2 Q. These sound understood penalties, if I can put it that
3 way. There were rules, I take it? Or was it
4 unofficial?

5 A. It was certainly officially sanctioned, probably in each
6 house. The funny paper that you had to buy, that was
7 obviously school sanctioned, rather than house
8 sanctioned. I'm trying to think what else you might get
9 a fine for in the house. It might come to me.

10 Q. All right.

11 A. You know, something, for example, not -- let's say games
12 started at 2.30. If you left the house late for games
13 or something similar, that's not particularly ...

14 Q. We've heard that in previous decades there was scope for
15 pupils to beat pupils.

16 A. Yes, yes.

17 Q. Did you ever experience that?

18 A. No. I don't know which headmaster's regime stopped
19 that, but I am aware -- I am aware that it went on
20 before I went to Fettes.

21 Q. Was it discussed?

22 A. I think at Duncan House I was frightened that at Fettes
23 that was possible, not knowing that it had -- was about
24 to be stopped or had been stopped. But one of my peers,
25 his father had gone there and he had been severely

1 beaten by a prefect, and the boy, my peer said his
2 father had broken his squash racquet over the prefect's
3 head as retaliation.

4 Q. Was there any physical punishment by pupils of pupils in
5 your time?

6 A. Yes. The house prefects were able to dispense -- issue
7 you with a cold bath. So the procedure was that you
8 would lie naked on the cold enamel white bath and the
9 cold water tap would be turned on with the plug in. And
10 depending on the -- the mood, I suppose, ma'am, of the
11 person, the prefect turning on the tap, the water either
12 flowed quickly and therefore the cold bath was shorter,
13 or you could almost trickle the water in and therefore
14 the cold bath would last a long time. And I think it
15 had to -- from memory, it had to cover up to your neck.
16 So your whole -- apart from your head, your whole body
17 was in cold water and your body temperature would have
18 already been lowered, having lain on the enamel of the
19 bath.

20 Q. What sort of things would merit a cold bath?

21 A. I -- for the life of me, I can't remember. But we're
22 just going to do one incident, which I can tell you
23 about.

24 Q. Please.

25 A. Foolishly I was not rude but impertinent to a prefect,

1 I think he was a school prefect, and he decided that my
2 peers -- no, I think I refused to participate in the
3 cold bath that was ordered, so he instructed my peers to
4 run the bath and place me in it. And I remember I'm in
5 my pyjamas and dressing gown, I can remember the
6 dressing gown and the type of sort of silky cord that it
7 had, like a rope cord, and when I eventually was allowed
8 out, my hands were so cold that I couldn't undo my
9 dressing gown cord and take my dressing gown and
10 pyjamas, cold, freezing pyjamas off to get into a hot
11 shower to try and restore body temperature. A kindly
12 soul, also from the second division, kindly undid the
13 knotted cord for me.

14 Q. You'd been given a cold bath, but you refused to have
15 it?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. And you'd been given the cold bath in the first place
18 for being --

19 A. Impertinent.

20 Q. -- impertinent to a prefect, and then his response when
21 you said no was to get your peers to put you in a filled
22 cold bath in your pyjamas and dressing gown?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. How often did you have cold baths?

25 A. It was a bit like Duncan House, I tried to temper my

1 adolescent behaviour to avoid this torture. So it --
2 that occasion and one other that I can recall, but
3 not -- not too many. I wasn't a stupid boy.

4 Q. How often did it happen? For the sake of argument, on
5 a weekly basis? Was it a weekly event, or a monthly
6 event?

7 A. No, I would say that somebody transgressed enough for
8 somebody to have one once a week, I would say.

9 Q. Was the housemaster aware of this?

10 A. I don't know. If you ask me my opinion, I would say the
11 first housemaster probably did and the second one would
12 have been mortified if he'd known.

13 Q. He would have stopped it?

14 A. I -- I -- he was of the character, I think, that would
15 have said, "You need to think of some other ..."

16 Q. All right.

17 A. " ... sanction."

18 Q. I think, very briefly, going back to fagging, you didn't
19 enjoy fagging but was that something you would consider
20 abusive?

21 A. I think at the time, and times being what they were, it
22 was a -- it was an unfortunate tradition. If you look
23 at it now, it's abuse. And it stopped before I got to
24 that age or that year, and I am and always have been
25 perfectly capable of cleaning my own shoes and my rugby

1 boots and making my own toast and making my own tea or
2 coffee. I don't need anybody to do that for me.

3 Q. You didn't feel hard done by, not having a fag in due
4 course?

5 A. No. And not even because I'd had to do it.

6 Q. No.

7 A. No. If I'd come later and said, I wish they
8 had fagging, that would be different, but I had no
9 regrets whatsoever that it wasn't provided for me.

10 Q. In terms of looking at the staff and the headmaster, you
11 mentioned that you're still in touch with one teacher,
12 the teacher you spoke positively about who tried to do
13 something about mocking but didn't really get much
14 purchase from what you're saying.

15 A. No.

16 Q. Would the school management, do you think, have been
17 aware of his efforts to try and address it?

18 A. They must have been, because he wasn't -- he wasn't --
19 he wasn't a housemaster and therefore he wasn't part of
20 the hierarchy of the school itself, so therefore he must
21 have had agreement or permission or something to begin
22 the campaign.

23 Q. But it wasn't picked up and run with by the school
24 management?

25 A. No.

1 Q. It fizzled out?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. This is a man you're still in touch with?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And I know, because you told me this yesterday, you

6 urged him to come -- or you'd asked him to perhaps

7 consider coming to speak to the Inquiry?

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. But that's not something he wished to do?

10 A. He didn't wish to do that.

11 Q. That's fine. But just so we can put this in context,

12 you have discussed Fettes with him and he was a teacher

13 at the time you were there?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So some of the information you're aware of comes from

16 this former teacher from the 1970s?

17 A. I don't think I've said anything that's hearsay.

18 I think he's perhaps confirmed or been able to give me

19 the background to some of the things, but if we were --

20 if you said to me have I given any hearsay evidence,

21 ma'am, the answer is no. If I've understood your

22 question correctly, sir.

23 Q. We'll come on, you can perhaps clarify that.

24 You had known of Chenevix-Trench, because he'd given

25 you a prize in your last year at Duncan House.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. When you got to Fettes, did you have any mental picture
3 of the man, other than the one from meeting him in
4 person? Did he have a reputation, in other words?

5 A. I don't know -- I'm not -- I'm not sure when the
6 information I'm about to say came to me. Perhaps in my
7 first terms, and I include the first term in that. I'm
8 kind of half embarrassed to say, ma'am, but there was
9 a rumour that when he was going to cane you, he would
10 bend you over the arm of his sofa and then while he was
11 collecting his cane, or strap, more on that later,
12 perhaps, he would masturbate, but I could only say to
13 you that that must have been, I hope, pure rumour and
14 speculation.

15 Q. But that was current amongst the boys?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. He was there, presumably, at assemblies? That's when
18 you'd see him?

19 A. We mainly saw him at chapel every morning, which I think
20 was at twenty to nine.

21 Q. And from what you saw, what was his condition at twenty
22 to nine for chapel?

23 A. Difficult to say, given the size of the chapel, not
24 enormous. But I used to have him later for Latin.
25 I can remember the classroom that we had, it was an old

1 science lab and the teacher's desk was similar to your
2 own and our benches in the lab were just slightly lower
3 than yours with the gas tap, so in my Latin class there
4 was only four or five of us doing it, the stench of
5 alcohol at 9 o'clock in the morning was overwhelming.

6 Now, in his defence, I should add that he did smoke
7 a pipe, so I'm not saying to you it was only pipe
8 tobacco, the smell of somebody who had been smoking
9 a pipe that was coming across, but at best there was
10 a combination of pipe tobacco and sherry, I would say,
11 which has a particular aroma to it.

12 Q. Again, how many years were you a policeman?

13 A. 31.

14 Q. I take it drink featured --

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. -- professionally in dealing with people who had taken
17 drink?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. And you would learn the difference between one and the
20 other?

21 A. One and the other, yeah.

22 Q. But I think, as you say at paragraph 83, mentioning --
23 this is page 13 -- being taught by Chenevix-Trench
24 Latin, you go on, having talked about the stench that
25 you smelt at 9 o'clock:

1 "I'm led to believe, though didn't hear it myself,
2 that every morning at 8.45, the deputy headmaster would
3 say to Chenevix-Trench, "Good morning Headmaster, are
4 you fit to take chapel? ..."

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Again, was that currency amongst the pupils?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. His drinking was known?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. It couldn't be avoided?

11 A. Yes. It would be impossible -- it would be impossible
12 not -- not to know that. And from -- at the time
13 I didn't know because I was a young lad, but his gait
14 was particularly slow and careful. Now, I know that
15 some people walk slowly to give off presence, but I --
16 from my experience in later years, it was to avoid
17 staggering or falling over or collapsing.

18 Q. You go into detail about a particular teacher who was
19 another house tutor, who disciplined you and this
20 involved you having to bend across his knee to be caned.

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. This followed getting a not-so-good mark in chemistry.
23 That teacher we'll call CBU for today's purposes.

24 A. (Witness nods).

25 Q. This happened on a number of occasions?

1 A. Twice.

2 Q. You found that disturbing, that you were placed over his
3 knee?

4 A. Initially I found it humiliating, and having skilfully
5 avoided the cane at Duncan House, which was a miracle in
6 itself, I think, for a grown man to place a boy of
7 15 over his knee strikes me as, at best, odd behaviour.
8 And then I got the first time six strokes, which we
9 always thought six was the maximum, but about
10 a fortnight later I got a poor mark in chemistry again
11 and the same thing happened and I got eight strokes.

12 Now, I mentioned earlier that we didn't cry in front
13 of teachers. On both those occasions when I got out of
14 his room and away from anybody, I burst into tears from
15 the utter humiliation of what had gone on.

16 Q. What age were you?

17 A. 15.

18 Q. 15. Crying with humiliation as opposed to the pain?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. Because I think we know that you made contact
21 subsequently with that teacher.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And I think the explanation was given, and we'll hear
24 it, that he did so so it would be less painful.

25 A. Yes. His term was it was a half caning. And I'm aware

1 we had -- we had some boys who smoked, and when he --
2 when he dealt with them -- they shouldn't have been
3 smoking. When he dealt with them, he made them put
4 their knees on the seat of the chair and their stomachs
5 that way facing the back, and I understood on one
6 occasion he'd made them put their pyjamas on, because
7 then they wouldn't have trousers and underwear, so for
8 greater infliction of pain.

9 Q. So those were the two episodes with that teacher when
10 you were 15?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. But I think, going back to Chenevix-Trench, you talk
13 about being sent to see him in your second term at
14 Fettes.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. By the same house tutor?

17 A. Well, sort of. Ma'am, my first report, and we've talked
18 about being overwhelmed and new establishment and so on,
19 it wasn't bad but "must try harder" sort of report. And
20 he'd written in my report, which this was not the start
21 they had expected, and when I went back in the Easter
22 term after the -- well, my first holiday, CBU said
23 that I was to report to the headmaster's house, which
24 was called the Lodge, within the main school building at
25 6.30 or something on the Tuesday night. So I was either

1 just short of 14 or just over 14 by days.

2 I remember there was about six of us in the hallway,
3 the entrance hallway, and he was clearly -- had somebody
4 in his office already. And he came out and he sort of
5 shoed the rest of us away into the kitchen where his
6 wife was listening to -- I always get mixed up with
7 this, Radio 3 or 4, the one where they talk, not the
8 classical one.

9 LADY SMITH: Classical's Radio 3, the talking is Radio 4.

10 A. She was listening to Radio 4 in the kitchen, and
11 I didn't really work it out immediately, but he was
12 clearly going to beat the first boy and he didn't want
13 us to hear it, which, you know, compared to Duncan House
14 that was very considerate of him.

15 Anyway, we were called back after a while and I was
16 the next to go in. His -- if you want the detail, I was
17 looking out the window, which would look towards
18 Carrington Road, apart from the curtains were shut, and
19 his desk was at that window and the sofa was to my left
20 and I stood to his right, if you're still with me.

21 So he went through the report and I remember him
22 saying that he thought that SNR [REDACTED] of Duncan
23 House was a sadist.

24 And then he started to rub the back of my right leg
25 through long trousers and my right buttock, and he said

1 he wanted me to think of him as my grandfather.

2 I only ever knew one grandfather. And he never did
3 anything remotely like that.

4 And then he said that he wanted to see me bent over
5 the arm of his sofa, and before I did that, he explained
6 that he gave boys the option of four of the cane, let's
7 say, or eight of the leather dog leash, but you had to
8 remove your trousers and underwear if you chose the dog
9 leash and the more strokes, let's call them.

10 But thankfully, thankfully, he wasn't giving me that
11 option because, for whatever reason, he just -- he just
12 wanted to see what I looked like bent over the arm of
13 his sofa. And that was that. And I pulled myself
14 together and I never got myself in that situation again,
15 of having to go to see him.

16 But when I next saw CBU, it seemed to me that
17 CBU wanted to know far too much detail of the --
18 let's call it the interview. But he didn't really
19 comment on the rights or wrongs or anything of it.

20 Q. Again you've talked about what was common currency, to
21 use my words, amongst the boys. In terms of
22 Chenevix-Trench and beating, were you aware whether
23 beatings by him were regular?

24 A. By the headmaster?

25 Q. Yes.

1 A. They seemed to be. And just from your question, anybody
2 who was sent to him for whatever reason -- a negative
3 reason -- just seemed to get caned. Nobody ever was
4 sent to him for strong words of advice or to ask them
5 to, you know, consider their effects of their behaviour
6 or anything like that. It was -- if you were sent to
7 him, he had predetermined that a caning or the leather
8 strap or the dog leash was the only option for him.

9 Q. Did he have a reputation for causing harm because of his
10 canings?

11 A. I know of one individual who had done something so -- so
12 bad, which really wasn't that bad, and I think he was
13 given 12 strokes of the cane on his bare buttocks, and
14 he had to go to the sanatorium, where there were proper
15 nurses working. But nothing happened -- sorry, nothing
16 was reported or nobody went, "Good God, I must phone the
17 police", or ...

18 Q. Do you remember what his transgression had been?

19 A. I think he got drunk.

20 Q. Was the irony lost on the boys or not?

21 A. Who knows.

22 Q. Okay. You've talked about this child going to the
23 sanatorium because of injuries.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And yet nothing was done.

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. The drinking was regular by Chenevix-Trench, I'm talking
3 about.

4 A. Mm.

5 Q. It was known about?

6 A. It must have been. It couldn't not have been.

7 Q. But he was there for the entire time you were there?

8 A. Yes. I think -- I think I left -- well, I know I left
9 in July 1978. I think he died during the holidays or
10 just at the start of the next term. I think.

11 Q. But nothing, from your perspective, was ever done?

12 A. No. Not that I know of, no.

13 Q. I'm just interested because at paragraph 99 on page 15
14 you say there was a culture at the school to maintain
15 its reputation. Would that be part and parcel, do you
16 think, of what you've just been talking about,
17 a headmaster who drinks and beats? To the point where
18 a pupil wound up in the sanatorium?

19 A. In my opinion, yes. That's not evidence, ma'am, it just
20 has to be my opinion.

21 Q. But you go on to say you know for a fact that two
22 teachers were never dealt with by the police for
23 inappropriate conduct with pupils and were simply
24 allowed to move on.

25 A. Yes. One I'm absolutely certain about.

1 Q. I think, just so we're clear, that's a gentleman who we
2 will call DXM .

3 A. Yes. So DXM -- I think DXM used to take
4 boys, not me, under the gymnasium for what were called
5 breathing exercises, but I think there was only one
6 heavy breather in the room, if you catch my meaning.

7 And then hearsay, if I may, if you'll allow me,
8 the -- sorry, this bit's not hearsay. The master who
9 was taking the breathing exercises with the boys was
10 just allowed to leave quietly. The older boys found,
11 I think [REDACTED] he was at the Open
12 at St Andrews [REDACTED] watching it, because
13 he clearly wasn't at work.

14 But the headmaster -- this is the hearsay part. The
15 headmaster decided to tell the staff, and he told them
16 in the staff common room, which was next to the dining
17 room and the staff eating area, and he said -- I won't
18 do the voice, but he called everybody "my dear" or "my
19 dears", so he was telling the gathered staff, and he
20 said, "I won't go into too much detail", and then
21 proceeded to go into explicit detail. Some of the
22 masters at Fettes were, for the time, for the era,
23 compared to now, led rather sheltered existences and sex
24 was for reproduction, not for man on man or man on boy.

25 Q. And you've been careful to say this is hearsay, but it's

1 hearsay from the teacher who you're still in touch with?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Who was present?

4 A. Yes. And he was aware of the -- nothing wrong with

5 living a fairly sheltered existence, but was aware of

6 who was shocked at what the headmaster was saying and

7 that anybody would do those sorts of things.

8 Q. And I think the same teacher, with whom you're still in

9 touch, as you say in your statement, when you told him

10 about your experience with Chenevix-Trench, his response

11 was?

12 A. "Good God, not you as well." He was kind enough not to

13 tell me who -- who the others were.

14 Q. All right. The second teacher, who you're less certain

15 about, was that sexual misconduct?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. With boys?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. All right. And that person also just left the school?

20 A. I'm not so sure that his role wasn't reduced.

21 Q. All right.

22 A. And that, if that is correct, that would fit into

23 protecting the reputation.

24 Q. Was this discussed by the boys?

25 A. I don't -- I don't think that individual's

1 transgressions were discussed. But the other man that
2 we referred to as DXM was -- a closed
3 establishment, it was widely -- widely discussed.

4 Q. He was a known quantity to the boys?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Someone to avoid?

7 A. Well, you -- you couldn't avoid him because if you were
8 doing the subject that he taught, you would be in
9 a smaller area than we are in a classroom, and, you
10 know, he would also -- nobody -- no master at the school
11 only taught their subject. There were evening
12 activities, afterschool activities. I just use
13 an example. Say you were doing your Duke of Edinburghs,
14 there would be weekends and longer weekends away. There
15 were cadet camps. I'm not sure which particular things
16 he was associated with. Nothing that I was doing,
17 thankfully.

18 Q. But there would be opportunities --

19 A. Yes. God, yes. Sorry. Gosh, yes.

20 Q. Was there the same culture of not telling in Fettes at
21 you described at Duncan House?

22 A. Yes. Yes. I don't know -- I don't know of anybody
23 who -- who would have told their parents and then left
24 the school, for example, because -- because of
25 something. I can't -- can't remember anybody.

1 Q. And, thinking of your parents, was it the same problem
2 you alluded to before: authority would be accepted as --
3 A. Slightly different with this. Mr Chenevix-Trench was
4 a Japanese prisoner of war and an Officer in the Royal
5 Artillery, and they tortured him. And he wouldn't do
6 such things, was my mother's opinion.
7 Q. The idea that he might have been traumatised --
8 A. Yes, was --
9 Q. -- and behave differently --
10 A. Why -- I guess why would somebody who'd suffered like
11 that pass on that suffering?
12 Q. Did things change after his death?
13 A. I think that within the country the -- the -- the
14 government was -- the UK government, certainly, not as
15 much as the Scottish government, was trying to reduce
16 corporal punishment across the board, particularly in
17 schools, and I think that one of the headmasters shortly
18 after Chenevix-Trench's demise introduced a book and
19 I guess -- not that there was a league table of beaters,
20 but hopefully somebody said, you know, "You're doing
21 twice as many as anybody else", along those lines.
22 Q. It's simply you talked in terms of Carrington House, the
23 mood changed with a new housemaster?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. Who seemed to be actually interested in pastoral work.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Did the same cultural shift follow the new headmaster
3 post Chenevix-Trench, was there a similar change?

4 A. I think so, and I can't remember where I read it, but
5 Fettes had -- in that era, a poor reputation for
6 pastoral care. So hopefully the governors, when they
7 interviewed candidates, at least one of the questions
8 was down, "What's your view on pastoral care?" or, "How
9 can we improve pastoral care in a boys' ..." well, by
10 then it was mixed, almost mixed -- "in a mixed
11 establishment?"

12 Q. Did you ever see the governors?

13 A. No. I know on Founders' Day they would turn up and sit
14 at the sort of top table, if you like, but I couldn't
15 name them or -- no governor came to the house -- our
16 house, certainly, School House, to --

17 Q. To talk to boys?

18 A. To talk to the boys or to do an inspection or -- no.
19 No.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. Sorry, that was a very long answer for "no".

22 Q. It's quite all right.

23 You left Fettes, and I think from what you said, as
24 time passed, did school become easier for you?

25 A. I left Fettes at 18, so I didn't -- I didn't go to

1 another school.

2 Q. No, no, but within Fettes, as you got to the top of the
3 tree, as it were?

4 A. Ah, sorry, yes.

5 Q. Did the mockings become less, for example?

6 A. Yes, but that -- that dreadful incident where I used the
7 bottle, that was in -- in upper school. So no, no, it
8 didn't.

9 Q. When you say upper school, what age were you?

10 A. I was over 16 and a half because I'd sat my GCSEs at 16,
11 so probably I was 17 when I did that. Again, I'm not
12 proud.

13 LADY SMITH: So that would have been the lower sixth year?

14 A. Yes, yes, my Lady.

15 MR BROWN: But thereafter, you went on, as you told us, and
16 had a full service career with the police.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Achieving rank and --

19 A. (Witness nods).

20 Q. -- gravity of roles?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Which we needn't go into. You said at the very
23 beginning of your statement and confirmed today that
24 your experiences at both schools has affected your life.
25 How so?

1 A. (Pause). I -- I don't know what sort of person I --
2 I don't know what sort of person I might have been had
3 I not experienced those things. (Pause).
4 My wife tells me that I shout out in the night and
5 she kindly wakes me. And one of two things is either
6 happening. I'm either about to be beaten by the people
7 we've talked about or I'm about to choke the person who
8 was -- who beat me, or the people who beat me. I'm
9 disarmed by compliments. I rarely do eye contact. And
10 I know I'm doing it now, but I have trouble showing
11 emotion. And I've got another five things here, but
12 I think you get the picture.
13 I have two positives. I hope I know how to behave.
14 And I don't usually complain.
15 LADY SMITH: That, of course, can be double-edged.
16 A. Yeah.
17 LADY SMITH: Sometimes making a complaint is entirely
18 justified and the right thing to do.
19 A. Yes. Yes, I know that, but I was more meaning if you
20 kept me waiting for an hour, which I know you wouldn't,
21 I would not complain. Poor service is another thing,
22 but the example I've given you is ... a good one.
23 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
24 MR BROWN: There's still a lot of anger?
25 A. In the night, there's rage, but I'm not -- I'm not

1 angry. I'm not -- you know, in the day. In the day,
2 I'm not -- I don't walk around with, you know, head in
3 hands or -- I just get on with it.

4 Q. Yes.

5 A. I don't complain. But when -- I know when I was
6 shouting because I wake myself up before my wife wakes
7 me.

8 Q. But from what you're saying, there's rage, to use your
9 word.

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. But there's also fear?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. 50 years after the event?

14 A. Yeah.

15 Q. And as you've told us, on your own son's 9th birthday,
16 that was a trigger and you expect his 13th, when you
17 started at Fettes, to be a trigger for you again?

18 A. Yeah. But not a -- you know, not -- this is something
19 I'm aware of. I don't need to say to my wife, "We're
20 getting near the time". Nothing's going to happen to my
21 son or, you know, I'm not going to go to his school and
22 cause a fuss or anything. It's just something that
23 I just have to -- have to manage.

24 Q. Yes.

25 A. Personally.

1 Q. I was coming on to the school, though, because, as you
2 said, holding a whistle, you now, having retired from
3 the police, work and have worked in schools teaching the
4 children who were like you, who couldn't or didn't have
5 ball skills --

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. -- those skills?

8 A. Yes. A prep school -- I thought I'd covered it, but
9 my -- I managed to get -- when I left the police, we
10 swapped roles, so I was the house husband and my wife
11 could earn more than me, she did the work and I looked
12 after our son. When he started school full time, just
13 by utter coincidence, there was a vacancy in the
14 kindergarten for a lady on maternity leave, and
15 I managed to get that role, so I was full time looking
16 after kindergarten. The kindergarten cop, they called
17 me. And then the lady that ran the nursery, witnessed
18 the effect of a man with the young children, so she used
19 to get me over into the nursery at 8.30, at drop-off
20 time, because for some reason an air of calmness
21 descended more quickly from the tearful parents and the
22 tearful -- even more tearful children being left in the
23 nursery from age 3 upwards. So a positive from my
24 experience. The female teachers were touchy-feely and
25 I was a bit more -- not harshly, but very kindly,

1 "Right, let's get the train set out, let's do
2 something", just to distract them.

3 And then the lady came back from maternity leave --
4 sorry, I'm waffling -- and they asked me to stay on and
5 do games, which I was very happy to do for the reasons
6 you've just said, that the other games teachers, male
7 and female, boys and girls, they would send them to me,
8 we would go to a corner of the games field and I would
9 tell them -- because there's a technique to everything.
10 Some people have the technique, some people don't. So
11 catch a ball, throw a ball, kick a ball, don't be
12 frightened of a rugby ball. You know, it behaves in
13 an odd way when it bounces. And all those things.

14 I hope that -- just so that they could enjoy their
15 compulsory games sessions in the afternoon.

16 Anyway, my son left that school, his new school's
17 too far away, so now I'm doing nasal flu sprays at
18 schools where I live, the county where I live, and
19 again, if I'm on admin and ushering the children in,
20 I can see straight away who is fearful, nervous and
21 whatever, so they get slightly more time than the ones
22 that are confident.

23 So out of evil comes something.

24 Q. Are you looking out for the second division?

25 A. Yes. Hope so.

1 MR BROWN: 'Robert', thank you very much indeed. Is there
2 anything else you would wish to say?

3 A. I just -- I had a thought last night. I don't think we
4 touched on it. Why did I not speak out? But all those
5 people relied on us never saying anything, and that's
6 what predatory -- whatever their predatory behaviour is,
7 they rely and depend on the victim's silence. And now
8 we're relying on, from safeguarding, everybody talking,
9 saying, "That's not right", and then if I tell you,
10 I then ask you what you did about what I told you about,
11 so checks and balances. Sadly lacking, but there we
12 are.

13 Q. Different world now?

14 A. Mm.

15 Q. Openness?

16 A. Yeah.

17 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
18 questions for 'Robert'?

19 'Robert', those are all the questions we have for
20 you. Thank you so much for your particular engagement
21 with the Inquiry, which has had a long history already,
22 you having first come to us in 2016. I'm really
23 grateful for your having done so and having lived with
24 the prospect of this case study coming forward, as it
25 now has done, you've added considerable value to my

1 learning.

2 A. Thank you, ma'am.

3 LADY SMITH: And I'm really grateful to you for that.

4 A. Thank you.

5 LADY SMITH: I know it's not been easy, but you've now got

6 half a day ahead that I hope you can put to more

7 pleasurable use than talking about things in the past

8 that have been so difficult for you. Thank you for

9 that.

10 A. Ma'am, and thank you to everybody here for support,

11 assistance, praise, and you too. Everybody. Thank you.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you. I'm now able to let you go.

13 (The witness withdrew)

14 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

15 MR BROWN: My Lady, as your Ladyship is aware, there's quite

16 a lot of read-ins, many of them are very short so

17 perhaps we could use the 15 minutes for Ms Bennie to

18 make a start on some.

19 LADY SMITH: Yes, absolutely. Let's move onto that if

20 Ms Bennie is ready.

21 MR BROWN: And if I may, I will withdraw and just have a

22 word.

23 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

24 MS BENNIE: Thank you, my Lady. The first read-in bears the

25 reference WIT-1-000000488.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 'Colin' (read)

3 MS BENNIE: My Lady, this witness wishes to remain anonymous
4 and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Colin':

5 "My name is 'Colin', my year of birth is 1948.

6 I qualified with a degree at Oxford University then
7 carried on at Oxford and did a Certificate in Education.
8 Fettes College was my first job where I worked for
9 16 years. I then moved to work in Switzerland for four
10 years then an international school in the Netherlands.
11 This only lasted a year as the backers withdrew finance
12 and it went bankrupt. I then moved to Norfolk where
13 I continued teaching. At the age of 60 I took the
14 option to go part-time and at 65 I retired.

15 Employment with Fettes College.

16 When I was doing my Certificate in Education, Oxford
17 University set me up to do one term at a school in North
18 London. One of the chaps working at the school came
19 from Edinburgh and I became quite friendly with him.
20 I learned about the job at Fettes College so applied
21 because I knew that they would pay my travelling
22 expenses so I could use it as an excuse to come and
23 visit him. I had one interview with SNR [REDACTED]
24 SNR FNP [REDACTED] and a few days later I was offered
25 the job. I just sort of drifted into it. I quoted one

1 referee who was the teacher in the Education Department
2 at Oxford. I have no idea if anyone ever contacted him.

3 I started at Fettes College in 1970 as an ordinary
4 teacher. I was 22 years of age and I was straight out
5 of university. I remained in that post for 16 years,
6 until I left in 1986. The chap who became the head of
7 department was around a year older than me and he spent
8 his entire career at Fettes, so there was little chance
9 for me to progress in the department. There was no
10 probationary period when I started. When I arrived,
11 I was just given a piece of paper with a list of topics
12 to teach and got on with it.

13 I don't recall ever getting any staff training at
14 Fettes in relation to my position as a teacher. I had
15 to hit the road running, as they say. No one sat in any
16 of my classes to appraise me or to give me any guidance
17 or support. Teachers rarely went into other teachers'
18 classrooms.

19 I had no involvement at all in policy in relation to
20 the care of the children at the school. The
21 housemasters used to have a meeting but I can't say if
22 the headmaster was present. I assume at these meetings
23 decisions were made but whatever was discussed never
24 made its way down to me. Part of my job was wandering
25 around getting to know the boys in the house but I was

1 never allowed to tell them what they could or couldn't
2 do.

3 I had absolutely no involvement in the strategic
4 planning at Fettes.

5 I was never in charge of or responsible for the
6 recruitment of other staff.

7 I was never involved in the training of any staff
8 and I don't remember ever receiving any training when
9 I was there.

10 I went to Fettes when I was very young and I never
11 questioned what training the existing teachers had or
12 how they learned what to do. I just assumed that they
13 knew what they were doing.

14 I was not responsible for any staff so I was never
15 involved in the appraisal or evaluation of other staff.
16 I didn't really have any formal chats with my head of
17 department. I would however see him regularly in the
18 department and we had frequent chats but in my 16 years
19 at Fettes, I never received any formal appraisal or got
20 any feedback about my performance. I am not aware of
21 anyone getting an appraisal.

22 There were three different headmasters during my
23 time at Fettes. There was never a declaration from the
24 headmaster saying who he was and that he wanted things
25 to be done differently.

1 Living arrangements.

2 There were seven houses at Fettes where the boys
3 lived. Each house had a housemaster and a live-in
4 tutor. The boys were age 13 to 18, although there were
5 some pupils there up to 19 who stayed on to prepare for
6 the entrance exams to Oxford and Cambridge Universities.

7 When I started at Fettes, all the pupils were boys
8 and all were boarders. After my first year, girls were
9 admitted. That first year, one brave girl came to the
10 school as a day pupil. The year after, there were
11 12 girls but they didn't board. They lived off campus
12 locally. Girls tended to just come for the sixth year,
13 but that did change at some point and it became fully
14 co-educational. I think they started to take girls
15 because the school had financial problems and there
16 weren't enough boys. I was the [REDACTED] for the
17 girls. This meant that they came round, usually four at
18 a time, for a coffee and a chat with me after lunch.
19 The feedback I got later was that they hated it. In
20 retrospect, hated is a bit strong. What I was trying to
21 convey was that they did not seem to think that my
22 coffee meetings were interesting. I think they attended
23 out of duty, rather than for pleasure. The meetings
24 were not my initiative - the housemaster had asked me to
25 undertake them. They never gave me any concerns or

1 disclosed any issues to me.

2 I lived in Carrington House as a tutor the entire
3 time I was at Fettes. There was a door connecting my
4 quarters with the rest of the house where the boys
5 lived. The boys had direct access to my quarters.
6 There was a door between the dormitory region and
7 a passageway with doors directly into my sitting room,
8 bedroom and bathroom. None of these doors was lockable,
9 apart from the usually facility to lock the bathroom
10 door when it was occupied. The boys had their own front
11 door to enter and leave the house.

12 Carrington House had about 60 boys living there.
13 All the other houses would have had similar numbers. It
14 was very rare for any other member of staff to go into
15 someone else's house. I think there was an unwritten
16 rule for this. If they did, they would usually go
17 through the housemaster. Even if it was to speak to
18 a particular boy, they would always seek the
19 housemaster's permission.

20 Once a week I was in charge of putting the children
21 to bed to give the housemaster a night off. There was
22 a matron on duty in the house, and usually the
23 housemaster and his wife would be in their part of the
24 house. If another member of staff was on duty, I would
25 often be in my room too, but nearly always only one

1 member of staff would actually see the boys to bed. One
2 day a week I also gave out pocket money to the boys,
3 which they had to sign for.

4 Culture within Fettes College.

5 Like nearly all the teachers, I became involved in
6 sports. Sports was a very big thing at Fettes. Rugby
7 was the main sport in the winter and cricket in the
8 summer. They also had squash clubs and fencing. I was
9 responsible for [REDACTED] and
10 also for a while [REDACTED] I took pupils on skiing
11 trips, whenever I could, to Glenshee, [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED] and went to the Trossachs almost every
13 second week. These were day trips and not overnights.
14 We travelled early on the Sunday morning and came back
15 that evening. Sometimes I used to open up the swimming
16 pool in the morning so the boys could have a swim before
17 breakfast. I would remain and supervise them. I think
18 the idea behind having so much sport available was to
19 keep the boys busy. I always found the children to be
20 pleasant, polite and friendly.

21 The junior boys would be given the task of cleaning
22 the common room, sweep the corridor and do other menial
23 chores. We referred to this as fagging. I am not aware
24 of what I believe to be the traditional independent
25 school fagging where the senior boys had junior boys

1 doing certain tasks for him. This didn't go on at
2 Fettes. It may have gone on before I arrived, but
3 I never saw it.

4 Discipline and punishment.

5 I am not aware of there being any formal written
6 policy on discipline and punishment. If boys committed
7 any serious offence or misdemeanour, the cane was used.
8 I was not given any guidance on using the cane or any
9 other punishment. I did ask the headmaster and he said
10 that what I did was in order. For more trivial
11 offences, lines or gating or maybe just a telling off
12 may be administered. Gating basically meant that the
13 boys were grounded and weren't allowed to go past the
14 gates taking them out of the grounds of the school.
15 I don't think gating was ever supervised and it would be
16 assumed that the boys would adhere to the punishment and
17 not go out as instructed. I don't think there was
18 a detention punishment. There was nothing to indicate
19 what offence warranted a particular level of punishment.
20 It was left to the individual member of staff to decide.

21 The prefects were allowed to hand out lines to the
22 boys. In the event of a serious offence, they would
23 refer it to the housemaster or tutor to punish them.
24 I am aware of this happening on a couple of times when
25 I was at Fettes, but it was very rare.

1 I had nothing to do with the running of the school
2 outside my circle. I got up, had my breakfast, went to
3 teach, [REDACTED] and occasionally was on duty in
4 the house. I didn't have anything to do with the
5 day-to-day running of the school.

6 I never witnessed any abuse when I was at Fettes.
7 I can't imagine it happening. The children I dealt with
8 were 13 and upwards, so if anything happened to any of
9 them, I am sure they would have spoken up and told
10 someone.

11 I never heard anything to make me think there were
12 any concerns about the school and I am not aware of the
13 school being the subject of any concern by any external
14 body or agency in relation to the treatment of children.

15 I had very little interaction with parents of any of
16 the schoolboys. I think there were parents meetings
17 probably twice a year. It started with a service in the
18 chapel and then throng into the dining room where
19 I discussed with the parents the teaching and the
20 progress of their child. There was never any
21 notification of whose parents were attending. There
22 were other social evenings organised and I can remember
23 chatting to a couple who came to every event. I started
24 talking to them about their son and their response was
25 that they weren't really interested and they were only

1 there for a drink. There was contact with parents, but
2 it was very informal.

3 I am not aware of there being an actual process for
4 the children or anyone else to report a concern or make
5 a complaint. I would imagine that any such concern
6 would be reported to a member of staff and it would be
7 taken from there. I never received any complaints or
8 reports of concern and I am not aware of anyone else
9 receiving such a report. I am not aware where any
10 paperwork relative to such a complaint or issue would be
11 recorded or stored.

12 I was never aware at any time of senior boys
13 bullying the younger boys. I always felt it was
14 a well-ordered and pleasant society.

15 I was not aware of there ever being anyone that
16 a child could speak to if they had any worries. There
17 wasn't a recognised counsellor or anyone like that
18 within any of the houses.

19 I don't think Fettes had a definition of abuse. If
20 there was one, it was never communicated to me. This
21 didn't change all the way through my time at Fettes.

22 I never received any training or instruction in
23 child protection or in respect of how children in the
24 school should be treated, cared for and protected
25 against abuse, ill-treatment or inappropriate behaviour.

1 Similarly, I wasn't given any guidance or instruction on
2 how to deal with any reports of abuse or ill-treatment.
3 There was nothing formal set up to reduce the likelihood
4 of abuse by staff or other adults towards the children
5 at the school. I think I just assumed that it wouldn't
6 happen. If it did happen, it would probably just be
7 reported through the housemaster or tutor.

8 I recall at least one inspection when I was at
9 Fettes. We must have known about it as it was the sort
10 of thing where you would put the top pupils near the
11 door and the not-so-good ones in the corner in the hope
12 that the inspector didn't notice. I have a feeling that
13 independent schools had to actually request
14 an inspection rather than there being an unannounced
15 visit.

16 On that one inspection that I do recall, I can't
17 remember if the inspectors spoke to any of the children.
18 I can't really remember anything about it at all.

19 Record-keeping.

20 Every three weeks or so we were required to add up
21 the marks of the work of around six children allocated
22 to us and to give each pupil a ranking. I then had to
23 give an opinion as to how much effort they had put in.
24 This was all recorded and these records were put in
25 a cabinet in the staff office in the main building.

1 I don't know who was responsible for these records and
2 I have no idea what happened with these records at the
3 end of the term. There was no secretarial back-up.
4 I never had occasion to try and look back at anyone's
5 records so I am not sure how much was kept or what
6 happened to them.

7 I never kept any records in relation to the boys
8 that I disciplined and I was not aware if anyone did or
9 if there was anything stored anywhere. I was never told
10 that I should keep any discipline records."

11 My Lady, I move on to paragraph 37:

12 "Specific alleged abusers.

13 Mr Chenevix-Trench took over as headmaster [REDACTED]
14 [REDACTED]

15 [REDACTED] I would have been there for about a year or
16 two when Mr Chenevix-Trench arrived. He must have been
17 the headmaster for around ten years and died in post.
18 He was replaced by Cameron Cochrane. I have no idea how
19 old Mr Chenevix-Trench was but he was considerably older
20 than me. I occasionally chatted with him and he
21 regularly invited staff into his house for social
22 evenings. He was very easy to talk to. He taught Latin
23 and Greek and was apparently quite brilliant at it
24 although sometimes he was a bit forgetful. On occasion
25 he forgot to turn up for lessons. I would never class

1 him as a friend. He was just the boss. I didn't see
2 him interacting or disciplining children, probably
3 because caning was never carried out in public. I never
4 saw or heard of him abusing children.

5 I know of one situation when the headmaster,
6 Mr Chenevix-Trench, told us in the staffroom about
7 a member of staff who was being too close to children
8 and he had been dismissed. I think the teacher was
9 [DXM]. I'm not sure when this was, but
10 Chenevix-Trench was the headmaster. I never heard what
11 'too close' meant.

12 I remember the teacher [DXM] as he was a [redacted]
13 teacher and he was around my age. I don't really know
14 anything else about him as I didn't socialise with him.
15 I never saw him interacting with children and I never
16 saw him disciplining or abusing anyone. I didn't know
17 him very well at all.

18 Helping the Inquiry.

19 To give any suggestion as to how children in
20 boarding schools can be protected now and in the future,
21 that is very dependent on the age of the children.
22 Because I was dealing with children aged 13 and above,
23 who would howl if anything happened to them, they would
24 make sure people heard about it. There is no doubt in
25 my mind that they would tell somebody about it. There

1 were younger children in the junior section but they
2 were kept separate. They were in a separate house and
3 had separate lessons.

4 Specific allegations.

5 I have been read a section of a statement of
6 'Robert', who was a pupil at Fettes College when I was
7 there. In his statement he claims that I caned him on
8 two occasions after putting him over my knee after he
9 had performed poorly in lessons. I recall the pupil
10 'Robert'. At this time it was perfectly legal to give
11 the cane.

12 Because he was over the knee, I couldn't have hit
13 him hard because of the mechanics, it just isn't
14 possible. If I had done it, I would have intentionally
15 had him on my knee so that I couldn't hit him too hard.
16 I would have given him the cane to try and dissuade him
17 from idling. In my view, I did not consider what I did
18 to the pupil 'Robert' as abuse. I think that the
19 passage of time may have affected my recollection of
20 what is alleged as it was 45 years ago. I am not saying
21 that these incidents didn't happen, but I do not recall
22 caning him as he said. In any case, getting caned on my
23 knee was a better, less painful option than bending over
24 a chair.

25 I think at the time I had a policy of punishing boys

1 who didn't work. If boys did work, I bribed them. They
2 would be given more opportunities to go into town more
3 often. Bribing was a potent force in that respect and
4 the boys reacted well to this.

5 I was contacted 10 to 15 years ago by the pupil
6 'Robert', who made the allegations against me. He has
7 obviously been harbouring a grudge against me for quite
8 some time. I can't really remember the content of his
9 email as it was now more than 10 years ago and I didn't
10 keep it. I did reply, explaining why I had caned him.

11 Leaving Fettes College.

12 Cameron Cochrane, who was the headmaster at Fettes,
13 had become the governor at a college in Switzerland. He
14 got me a one-year secondment at the college. This
15 college was in a ski resort and during the winter their
16 main sport was skiing and I was a keen skier. I waved
17 goodbye to Fettes and worked in Switzerland for four
18 years. As far as I know, Fettes never gave me any
19 references for the job in Switzerland. It was supposed
20 to be only for a year and by the end of the year they
21 knew me anyway.

22 During my four years in Switzerland,
23 Cameron Cochrane became the headmaster of a boarding
24 school in the Netherlands and he offered me a job as the
25 head of [REDACTED] I ended up in the Netherlands and

1 became good friends with Cameron Cochrane.

2 I have no objection to my witness statement being
3 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
4 I believe the facts stated in this statement are true."

5 My Lady, the statement is signed and it's dated
6 4 November 2020.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Ms Bennie.

8 It's just after 1 o'clock now so I'll rise now for
9 the lunch break and we'll resume at 2 o'clock, please.

10 (1.03 pm)

11 (The luncheon adjournment)

12 (2.00 pm)

13 (Proceedings delayed)

14 (2.10 pm)

15 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

16 MR BROWN: My Lady, apologies for the slightly delayed
17 start, there were technical issues.

18 This afternoon will be a section of read-ins and the
19 first is from the witness 'David'. The reference number
20 is WIT.001.002.4332.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 'David' (read)

23 MR BROWN: "My name is 'David' and I was born in 1961. My
24 childhood was all good. I have no bad memories of
25 growing up. My parents are still alive and still

1 together.

2 My parents decided they wanted the best education
3 for me. They worked very hard to put me through school.
4 At the age of 9, I went to Edinburgh Academy and that's
5 where I remained for the rest of my schooling. This was
6 an all boys' school. I spent one year at the junior
7 school.

8 I don't remember any particular process of
9 integration at the school but there must have been
10 something, like being shown around and being told where
11 things were. I don't actually remember my first day
12 there. I do remember specific events, though.
13 I remember a specific teacher, and this would have been
14 in my form classroom.

15 I had one form master, 'Edgar', who I particularly
16 remember. He taught Latin, geography and maths in our
17 form class. We didn't stay in that one classroom, we
18 would go off to a different classroom where other
19 teachers would teach different subjects.

20 I was a day pupil but there were other pupils who
21 attended my classes who were boarders at the school.
22 The boarders would have breakfast together communally
23 and I would say that as kids the boarders and the day
24 pupils just got on. There were no issues. I knew that
25 the boarders lived in boarding houses but I never

1 attended the boarding houses.

2 I settled in really well to the school.

3 The form master was South African. Looking back, he
4 seemed like an old man to me but he was probably mid to
5 late 30s. There were incidents that I am concerned
6 about involving 'Edgar'.

7 I don't remember how quickly after I started
8 attending Edinburgh Academy the incidents with 'Edgar'
9 began to happen. I don't actually remember the first
10 occasion when something happened. What I do remember,
11 though, is how it would happen.

12 There would be a classroom full of kids. He would
13 be at his desk at the front. I would have been nine
14 years old at this stage. He would get you to stand up
15 at his desk on the pretext of checking your work and he
16 would run his hand up the inside of your trouser leg and
17 fondle your genitals. It was always boys in short
18 trousers. He did this in front of everybody. This went
19 on for the year I was there. It was a frequent,
20 sometimes daily event over the full time I was there.

21 Oddly enough, nobody mentioned it or talked about
22 it. It was just accepted because of this guy's
23 position. He never said anything whilst he was doing
24 it.

25 Uniforms would be worn all year round and they would

1 have been long blue shorts, grey shirt, tweed jacket in
2 winter, blazer in summer. Thinking back on it I thought
3 maybe this was just a summer event because of the shorts
4 but I remember that the junior school wore shorts all
5 year round.

6 They did issue us with a book of rules and
7 regulations and the dress codes are in there. I've been
8 able to check.

9 When these things were happening to me, I don't
10 remember feeling disgusted because it was just accepted.
11 Also, I had no comprehension of sexual things at that
12 age. It would have happened to other boys as well.
13 I have a vague recollection of knowing it was happening
14 to other boys but not looking. So I guess I must have
15 felt that it was not right. I definitely felt
16 uncomfortable.

17 I was always guilty of not doing my homework and
18 when you got an answer wrong or 'Edgar' thought you
19 should be doing better, he had this other thing that he
20 used to do, which was to come up to you, grab your
21 sideburns and gradually lift you up until you were
22 standing on your desk. Then you would be standing on
23 your tiptoes being held up by your sideburns.

24 It was fairly uncomfortable and it added to the
25 feeling of him being in charge. He was in charge of

1 classes that I was in every day. It started off with
2 roll call in the morning, then it would be off to the
3 hall to listen to a lecture or something, then it would
4 be back and off to your classes, which for at least two
5 or three 'Edgar' was my teacher.

6 We had sport at school and I played rugby and
7 cricket. On occasions I was particularly uncomfortable
8 after sport because we'd go into the showers. Everyone
9 was naked and we would all hop after sport into
10 a communal shower. I do remember one time being really
11 uncomfortable getting dressed after a shower. 'Edgar'
12 was just walking around watching and looking.
13 I remember thinking that I had to get dressed and out of
14 there quick. He wasn't actually in charge of the
15 sporting activity as there were specific gym teachers.
16 However, the other teachers were encouraged to get
17 involved by being referees or umpires or whatever.

18 There were punishments at the lower school.
19 Punishments included getting whacked on the backside
20 with a wooden spoon, which was meant to be a sporting
21 instrument called a clachan. It was like a small
22 paddle. Sometimes a shoe or a gym shoe was used. These
23 punishments could be for trivial things or
24 misdemeanours. There was no belt, there was just the
25 clachan. A couple of teachers had a reputation for

1 really belting you with the clachan."

2 Moving on to paragraph 20 and reporting abuse to the
3 school:

4 "I don't remember there being any school counsellor
5 or anyone you would take concerns to. If anything, the
6 person I would have been expected to go to would have
7 been my form teacher.

8 I definitely did not feel that the abuse was
9 anything that I could have spoken to my parents about.
10 I didn't mention it to anybody.

11 Reporting abuse to the police.

12 Incidents of abuse all came to light over 10 years
13 ago. There was a thing in the paper, I think it was
14 about Loretto School in Musselburgh. As a result of
15 that being in the paper another guy I was at school
16 with, who I was friendly with at the time, wrote
17 a comment in a newspaper article about his experiences.

18 

19 He said that stuff happened at our school.

20 I thought after the article everything that had happened
21 at the school was going to come out, but I heard
22 nothing. I think at the time Loretto School handled it
23 pretty well. I think they wrote letters to the parents.
24 But still absolutely nothing about our school came out.
25 Then, a couple of years ago there was another guy who

1 was about two years younger than me. He went to the
2 paper and said that the same sort of things happened at
3 Edinburgh Academy. That's how I know it happened for
4 a few years, at least 1970 to 1972 and possibly 1973.

5 I decided eventually to go to the police.

6 I appreciate that what 'Edgar' had done may sound fairly
7 trivial, but I kept thinking about how I would feel if
8 it happened to my child. It wasn't easy going to the
9 police back then, it was nine or ten years ago. I think
10 you had to go to a certain division or something but
11 I ended up filling in a form but nothing happened. This
12 was Lothian and Borders Police.

13 I was going to Edinburgh anyway and this time
14 I managed to get in touch with a detective who was
15 looking into allegations. He told me that I was not
16 alone and that a number of people had come forward with
17 similar information. He told me that they would pursue
18 the allegations.

19 Impact.

20 Regarding the events at the lower school, I never
21 used to think about it apart from it popping into my
22 head from time to time. However, since the article
23 about Edinburgh Academy was first in the paper,
24 I started to think that now this is out, let's get this
25 guy and seek justice. It just hasn't happened, though,

1 so it has been playing on my mind more frequently,
2 knowing that something could have been done.

3 I do understand that these wheels move very slowly.
4 However, the reason I decided to go to the police was
5 because the other pupil who joined the school in 1972
6 came forward in another newspaper and said that he had
7 gone to the police about this. I thought, 'Good on you,
8 mate, I'm going to add my name to that as I don't want
9 you to be alone'. He didn't actually name a teacher but
10 he said something like, 'This went on in front of our
11 class'. That's when I thought I knew what he was
12 talking about.

13 I do wish that the police involvement had taken off
14 15 years ago but I just want justice. I've never sought
15 counselling or any other support for what happened to me
16 at the school because I'm fine and I don't think I need
17 it.

18 I do wish the school had shown a bit more
19 transparency at the time. If they knew about this, they
20 should have gathered the boys at assembly and asked if
21 anyone knew anything about it, told them that the school
22 will take the necessary steps to deal with it. I don't
23 know if 'Edgar' was found out and sacked or whether his
24 visa was just up.

25 Lessons for the future.

1 I think there should be a mechanism within each
2 school that would allow an investigation to be carried
3 out. Someone that people can go to. We had a chaplain
4 that I may have talked to because he was a good guy.
5 I would have spoken to him because of that as opposed to
6 him being a chaplain. So I suppose I'm saying that it
7 is important that individual teachers create that trust
8 relationship with the pupils. Ironically the teacher
9 I should naturally have gone to should have been my form
10 teacher and he was the actual abuser.

11 In relation to the behaviour of 'Edgar', despite my
12 thinking at the time that nobody knew about it, I now
13 think that somebody must have been aware of it. There
14 must have been pupils and teachers at the school over
15 a period of years that knew these things were happening.
16 The culture of the place at that time must have been
17 that they had to keep a lid on it.

18 After school I went to university. I later moved
19 overseas and have otherwise lived a happy life.

20 I have no objection to my witness statement being
21 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
22 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
23 true."

24 And 'David' signed the statement in February 2019.

25 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

1 'Grant' (read)

2 MS BENNIE: Thank you, my Lady. The next read-in bears the
3 reference FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes
4 to remain anonymous and has adopted the pseudonym of
5 'Grant'.

6 "The events I shall describe in 1956 occurred my
7 whole lifetime ago, and raking up such painfully
8 negative past incidents is extremely uncomfortable and
9 the exposure of it is still raw. I have considered
10 taking such action before now, but I decide against it
11 for similar reasons. So I can only hope that this
12 history will be of some use in preventing any possible
13 recurrence.

14 I am in my 52nd year as a probation officer working
15 in a variety of different parts of the Probation
16 Service. For the past 12 years I have worked in
17 a resettlement hostel for ex-offenders who are still
18 considered to be at high risk on their release.
19 I currently work there as a relief assistant and I get
20 called in at short notice to cover colleagues' absences.

21 I was in Glencorse House from May 1953 to July 1957.
22 [REDACTED] the headmaster
23 Donald Crichton-Miller, whom I think I spoke with just
24 once and briefly.

25 To provide some context to the events I shall

1 describe, in 1956 I was in the final stages of gaining
2 a flying scholarship to RAF Cranwell - my interest in
3 life having been devoted to a love of aircraft in all
4 their manifestations, from making models to flying in
5 them. The final week's testing for this scholarship was
6 in Essex, which I completed, and on the final day I was
7 handed a slip of paper which said, 'Congratulations!
8 You have successfully passed the necessary tests for
9 your flying scholarship'. Handwritten in pencil beneath
10 were the ominous words, 'Subject to satisfactory
11 medical'. I had travelled down from Edinburgh the
12 previous night so had missed the scheduled 9 am Monday
13 medical testing session, which was subsequently
14 postponed to the Friday afternoon, after most of the
15 other applicants had departed. Alas, a scar was
16 discovered on my eardrum, of which I had no knowledge
17 before or since. My world suddenly and dramatically
18 collapsed. I had not studied for nor planned to go to
19 university. My parents lived abroad and I had never
20 visualised or considered any alternative career. The
21 full implications for my future took a while to sink in.
22 At 16, I felt abandoned, lost and vulnerable.

23 Glencorse House had a resident houseman whose job it
24 was to look after the building, maintaining the boilers,
25 make porridge every morning, some cleaning, et cetera.

1 He lived in his own private room at the back of the
2 house. In those days, senior pupils were allowed to
3 decorate their own shared study rooms, and most chose to
4 do so. The houseman would sometimes offer to assist
5 those less able with hanging wallpaper. As
6 an ex-Merchant Navy seaman, he was a friendly man but he
7 did not mix socially with the staff and residents. He
8 would occasionally invite pupils to visit him in his
9 secluded room - I am sure you can guess where this sad
10 story is going. In his room he had an impressive large
11 hardback publication of black and white nude photos
12 called Art and Anatomy which contained pictures of naked
13 human bodies in artistic poses, which certainly excited
14 the passions of teenage boys, including myself. The
15 cost of his decorating help was to be seduced, sexually
16 assaulted and anally raped. I have never in my life had
17 any homosexual ideation or inclination. I was just
18 a naive teenager. I was not keen on team sports such as
19 rugby and cricket; not being well coordinated I latterly
20 evaded them whenever possible, not that the compulsory
21 games were easy to avoid.

22 I enjoyed squash, fives, golf, shooting and
23 of course the CCF, RAF section. My studies were waning
24 and I was sexually inexperienced, ignorant and
25 innocent - but sexually curious. With no direction or

1 support, having intended to leave to take up a place at
2 RAF Cranwell the following year, I had time on my hands.

3 I have no doubt that the houseman had other pupil
4 victims in Glencorse House as he was well equipped and
5 practised in such abusive practices and very subtle or
6 sly in his approach, though none of his other victims
7 were known to me or ever mentioned it to me, except for
8 occasional veiled hints from colleagues.

9 I cannot remember for how long or how frequently my
10 abuse lasted, but I was impelled to silence and I felt
11 there was nobody at all to whom I could turn for help or
12 advice. Not even the charming and maternal house
13 matron. My parents overseas, had I told them by letter,
14 would no doubt have been appalled and frustrated at such
15 information.

16 It is now 64 years ago that this occurred and, as
17 far as I can tell, those repugnant events have had no
18 obvious lasting effect on me except for a diminution of
19 my already low feelings of self-worth at the time.
20 I trust it has helped me to better understand the needs
21 of the victims I encounter today. For at least a decade
22 after leaving Fettes, I bitterly resented my time there.
23 It was to me a mostly hostile and unsympathetic
24 environment, one which I took for granted and suffered
25 as an inevitable necessity of having family abroad.

1 With the benefit of hindsight I can now understand it is
2 a period of time and series of events which eventually
3 shaped and strengthened my character. Having suffered
4 and withstood the hardships of Fettes, including
5 wintering in freezing Edinburgh, I believed I could
6 withstand with impunity any future hardships and I still
7 do. Boarding school life at Fettes ironically also
8 equipped me for more than 11 years of institutionalised
9 work inside prisons. My many good friends at Fettes
10 gave me a lasting affinity with Scotland and the Scots,
11 which I now greatly enjoy.

12 Without wishing to diminish the above true
13 revelation with inappropriate levity, I remember that
14 careers advice at the time offered three main choices
15 for those not already decided on their future: either
16 the army, the church or accountancy, and if the many
17 overseas posts offered by the Public Schools
18 Appointments Bureau in the fast-fading empire were not
19 to your choice, you had to find your own way. No thanks
20 to Fettes' career guidance. So unwittingly and
21 reluctantly in 1957 I became an articled clerk to a firm
22 of chartered accountants in the City of London. I held
23 that post for three years. They were the most boring
24 three years of my life which I gladly escaped at 21
25 without qualifications into the vastly preferable world

1 of advertising and PR industries.

2 Whilst there, I was married and my wife's financial
3 support allowed me to make a dramatic change of career
4 into social work, my forte. Hindsight, a wonderful
5 attribute.

6 As to my time at Fettes, I now have few regrets.
7 I do greatly regret that it was not co-educational at
8 the time. It is also easy to regret with hindsight that
9 as an intelligent student I wasted valuable academic
10 chances, but now aged 80 I've left that rather late. By
11 way of some compensation to myself, I achieved an
12 external MA degree in Social Policy and Administration
13 at my own expense when I reached the age of 50.
14 I received minimal career support at Fettes at a time
15 when I needed it most, but I was immature, certainly not
16 worldly wise, despite appearances, and I didn't know how
17 to ask for help or advice."

18 My Lady, this witness statement is signed and it's
19 dated 22 September 2020.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

21 'John' (read)

22 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

23 WIT-3-000001063. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
24 anonymous and he has adopted the pseudonym of 'John'.

25 "My name is 'John', my year of birth is 1942.

1 On 15 September 2020, in response to an email sent
2 by the head of Fettes College to Fettes alumni,
3 I emailed the following account of my own experiences,
4 which I entitled, 'Fettes, 1955-60 sexual mores':

5 I was a full time border in CW from 1955 to 1960 and
6 had, for the most part, an immensely rewarding
7 experience. With respect to 'child abuse', my first
8 comment would be that we were scarcely children any more
9 and some of us were morally at least as experienced as
10 the staff - even capable of exploiting the staff rather
11 than the other way round.

12 The only male staff member of whom I have any
13 recollection as being a potential exploiter of the boys
14 for sexual purposes was a [REDACTED] teacher. I heard that
15 he allowed boys to smoke and/or drink beer in his room,
16 but this is 100 per cent hearsay. I was much involved
17 in [REDACTED] but never experienced anything of that kind.

18 There was, I believe, a slight undercurrent of
19 potential homosexuality amongst the boys, but again
20 I experienced nothing of this directly, though we did
21 discuss it intellectually, particularly in the context
22 of the Greek philosophers.

23 By the time I left school, I was entirely accepting
24 of homosexuality, though not in the slightest bit drawn
25 to it myself.

1 The only case I know of exploitation of a boy in
2 a sexual context was of an unfortunate American student
3 at Fettes on some exchange scheme who developed
4 a seriously bad 'jockey rash' caused by the jock-straps
5 we wore to protect our privates in rugby. This lad was
6 the cleanest creature for miles and washed every orifice
7 daily and was as a consequence far too soft-skinned to
8 tolerate the coarse elasticated material. He ended up
9 in the sanatorium where one of the nurses took pleasure
10 in applying some kind of plaister of oatmeal to his
11 privates, with the inevitable and deeply embarrassing
12 consequences for the boy. In essence she masturbated
13 him and he was absolutely mortified. When I think back
14 on it, I admire his having admitted it occurred.

15 That instance aside, if people are looking for
16 sexual exploitation in those days, in my view the real
17 abuse was in the condemnation of masturbation and the
18 genuinely meant threats that it would render you either
19 infertile or impotent, never mind going blind. We were
20 told that women suffered childbirth in part as
21 a consequence of men pursuing their own pleasure. The
22 idea that women might get pleasure from sex was not part
23 of our education but we had no sex education worthy of
24 the name.

25 In addition to the foregoing, on 22 September 2021

1 I emailed the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry my
2 recollections regarding physical abuse at Fettes. I did
3 so not out of any desire to revive a sense of grievance,
4 which I do not feel in any way, but from the point of
5 view of historical interest.

6 The physical, not sexual abuse of which I either had
7 knowledge or direct experience can be divided into abuse
8 by boys of boys and abuse of boys by staff, both falling
9 under the general category of institutionalised abuse.

10 In both cases, the primary instances were those of
11 institutionally sanctioned beatings.

12 Beatings.

13 There were three basic classes of beatings: house
14 beatings, administered by the house prefects; school
15 beatings, administered by the school prefects; and
16 beatings by a housemaster or the headmaster. In the
17 house and school beatings, all boys in the house or
18 school were confined to their studies or communal study
19 areas and silence was strictly observed, sometimes
20 lasting for well over half an hour. The psychological
21 effect of this on the whole community was powerful. One
22 listened out for the steps in the empty corridor of the
23 boy to be beaten, and for any sound from the room where
24 the beating took place, and of course for any sounds of
25 distress. The house and the school beatings were not

1 monitored by the staff.

2 The beatings were administered with a cane on the
3 bare buttocks, the offender (sometimes merely for too
4 many sets of lines) kneeling on a chair, his body bent
5 over the back of it and his trousers and underpants down
6 or completely removed by the boy himself.

7 The usual punishment was six strokes of the cane
8 administered by six different prefects. Reluctance
9 to administer your allotted stroke, if you were the
10 prefect, was scarcely tolerated. Prefects would
11 practice caning on a cushion to ensure that they all
12 struck in the same area. I have no knowledge of how
13 many strokes were administered by staff or in what
14 precise manner.

15 I can recall only one school beating during my time
16 at Fettes. The boy in question (I do not recall his
17 name) was a bully and unpopular, but I do recall that
18 the beating did far more than admonish him: my
19 recollection is that he was crushed by it and I also
20 recollect a communal sense of moral disturbance among
21 the boys, though scarcely, if at all, articulated.
22 I also recall that it was administered in the school
23 library and that the cane was brought to the prefects on
24 a salver by one of the employees.

25 I also recall - and this was entirely hearsay

1 amongst the boys - of one beating which was so severe
2 that the boy had to be sent to the Edinburgh Western
3 General for treatment. I do not know if this was
4 a house beating or by one of the staff. Needless to
5 say, it was hushed up, though we did understand that the
6 medics read the riot act.

7 Other types of physical abuse.

8 I recall two initiation rituals usually practised in
9 the dormitories. One was for the boys to form
10 a corridor and to make a boy run naked between them as
11 he was flicked with wet towels. A wet towel flicked can
12 cause a lot of pain and possible injury. Another common
13 ritual was to make all boys new to the dormitory jump to
14 grab the high bar which straddled the central corridor
15 between the bed stalls and swing over it, naked, again
16 while being flicked with wet towels. This was quite
17 a gymnastic exercise and not every boy could manage it.
18 Failure, sometimes after enforced repetitions, earned
19 verbal abuse and humiliation.

20 By my time, stretchings were no longer done by the
21 boys, or at least I was never aware of it, but they were
22 recent history. A boy would be laid naked on his back
23 and stretched across the low boot lockers in the
24 changing rooms. His stretched stomach would then be
25 scraped with a comb and salt rubbed in.

1 Prefects were entitled to bum boys, so-called
2 because they could be asked to warm up the toilet seat,
3 among other duties such as preparing the army kit.

4 The way rugby house matches were played was brutal
5 and merciless. Boys even filed the leather of their
6 studs to expose the nails on their boots.

7 All of the above reads pretty unpleasantly and it
8 would be easy to extrapolate from it that life at Fettes
9 was pretty nasty and brute-ish. That was not the case
10 as far as I was concerned. We were very well fed, kept
11 thoroughly fit and extremely well-educated. I was able
12 to take part in many productions of plays, in painting,
13 photography, literature and debating philosophy. Music
14 was my main subject and I was given every facility and
15 encouragement. I sang in the choir as a boy soprano and
16 as a baritone, played in the orchestra and was allowed
17 in my final year many hours in the music library
18 listening to LPs of classical music. The staff were
19 excellent and the one disadvantage of the system that
20 took me a while to overcome was the absence of girls of
21 our own age.

22 One final thought. The school ran a Combined Cadet
23 Force. This was originally named the Officer Training
24 Corps, the expectation being that boys from Fettes were
25 destined to become officers. The language habitually

1 used with respect to people of colour was racist. I, as
2 a citizen of the Irish Republic, was sometimes at the
3 receiving end of its equivalent. Participation in the
4 CCF was obligatory unless you could prove that you were
5 a genuine conscientious objector. I believe that at
6 least some of the attitudes to physical and mental abuse
7 and the like were part and parcel of training boys to be
8 brutal enough to manage men in brutal situations. For
9 myself, I preferred the RAF mountain rescue.

10 I have no objection to my witness statement being
11 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

12 I believe the facts in this statement to be true."

13 My Lady, the statement is signed and it's dated
14 28 September 2021.

15 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

16 'Brian' (read)

17 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

18 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
19 anonymous and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'Brian'.

20 'Brian' was a pupil of Inverleith House and
21 Glencorse in years 1956 to 1962.

22 "Overall my time at Fettes was extremely helpful,
23 positive and happy, but there were still some issues
24 along the way. I arrived at the age of just 12 years
25 and 4 months, over a year younger than the average and

1 also boarding for the first time. On the other hand
2 I was big for my age and was appointed captain of the
3 [REDACTED] and then head of [REDACTED]
4 [REDACTED] for the Lent term. After the last rugby
5 match in March I could hardly walk [REDACTED]
6 [REDACTED] which meant that I was off
7 all games except golf for two years. As this coincided
8 with my moving up to Glencorse this was particularly
9 difficult. When I was able to resume games just under
10 two years later I was in teams with those in the year
11 below me in the school. All these issues very largely
12 disappeared once I was over 15 and a half and in the
13 sixth form.

14 Glencorse was a happy and well-run house. At one
15 stage the assistant house tutor, Peter Shepherd, said
16 that he thought it was too much the model house, with
17 members not exposed enough to the harsher realities and
18 challenges of life. Another tutor, two or three years
19 after me, had quite a difficult start, coming from the
20 state sector and not used to the fairly strict games
21 routine and discipline, and no doubt petty snobberies
22 that have disfigured the private sector. In the school
23 as a whole there were just a few boys from South
24 America, South Africa, and one of mixed-race. Names
25 like Dago and Wog were used, totally unacceptable now

1 of course and should have been then, but in my
2 experience this was not in any way linked with bullying
3 of any kind.

4 The housemaster of Moredun had a reputation for
5 being perhaps overstrong on discipline and punishment,
6 and Carrington as a house likewise. I had no experience
7 of and was not aware of any instances of abuse.
8 Concerns were expressed about a friendship between two
9 boys in different years, and also when photos of younger
10 boys playing female roles in plays were posted on
11 noticeboards, but I don't remember anything more than
12 that. I was involved in just two beatings, this
13 practice of course stopped not long afterwards. It
14 seemed to me that the requirement of all the house
15 prefects to be present was a key safeguard against
16 abuse. There were still elements of older boys making
17 life harder for younger boys but nothing extreme in my
18 experience.

19 Life in the sixth form and as a prefect and captain
20 was a great privilege and a time of learning, with
21 particularly good relationships with the many teaching
22 staff, housemaster and assistant and matron. In my
23 experience, for all the real limitations and
24 shortcomings, the overwhelming majority of prefects and
25 staff were aiming to be fair and to work together for

1 the good of all.

2 Being based in England, I did not keep in close
3 contact with the school after leaving but was invited to
4 speak at the Centenary Dinner and then to spend a full
5 week for Lent talks and meetings in February 1975,
6 staying with the then headmaster, Anthony
7 Chenevix-Trench. One of the things that struck me most
8 at the time was how strongly one group of 14-year-olds
9 said they found the lack of privacy and the pressures to
10 conform. It was only much later that I read of concerns
11 about Anthony Chenevix-Trench's relationships with the
12 boys. At the time I remember the chaplain,
13 Richard Gorrie, saying that some of the housemasters
14 resented the fact that one or more of their boys went to
15 the head and not them at times to play one-off against
16 the other or somehow to their own advantage. Against
17 that, Anthony Chenevix-Trench was very insist that each
18 boy was a unique, special individual and should be
19 treated as such. He said to me there are things going
20 on in Glencorse the housemaster knows nothing about.

21 I was also invited to preach in 1988 when the school
22 seemed to be a very happy and purposeful community."

23 My Lady, this statement is dated 24 September 2020.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

25

1 'Ian' (read)

2 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

3 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
4 anonymous and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Ian'.

5 "When I went to Fettes in 1956, overnight from being
6 a boy at prep school, I became a man on my arrival. New
7 pupils were immediately grouped by the classification
8 'new men'.

9 Looking back on my first days, I can scarcely credit
10 that those in authority were perhaps only five years
11 older than me. The thought never crossed my mind at the
12 time. They had such surety, such presence.

13 Very quickly one learned to recognise that these
14 'elders' who wore suits were either school or house
15 prefects, and this minor advantage at least made them
16 easier to spot. Those not wearing suits wore the grey
17 corduroy battle top which immediately classed us all in
18 the same mould.

19 There were without doubt rules that were expected to
20 be followed and obeyed. Simple things like longish hair
21 or dirty shoes were not tolerated and punctuality was
22 considered to be essential. Politeness was taken for
23 granted and remembrance of its importance never allowed
24 to be misjudged.

25 The lines of authority were in my eyes clearly

1 defined. School prefects were responsible to the
2 headmaster for ensuring ground roots discipline and the
3 teaching staff knew that any bad behaviour would be
4 jumped on. In a similar sense, the house prefects were
5 responsible to the housemaster for house discipline.
6 I think it was very clear where the boundaries were set
7 and this serious disobedience could involve corporal
8 punishment, but only with the approval of either the
9 housemaster or the headmaster. Crimes that involved the
10 reputation of the school were dealt with by the school
11 prefects but these were very extremely.

12 During my period there was fagging. Never as
13 betrayed in the novels like Tom Brown's School Days or
14 sketches of what outsiders thought it might be like at
15 Eton College. You ran errands, pressed corps uniforms
16 and cleaned prefects studies and their shoes. Provided
17 you did a decent job, this was often rewarded by 'buy
18 one at the tuck shop for yourself when you are there'.

19 As ever, there were some who were more demanding
20 than others so you had to have a clear knowledge of your
21 boss. The ultimate role reversal was when the tables
22 were turned and the prefects laid on a splendid meal for
23 their fags with them acting as the waiters. This was
24 an annual event generally held in the summer term.

25 Involvement in the school sports was expected but

1 recognition of ability was allowed to span age groups.
2 Good sportsmen were team players regardless of age.
3 House sports were deemed essential too even if you were
4 not the best performer. Houses encouraged all talents
5 right across the age spectrum in such opportunities as
6 the house play or the piano competitions. The Fettes
7 choir was a groomed team of choristers who enjoyed the
8 challenge of new music and never failed in its success.
9 The school orchestra was a similar creation but never
10 quite got the same amount of exposure.

11 Fettes provided a unique challenge to encourage and
12 develop a thriving art hub. Many people who developed
13 their skills in art went on to become proficient artists
14 or architects.

15 Many bad things have been said about Fettes and
16 a supposed bullying culture. I myself never witnessed
17 it and any misdemeanours I personally made, and there
18 were some, were punished according to the level of error
19 and generally I knew the expectation of my punishment.
20 You cannot be in an establishment the size of Fettes
21 without disliking some people. This is natural and
22 probably reciprocated. You work around it and rub along
23 as best possible. What people fail to pick up are on
24 the good things that Fettes offered. Some people who
25 shared studies in college have remained close friends

1 for life. The opportunities are massive, but each
2 individual must decide how they are going to enhance
3 their own well-being, both in the short and longer term.

4 Having gone through Fettes when it was run very,
5 very efficiently by both prefects and tutors, I was
6 happy to send my son there for the further development
7 of his character and scholastic abilities. I never
8 regret it, he never regrets it, and some 20 years on
9 still keeps in contact and meets up with about a dozen
10 of his close friends. Fettes made him into what he is
11 today - a good example of what a school like Fettes can
12 contribute to the process of growing up."

13 My Lady, we don't have the date for this statement.
14 I will ensure that the date will be provided.

15 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

16 'Sherlock' (read)

17 MS BENNIE: The next read-in bears the reference

18 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
19 anonymous and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Sherlock'.

20 "I never experienced or even heard of sexual abuse
21 in my time there. What was not classified at the time
22 as abuse (but would be today) was the widespread and
23 quite frequent use of corporal punishment, usually by
24 house prefects on junior house members. There was also
25 for the most serious 'offenders' a 'schoolie' that was

1 inflicted by school prefects. Prior to becoming
2 a prefect, I would be caned on the rear end on average
3 once per term. Once a prefect, unfortunately, I had to
4 participate in doling out such punishment. It was real
5 Billy Bunter stuff but not as bad as Tom Brown's School
6 Days, thank goodness.

7 As far as I recall, the cane was held by the
8 housemaster or headmaster in the case of 'schoolies' and
9 had to be issued to allow the event to take place. That
10 means that there may be a record of each event. The
11 housemaster at the time was Michael Leslie. The matron
12 was a Miss Valentine. The housemaster, his wife and the
13 matron were all very kind, supportive and approachable.

14 The memories are still with me but I guess we are
15 all creatures of our times. A parallel today might be
16 the activities on (anti)social media. I predict
17 a severe crackdown on that within the decade.

18 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email
19 and it's dated 15 September 2020.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

21 'Ben' (read)

22 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

23 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
24 anonymous and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Ben'.

25 'Ben' was a pupil at Fettes between the years 1961

1 and 1964.

2 "Life at Fettes was much different down the decades
3 as you can appreciate and in my era of the early sixties
4 it would have been considered harsh by today's standards
5 and perhaps unacceptable had word got out.

6 However, we were all treated as men rather than as
7 children as if we were soon to be heading a platoon into
8 the jungles of Borneo.

9 Life was hard but fair with fagging, lack of privacy
10 or official beatings by prefectal students.

11 One was never expected to complain about these and
12 I don't to this day.

13 Rather, I am glad and proud to have been a teenager
14 of that era attending the school, in particular
15 Carrington House. House Rules were in a crusty old
16 handwritten tome, accessible on request via the head of
17 house.

18 Even though at the time I hated every minute of it
19 to the extent of three years feeling like a decade,
20 I value the unwritten curriculum without reservation.

21 The comradeship was essentially more military than
22 civil, ensuring a full life of public service.

23 As a house we were proud of our level of discipline
24 and with maturity its subsequent transformation into
25 self-discipline for adult life.

1 I have every confidence that today's students can
2 meet the same boundaries and achieve great potential
3 under more thought-provokingly acceptable guidelines."

4 Again my Lady this statement is in the form of
5 an email and it's dated 15 September 2020.

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

7 'Michael' (read)

8 MS BENNIE: My Lady, the next statement bears the reference
9 FET-000000313. The witness wishes to remain anonymous
10 and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Michael'.

11 "I was a pupil at Fettes from 1961 to 1965 in
12 Glencorse.

13 Discipline was strict and consisted of several lines
14 of punishment. Lines, 25-50 or 100 on paper one had to
15 purchase for a penny a sheet.

16 Next was calling, which consisted of two or three or
17 four days on which one had to report to designated
18 prefect on rising in the morning to do a menial task
19 before breakfast. Caning was used for the more
20 egregious sin and was phased out during my time there
21 and finally expulsion, which was much less wanted than
22 even a caning as it affected your life forever. Caning
23 was painful but was temporary and one got to be a hero
24 for a while.

25 No one that I was aware of was abused and it would

1 have been common knowledge if it had occurred. There
2 were all sorts of personalities at school, some of whom
3 were less desirable than others, and that went for
4 students as well as the staff and we all knew of them
5 and I have no doubt that if anyone had been seriously
6 abused we would have been aware as we were in a closed
7 community and there were few secrets.

8 We also had four sons who were at Fettes between
9 1986 and 2003 and we were never aware of any abuse that
10 had occurred. I feel that some individuals did not take
11 to boarding life and would have been better in
12 a different environment but there is no doubt in my mind
13 that this school did all in their power to make each
14 student as comfortable as it could."

15 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email
16 and it's dated 16 September 2020.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 'Jason' (read)

19 MS BENNIE: My Lady, the next statement bears the reference
20 FET-000000213. The witness wishes to remain anonymous
21 and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Jason'. The statement
22 is very short and it says:

23 "I was and am not aware of any child abuse at Fettes
24 College in Edinburgh when I was a pupil there from 1962
25 to 1966."

1 The statement is in the form of an email and it's
2 dated 15 September 2020.

3 Norman Rowbotham (read)

4 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference
5 FET-000000213. This is a statement of Norman Rowbotham.
6 Mr Rowbotham has waived anonymity and the statement is
7 in the form of an email and it's dated 15 September
8 2020:

9 "I attended Fettes from the summer of 1963 to 1968.

10 I started in the then Inverleith House and then
11 Carrington under IC Leslie with David Pighills as house
12 tutor. I can only say that my time at Fettes was
13 delightful and I had no hint of any abuse, either
14 sexual, physical or mental, whatsoever.

15 I write, as having been a headmaster of a prep
16 school, where I took over after a child abuse incident
17 (the member of staff was convicted) and am still having
18 25 years later, to attend court, as a witness,
19 in February next year for historic abuse that has only
20 come to light in the last 18 months.

21 As a member of staff I was appalled at what had been
22 happening and found that I could not, some three years
23 later, continue to teach in the atmosphere the case
24 created. I have not taught since 1998. Not only do
25 those who are abused suffer but innocent staff too, but

1 not to the same extent as those who suffered the abuse."

2 'John' (read)

3 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

4 FET-000000213. This witness wishes to remain anonymous

5 and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'John'.

6 "I went to Fettes on a foundation scholarship in
7 1964. I spent one term in Inverleith and then was in my
8 senior house, Moredun. FGP [REDACTED] was the
9 housemaster. One of his great heroes,
10 Winston Churchill, apparently described the traditions
11 of the Royal Navy as 'rum, sodomy and the lash'. My
12 time at Fettes was marked by beating, bullying, and
13 buggery. I suffered badly from two and narrowly missed
14 the third. I might add that while rum was not prevalent
15 at Fettes, I know that at least one pupil kept a bottle
16 in his tuck box.

17 In a nutshell, my time at Fettes was not a great
18 success. Apart from instilling in me a lifelong love of
19 music and choral singing and a love of the English
20 language, Fettes did very little for me. This was
21 partly my fault, of course, but was also due in the
22 large part to the behaviour I experienced from my peers
23 and some of those in authority, in which I include the
24 headmaster.

25 But what is the point in continuing with what could

1 be a lengthy diatribe? All of those responsible --
2 including at least one of my abusing peers, a senior
3 house prefect -- are long dead. Either those in charge
4 knew and did nothing, or were ignorant.

5 Both are equally culpable."

6 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email
7 and it's dated 17 September 2020.

8 'Matthew' (read)

9 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference
10 FET-000000213. The witness wishes to remain anonymous
11 and he has adopted the pseudonym of 'Matthew'. The
12 statement is in the form of an email and it's dated
13 15 September 2020.

14 "Maybe a nil return has no purpose but looking
15 back -- I am just 70! -- to my 14 terms at Fettes from
16 January 1964 to July 1968 I cannot recall a single
17 incident which could be reasonably called abuse beyond
18 the regular beatings administered by both masters and
19 prefects."

20 Ian Ross (read)

21 MS BENNIE: My Lady, the next read-in bears the reference
22 FET-000000213. This is a statement by Ian Ross.
23 Mr Ross has waived anonymity. The statement is in the
24 form of an email and it's dated 16 September 2020.

25 "When I was at Fettes there was strict discipline

1 and bad behaviour was punished by such things as early
2 morning cold showers and runs, callings, or canes. But
3 most public schools, as well as prep schools, in the UK
4 did the same thing at that time. And, whilst it was
5 pretty awful to endure, I'm sure it never did anyone any
6 harm.

7 And for sure there was no sexual abuse of any sort.
8 Nobody ever heard of anything like that.

9 Personally I was always in trouble and I was no
10 tough guy either, much preferring squash to rugby.

11 People have to realise that all public schools in
12 Britain, and a lot of the prep schools too, were very
13 tough in the 1950s and 1960s. It doesn't make it
14 better -- that's just how it was, and Fettes, Loretto
15 and Gordonstoun were at the top in this tough list and
16 rather proud of it.

17 A lot of it came from the fact that, because it was
18 soon after the Second World War, a lot of the teachers
19 were ex-military officers who brought tough discipline
20 with them.

21 But let's still not forget that all parents were
22 aware of this too and still paid high fees not to send
23 their kids to the local 'safe and free' grammar schools.

24 I would imagine that there are still students who do
25 not like boarding at public schools but I guess you'll

1 always get that."

2 'John' (read)

3 MS BENNIE: My Lady, the next read-in bears the reference

4 FET-00000213. It's the statement of 'John'. 'John'

5 wishes to remain anonymous and 'John' is a pseudonym.

6 "I was a boarder at Fettes from 1970 to 1975. I was

7 in Moredun House under two [REDACTED] housemasters,

8 FGP [REDACTED] and ECD [REDACTED] I am an

9 only child and my parents worked in West Africa

10 throughout the time I was at Fettes. I kept a diary

11 throughout my school years and wrote weekly to my mother

12 and father.

13 My experiences at Fettes were extremely positive.

14 I thoroughly enjoyed life in the boarding house and in

15 the school at large. I was reasonably academic (and

16 left Fettes with a scholarship to Cambridge) and fairly

17 sporty. I also enjoyed drama, the Duke of Edinburgh

18 Award Scheme, the CCF, and in particular the pipe band,

19 and the Christian Union.

20 In my first year in the house I was a fag, and

21 a personal one at that, which meant I was allocated to

22 a particular prefect. He was fair and friendly and

23 treated us fags as being like younger brothers. He

24 looked out for us and whilst we did tidy his study,

25 clean his shoes and fetch his books from time to time,

1 we didn't have a note to the date that he signed. I do
2 have it now. It's 15 October 2020.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much indeed.

4 'Peter' (read)

5 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

6 FET-00000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain
7 anonymous and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'Peter'.

8 "I was at Moredun House Fettes in the mid 1970s and
9 my brothers a few years earlier. I would characterise
10 the school as tough but fair and I neither experienced,
11 saw, or heard of behaviour I would characterise as abuse
12 of children. Moredun House under Mr FGP who
13 I would say was an eccentric, and Mr ECD
14 generated a real esprit de corps which I remember fondly
15 to this day. I believe the house and school encouraged
16 standing on your own two feet and putting the collective
17 before the individual, characteristics which I am
18 grateful for having learned.

19 I would say that when I went to Fettes I was
20 a spoilt child and the school did much to improve me in
21 that regard. Fagging existed when I first got there and
22 did me good rather than harm, consisting generally of
23 cleaning shoes and making tea or toast. Two-minute cold
24 showers were a light punishment and were regarded as
25 such, preferable to detentions.

1 When I went to Cambridge University and heard the
2 English schoolboys complaining about the college food,
3 I realised that Fettes cuisine was sadly lacking because
4 I thought college food was wonderful. Ditto when I went
5 on army camps. But I doubt that giving me a lifelong
6 aversion to tapioca counts as abuse.

7 I regard myself as fortunate to have experienced the
8 school, especially at Moredun."

9 This statement is in the form of an email and it's
10 dated 18 September 2020.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 'Patrick' (read)

13 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference
14 WIT-3-000001073. This witness wishes to remain
15 anonymous and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'Patrick'.

16 "My name is 'Patrick'. My year of birth is 1960.
17 I refer to an email of 18 September 2020 and confirm
18 that I believe the facts stated in my email to be true.
19 In that email I stated:

20 'I am pleased to hear that Fettes College is now
21 addressing the issue of pastoral care. While I did not
22 know of any physical or sexual abuse at Fettes during my
23 time, verbal mocking was remorseless and directed by
24 almost everyone to almost everyone. It was incessant
25 and created an unhealthy environment.

1 Perhaps I received more mocking verbal abuse than
2 most pupils. I am from Northern Ireland and the
3 terrorist violence of the 1970s both reduced my feelings
4 of well-being and provided other pupils with an easy
5 target for mockery. During my time at Fettes there were
6 thousands of bombings and many people at home were
7 injured. Some 1,291 people were killed as a result of
8 terrorist activities in Northern Ireland in that
9 five-year period. To put this into context, had such
10 a level of fatality been experienced across the UK,
11 there would have been over 45,000 people killed. Normal
12 life was severely restricted by the security forces'
13 attempts to prevent further trouble in Northern Ireland
14 and the climate of fear did not dissipate for decades.

15 However, no one at Fettes ever asked me how things
16 were at home. I was not aware of the existence of
17 pastoral care, nor was I aware of any effort to curb the
18 invidious behaviour of mockery, derision and ridicule.

19 I am left with mixed memories of Fettes. Teenage
20 boys will make friends and enjoy much of their time
21 irrespective of the surrounding regime, and while the
22 architecture of the buildings and the beauty of the
23 trees and grass of the campus remain a delight, I am
24 saddened that there was too much unpleasantness and
25 a lack of pastoral care.'

1 In essence the problem I faced at Fettes was that
2 rather than receiving psychological support through
3 discussion with friendly folk to counter the turmoil of
4 terrorist activity at home in Northern Ireland,
5 I received relentless mocking of my accent and country
6 of origin. My differences provided an opportunity for
7 derision and ridicule from the other pupils and there
8 was no structure in place or intervention by any member
9 of staff to indicate that this behaviour was wrong.
10 I think that staff were subconsciously unaware that it
11 was wrong and perhaps took the view that it did no harm
12 and might even toughen up a boy. It does not. It
13 weakens the boy, generates a feeling that he is not
14 worthy of care, breeds resentment, and causes the pupil
15 to disengage.

16 I have no objection to the evidence contained in my
17 email or this witness statement to be published as part
18 of this Inquiry."

19 My Lady, the statement is signed and it's dated
20 12 October 2021.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 'Kevin' (read)

23 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

24 FET-000000213. The witness wishes to remain anonymous
25 and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Kevin'.

1 "I was at Fettes College (senior element only) from
2 1976 to 1908 (Moredun House). All I can say is that the
3 entire experience was exceptional -- from the quality of
4 staff, teaching sports, pupil camaraderie and
5 opportunity and quality of pastoral care. Never once
6 did I detect a whiff of mis-propriety during my time at
7 the college and believe this is likely to be the
8 recollection across our year group (certainly from
9 within Moredun)."

10 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email
11 and it's dated 17 September 2020.

12 Jonathan Ritchie (read)

13 MS BENNIE: The next read-in bears the reference
14 FET-000000213. This is a statement of Jonathan Ritchie.
15 Mr Ritchie has waived anonymity and his statement is in
16 the form of an email dated 15 September 2020 and it
17 states:

18 "Fettes contributed to the abuse of children by
19 placing underage prefects in the charge of children to
20 cut costs."

21 Francis Salvesen (read)

22 MS BENNIE: The next read-in bears the reference
23 FET-000000213. This is the witness statement of Francis
24 Salvesen. The witness has waived anonymity and the
25 statement is in the form of an email, which is dated

1 15 September 2020.

2 "I welcome the opportunity to contribute to your
3 investigations and will limit my observations and view
4 to ECG [REDACTED]

5 I knew ECG [REDACTED] throughout my years at
6 Fettes, from 1979 to 1984, and in my prior years at
7 Cargilfield from 1973 to 1979.

8 We met regularly whenever he was at Fettes, where he
9 was not only a regular visiting [REDACTED] but also taught
10 sixth formers general knowledge and came to speak to
11 a sixth form club I formed, along with Norman Drummond,
12 called 'Offside', which discussed current affairs.

13 As a potential officer I wanted to join the Royal
14 Scots, where ECG [REDACTED] served during the war, so
15 he often invited me to the Queen's House, [REDACTED]
16 [REDACTED] to discuss his life and what it would be like in
17 the army and in that regiment. He also arranged lunches
18 at Edinburgh Castle in the officers' mess, where I could
19 meet and talk to serving officers.

20 Throughout our master-schoolboy relationship
21 ECG [REDACTED] was totally proper and professional.
22 There was never any hint of any impropriety either in
23 what he said or in any actions, either with me or with
24 the very many other students he taught and advised. He
25 was a perfect gentleman who took a very positive and

1 paternal interest in furthering and informing the lives
2 of his charges.

3 I am outraged that Fettes has taken down [REDACTED]
4 dedicated to him and urge you to ensure that this is
5 returned to its proper place. I also urge you to stand
6 up for ECG [REDACTED] against anyone who has slandered
7 his name. I simply do not believe any truth in any
8 paedophile accusations made against him: that was not
9 his nature or the way he thought or acted.

10 ECG [REDACTED] was dedicated to helping young men
11 in a totally Christian way. He allowed many Fettesians
12 to use his cottage in Anstruther, where there were
13 wonderful weekends which Fettes staff supervised
14 ECG [REDACTED] was never there himself).

15 I would also add that I have discussed this matter
16 with my father, who is now in his 80s, and who was also
17 [REDACTED] during the time ECG [REDACTED] was
18 teaching and advising and he is also outraged at
19 accusations of impropriety. It is simply not true.
20 There were never any suggestions, rumours or accusations
21 made against ECG [REDACTED] during his time as
22 [REDACTED] Nor indeed were there any made against
23 ECG [REDACTED] before that, as my father knew ECG [REDACTED]
24 ECG [REDACTED] well all his life. He has demanded of me that
25 I convey his disgust at these suggestions of impropriety

1 and urges you to reject them totally, and ensure that
2 this is conveyed to all the staff past and present."
3 My Lady, that concludes the read-ins for this
4 afternoon.
5 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. So what does tomorrow
6 hold in store for us, Mr Brown?
7 MR BROWN: My Lady, all being well, we will have two live
8 witnesses and the same on Friday, all of which will be
9 focusing on 'Edgar'.
10 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much indeed.
11 I'll rise now until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning.
12 Thank you all very much for your attendance here today.
13 (3.30 pm)
14 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am
15 on Thursday, 25 November 2021)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

'Robert' (sworn)	1
Questions from Mr Brown	2
'Colin' (read)	86
'David' (read)	100
'Grant' (read)	109
'John' (read)	114
'Brian' (read)	121
'Ian' (read)	125
'Sherlock' (read)	128
'Ben' (read)	129
'Michael' (read)	131
'Jason' (read)	132
Norman Rowbotham (read)	133
'John' (read)	134
'Matthew' (read)	135
Ian Ross (read)	135
'John' (read)	137
'Peter' (read)	139
'Patrick' (read)	140
'Kevin' (read)	142
Jonathan Ritchie (read)	143
Francis Salvesen (read)	143

