

1

Tuesday, 28 May 2024

2 (10.00 am)

3

(Proceedings delayed)

4 (10.15 am)

5 LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome to the next chapter,  
6 Chapter 6 of Phase 8 of our case study hearings in this  
7 section of the Inquiry's work. We will, in this  
8 chapter, be looking at provision by Dr Guthrie's Schools  
9 and Loaningdale, starting with the Dr Guthrie's part of  
10 the evidence.

11 Now, Mr Sheldon, if you would like to introduce what  
12 is happening today, that would be helpful.

13 Submissions by Mr Sheldon

14 MR SHELDON: As my Lady says, in this chapter we'll be  
15 looking at the Dr Guthrie's Schools in Edinburgh and  
16 Loaningdale School, just outside Biggar.

17 Dr Guthrie's operated as Approved and List D Schools  
18 until they closed in 1985 and 1986 respectively. The  
19 boys' school was situated in Liberton and the girls'  
20 school fairly close by in Gilmerton. The buildings are  
21 still there, albeit now used for other purposes and  
22 I'll be showing some photographs of them later today.

23 Dr Guthrie's was operated through a charitable trust  
24 which is still extant, albeit that it now runs purely as  
25 a grant-giving body and isn't involved in the provision

1 of residential childcare.

2 Loaningdale operated from 1963 until about 1989. It  
3 was seen at the time as an experimental school, taking  
4 what was thought to be a more child-centred approach to  
5 running such establishments. One of the things the  
6 Inquiry is interested to establish is whether such  
7 an approach reduced the incidents of abuse.

8 The organisation that ran Loaningdale also now  
9 operates only as a grant-giving body, supporting various  
10 projects and schemes around children and young people.  
11 We'll hear later in the case study from the respective  
12 chairs of these bodies, Elizabeth Ridder and Angus Knox,  
13 Ms Ridder will be giving evidence next week and Mr Knox  
14 in the week after.

15 Today, my Lady, we have a witness, Alison Scott, who  
16 is the archivist employed by Dr Guthrie's to look at and  
17 sort, as I understand it, the records that are held by  
18 the Records of Scotland, not by Dr Guthrie's, again, as  
19 I understand it, and we can ask Ms Scott later what her  
20 instructions were and what she did.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 MR SHELDON: I understand, my Lady, that there may be  
23 introductions to be made by other parties.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

25 Now, Mr Macpherson.

1 Submissions by Mr Macpherson

2 MR MACPHERSON: Thank you, my Lady. I appear for the  
3 Loaningdale School Company Limited and I'm grateful for  
4 the opportunity to make this short opening statement  
5 this morning.

6 The Loaningdale School Company was responsible for  
7 the one school of that name in Biggar. The company has  
8 no connection with any other educational establishment,  
9 past or present. It no longer has any direct  
10 involvement in the education of children.

11 The company was registered as a charity in 1962 in  
12 order to set up the school. Although the school was  
13 closed in 1989, as Mr Sheldon says, the charity  
14 continues to exist. It remained in existence to manage  
15 and disperse the funds that it held when the school  
16 closed. It continues to do so for charitable purposes.

17 Its current objective is to provide financial  
18 assistance to children and young people in need, with  
19 particular focus on those residing within the area of  
20 Clydesdale in South Lanarkshire. The company provides  
21 loans and grants for projects that others carry out. It  
22 has funded individuals, schools, sports clubs and  
23 community events.

24 It has not, since 1989, had any direct management or  
25 control over any services, education or otherwise, and

1           it exists solely to provide funding.

2           I'm conscious, my Lady, that the company comes  
3           before the Inquiry unable to provide much information  
4           about Loaningdale School. While the school was in  
5           operation, between 1962 and 1989, the company was  
6           responsible for it. However, as the Inquiry is,  
7           I believe, aware, those presently working for the  
8           company who had no connection with it while the school  
9           was in operation, have, despite their investigations,  
10          been unable to trace any documents or records beyond  
11          those the Inquiry may already have.

12          The company submitted a response to the Inquiry's  
13          Section 21 notice in April 2017.

14          The company has, of course, considered what is said  
15          about the school in the Inquiry's framework document.  
16          This describes the setting up of Loaningdale as  
17          an Approved School and becoming a List D School in 1971.  
18          The evidence suggests that Loaningdale was to an extent  
19          seen as offering an alternative or more liberal approach  
20          to the provision of education.

21          The company sees there is some evidence that may  
22          criticise Loaningdale, including in relation to  
23          discipline, although it observes that some complaints  
24          appear to be rather more about a lack of discipline than  
25          about enforcement or punishment.

1           The company is aware of the importance of the  
2           Inquiry's work. I can advise that its chairman, Mr Knox  
3           is present today. I understand that the Inquiry intends  
4           to call Mr Knox as a witness later, during these  
5           hearings. Mr Knox is happy to assist the Inquiry in any  
6           way that he can.

7           I can reassure your Ladyship that Mr Knox and the  
8           company will pay close attention to all the evidence the  
9           Inquiry hears in relation to Loaningdale. The company  
10          will reflect on that evidence, and if there's anything  
11          further it can usefully add, then it will of course seek  
12          to do so in its closing statement in due course.

13          In the meantime, my Lady, the company is grateful  
14          for the opportunity to be represented at this stage in  
15          the Inquiry proceedings. Thank you.

16   LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Mr Macpherson.

17          Now, just turning to the representation for  
18          Dr Guthrie's, Mr Haywood, are you proposing to make  
19          an opening statement?

20   MR HAYWOOD: No, my Lady. I'm content with what was said  
21          back in September 2023.

22   LADY SMITH: Very well. Thank you.

23   MR SHELDON: My Lady, an issue has arisen this morning about  
24          Ms Scott's evidence and the A to D submitted by  
25          Dr Guthrie's. I would be grateful for a very short

1 break just to clarify, if we can, the position there.

2 LADY SMITH: Well, I'm happy to do that. I was told earlier  
3 on that there were some matters that still needed to be  
4 checked. If you can keep in touch with me. We can  
5 maybe try to keep this to about 15 minutes, but let me  
6 know how things are progressing.

7 MR SHELDON: I would hope less than that, my Lady.

8 LADY SMITH: Very well. Thank you.

9 (10.22 am)

10 (A short break)

11 (10.30 am)

12 LADY SMITH: Mr Sheldon.

13 MR SHELDON: My Lady, I'm grateful for the brief break. As  
14 it happens, I don't think we'll be able to clarify the  
15 particular issue that arose today, but we will try. We  
16 have, of course, the chair of Dr Guthrie's coming next  
17 week and we can explore the matter with her at that  
18 time.

19 LADY SMITH: That will be helpful. Very well. So, the  
20 witness, I think, is ready; is that correct?

21 MR SHELDON: I believe so, my Lady.

22 LADY SMITH: Very well. Thank you.

23 Alison Scott (affirmed)

24 LADY SMITH: I hope the first question is an easy one for  
25 you. How would you like me to address you? I'm happy

1 to use your first name or --

2 A. First name is fine, yes.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Alison.

4 Now, you know that we're going to ask you about some  
5 work you've done on archives and the documents that are  
6 available to you are in that red folder in front of you.  
7 You might find that helpful. We'll also be able to put  
8 some documents up on screen. But, if you want us to go  
9 to anything that we haven't done, no doubt you can let  
10 us know.

11 As you go through your evidence, Alison, if you have  
12 any questions, please don't hesitate to speak up or if  
13 there's something you think we should be asking you  
14 because it would be helpful, do let us know.

15 A. Right.

16 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Mr Sheldon.

17 He'll take it from there; is that okay?

18 Questions by Mr Sheldon

19 MR SHELDON: Thank you, my Lady.

20 Alison, you very helpfully provided a CV to the  
21 Inquiry and I think it should be in your folder in front  
22 of you; do you have that there?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Perhaps we can just begin by having a look at that. If  
25 we take it, as it were, in reverse order and go to the

1 last page of it.

2 A. Oh, right.

3 Q. Can I just ask you, first of all -- I should have said,  
4 you describe yourself as a freelance archivist; do you  
5 have any qualifications?

6 A. Yes. I did a masters of archive administration at the  
7 University of Liverpool and I qualified as an archivist  
8 in 1991.

9 Q. On page 3 of your CV, the third page, you describe -- or  
10 you set out some jobs that you had starting in 1991 with  
11 Oxfordshire Archives?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And really quite a wide variety of jobs or posts since  
14 then. I think we see that in 2011, 2013, you were  
15 responsible for two Wellcome funded projects, working at  
16 the Royal College of Physicians; can you just tell us  
17 a little about that and what that involved?

18 A. The Royal College of Physicians in Edinburgh, which is  
19 on Queen Street here in Edinburgh, they were founded  
20 in -- late 17th century and they had a lot of  
21 collections that had been deposited with them in the  
22 archive by fellows of the college. So this is not  
23 necessarily the records relating to the college itself,  
24 but collections that have been accumulated by fellows of  
25 the college.



1           So they managed to get Wellcome Trust funding for  
2           a project to catalogue those collections and that's what  
3           I did for the two years I was there.

4   Q. All right. Perhaps just arising from that: can I just  
5           ask you what the job of an archivist really involves?  
6           It's something that one thinks one knows, but just to  
7           get in your own words the function it is?

8   A. Yes, I have specialised increasingly of recent years,  
9           but that job at the Royal College of Physicians is  
10          a case in point in cataloguing. I mean, that is not the  
11          only function that an archivist performs. But it's the  
12          one that I enjoy the most, so that's the one  
13          I've specialised in.

14          Archives are unique, unlike library material, which  
15          you can access anywhere, mostly. And library material  
16          is easier to describe because you've got an author, a  
17          title, and it's quite easy to catalogue library  
18          collections.

19          Archive collections, every single collection is  
20          unique. So trying to describe the collection in a way  
21          that makes it useful for other people to access it, to  
22          try and get an understanding of what's in the  
23          collection, so they don't have to just go through  
24          everything that's there. They can actually have some  
25          kind of catalogue that gives them an indication of the

1 material that's in the collection and what might  
2 actually be useful to them for their research.

3 Q. Would it be fair to say it's a means of organising  
4 information?

5 A. Organising information, absolutely.

6 Q. You talk about a number of other jobs that you carried  
7 out, University of Stirling, creating an online  
8 catalogue and customising software?

9 A. Mm hmm.

10 Q. Were you writing the software yourself?

11 A. The software, there is a software that's called Calm,  
12 which is computing for archives, libraries and museums,  
13 is the acronym. But a lot of archives use it and the  
14 University of Stirling uses it.

15 But a large part of the collection of the Royal  
16 Scottish National Hospital was the case files relating  
17 to the children who were admitted and I did some  
18 adaptations to the screen to capture information on  
19 those files relating to the father's occupation and  
20 various other kind of social elements relating to the  
21 children to make it more useful to researchers who are  
22 wanting to use the collection.

23 Q. Right. Thank you very much.

24 The first page of your CV, there is a post that you  
25 describe as project archivist at the University of

1 Stirling. You say that you produced a survey of the  
2 dispersed collections of the Institute for Retail  
3 Studies:

4 '... carried out appraisal and disposal and  
5 organised transfer of core records.'

6 What do you mean by 'appraisal' in that context?

7 A. The Institute for Retail Studies, it's their 40th  
8 anniversary this year, so that was the instigator for  
9 this project. They have -- they had a large resource  
10 centre with a lot of duplicated material in it. They'd  
11 also had -- there were also two deposited collections,  
12 one from the founder of the institute and another retail  
13 analyst, and there was duplication across all three  
14 elements of the collections. So appraisal in that  
15 context largely related to identifying that duplication,  
16 identifying material that perhaps wasn't as important  
17 for long-term preservation, because it was a voluminous  
18 collection. If they wanted to transfer it all to the  
19 university archives that wouldn't be possible because  
20 they didn't have the space, so some kind of appraisal  
21 criteria had to be applied that -- looking at what was  
22 more fundamental to the institute's work and making sure  
23 that was flagged up and less important information could  
24 possibly be disposed of, if that's what they decided in  
25 the future.

1 Q. A process of sifting out material --

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. -- in some respects.

4 Moving on again, you say that you started working as  
5 a freelance archivist in November 2018 and you've set  
6 out the various contracts that you worked on. I see  
7 that in the last few years two very interesting entries  
8 for the Campari Group and Edrington Group?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Can you tell us a little bit about that?

11 A. Well, whisky companies have money to pay for archive  
12 work and they have the business interest in developing  
13 the heritage side of the business, because that's what  
14 sells whisky, because people like the connection between  
15 Scottish history and the drink.

16 So Macallan has been quite a regular client and  
17 it's -- for example, the last work I did for them was --  
18 it sounds boring, but it's very important from their  
19 point of view -- was cataloguing whiskey bottle labels  
20 because Macallan whiskey sells for so much money they  
21 have to be able to authenticate the bottles. So knowing  
22 what the label should say, what the label stock code  
23 numbers and so forth are, they need to know all that  
24 information so they can authenticate bottles of whisky  
25 should they come up for auction.

1 Q. Thank you.

2 More germanely to our investigations, we see that  
3 you did some work for Aberlour Childcare Trust in 2020  
4 and Quarriers in 2019; can you tell us, if you can,  
5 a little bit about that and how that came about?

6 A. The Quarriers work was -- I think the safeguarding team  
7 there just did an internet search for an archivist,  
8 which is how they found me.

9 As it happens, I actually live quite near where  
10 Quarriers was in Kilmacolm, so I knew -- and my mother  
11 used to teach there, so I knew about the Quarriers  
12 Homes.

13 I think possibly coming out of their contact with  
14 the Inquiry, they realised that they wanted to improve  
15 their record keeping -- certain aspects of it that they  
16 wanted to improve and they asked me to do -- it wasn't  
17 a catalogue; it was just a scoping report looking at the  
18 list of records that's -- prepared for the Inquiry, how  
19 accurate it was. Looking at other records that were  
20 held in the Quarriers headquarters. Looking at the  
21 condition of the records, what could be improved  
22 condition-wise, whether there is anywhere on site that  
23 they could use for an archive.

24 There were additional issues about the charges that  
25 were being made for software that -- they had been

1 digitising case files and the software was costing them  
2 a lot: should they translate to another supplier? Those  
3 kind of issues.

4 So it was only about two or three weeks work.  
5 I can't actually remember now. And I wrote a report  
6 and, unfortunately, the man who is head of safeguarding  
7 has since left, so I don't know whether that has been  
8 pursued or not.

9 Q. So the Quarriers work was really the result of Quarriers  
10 involvement in the Inquiry?

11 A. I think so. That was my understanding, yes.

12 Q. And was the same true of the Aberlour contract?

13 A. Aberlour, slightly different. They were going to  
14 deposit the records with -- the historic records with  
15 the University of Stirling, which they've since done.  
16 So Archives Revealed is a scheme run by The National  
17 Archives in London and they got scoping report money to  
18 kind of assess the collection, which was, at that  
19 time -- was being kept in records management storage in  
20 a very -- slightly haphazard way. So it's like looking  
21 at the collection in its entirety and assessing how long  
22 it would take to catalogue and what kind of issues might  
23 come up with the cataloguing.

24 So, again, that was only six days' work.

25 These Archives Revealed scoping report grants are

1           very specific. You know, small amount of work, you  
2           produce the report and they can then go on to apply for  
3           other grant funding, should they want to, and they did  
4           and -- yes.

5   Q.   So they did go on?

6   A.   They did. They deposited the records with University of  
7           Stirling. I think they then got funding for cataloguing  
8           work, which has been finished. Not by me, but somebody  
9           else has catalogued it.

10  Q.   All right. Thank you. That's interesting.

11           Coming up to date, at least for our purposes, we see  
12           that in 2022, you did some work for the Dr Guthrie's  
13           Association?

14  A.   Yeah.

15  Q.   You described that as cataloguing their archives,  
16           suggesting items for exhibition and providing --

17  A.   No, Dr Guthrie's --

18  Q.   I'm sorry. I'm reading the wrong line. I'm so sorry.  
19           Researching their archives held at NRS to fulfil the  
20           requirements of this Inquiry.

21           First of all, I should ask you: can you tell us  
22           exactly what your instructions were?

23  A.   I was first contacted in December 2021 by Lindsays  
24           solicitors and they -- it was initially quite -- they  
25           were making -- stating the problem, in that Dr Guthrie's

1 Association is run by volunteer -- I'm just reading  
2 my -- what -- the actual wording of the initial email:

3 'Our client is staffed by and run by volunteers and  
4 so to meet this request they require specialist support  
5 in processing the archival materials held both by  
6 themselves and by the National Records of Scotland.'

7 So they wanted me -- I then had a phone conversation  
8 with Paul Harper at Lindsays about what that would  
9 actually entail. My understanding was that I would be  
10 looking at the material still held at Azets' offices in  
11 Edinburgh and at the National Records of Scotland from  
12 1913 until the date when the schools closed.

13 Other than the material that had already been  
14 identified for scanning in its entirety, which was the  
15 admissions and discharge registers. They were  
16 scanned -- my understanding is they were scanned --  
17 well, scanning was arranged for those before I was  
18 involved in the project.

19 LADY SMITH: Sorry, just to interrupt. Forgive me, Alison.

20 Documents were in two places, the National Records of  
21 Scotland, but also in the office of Azets; the chartered  
22 accountants?

23 A. Azets, yes. They performed secretarial support to  
24 Dr Guthrie's Association and as far as I know they still  
25 have some of the later Dr Guthrie's material in their



1 office. I did speak to Alan Borthwick at the National  
2 Records of Scotland. They're happy for them to deposit  
3 that remaining -- those remaining records. Whether they  
4 have or will, I don't know, obviously.

5 Q. All right.

6 Can I ask you then, first of all: what was the  
7 extent of the archive?

8 I mean, put bluntly: how big was it?

9 A. The catalogue and the material at the National Records  
10 of Scotland has been catalogued, not in a huge amount of  
11 detail, but at least by item. There are 321 items in  
12 the catalogue. But obviously -- and I think Paul Harper  
13 at Lindsays referred to it as being 19 metres of records  
14 held, linear metres of actual space taken up by this  
15 collection.

16 Obviously, not all of that is -- comes within the  
17 remit of this Inquiry because some of it is pre-1930  
18 because the schools were founded before that. So I was  
19 briefed to look at everything from 1930 onwards, as  
20 I say, apart from the stuff that was already identified  
21 for scanning.

22 Q. Are these in the form of books of some sort?

23 A. Sorry?

24 Q. The documents were in the form of books?

25 A. Books and there was -- there were case files. Although

1           that is a separate issue, so the decision was made not  
2           to look at all of those. There were cards, I think  
3           record cards for staff, record cards for pupils. But it  
4           was mostly volumes, yes, I would say so. Some  
5           photographs and published material, which was outwith  
6           the remit of this Inquiry.

7   Q. And the volumes relating to years or runs of years?

8   A. Runs of years, yes.

9   Q. What sort of condition were the documents in?

10  A. Good, yes. They'd obviously been well looked after.

11  Q. You said they were catalogued, so were they ordered then  
12       on the shelves?

13  A. The National Records of Scotland has quite a flat  
14       approach to cataloguing. They just take the records and  
15       just give them running numbers. They don't try and  
16       organise them in -- from an archival point of view, we  
17       try to organise things more hierarchically, but they  
18       just have too much material to invest that kind of time  
19       in cataloguing. So it was quite a flat cataloguing  
20       structure, but they did start with the minutes. I mean,  
21       it started with what they perceived as being the more  
22       important material and then ending with photographs,  
23       which obviously were less important for the purposes of  
24       this Inquiry.

25  Q. Yes. You mentioned case files; are those case files for

1 individual children then?

2 A. Only for the boys' school. The girls' school, no case  
3 files. But there were 123 boxes of case files. So I  
4 timed how long it would take me to go through a box and  
5 the decision was made that it would take over 60 hours  
6 to go through all the boxes. So without -- if we'd  
7 known individual names of boys we could have asked --  
8 called up the specific files for any particular boys,  
9 but I wasn't given those names, so I didn't do that.

10 Q. And the files, were they loose leafs or --

11 A. Yes, they were like correspondence. And I do have  
12 a description of what's in them, if you need that.

13 Q. All right. If you have it handy?

14 A. Yes, and it's -- I did an analysis of the records that I  
15 cited. I don't know if you were given this document by  
16 Azets?

17 Q. I have it. I was going to take you to it, actually.

18 A. Okay. Yes, so -- I only, as I say, looked at one,  
19 because it's easy to look at online, but ...

20 Q. Before we get -- we will look at the document that  
21 you've mentioned, the records that you have cited.

22 A. Right, I might look at it online because it is easier  
23 than trying to deal with the paper version.

24 Q. We do have that and we can show it to you on the screen  
25 in a moment or two.

1           Just wanted to ask you about your approach to  
2           examining the archive. You talked about sampling the  
3           case files; did you personally look at all the records?  
4    A. Yes.  
5    Q. All right. And I think some of them are handwritten; is  
6           that right?  
7    A. The majority, yeah.  
8    Q. Yeah. Did you find the handwriting easy to decipher?  
9    A. Yes, that's -- you get used to reading handwriting if  
10           you do this work, yeah.  
11   Q. This is a relief because we'll be showing some of it  
12           later on.  
13   A. Oh, right. Oh, no.  
14   Q. Certainly I found some of them quite hard to decipher.  
15           Did you provide the association, Dr Guthrie's, with  
16           reports, regular reports? How did that work?  
17   A. I gave them updates as to what I'd seen that week --  
18           mainly because we were concerned about the upcoming  
19           deadlines and so on. So we wanted to make sure I was  
20           moving through the material quickly enough.  
21           I -- there was a change in approach to the logbooks.  
22           The National Records of Scotland didn't have the  
23           capacity to digitise them, so I was going to go through,  
24           read them and photograph relevant pages. So I was  
25           sending the images that I took to Azets and they were

1           uploading them and sending them on to the Inquiry. So  
2           that was another way that they were being kept abreast  
3           of what I had been looking at.

4   Q. So if we can look, please, at DGS-000003005.

5   A. Right.

6   Q. You may not recognise that immediately as your document.  
7           It's an adaptation of the document that you provided to  
8           the Inquiry.

9   A. Right, okay.

10   Q. For the record, my Lady, the reference to that document  
11           is DGS-000001186, but there was a difficulty fitting it  
12           all on the screen physically because of the amount of  
13           information it contained.

14   A. Yes.

15   Q. So, I think on the first page of that -- and I'm sorry,  
16           my Lady, would you bear with me just for a moment?

17   LADY SMITH: Certainly.

18   MR SHELDON:

19           (Pause)

20           Sorry, my Lady, it's my fault, working the  
21           technology. Or not, as the case may be.

22           (Pause)

23           Thank you, my Lady.

24           So I think on the first page you're dealing with  
25           records that you saw. If we can perhaps just expand

1           what's on the big screen a little, please. It's quite  
2           small writing.

3           We see the first entry there is the Dr Guthrie's  
4           minute book.

5   A. Mm-hmm.

6   Q. There is a description, contents, and we see in the  
7       column to the far right a heading; is that 'Scans'?

8   A. Yes.

9   Q. What did you mean by 'scans'?

10  A. The items that I -- this particular volume is still  
11       held -- well, was held at the Azets office when I saw  
12       it. So I think in that instance I told Kirsty Ashworth,  
13       at Azets, that those particular pages mentioned things  
14       that came within the remit of the Section 21 notice.  
15       They were to do with discipline. They were to do with  
16       staff and she scanned and sent them in through whatever  
17       system it was that they use.

18  Q. Yes. I think we see in that heading, 'Scans', the  
19       second entry, page 241, a teacher in the boys' school  
20       struck pupils and was given a final warning. We,  
21       I think, have that record to show you later on.

22           But can we take it that where there was an entry  
23       suggestive of abuse that was something that you would  
24       scan?

25  A. Yes, anything that was out of the ordinary, I flagged

1       it, yeah.

2       Q. I think there is also a note, page 378, Ms Martin asked  
3       to resign. Again, I think we can have a look at that  
4       record later on.

5             If we can go over the page, please, there is  
6       a reference in the first column to, again, minute books,  
7       and in the second block of entries, school logbooks.

8             I think we see that there was a daily record of  
9       activities. Page 19 suggests that a boy had been  
10      thrashed on the bare bottom.

11            Page 23, a teacher struck a boy and was given  
12      a warning.

13            Page 41 to 43, a teacher seems to have been charged  
14      in relation to assault and, a little down the page,  
15      a named pupil was slapped by a teacher, and several  
16      entries suggesting that boys were being engaged in  
17      sexual activity with older men outside the school.

18            If we go over the page again, please, this is  
19      another logbook, boys' school logbook, 1977 to 1985,  
20      report of a teacher hitting a pupil. Pupil taken away  
21      for the weekend by a member of staff. Again, we can  
22      have a look at some of those records.

23            Page 6, note there were record cards for each boy  
24      giving various dates, release, end of supervision. That  
25      is for the period 1956 to 1970; were there similar cards

1           for other periods or was it only for that period?

2   A.   The girls' and boys' schools employee cards; is that

3           what you're talking about?

4   Q.   Can we expand what's on the screen, please?

5   LADY SMITH:  You mentioned a period, 1956 to 1970,

6           Mr Sheldon.

7   MR SHELDON:  Yes, my Lady.

8   LADY SMITH:  I'm struggling to find that on this page.

9   MR SHELDON:  I am, too, my Lady.  This is -- is this the

10           third page, page 3 of this document?

11   LADY SMITH:  These are record books for each individual boy.

12           There is an entry there for boys' school logbook and

13           then boys' school -- the employee cards, but it's the

14           boys and that would be the 1977 to 1985 period that's on

15           that page.

16   MR SHELDON:  I'll come back to that, my Lady.

17           I'm struggling to see the screen and I don't have a hard

18           copy of that.  In the 'Scans' column again --

19   LADY SMITH:  It's right over to the right-hand side.

20   MR SHELDON:  Right-hand side.  This is the girls' school

21           log, so I think further down that page.

22   LADY SMITH:  This is the pupil cards there for 1984 to 1986.

23   MR SHELDON:  Yes.

24           I'm sorry, my Lady.

25   LADY SMITH:  Do you want us to go over to the right-hand



1 side there? There may be something on the scans for  
2 that.

3 MR SHELDON: Yes.

4 LADY SMITH: No.

5 MR SHELDON: It's my fault, my Lady. I think I'm misreading  
6 my own notes. Sorry, it's actually page 6 of this  
7 document. Page 6, please.

8 There we have the record cards in left-hand column,  
9 1965 to 1970, a card for each boy. The question was: is  
10 that the only period for which there were such cards or  
11 are there --

12 A. There were -- I'll get my own copy, if I may. Record  
13 cards. I did actually look at -- the GD425 references  
14 are the catalogue references at the National Records of  
15 Scotland. This first one, 1956 to 1970, and there were  
16 three other sets as well and 1970 to 1977. And there is  
17 another slightly anomalous bundle, 1957 to 1975, which  
18 had been arranged into different categories.

19 I don't think I looked at the bundle for -- the 281  
20 bundle, because it would have been very similar, so  
21 I didn't -- I thought the same information would be  
22 given as were given in items 280 and 282, which is ...

23 The other entry isn't on here. I don't know why.  
24 But I did look at two bundles which covered the period  
25 1956 to 1977.

1 Q. Okay. Thank you.

2 If we can look at page 9 in this document, please.

3 Scrolling down to the foot, Dr Guthrie's Girls' School

4 logbook, and over to the far right-hand side --

5 LADY SMITH: This is for 1971 to 1973; is that correct?

6 MR SHELDON: That's right, my Lady.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

8 MR SHELDON: There are various entries there in relation to

9 a LIA or Mr LIA and I think, scrolling down, we see

10 there are various complaints against him.

11 A. Mm-hmm.

12 Q. I think you found some records about that episode or

13 chapter.

14 A. That's the only case of specific names that I was given

15 to particularly look out for -- was relating to this

16 gardener and the four girls that complained about him.

17 So that's why I concentrated on that particular

18 incident.

19 Q. All right.

20 You weren't asked to look into an individual called

21 Pountney [REDACTED]?

22 A. No, I was never given those specific names. If I found

23 information, it was just because I was looking in

24 a general sense.

25 Q. All right. Sure. Again, we can look at the records in

1 relation to LIA and Mr Pountney later on.

2 So, if we put that aside -- and that gives us  
3 an idea of the breadth of the records that you looked  
4 at, Alison. And if we can look, please, at a document  
5 DRG.001.001.0049.

6 I think we see, first of all, that's a letter to the  
7 Inquiry, to Lady Smith, dated 29 September 2017. This  
8 is the heading -- it's headed:

9 'Answers to sections C to D.'

10 As I think you now know, the A to D and indeed the C  
11 to D, are our term for reports given to the Inquiry that  
12 are sought by the Inquiry from various individuals and  
13 organisations.

14 The C to D covers, in particular, matters relating  
15 to abuse and alleged abuse. If we just look briefly at  
16 the letter, in the first paragraph we are told:

17 'As previously advised Dr Guthrie's schools closed  
18 in 1986 and the association has no contact with any of  
19 those involved in running the schools. In order to be  
20 able to respond to sections C to D of the Inquiry, we  
21 employed a researcher to review the school's minutes,  
22 which are principally held in the National Records  
23 Office.'

24 The letter goes on to narrate some matters that the  
25 researcher talked about.

1           When were you instructed?

2   A. 2021.

3   Q. All right. So the researcher is not you?

4   A. Not me, as I had, yes, misled you earlier. Yes.

5   Q. I'm sure it was my fault, Alison. This is the letter  
6       covering the provision of the C to D report. That being  
7       so, can we take it that the material that you found  
8       wouldn't be reflected or wouldn't necessarily be  
9       reflected in this document?

10  A. Wouldn't necessarily. But, having looked at it, I mean,  
11       it does -- there is some duplication obviously, because  
12       I think we were having -- whoever this other researcher  
13       was, we obviously -- there's only -- we would have been  
14       looking at the same material.

15  Q. Yes. If we look, for example, at ...

16           Go to page 34 in the document, please. This is in  
17       a section dealing with abuse and response to abuse, what  
18       we call the Part D report.

19           At page 34, we see a reference -- this is the top of  
20       the page, paragraph -- (vi), there was an internal  
21       investigation into allegations about a Mr Pountney and  
22       we're told that the school wasn't able to find the  
23       headmaster's note:

24           'Were recommendations made following the  
25       investigation? Not known.'

1           But it noted there was a change in recording minutes  
2           after the Pountney investigation at the boys' school.  
3           Previously headmaster reports on the schools were  
4           presented to the general purposes committee,  
5           subsequently this was changed to a different committee  
6           reporting system.

7           If we look at page 36, please, of this document,  
8           towards the top there, again, this is under the  
9           heading -- I'm sorry, I should have taken you to it:

10           'Known abusers at the establishment.

11           'Does the organisation know of specific abusers?'

12           And the school names two individuals there, Mr LIA  
13           and Mr Pountney; do you see that?

14   LADY SMITH: Which question are you addressing here?

15   MR SHELDON: I'm sorry, my Lady, this is question 5.8.

16           Moving on, of course, to the other headings of the  
17           question.

18           So the organisation does know of alleged abusers.  
19           If so, what are the names of the alleged abusers? There  
20           is mention of investigation into a Mr LIA at the girls'  
21           school and a Mr Pountney, teacher at the boys' school.

22           I think you've told us that Mr LIA was someone  
23           whose name you came across in your research?

24   A. Yes.

25   Q. But Mr Pountney was not; is that correct?

1 A. Well, 'LIA' was a name I was given by the solicitors,  
2 so I knew to particularly look for information. If  
3 I also found information relating to Pountney, it would  
4 have been because I was looking for anything that was  
5 indicative of abuse and -- but I hadn't known his name  
6 beforehand, so I didn't know to particularly look for  
7 him.

8 Q. All right.

9 I think if we move on to page 38, please, we see,  
10 right at the top of the page, the question:

11 'What was the form of response, eg apology, redress  
12 and so on?'.  
13

14 And the response is:

15 'Not known. Although the police and Procurator  
16 Fiscal were notified about Mr LIA.'

17 If we go to page 39, please, at the foot of that  
18 page -- this is under the heading 'Crown':

19 'To what extent has the Crown raised proceedings in  
20 respect of allegations of abuse?'.  
21

22 And we are told the minutes of October 1982 stated  
23 that Mr Pountney might be brought before the Sheriff in  
24 Arbroath:

25 'But we do not know whether this was related to the  
allegations made about him, although it would appear to  
be likely from the minutes.'

1           So, again, there is a focus on Mr LIA and  
2           Mr Pountney in this connection.

3           My Lady, I can say that at a late stage the Crown  
4           contacted the Inquiry to say that an individual was  
5           convicted in 1983 of sexual offences and his name was  
6           Pountney [REDACTED]. That was at Livingston, my Lady.

7 LADY SMITH: It looks as though they only searched in Forfar  
8           at this time.

9 MR SHELDON: Yes. We have of course asked for the papers in  
10          relation to that prosecution, but they have not -- this  
11          was only last week, my Lady, and the papers haven't yet  
12          been forthcoming.

13 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

14 MR SHELDON: But that will be attended to.

15 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

16 MR SHELDON: So, Alison, thank you for that.

17          I appreciate that you only saw this document, the A  
18          to D, this morning and there's perhaps a limit to what  
19          you can tell us about it. But it's helpful to know that  
20          your material wasn't part of the input for this  
21          document.

22 A. I don't think so. The way it's worded, they seem to  
23          very much have concentrated on looking at the minutes,  
24          whereas obviously I was looking at everything else as  
25          well. The logbooks were often a more informative source

1 of information. The minutes tend to be more sanitised.

2 Q. Yes. They're fairly high level; is that fair to say?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. So if we can turn then to look at some of the detail of  
5 the records.

6 I've tried to group these together under various  
7 headings and the first of these is: punishment and  
8 punishment returns.

9 If we can look, please, at DGS-000000459. And that  
10 should come up on the screen in front of you.

11 If we look at the entry for 25 August 1955; do we  
12 see a record there --

13 A. This is April and May.

14 Q. I'm so sorry, it's April.

15 Do we see there a record of five boys being denied  
16 a holiday because they'd failed to accumulate sufficient  
17 good conduct marks?

18 LADY SMITH: Do you have a date for that, Mr Sheldon?

19 MR SHELDON: I think it's 5 April.

20 LADY SMITH: We need to go back a little bit.

21 MR SHELDON: Top of the page.

22 LADY SMITH: There we are. Boys on holiday, 5th to 16th,  
23 five boys --

24 A. It's:

25 'Five boys deprived of holiday through failure to



1           obtain sufficient good conduct marks.'

2   MR SHELDON: Thank you.

3           One might think a rather draconian sanction for  
4           failure to obtain conduct marks?

5           These were presumably the Easter holidays at that  
6           time?

7   A. Possibly, yes.

8   Q. And if we look at DGS-000000472 and the entry for  
9           25 August 1955 --

10   LADY SMITH: Can we enlarge that any further or not?

11   MR SHELDON: I've found the writing very difficult, my Lady,  
12           I have to say.

13   LADY SMITH: That's better at that size. Thank you. Sorry,  
14           what date?

15   Q. 25 August 1955.

16   A. 'Four boys deprived of holiday through failure to obtain  
17           requisite percentage of good conduct marks.'

18   Q. Yes. And while we're looking at this record, perhaps  
19           you could look, please, at the entry for 30 September  
20           and if you can read that for us, please?

21   A. 'School visited by HMIS, Mr McPherson and Ms Renwick,  
22           SED to discuss question of staffing, suggested reduction  
23           of teaching staff by one at a convenient time.'

24           And:

25           'G, the assistant gardener, suggested that a boy

1 from Wellington Farm School come to assist the gardener,  
2 suggested that girls from the girls' school be employed  
3 in the kitchen. Payment of residential duty to staff at  
4 camp was discussed.'

5 Q. Thank you. So we see there the SED inspector has  
6 visited. It's not clear whether that was announced or  
7 unannounced from that entry. There is a question of  
8 staffing and it looks as though the school is trying to  
9 use pupils to cover staff roles; is that the thrust of  
10 the entry, do you think?

11 A. Yes, I would think.

12 Q. Thank you.

13 If we go to DGS-000001057, and I don't think there  
14 are dates on this, but it's towards the bottom of the  
15 page --

16 A. 1958 is date at the top of the page.

17 LADY SMITH: October 2, on left hand at the top.

18 Q. We don't have the convenient waypoints on the way down  
19 the page, unfortunately. But it's towards the bottom,  
20 an entry, 'gave a particular child ...' It's redacted.

21 LADY SMITH: 'Gave choice of ...'

22 A. I don't know where you're reading from.

23 LADY SMITH: I think this might be seven lines up from the  
24 bottom, Alison.

25 A. Oh:

1            'Gave choice of going out today and missing wedding  
2            next week or going to wedding and missing visiting day.'  
3            So she could not do both. She was given a choice.  
4 MR SHELDON: Yes, all right.  
5 A. She chose today.  
6 Q. I think it may look as if it was a family wedding as  
7            well. I may be misreading that.  
8            Anyway, I think we have the gist of that.  
9 A. The gist, yes.  
10 Q. The child is given the choice. She can't do both and  
11           she has to decide whether she wants a visit or go to  
12           a wedding.  
13 LADY SMITH: And there is some reference -- is it bad  
14           behaviour, about three lines up?  
15 MR SHELDON: Yes.  
16 A. That could possibly relate to somebody else though,  
17           Mr ...  
18 LADY SMITH: 'She chose today. Spoke to ... [somebody's  
19           mother] re ... [somebody's] bad behaviour. Mother  
20           appears to understand the situation.'  
21           Do I have that right, do you think, Alison?  
22 A. Yes, that's right. But the two things may have been  
23           separate people.  
24 LADY SMITH: Ah, I see.  
25           What type of record was this?

1 A. That looks like it's a logbook.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

3 MR SHELDON: I appreciate this is a diverse group of  
4 records, Alison, but it's perhaps a tour of the  
5 landscape, as it were, to see what we have and what you  
6 found, very helpfully.

7 So if we look at DGS-000000425, this is an entry for  
8 29 May 1959. It looks again as though this is a logbook  
9 or a daybook or something of that sort; is that right?

10 A. That looks more like -- ah, right. No, yeah. Yeah, it  
11 could be a logbook, but you need to scroll down more if  
12 you want to see the entry.

13 Q. It's the entry for 29 May?

14 A. 'HMIS, Mr McPherson instructed that only corporal  
15 punishments need be entered in the punishment book as in  
16 CS15.'

17 I don't know whether that's a regulation or ...

18 Q. Maybe a Scottish Office circular. But, at all events,  
19 my Lady, that doesn't appear to be consistent with the  
20 regulations.

21 LADY SMITH: Not the rules, no.

22 A. The punishment book and the incident book were both  
23 scanned in their entirety as well.

24 MR SHELDON: Thank you.

25 We do have some of the punishment books, Alison,

1           thank you, but they're perhaps not terribly informative.

2   A.  Ah, right, okay.

3   Q.  They exist and were completed, but unless my Lady is

4           keen to see them --

5   LADY SMITH:  I don't think we need to see them at the

6           moment.  If necessary, we can go back to them later.

7   MR SHELTON:  Yes, I don't see it as particularly helpful.

8           DGS-000001160, please.  This is an entry for

9           9 September?

10  A.  Mr Guthrie visited.

11  Q.  That's it, please.  Yes.

12  LADY SMITH:  Which year?

13  MR SHELTON:  I'm not sure the year appears on that.

14  LADY SMITH:  Is it on the left-hand page?

15  MR SHELTON:  It may be, my Lady.  But many of the pages are

16           cut off and the way they've been copied, they're not

17           sequential, my Lady.

18           So it's been a case of trying to piece together

19           some -- I think -- I have a note, my Lady, that this is

20           in a run of logbooks for 1965 to 1967.

21           Alison, if you could perhaps just read the entry out

22           for us?

23  A.  On the 9th?

24  Q.  Yes, please.

25  A.  'Mr Guthrie visited.  Checked the punishment book ...'

1 I'm not sure what that says at the end of the  
2 second line:

3 '... re ... [somebody's] behaviour on Sat  
4 [Saturday] afternoon leave.'

5 Q. I think we understand that Mr Guthrie was then the Chair  
6 of the trustees?

7 A. As in the relative of -- the descendant of the original  
8 Dr Guthrie, yes.

9 Q. Certainly from the terms of the note, it looks as though  
10 this was an unannounced visit. He just dropped by.

11 A. He did tend to do that. His visits pop up in the  
12 logbooks quite often.

13 Q. You found other instances of that?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. If we could look -- actually, my Lady, it might be  
16 helpful to look at one of the punishment books,  
17 punishment returns rather. This is SGV-000102990.

18 Does that appear to be a document for the Social  
19 Work Services Group? And it's -- I can't quite read  
20 that, I'm afraid. Can you increase the size of that  
21 slightly, please?

22 So, 'Segregation return'. If we scroll down, we'll  
23 see that this is a document relating to the girls'  
24 school, September 1973. Scrolling down again, please,  
25 this is certification by the head of school that the

1 entries shown overleaf are correct and the requirements  
2 of rule 33 of the Approved Schools (Scotland) Act 1961  
3 have been duly observed.

4 So that's what the return to the SED or SWSG is  
5 saying. We'll perhaps come back to look at some records  
6 which cast some light on that, perhaps, or further light  
7 on it.

8 LADY SMITH: So that's for a quarter ending at the end of  
9 September 1973 and it's submitted several months later,  
10 in December.

11 MR SHELDON: Yes, my Lady.

12 LADY SMITH: And that's under the 1961 Rules, Rule 33?

13 MR SHELDON: Yes. Did you find returns like these, Alison,  
14 for all the years or was there a limited number of them?

15 A. Because I requested the punishment register and incident  
16 register to be scanned completely, I didn't then look at  
17 them because I thought you'd be getting the whole  
18 volumes. I didn't then -- I certainly didn't come  
19 across anything like that in -- you know, enclosed,  
20 inserted in any other volume.

21 Q. Okay. Thank you.

22 If we look at DGS-000001074, please, this is from  
23 the minutes. 1975, it's January 1975. It's obviously  
24 a record of who attends. But, if we scroll down,  
25 please, there's a heading at the left-hand side:

1           'Report of head of boys' school.'

2           We see that the headmaster reported on the affairs  
3           of the boys' school, particularly stated that since the  
4           return from Christmas holidays 15 abscondings have taken  
5           place. He regretted that among the absconders there  
6           were some who for various reasons were unaffected by the  
7           normal sentence of deprivation of leave and, in these  
8           cases, the only action open to him was to inflict  
9           corporal punishment.

10          So it appears that in January 1975 there had been 15  
11          abscondings. If these are the minutes -- I think we  
12          don't see there any consideration by the attendees of  
13          why that might have been; is that fair to say?

14        A. No consideration by the attendees of?

15        Q. Those at the meeting.

16        A. Of -- no comment was made and the fact that corporal  
17          punishment -- that certainly wasn't reported, no.

18        Q. Yes.

19          Moving on to a different topic and just one record  
20          here, DGS-000000334.

21          This is going to be very difficult to read, I think.  
22          But I think, Alison, you can probably see that this is  
23          an admissions and discharges book?

24        A. Oh, right. I never actually saw those because they had  
25          been before I --



1 Q. Right.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Just to take this very briefly then. We can obviously  
4 see the column giving the names of the people admitted  
5 and discharged. But it's just to take something that's  
6 right at the top of the page, please, first of all  
7 certainly. Go right to the top, there are a number of  
8 headings for the columns. So date of admission,  
9 names --

10 LADY SMITH: No, can we go back, so we can see the typed  
11 part?

12 MR SHELDON: Right at the top.

13 There is a column, I think it's four or five columns  
14 to the right, 'With what charged'; do you see that?

15 A. Yes, 'With what charged and under which section of the  
16 Act'.

17 Q. Yes, and if we scroll down and --

18 LADY SMITH: Yes, because we can see from the chart that  
19 these are children who have ended up at the school  
20 because of an order of the Sheriff Court, usually  
21 Lothian and Peebles, but later Lanarkshire Sheriff  
22 Court. So the court is specified and then the reason  
23 why they ended up in court is specified.

24 MR SHELDON: Yes, and the majority of those in that column,  
25 Alison, I think you can see are for charges like theft,

1 for example; do you see that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. If we scroll down -- and I think this is the last entry  
4 in that column on that page -- do you see a slightly  
5 different reason for admission?

6 LADY SMITH: Or is it the last but one?

7 A. Second to last, it says 'In need of care and  
8 protection'.

9 MR SHELDON: Yes. So this is a child who for some reason or  
10 another is in exactly that, in need of care and  
11 protection. But this is under a column 'With what  
12 charged'. So this is the variety of children that find  
13 their way into an establishment like Dr Guthrie's.

14 I'm going to move on, my Lady, to another heading,  
15 which is a rather longer one, the heading -- my heading  
16 anyway, 'Staff incidents' --

17 LADY SMITH: We could make take the break just now, I think.

18 Alison, I usually take a short break at this stage  
19 in the morning so we can all get a breather. So if it  
20 will work for you, I'll do that now and resume at about  
21 quarter to 12; all right?

22 (11.29 am)

23 (A short break)

24 (11.45 am)

25 LADY SMITH: Alison, are you ready if we carry on just now?

1 A. Yes, absolutely.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Mr Sheldon.

3 MR SHELDON: Thank you, my Lady.

4 Alison, I was about to move on, before the break, to  
5 another of my headings. This broadly is incidents  
6 involving staff at the Dr Guthrie's schools.

7 The first document to look at is DGS-000001061.

8 This is a page from minutes, Alison; do you recall  
9 looking at minutes in this form?

10 A. I read minutes. I don't remember -- I don't remember in  
11 enough detail to say whether that's definitely from  
12 a minute book.

13 Q. All right. This is quite an early one. It's 1931.

14 A. Oh, right. It could well have been handwritten then,  
15 yes.

16 Q. If we look six lines from the top of the page, it's  
17 a sentence starting:

18 'In connection with ...'

19 Perhaps you can just read that to us?

20 A. 'In connection with an article appearing in a periodical  
21 John Bull seriously reflecting upon Dr Guthrie's schools  
22 in regard to the treatment of a girl ... [redacted] and  
23 subsequent questions in Parliament appearing to arise  
24 out of the article referred to. The chairman reported  
25 that a complete statement of the whole facts had been

1 prepared by the secretary and had been transmitted  
2 through the Scottish Education Department to the  
3 Secretary of State for Scotland and that the statement,  
4 which was supported by letters from the girl's mother  
5 and other documentary evidence, clearly showed that  
6 there was not the slightest foundation for the  
7 accusations of harsh treatment appearing in the article  
8 and that a complete denial of the existence of the  
9 conditions inferred by the questions in Parliament had  
10 been given by Mr Westwood Undersecretary of State for  
11 Scotland.'

12 Q. Thank you, Alison.

13 So there had been an allegation of harsh treatment  
14 of a particular girl. That's refuted by the school. In  
15 fairness, my Lady, I should also take Alison to  
16 DGS-000001069.

17 I'm told that's not in the bundle, my Lady. But,  
18 just in brief, it's another minute that notes that  
19 an apology had been printed in the publication. But if  
20 we can just remind ourselves, my Lady, you will have  
21 seen some document several times before, but it's  
22 a document SGV.001.001.8545 you won't have seen this  
23 before, Alison, I think. It's a document that we've  
24 seen. It's a history of heads, an informal document  
25 written by a former inspector of Approved Schools,

1 Inspector Murphy. In the second paragraph, five lines  
2 down, I think we see that he says:

3 'On my entry in 1950, my first main task was to  
4 secure, against the wishes of the managers, the  
5 dismissal from Dr Guthrie's Girls' School of SNR  
6 SNR whose 20 years of service had been marked by  
7 sadistic cruelty and many other irregularities which had  
8 brought such misery to two decades of girls.'

9 So, if the inspector is right about that, and he's  
10 fair in his characterisation of SNR  
11 SNR the school, then it perhaps casts the 1931  
12 entry in a slightly different light; would that be fair  
13 to say?

14 A. That would be fair to say.

15 I don't know if it's relevant, I did ask for some  
16 pages from that minute book to be scanned and sent  
17 relating to the treatment of a particular girl in  
18 May 1931. I don't know whether you have those?

19 Q. I don't think we do. But we'll certainly check, Alison.  
20 Thank you for that.

21 Next record, please, DGS-000001066.

22 I think we can see this is a minute of a meeting of  
23 the Educational Committee, April 1953. Under the  
24 heading 'Boys' school', there is a reference to  
25 a teacher. The secretary submitted letters from

1 Mr McAllister, who we think is the head at the time,  
2 dated 14 March and 20 April, reporting that this teacher  
3 had on more than one occasion struck a pupil with his  
4 hands for the purposes of inflicting punishment:

5 'As the care and training regulations made it quite  
6 clear that such punishment was not permissible and as  
7 this teacher was fully aware of the terms of these  
8 regulations and had been cautioned several times by  
9 Mr McAllister, it was agreed that the teacher should be  
10 given a final warning and that if he again infringed  
11 these regulations in this manner he would be dismissed.'

12 At least on the face of it, the committee there  
13 seems to be taking that matter reasonably seriously and  
14 issuing a final warning. But it's clearly accepted that  
15 there had been a striking of the pupil more than once,  
16 with hands.

17 Next record, please, DGS-000003007. If we go to the  
18 bottom of that page, please, it's an entry for  
19 17 October. This is 1956 now. We see that there is  
20 an entry about a visit from HMIS, Mr McPherson,  
21 discussing annual estimates, but also three criticisms  
22 of the school had been made to the department. We think  
23 that must be the Education Department -- Scottish  
24 Education Department, by an unknown complainer. These  
25 were:

1           '(a) boys frequently received burns from the steam  
2           heating pipes; (b) a boy had, early in July, his  
3           arm ...'.

4           And the record cuts off, my Lady, so -- but --

5   LADY SMITH:   What follows?

6   MR SHELDON:   But the next document -- and it's fiddly  
7           getting this all lined up, my Lady, but the next one is  
8           DGS-000000384.

9           So the previous line had been a boy had his arm  
10          broken and proper medical treatment had not been given,  
11          and (c) that a boy had been thrashed on the bare  
12          posterior by a master. Mr McPherson investigated these  
13          charges.

14          There's then what I think appears to be a response.  
15          (a) is that occasionally boys received burns as stated.  
16          The headmaster said:

17          'This generally occurred when steam heating was  
18          resumed after an interval and when boys became  
19          accustomed to the fact heating was on accidents of this  
20          kind did not occur. The injuries were always minor and  
21          received immediate treatment.

22          'It's been considered that the infrequency of this  
23          type of accident did not justify the expense of  
24          providing [I think that's] guards for the pipes  
25          throughout the school.'

1 I should say, my Lady, it's not clear whose response  
2 this is. It appears to be the school's, rather than  
3 Mr McPherson's.

4 LADY SMITH: Yes.

5 MR SHELDON: At (b):

6 'There was no foundation for this criticism.'

7 LADY SMITH: And that's the broken arm?

8 MR SHELDON: That's the broken arm. Communicates with  
9 assistant matron who was at Thorntonloch Camp by  
10 telephone and, I think:

11 'Obtained information from her diary. The boy had  
12 received treatment.'

13 But in relation to (c), the response is:

14 'The headmaster and deputy state that there was no  
15 truth whatever in this allegation so far as they knew.  
16 Both asserted that they ...'

17 I think:

18 '... are the only two masters with authority to  
19 administer corporal punishment and had certainly not  
20 been guilty of such conduct.'

21 So there's a denial by the head and deputy head of  
22 the thrashing, but -- so far as they knew.

23 LADY SMITH: But it wasn't either of them against whom the  
24 allegation was being made; is that not right?

25 MR SHELDON: It doesn't appear to be, my Lady, no.



1 LADY SMITH: It's 'a teacher'.

2 MR SHELDON: Yes.

3 A. I think the implication is: if it had happened, it  
4 wasn't somebody who had authority to administer corporal  
5 punishment in that case.

6 LADY SMITH: Seems to be.

7 MR SHELDON: Yes.

8 Next record, please, DGS-000000403. It's an entry  
9 for 22 July 1957. And we see that a Ms something  
10 struck -- and we know that's a boy -- for stealing  
11 a turnip from kitchen annex. At first she denied this,  
12 but the headmaster was an eyewitness. Also struck  
13 another boy across the face with a dishcloth. The  
14 individual was interviewed in the presence of another  
15 member of staff, warned that she would be dismissed if  
16 any further incidents of that kind occurred and the  
17 circumstances reported to the managers.

18 Now, if we can compare, please, another record.  
19 It's DGS-000000427. And this is an entry for 28 -- give  
20 me a second.

21 (Pause)

22 The date of this, my Lady, isn't particularly clear.  
23 But we see that 13th something, police interviewed --

24 A. I think that's 23rd.

25 Q. You are clearly better at reading the writing than I am,

1 Alison.

2 LADY SMITH: Yes, the number above has certainly a 2-3, so  
3 you wouldn't go back to 13, the number below. It's not  
4 quite as clear. I see that.

5 MR SHELDON: Yes, it looks as though it must be  
6 23 September, police interviewed. This is the same name  
7 as in the record that we just saw, about incidents in  
8 school before four boys absconded.

9 LADY SMITH: In the school corridor, I think, is it?

10 MR SHELDON: Yes.

11 So, if the police are involved, then this,  
12 presumably, is a rather more serious incident, or may  
13 be?

14 Next entry, DGS-000000407.

15 This is a log entry, 28 November 1960, and we see,  
16 again, it's a visit by Mr McPherson, HMI McPherson. Can  
17 you read the word at the first -- right at the end of  
18 that first line, Alison?

19 A. 'Mentioned allegations by ... [blank] of ill-treatment  
20 by staff.'

21 Q. Thank you. And --

22 A. Complaints about poor food.

23 Q. Poor food.

24 A. 'Had seen representative of the Scottish Education  
25 Department who visited the remand home. Mr McPherson

1 saw ... [blank] re allegation.'

2 Q. All right.

3 A. 'I am satisfied that there is no truth in this.'

4 Q. Yes. Thank you, Alison.

5 I think, perhaps, there is no need to go to the  
6 reference, my Lady, but my Lady will recall Levitt and  
7 complaints about ill-treatment and poor food in the  
8 girls' school in 1958. That's -- the reference is  
9 LIT-000000379, page 99 to 101. But, as I say, I don't  
10 think we need to go to that right now.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 MR SHELDON: Alison, I do apologise, it's going through  
13 records that you, as it were, don't have a direct input  
14 about, but it's just to get these into the record.

15 Next one is DGS-000000468.

16 So these are entries for 9 and 10 September 1959.  
17 I think we see that on the 9th the police take  
18 statements from 22 boys re the alleged assault by,  
19 it's not clear what the name is, but that name does  
20 re-appear and we'll come back to that, assault by a  
21 particular member of staff. Four absconders at a home  
22 in Dumfries and made statements alleging assaults by  
23 another teacher. But, again, that is a name we have  
24 seen already, my Lady, to Dumfries Police and the boys  
25 brought back to school.

1           On the 10th, the doctor examined all boys who  
2           alleged assault and reported the matter to  
3           HMI McPherson, who made an investigation. One of the  
4           teachers was then charged with assault at -- I think --  
5           is that 5.00 pm?

6   LADY SMITH: Five something in the afternoon. Yes, it looks  
7           like 5.00 pm, yes.

8   MR SHELDON: The entry for 17th, the police interviewed,  
9           I think, two boys re statements in Dumfries alleging  
10          assault by the same person.

11           If we go to 427, please, DGS-000000427, and this  
12          appears, I think, to be September, October. We have  
13          looked at this before.

14   LADY SMITH: We have been to this page before.

15   MR SHELDON: Yes. DGS-000000426.

16           Yes, this is October 1959. On 19th, we see an entry  
17          to the effect that the inspector of police visited  
18          school and showed headmaster preliminary draft of his  
19          report. In the case of one of the teachers we have just  
20          been hearing about, Mr **HCM**, the draft report, which  
21          was for the information of the police, indicated that  
22          there was no evidence to support a charge of assault  
23          against him, and that seems to have been conveyed to --  
24          I think that's the boy. Perhaps not clear. Then, on  
25          next entry, for 25 October --

1 LADY SMITH: I think that's to the teacher. That looks like  
2 'Mr' before the redaction, 'was to be conveyed to  
3 Mr ...' somebody.

4 MR SHELDON: It could be Mr McAllister, my Lady.

5 LADY SMITH: Possibly.

6 MR SHELDON: Can't read that.

7 So, entry for October 25, another teacher who we  
8 have heard about, I think -- we think it's Mr [REDACTED] --  
9 reported to the headmaster that the charge against him  
10 had been transferred to the Sheriff Court and would be  
11 heard in [REDACTED] 1960.

12 So it seems to have been quite an eventful month or  
13 so.

14 I note in passing that the entry for -- I think it's  
15 November 27, explosion in gas cooker in the kitchen.  
16 Mr -- I think it's Glanville -- was lighting a gas ring  
17 and the oven was full of gas. So it appears there was  
18 quite a large explosion, but no one appears to have been  
19 hurt.

20 The next set of records again deals with  
21 a particular member of staff or seems to. If you look  
22 at DGS-000001059.

23 Date of this is unclear from the actual record,  
24 my Lady, but it seems to be in the period 1960 to 1963  
25 or thereabouts.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MR SHELDON: Right at the foot of the first column, there  
3 are two pages there, first page, the record for 13th,  
4 whatever that is, appears a particular person had  
5 a tantrum. Appears to have been quite mad, threatening  
6 staff with dismissal re what she knew, et cetera, put  
7 her in detention and relieved her of -- and I think that  
8 seems to be 'staff duties' --

9 LADY SMITH: Yes, relieve her of staff duties or 'and  
10 relieved her of staff duties'.

11 MR SHELDON: Yes. If we go to DGS-000001058 --

12 LADY SMITH: So the tantrum appears to have been a tantrum  
13 exhibited by a member of staff.

14 MR SHELDON: It looks that way, my Lady. This next record,  
15 if we go -- I think it's about eight lines down. This  
16 is very difficult to read. It's the same name, my Lady,  
17 Ms Martin, let loose her usual tirade about what she is  
18 going to do when she leaves the school re press,  
19 et cetera. This is of course in front of the girls, who  
20 enjoy it thoroughly. So there's that, my Lady.

21 And then DGS-000001080, please.

22 A. So that last volume, by the way, was 1955 to 1960. I  
23 don't know if you were --

24 Q. Oh, I beg your pardon.

25 A. It's just I have a record of it and I have a record of

1 the dates. I don't know whether --

2 Q. That's very helpful. Thank you.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

4 MR SHELDON: Sorry, the period began in 1950?

5 A. The volume starts in 1955 to 1960.

6 MR SHELDON: Thank you. That's very helpful context for  
7 what is next. DGS-000001080.

8 We're back to some minutes here. About two-thirds  
9 of the way down -- sorry, a third of the way down the  
10 page, there's an entry about Ms Louisa Martin,  
11 housemistress, girls' school, perhaps you can just read  
12 that entry to us, Alison?

13 A. 'Having been discovered that this member of staff had  
14 been writing letters to a pupil of the school who was  
15 still on the school roll, but working in Lancashire and  
16 had, in her letters, made some subversive comment on the  
17 running of the school by the present headmistress, the  
18 subcommittee had decided that the member of staff should  
19 be called for interview today and Ms Martin was called  
20 into the room to answer certain questions.

21 'After interviewing Ms Martin, who was asked to  
22 retire from the room for a short time, the members  
23 present considered unanimously that the only course open  
24 to them was to request the resignation of this member of  
25 staff who had been guilty of a serious act of disloyalty

1 to the school. It was also agreed that her departure  
2 from the school should not be delayed beyond the end of  
3 the current week and that she should be paid one month's  
4 pay in lieu of notice. Her contract being on the basis  
5 that one month's notice was required on either side to  
6 terminate her engagement.'

7 Q. I think we can stop that there. But we see that this  
8 woman is summarily dismissed and there appears, on the  
9 face of the record, not to be any investigation of the  
10 substance of what she was saying. It's just regarded as  
11 an act of disloyalty.

12 I should add, my Lady, that there is some  
13 uncertainty about the connection here, because this  
14 person is referred to as Louise Martin and the person in  
15 the records that we have just been looking at, the  
16 handwritten ones, were an N Martin. It's an odd  
17 coincidence and we're trying to get to the bottom of it,  
18 my Lady.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

20 MR SHELDON: But the records are there and it seems unlikely  
21 to be a coincidence, but there is some doubt about the  
22 matter.

23 LADY SMITH: There is a consistent thread of the story, if  
24 that's the right way to put it. She may have had two  
25 first names and known by one and formally her name was



1 another.

2 MR SHELDON: Yes.

3 Next please, DGS-000001146.

4 This is an entry for 15 October 1961. The date is  
5 quite difficult to make out, but the 14th is quite  
6 clear. It's the 15th we're looking at.

7 We see there that a particular boy made allegations  
8 of assault against -- very difficult to read, but I  
9 think it's possibly Mr KKP .

10 Perhaps you're better qualified --

11 A. You want me to read it:

12 '[Blank] ... Made allegations of assault against  
13 the teacher.'

14 It's hard. I was just scanning it quickly:

15 'I have investigated these and find some substance  
16 in them.'

17 Perhaps it's:

18 'But ...'

19 Something -- or possibly it goes over to the next  
20 line and something 'denial has been made' by the  
21 teacher:

22 'Blank is a ...'

23 LADY SMITH: Firm denial, maybe?

24 MR SHELDON: Yes.

25 A. 'Insolent and disobedient boy and I have made it clear

1 to ...'

2 No.

3 Something 'concerned to':

4 'Members concerned that if -- that in such treatment

5 were ...'.

6 I think it's a lack of ink, is the issue, rather

7 than the handwriting, unfortunately.

8 Q. At all events, there is an allegation of assault.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. The member of staff writing the log thinks there's some

11 substance in it, but adds that the person making the

12 allegation is a disobedient and insolent boy.

13 A. 'I have made it clear to the member of staff concerned

14 that if such treatment were true ...'

15 And:

16 'Very severe consequences would ...'

17 Something. 'Would result'?

18 Q. I think that is perhaps as far as we can take that, but

19 thank you.

20 LADY SMITH: I think that last word might be 'follow'.

21 A. 'Follow'.

22 MR SHELDON: Yes, that would make sense in the context,

23 my Lady, yes.

24 We are making progress, I promise.

25 DGS-000001147, please. This is -- it's bottom of

1 the first page, an entry for 18 May 1963, a boy reported  
2 that he'd been hit by a teacher, whose named,  
3 investigated, and the teacher admitted he had slapped  
4 the boy on two occasions:

5 'This teacher has been made fully aware of the  
6 serious view I take of such action and has been informed  
7 I will never condone such practises even in the case of  
8 a difficult boy.'

9 He's saying this boy is difficult, there, I think:

10 '(b) This incident is being entered in the school  
11 log.'

12 So, again, there is an allegation which is, in  
13 substance, accepted.

14 LADY SMITH: Alison, that would suggest that at times  
15 matters were regarded as though there was a hierarchy of  
16 incidents and some didn't need to be entered in the log,  
17 but if it was really serious then --

18 A. Then it would be, yeah.

19 LADY SMITH: -- this is so bad it's going to go into the  
20 log; did you see that anywhere else in your researches?

21 A. Throughout the logbooks, these kind of incidents are  
22 mentioned often. I would be surprised if it wasn't,  
23 because, I mean, the logbooks were very much a diary of  
24 daily events. So if something untoward happened --  
25 I don't know whether being entered in the school logbook

1           meant something more than just this narrative that they  
2           kept anyway.

3           It seems like a threat, but they've already written  
4           about it, so I don't see how it could be escalated.

5   LADY SMITH: Yes. But it was something that he said would  
6           need to be done. It doesn't suggest that it was  
7           a question of judgement for the individual.

8   A. Unless there are these logbooks, the kind of record of  
9           daily events, and then if it was maybe going to be  
10          reported on to the relevant committee. Perhaps that's  
11          what they meant by being entered into the school log.  
12          But that's speculation, though.

13   LADY SMITH: Thank you.

14   MR SHELDON: Moving on then to DGS-000001550.

15          Again, the date's not particularly clear. Well,  
16          certainly that's 26th of something. My notes suggest  
17          this is from a log 1973 to 1980. Alison, perhaps -- do  
18          you have any --

19   A. A logbook ...

20   Q. -- view about that? That's certainly how this was  
21          coded, maybe, but --

22   A. 1971 to 1973. Yes, 1973 to 1980.

23   Q. Yes. At all events, we can try --

24   A. Page 50. Yeah, I did highlight a page 50, so that could  
25          well be that volume, yes.

1 Q. Thank you very much.

2 A. 1973 to 1980.

3 Q. Thank you, that's helpful.

4 A. In which case it's February 1975.

5 Q. All right.

6 So this is about halfway down the page, paragraph

7 beginning:

8 'Called to school at 10.20 pm because of disruption

9 among girls.'

10 This is a girls' school log:

11 'To investigate accusation of assault made against

12 ... [I think certain members of staff]. Briefly, a girl

13 had refused to comply with an instruction ...'

14 Taking it short, became abusive and was removed from

15 the coach following some difficulty, placed in

16 segregation, probably.

17 LADY SMITH: Was it an assault made against a girl or

18 a member of staff?

19 MR SHELDON: There is another name under the redaction

20 I can't read, my Lady, under the transparent redaction.

21 It is certainly a teacher involved. Maybe another

22 member of staff, too.

23 LADY SMITH: I see. Thank you.

24 A. I don't know if I'm allowed to say. I have the

25 originals of these images, so I could tell you --

1 LADY SMITH: Who is the complainer and who is the accused?

2 A. I could tell you the name if you want me to.

3 LADY SMITH: You can tell me here, because names -- some

4 names are not to be repeated outside here.

5 Who is it?

6 With the redactions it could be either way. The

7 reading is ambiguous.

8 MR SHELDON: One of the names is a Mr HSB, the second

9 of the two. But I can't read the first one. I think it

10 might be SNR, my Lady.

11 LADY SMITH: Oh right. It could give the role: SNR

12 Mr So-and-so.

13 A. Called to school made against SNR

14 Mr HSB.

15 LADY SMITH: Right. That's it. Thank you.

16 MR SHELDON: We are told that HM interviewed girls. Then

17 staff involved or present, including Mr HSB and

18 concluded that there had been premeditated collusion on

19 part of the group of girls. Individual questioning

20 produced varying accounts. Mr HSB appeared to be

21 in a situation which called for immediate action on the

22 part of the -- not sure what that is.

23 A. 'Senior responsible staff member'.

24 Q. Yes, that will be it.

25 A. 'This he did to my satisfaction.'

1 Q. Yes. So the head seems to be approving of what was done  
2 here. There's no detail of the assault which was  
3 alleged, but rather the events leading up to it.

4 DGS-000000438.

5 This is an entry for 20 October 1977. Again, this  
6 is quite difficult to read, certainly I find it so. But  
7 it seems that a particular person -- not clear if it was  
8 a boy -- was interviewed by the headmaster, with  
9 Mr Mackey, Mr Rawlson present. It would appear that --  
10 yes, it's a boy -- had made a false statement to his  
11 parents that he had been detained all night in the  
12 visitors' room, following an incident involving --  
13 again, very difficult to make out. Mr KLC possibly,  
14 night watchman, during evening activities.

15 This appears to be the parent of the boy, who I  
16 won't name. Accepted that he had been visited by his  
17 son and stated that he had approached St Andrew's House  
18 under pressure from his wife. So there appears to have  
19 been a complaint, straight to SED, my Lady.

20 LADY SMITH: Yes.

21 MR SHELDON: Further disclosed that he was satisfied by the  
22 school --

23 A. The school's care of his sons.

24 Q. Yes. And wanted the son to have an opportunity to  
25 attend on a daily basis, if that became possible,

1 because he couldn't get in anywhere else.

2 The interview, we're told, clearly demonstrated the  
3 manipulative and strongly anti-authority attitude of the  
4 parents. So, again, there seems to be a judgment being  
5 made about the incident, because of the nature of the  
6 people involved. Or the perceived nature, I should say.

7 DGS-000000439, please. This is an entry relating to  
8 16 November 1983. Yes, this is, I think, three lines  
9 down, a particular boy reported that GBC  
10 handyman, had grasped him painfully by the lower lip:

11 'Mr GBC came himself to the office to report the  
12 incident this morning.'

13 Is that 'I reminded him'?

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. I think it could be: I reminded him that he had  
16 previously been given ...

17 Sorry: I had previously given him a specific verbal  
18 warning that physical ...

19 Can you read that? Physical something?

20 A. 'Physical responses to misbehaviour were inappropriate  
21 and would not be tolerated.'

22 Q. 'I also informed him that I was now formally warning him  
23 that should there be any further incident of a like  
24 nature, I would immediately suspend him from duty and  
25 that the probable discussion of the school's managers



1 should be dismissal.'

2 A. Decision.

3 Q. Sorry, decision.

4 Again, there is a reference to a report going in the  
5 log.

6 My Lady, I've gone to that record particularly  
7 because there are applicant reports specifically about  
8 that type of behaviour.

9 LADY SMITH: I think that also links to the man's nickname,  
10 doesn't it?

11 MR SHELDON: Indeed, yes.

12 Moving on to a different heading, this is entries in  
13 relation to Mr LIA and of course I think you came  
14 across a number of entries about him.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. I won't go through all these. There is really quite  
17 a range. The entries all -- the relevant entries  
18 certainly being late September, early October 1972.

19 I just want to take you to two or three of these  
20 records. The first is DGS-000001571. Just to note  
21 an entry for 25th, this is October:

22 'Record of the board of managers, general purposes  
23 meeting in the offices of Scott Moncrieff. Proposed  
24 action in regard to Mr LIA endorsed.'

25 A. 'HM', headmaster or mistress, whichever it was at that

1 point.

2 Q. 'Outlined situation to superintendent.'

3 I think that's Smail at county police station,  
4 Dalkeith:

5 'After due consideration advised that the  
6 information be laid before the Procurator Fiscal.'

7 This was to be done by a particular member of staff.

8 If we can go to the next entry or record, which is  
9 DGS-000001573, please, entry for 27 October, there is  
10 a reference there to two absconders, which we're not  
11 concerned with.

12 But, again, three lines down, emergency meeting of  
13 headmaster, Mr Guthrie, and Mr Skinner, to consider  
14 statements made by two girls, alleging behaviour and  
15 conversation of a lewd nature by Mr LIA, gardener.  
16 This is a recurrence of the events recorded on  
17 2 October 1972 and thereafter:

18 'Mr LIA interviewed at this time and both girls  
19 asked to restate allegations in front of him. He denied  
20 having acted in this way. Following further discussion  
21 Mr LIA resigned and handed over his keys.'

22 A. Mm-hmm.

23 Q. So, again, my Lady, an example. This is a relatively  
24 late example of children having to, as it were, face the  
25 person that they're accusing.

1 LADY SMITH: Yes.

2 MR SHELDON: There is a minuting of the resignation. But,  
3 if we can go finally in this connection to  
4 DGS-000001589. It's the entry for -- we think this is  
5 16 February 1973.

6 LADY SMITH: This has an asterisk on it.

7 MR SHELDON: Yes.

8 There is a reference to a particular girl being  
9 probably pregnant. But, again, three lines down, one of  
10 the girls involved in the LIA incidents, there is  
11 an entry:

12 'Also seen by doctor in fear of pregnancy following  
13 involvement in garden incidents.'

14 So it appears that there was at least a possibility  
15 that these incidents had resulted in a pregnancy.

16 A. Is there doubt about the date of that? I mean, I can  
17 give you the date. We're up to 1973 at this point.

18 Q. Well, perhaps let's double check it, yes. That's  
19 certainly the date that I had.

20 LADY SMITH: We think it is, but do you have a clearer date?

21 MR SHELDON: In you've --

22 A. It's 16 February. If it's -- the following involvement,  
23 it's 16 February 1973.

24 LADY SMITH: It is 1973.

25 MR SHELDON: Thank you.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MR SHELDON: So next record, please, is moving on to  
3 a different topic and a different alleged abuser.

4 LADY SMITH: Just to sort of link up the dates, so Mr LIA  
5 resigned in October 1972.

6 MR SHELDON: And this is --

7 LADY SMITH: Then this is February 1973, just four months or  
8 so later.

9 MR SHELDON: Yes.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

11 MR SHELDON: So the dates, I suppose, could fit.

12 LADY SMITH: Could fit.

13 MR SHELDON: Could fit.

14 So the next record is DGS-000003006.

15 Now, this is another one which is -- certainly  
16 I found rather difficult to read.

17 LADY SMITH: We're in 1982 now, are we?

18 MR SHELDON: We're into 1982 and the first entry is --  
19 18 March 1982.

20 LADY SMITH: There we are. That's it.

21 MR SHELDON: As best I can make that out -- and again if you  
22 feel you can help Alison just jump in -- the school  
23 attendance officer at Cowdenbeath contacted Mr Mackey,  
24 presumably at the school. He was concerned at --  
25 concerned, I think, to check the non-attendance of

1 a pupil --

2 A. Of a former pupil.

3 Q. Former pupil:

4 'When visiting his home he had been told that he was

5 with a member of Dr Guthrie's staff. Was this so?'

6 Taking that short, the headmaster telephoned the

7 member of staff, Mr Pountney, at his home in Arbroath.

8 Had Mr Pountney seen him? And was given the answer

9 'no'. That information was conveyed to the attendance

10 officer, school attendance officer, who asked someone to

11 check. That's -- the next name is almost illegible,

12 my Lady.

13 LADY SMITH: It's the same man. It's the attendance

14 officer.

15 A. I think it's Murnoch.

16 LADY SMITH: On the first line and then towards the end of

17 that paragraph -- sorry, start of that paragraph we're

18 in now and then again:

19 'Could he please check.'.

20 The head said, 'Would you please check', something

21 like that.

22 MR SHELDON: We then have -- sorry, my Lady, I've --

23 LADY SMITH: Does that look as though the person who was

24 being sought had in fact spent the weekend at Arbroath

25 with, maybe, Mr Pountney? Although Mr Pountney had said

1 he wasn't there.

2 MR SHELDON: That certainly seems to be the case, my Lady.

3 At page 2, it confirms that.

4 Yes, it's about -- just at the top of page 2, there  
5 is another telephone call to Mr Pountney and it's put to  
6 him that he'd --

7 LADY SMITH: 'He lied to me and said yes.'

8 MR SHELDON: And he admits that, says the boy is now at  
9 home.

10 Sorry, my Lady, I'm having trouble with the screen  
11 here.

12 He's basically told -- Pountney is told to report to  
13 the school. I think the head has said:

14 'I strongly advise you to see me as soon as  
15 possible.'

16 About halfway down the page:

17 'I informed him that an interview would be very  
18 formal and official.'

19 And he's asked if he wants to have a colleague  
20 present, but he declines.

21 Over the page, page 3, it's about halfway down,  
22 my Lady, he's informed that his conduct had been highly  
23 unprofessional, whatever the motivation, and his lack of  
24 judgment was abysmal and he'd endangered the reputation  
25 of the school to a serious degree, that only common

1 sense and skill --

2 A. External agency --

3 Q. And their goodwill had allowed the matter to be

4 investigated by colleagues. I think that's 'and then

5 the police'.

6 A. 'Rather than the police.'

7 Q. 'I reminded him that he'd already been warned.'

8 A. 'Warned about favouritism.'

9 Q. 'And about giving boys holidays at his home.'.

10 So it appears that this isn't the first time that

11 had had happened:

12 'In future he would not at any time while in his

13 present employment entertain any pupil, past or present,

14 in his home and give such pupils a lift ...'

15 Then:

16 'Such action would lead to dismissal.'

17 And then over to page 4 -- sorry, my Lady, I've lost

18 the particular passage.

19 LADY SMITH: Do you know what date it is?

20 MR SHELDON: It's 10 June.

21 LADY SMITH: So we need to go a bit further down.

22 MR SHELDON: It's page 5, my Lady. I'm sorry.

23 LADY SMITH: Here we go. It's coming up now.

24 MR SHELDON: There is a meeting with Mr Eadie, the

25 headmaster.

1 LADY SMITH: And a boy's mother and social worker.

2 MR SHELDON: And the social worker, to learn from them what  
3 he now alleges occurred during visits with Mr Pountney.  
4 As a result of this meeting, informed, I think, the  
5 headmaster that further investigations were necessary  
6 and that in his opinion Mr Pountney, currently on sick  
7 leave, should be suspended. So --

8 A. On full pay, pending --

9 LADY SMITH: Yes.

10 MR SHELDON: Indeed. Thank you for that. Page 6, line 7 --  
11 actually, can you read from line 6, Alison? If you can  
12 make that out.

13 A. 'Had interviewed ... [somebody] in the presence of his  
14 mother. Mr GQC and Mr GBD for this school that  
15 certain allegations had been made.'

16 That:

17 'Some appeared to be confirmed by another boy. I  
18 informed Mr ... that he was suspended from duty  
19 immediately pending investigation of the allegations and  
20 Mr GBD would accompany him to collect any private  
21 possessions he might have in school. I also reminded  
22 him that he had resigned his post from 31 July and that  
23 his resignation would remain effective unless he chose  
24 to advance the date out of consideration for children,  
25 colleagues and school.'



1 Q. So it looks as though he was planning to resign from  
2 a particular date, but was effectively invited just to  
3 go.

4 To complete that, if we look, please, at  
5 DGS-000001073, this should be a set of minutes. Yes,  
6 minutes 27 October 1982.

7 Foot of the page, item 10:

8 'In addition to his monthly report ... the  
9 headmaster reported that allegations had been made  
10 concerning Mr Pountney, a teacher who had left the  
11 service of the school at the end of June 1982 and his  
12 relationship with certain pupils and former pupils. It  
13 was noted that certain members of staff had been  
14 interviewed by the Procurator Fiscal and it appeared  
15 likely that Mr Pountney might be brought before the  
16 Sheriff in Arbroath in the near future.'

17 LADY SMITH: So that must be note of the minute that's  
18 referred to in the Section 21 response.

19 MR SHELDON: Yes.

20 It appears, in fairness, my Lady, that Mr Pountney  
21 lived in Arbroath and it may be that's why it was  
22 thought the case would be there. But, in the event, it  
23 seems to have been a High Court matter, my Lady, and so,  
24 yes, the papers wouldn't, I think, be kept there.

25 Alison, thank you for bearing with me. We're on the

1 final strait.

2 If we can look, please, in relation to another  
3 teacher, a Mr KMI DGS-000002648.

4 It's an entry for 22 August 1974. We're told that  
5 Mr Keddie informed the headmaster of an incident which  
6 had occurred between Mr KMI, teacher, and a pupil on  
7 Wednesday, 14 August. Headmaster informed Mr Guthrie,  
8 the chair, by telephone, that he was investigating that  
9 information presently available indicated a serious  
10 error on part of ...'.

11 Is that 'serious error'?

12 A. 'Serious error', yes.

13 Q. On the part of Mr KMI I think there must be another  
14 member of the board -- was also informed and the  
15 headmaster interviewed the teacher.

16 If we look at the next entry for 23 August,  
17 Mr Keddie reported an incident between the same teacher  
18 and another pupil had occurred. Is that 'shortly after  
19 boys'?

20 A. 'Shortly after boys had risen' perhaps.

21 LADY SMITH: It looks like it, doesn't it?

22 A. Hasn't got out of bed.

23 MR SHELDON: At that time, the night supervisor was not  
24 available. The entry then runs out, my Lady, and we  
25 don't know what the result of that was.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MR SHELDON: But if we look at DGS-000002653, please. This  
3 is on the first of the two pages there, an entry for  
4 25 April 1975, and we see that there's a report that  
5 a number of boys had made a complaint against their  
6 class teacher, Mr KMI . I think that's 'with him was  
7 another boy', possibly:

8 'I looked at a small cut on one of the boys' lip,  
9 but he was not bleeding. I later saw the boys named and  
10 from them learned that a sustained and lengthy  
11 deliberate period of provocation had taken place which  
12 culminated in a ...'

13 Can you read that Alison: in a disorderly and  
14 disobedient group?

15 A. 'Disorderly and disobedient', yeah, among which somebody  
16 took a leading part.

17 Q. So the suggestion seems to be that an incident had taken  
18 place.

19 If we look at the continuation on next page, about  
20 six lines down, the suggestion that the boy had made  
21 much of the bleeding, so clearly had been bleeding. Can  
22 you read the next word?

23 A. 'Alarmed the others who crowded round and were in turn  
24 pushed back into their seats.'

25 Q. 'Mr KMI , when interviewed, both gave details of the

1 considerable provocation he had suffered and agreed to  
2 the basis of the boy's complaint while asserting that  
3 his class's conduct ...'

4 A. '... had reached a point where he had to physically put  
5 several in their place.'

6 Q. So, as it were, reading between the lines, it seems that  
7 there was an incident where the boy was struck.

8 There is then a group of boys apparently concerned  
9 about their friend, their classmate, and they are then  
10 pushed back into their seats by, presumably, by  
11 Mr KMI .

12 Finally on this particular teacher, DGS-000000412.  
13 This is an entry for 7 September 1977, and we see the  
14 entry:

15 'Following an incident in class between [the  
16 teacher] Mr KMI and a pupil, it became apparent  
17 that ...'

18 Can you read that?

19 A. I want it to say 'abnormal', but I'm not sure. Or  
20 an 'observed build-up of pressure and strain'.

21 Q. Had --

22 A. 'Observed', yeah.

23 Q. And then 'caused Mr KMI '?

24 A. 'Had rendered Mr KMI unfit to work. Any attempt to  
25 accede to his desire to ...'.

1 'To' -- 'would' --

2 Q. The next page may give that some context.

3 A. 'Desire to continue would place both', yeah.

4 Q. The continuation page is DGS-000000420:

5 'Would put [I think] Mr KMI and his pupils at  
6 risk, there being no further additional means of support  
7 available to relieve the situation.'

8 Then something referred to Mr KMI family doctor:

9 'Confirmed the school's opinion and Mr KMI has  
10 since been sent on sick leave which is likely to be of  
11 lengthy duration. The boy's mother is aware of the  
12 incident, of which a report is available and will be  
13 submitted to the meeting of the house committee.'

14 Again, we're not given very much detail about the  
15 incident, my Lady, but it again seems to have been quite  
16 a serious one, given what's being said about it.

17 LADY SMITH: Alison, do you recall finding out what was the  
18 full extent of the house committee's remit? We have  
19 seen it referred to a few times.

20 A. When I was describing the contents of the minute books,  
21 do I actually say what the -- I don't think I actually  
22 say what the remit of each committee was. I list which  
23 committees are listed in the minute books, but I don't  
24 actually say their remit, no.

25 LADY SMITH: Okay. We can no doubt explore that further

1 with somebody else.

2 I've seen it relating perhaps to the buildings, but  
3 then this is nothing to do with the buildings if it's  
4 the house committee needing to know about a particular  
5 member of staff.

6 MR SHELDON: My Lady, I'm moving on to a different heading.

7 There's not a lot of references still to go, but  
8 certainly enough for perhaps 15 minutes.

9 LADY SMITH: Well, I think we should stop now.

10 A. The letter from 2017 mentions the house committee's  
11 remit, because they did a bit more on the minutes than I  
12 obviously did.

13 LADY SMITH: I'll check that.

14 Alison, I'll stop now for the lunch break and sit  
15 again at 2 o'clock. We can pick up the rest of your  
16 evidence, which I'm assured won't take too long.

17 Before I rise, those who have been following this  
18 phase of hearings will know that there are a lot of  
19 names being used in this room in the course of evidence  
20 for convenience, but they are in respect of people whose  
21 identities are protected by my General Restriction Order  
22 and we have four from this morning who fall into that  
23 category, Mr LIA, Mr Pountney, although he may no  
24 longer, if we're right about the conviction that we  
25 think we have uncovered, be on the list, but he's there

1 at the moment. Mr HSB and GBC.

2 So that's it for just now and I'll sit again at  
3 2 o'clock.

4 (12.59 pm)

5 (The luncheon adjournment)

6 (2.00 pm)

7 LADY SMITH: Are you ready for us to carry on, Alison?

8 A. Yes.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 Mr Sheldon.

11 MR SHELDON: Thank you, my Lady.

12 As I indicated before lunch, there isn't a great  
13 deal further to go with these records, but I'd like to  
14 take you, Alison, through some records about restraint  
15 and segregation.

16 First of all, it's DGS-000002498.

17 I think we can see this is an excerpt from  
18 a logbook --

19 A. Yes, it looks like it.

20 Q. -- or a diary, for December 1961 into January 1962.

21 I think we can see, right at the top of that page, that  
22 a particular girl -- and it is girls in this case --  
23 allowed out for lunch as it was Christmas Day, from then  
24 was in circulation daily, but slept in detention from  
25 8.00 pm.

1           There is then an entry, 30 December:  
2           'Trouble necessitated calling of police.'.  
3           We can see from the redactions, the transparent  
4           redactions, this is the same girl:  
5           'Taken to detention, 9.00 pm. The next day she's  
6           still in detention. Refused all food or toilet. Asked  
7           consent of committee member to detain her.'.  
8           And we're then into 1 January 1962 and the same  
9           girl:  
10           'Took breakfast and dinner, but did not go to toilet  
11           until afternoon and not again that day.'  
12           The next day, she still seems to be in detention,  
13           2 January, and there is, again, reference to the toilet:  
14           'Safari put in place of Maltese.'  
15       LADY SMITH: Mattress.  
16       MR SHELDON: I beg your pardon, yes.  
17       LADY SMITH: Safari?  
18       A. Safari, it must be some kind of mat, I imagine, instead  
19           of a proper mattress.  
20       MR SHELDON: The reference to 'safari' might be the sort of  
21           mat that one --  
22       LADY SMITH: Camping.  
23       MR SHELDON: -- puts on the ground camping.  
24           Then on the 3rd, she's still in detention, it seems,  
25           but going to the toilet more regularly.



1           On 5 January, she is put up to sick bay and she  
2           remained there until 8 January 1962. So it does seem  
3           from these entries that this particular girl has  
4           essentially been in detention for nearly a week and  
5           she's then sent to sick bay for reasons that aren't --  
6   LADY SMITH: It must be more than a week because she was in  
7           detention on Christmas Day.  
8   A. She was given dispensation on Christmas Day, so it may  
9           have been before that she's actually --  
10   MR SHELDON: I had taken it from the record, my Lady, that  
11           she had been taken back to detention on 30th. But that  
12           may be -- I think my Lady may be right, that she's in  
13           circulation during the day, 25th to 30th, but is put, as  
14           it were, permanently in detention from 30th up to 5th,  
15           when she goes to sick bay.  
16   LADY SMITH: But if we just go back to the beginning, when  
17           we had Christmas Day, there we are, 25th, so she seems  
18           to have been -- ah, right, she was confined on 25th,  
19           allowed out for lunch. Then allowed out, if you like,  
20           during the day, but had to be in detention overnight.  
21           So she's subject to restrictions at least from Christmas  
22           Day and then full-time detention from the 30th.  
23   MR SHELDON: It certainly seems that way, my Lady, yes.  
24   LADY SMITH: Yes.  
25   MR SHELDON: So, if we move on to another record, it's

1 DGS-000002497, an entry for 25 April 1962. Sorry, is  
2 that right?

3 A. 28th, I think.

4 Q. Yes, I beg your pardon, it's 28th.

5 We see that two girls were isolated in separate  
6 rooms for 24 hours for absconding, and it says:

7 'And being very refractory.'

8 I just remind my Lady, if any reminding is needed,  
9 that rule 33 of the rules refers to children being  
10 unmanageable or violent.

11 LADY SMITH: Yes.

12 MR SHELDON: The next record is DGS-000002504.

13 These are entries for 12 and 13 May 1965. A girl in  
14 detention for three hours. She had refused to do  
15 anything in gym class. She's described as being  
16 defiant, had scratched her arms. It's not clear from  
17 that record what the scratching involved or how serious  
18 it was, but there certainly seems to have been  
19 an element of self-harm.

20 Alison, perhaps you could read the entry for the  
21 13th? You can take it from me it's the same girl.

22 A. 'The girl was in detention, defying Ms O'Rourke and  
23 refused to do as requested for everyone. Called in  
24 police to have her put in detention and she fought them,  
25 pulling buttons from their uniform and biting. Refused

1 food, again scratching her arms.'

2 Q. So this does appear to be a girl who is in really quite  
3 a distressed state and she's being put in detention,  
4 where she's -- again, we're not sure what the extent of  
5 it is, but self-harming to some extent.

6 Next record is DGS-000002610.

7 Does this just appear to be a slip of some sort?  
8 It's not entirely clear who has signed it, but  
9 presumably a senior member of staff. It's addressed to  
10 Mr Guthrie. What we're told is:

11 'I hereby authorise Ms McLaren to keep ... [three  
12 named girls] in detention as long as necessary.'

13 Do you see that?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Am I right in thinking, Alison, there were quite  
16 a number of these slips like this?

17 A. I don't recall seeing many. But I do remember that  
18 requests were made, particularly later -- in the later  
19 periods, requests made to social workers -- the girls'  
20 social workers, whether detention could be used and  
21 segregation could be used.

22 LADY SMITH: And no indication about who is to judge what is  
23 necessary so far as the length of detention.

24 A. Mm-hmm.

25 LADY SMITH: Maybe Ms McLaren has sole discretion on that

1 matter.

2 MR SHELDON: It certainly seems that way, my Lady. It seems  
3 to be, on the face of it, entirely open ended.

4 LADY SMITH: Yes.

5 MR SHELDON: Just really, I think, two more of these to go.

6 DGS-000001606. This, we think, is 1 June. It's  
7 from the 1980 to 1986 set of logbooks, but not clear  
8 precisely when. My recollection is that this  
9 handwriting is typical of entries from the early 1980s;  
10 is that right?

11 A. Yes. Up to when the school closed, that's right.

12 Q. Towards the bottom of the page, it's about nine lines  
13 from the bottom -- sorry, the context is a little higher  
14 up than that. There is a paragraph that starts with  
15 a redaction.

16 A. So she's physically aggressive in-house on:

17 'Required physical restraint and removal by Ms EQE  
18 and Mrs Denham today, after she aggressively refused  
19 dress as for day school and ...'.

20 I don't know what that says:

21 '... and was impeded from absconding by Ms EQE,  
22 attacked HM and under restraint and, with difficulty,  
23 again removed to segregation. Arrangements made  
24 immediately for girl's removal by social worker.'

25 Q. And going on with that:

1           'Since before Christmas the school has been used as  
2           a receptacle for a large number of highly disturbed and  
3           disturbing girls and staff.'

4           So what might be thought of as quite a derogatory  
5           reference to the way girls were being consigned to the  
6           school.

7           Certainly, if we look at one more record,  
8           DGS-000001609, this is 1983. Yes, it's an entry for  
9           22 August 1983. We see that a medical person from the  
10          Royal Edinburgh Hospital -- and I think that used to be  
11          the psychiatric hospital.

12        A. Yes. The YPU was the young person's unit at the --

13        Q. 'Requested school to see a particular young person  
14          because of distressed and extremely disturbed  
15          behaviour.'

16          As always, these referrals and reports are collated  
17          in the girl's personal file.

18          So I suppose that at least bears out the element in  
19          the last entry that we saw, that there were distressed  
20          and disturbed girls --

21        A. Yes.

22        Q. -- being admitted to this List D School.

23          One final question -- and I should really have asked  
24          you this morning -- but it is: did you come across any  
25          photographs of the school in your various researches?

1 A. There are photographs in the collection, but I didn't  
2 look at those because I felt it was outwith the remit.  
3 But --  
4 Q. I understand.  
5 A. -- I don't know if you have a copy of the catalogue?  
6 But the photographic items are listed at the end of  
7 the ...  
8 Q. I'm grateful. Perhaps in the meantime it's helpful just  
9 to -- because we do have some photographs -- and helpful  
10 just to let the Inquiry see the lie of the land, as it  
11 were.  
12 The first one is DGS-000000858. If we can blow that  
13 up. Yes, thank you. We know, my Lady, that's a view of  
14 Dr Guthrie's Boys' School in Liberton from the  
15 south-east, taken early 1900s.  
16 LADY SMITH: Thank you.  
17 MR SHELDON: If we can look at DGS-000000866. Another view  
18 of the school around the same time. My Lady will see  
19 that there are quite substantial fields, possibly  
20 playing fields. Not clear from the photograph, but  
21 there certainly were playing fields near the school.  
22 Now all built --  
23 LADY SMITH: Is that the frame of, perhaps, some goals that  
24 we can see over on right-hand side?  
25 A. It looks like it.

1 LADY SMITH: Amongst the trees?

2 MR SHELDON: I think my Lady is right. On the other side of  
3 the wall.

4 LADY SMITH: Yes. Do you know if the land on this side of  
5 the wall was Dr Guthrie's land or not?

6 MR SHELDON: I don't offhand, my Lady. I can certainly try  
7 to find that out.

8 LADY SMITH: It may not have been.

9 MR SHELDON: But there is certainly reference in some of the  
10 statements to that area or an area very close to it  
11 being used by pupils.

12 Finally, on the boys' school, DGS-000000862, please,  
13 that's a view of, again, the boys' school. We  
14 understand that was uploaded to a website in 2017 and  
15 predates, it seems, the conversion of the building to  
16 flats, as it now has been.

17 LADY SMITH: Yes.

18 MR SHELDON: Turning to the girls' school, if we can look,  
19 please, at DGS-000000864. That is understood to be  
20 a view from the east. From, in other words, the  
21 roadside. It's Gilmerton Road.

22 And 855, please. That's a view of the school, also  
23 from the east, as it is now, substantially unchanged  
24 really.

25 LADY SMITH: Yes.

1 MR SHELDON: My Lady, there are photographs of Loaningdale  
2 as well, but I'll take those later in the sequence.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

4 MR SHELDON: My Lady, that is all that I have for Alison.  
5 Does my Lady have any --

6 LADY SMITH: I have no other questions.  
7 I just want to thank you very much for bearing with  
8 us, as you have done, Alison. It's been so helpful  
9 having you here to tell us about the work you did and  
10 helping us with these other records. I'm really  
11 grateful.  
12 I'm now able to let you go.  
13 (The witness withdrew)

14 MR SHELDON: My Lady, we have no further live witnesses  
15 today, but there are a number of read-ins, as my Lady  
16 knows. The first will be taken by Ms Forbes.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

18 MS FORBES: Good afternoon, my Lady. The first read-in is  
19 from an applicant who is anonymous and to be known as  
20 'John' and the Nuix reference is WIT-1-000001035.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.  
22 'John' (read)

23 MS FORBES: My Lady, 'John' was born in 1955. Parts of his  
24 statement have already been read in, in three different  
25 chapters, and I'll refer to those days as we go through



1 his statement, my Lady.

2 He talks about his life before going into care,  
3 between paragraphs 2 and 8. He was born in Glasgow. He  
4 lived with his parents and older sister, who was three  
5 years older. His mother was a nurse and his father was  
6 a labouring engineer. He grew up in the north of  
7 Glasgow and went to Hyde Park school. He thought that  
8 was a great school, and he said he was clever and took  
9 it all in.

10 However, he started hanging about with older boys  
11 when he was in primary school and that's where things,  
12 from his point of view, all went wrong.

13 Your Ladyship will have heard already of the  
14 incident where he climbed into a funnel at the back of  
15 a laundrette to get warm and got stuck and police had to  
16 come and get him out.

17 As a result of that, he was sent to Juvenile Court  
18 in Glasgow and was charged with breaking into the  
19 laundrette. He was only ten years old at the time. He  
20 was sentenced to go to an Approved School. He had to go  
21 for assessment first and, to him -- this took him by  
22 complete surprise and he was taken to Larchgrove  
23 straight from court.

24 He talks about his time at Larchgrove between  
25 paragraphs 9 and 29. This part of his statement was

1 read in during chapter 4 and it was on 22 March of this  
2 year and that was Day 427.

3 He was only ten years old when he went to Larchgrove  
4 and he was there for about two months. That part of his  
5 statement talks about physical assaults from staff,  
6 there being a free use of violence. He was told the day  
7 before that he would be leaving and going to  
8 Dr Guthrie's.

9 He then talks about going to Dr Guthrie's between  
10 paragraphs 30 and 114. He was still only ten years old  
11 at that time.

12 If I can just go to paragraph 30 of his statement  
13 and take it from there, my Lady:

14 'I was ten years old when I went to Dr Guthrie's.  
15 The building was beautiful from the outside. There was  
16 a big square with lots of greenery and massive playing  
17 fields around it.

18 'We weren't locked up in there, so you could get out  
19 the front door and walk out the building. We were split  
20 into four houses called Argyle, Belhaven, Jeffrey and  
21 Stair, which all had a dormitory each. They were all on  
22 one landing with Jeffrey and Stair on the east side of  
23 the building and Argyle and Belhaven on the other side  
24 of the corridor.

25 'There were about 20 boys or so in each house and

1 dormitory. I was in Jeffrey. Each house had a captain,  
2 a vice captain and two monitors.

3 'There were more boys in there than Larchgrove. The  
4 boys in there aged from ten to 13 years old. There were  
5 twins from Aberdeen in there [and he names them] and  
6 there were boys from Dundee.'

7 And he names that boy, too. He also names another  
8 boy who is from Wick. He says -- someone he describes  
9 as a 'wee coloured boy' who was in there as well. He  
10 says he had a friend in there who was from Possilpark,  
11 who was in because his parents were alcoholics. He  
12 describes him and says:

13 'He was a great wee guy and there were boys in there  
14 from all over.

15 'There was a girls' school at Dr Guthrie's, but they  
16 were in a different building. They were up in Liberton  
17 and we never had anything to do with them.'

18 He then goes on to talk about staff from  
19 paragraph 35 and he names some of the staff and  
20 describes them. I'll go through that, my Lady, to set  
21 out who was there at that time:

22 'Mr GZP [REDACTED] was SNR [REDACTED] of the place for  
23 a while. He died of a heart attack a year or 15 months  
24 after I went there. Mr GFC [REDACTED] was SNR [REDACTED]  
25 SNR [REDACTED]. There were educational teachers in the

1 school and then there were staff who looked after us  
2 after school and some who did both.

3 'Mr GII [REDACTED] was a teacher and took [REDACTED]  
4 [REDACTED], known as [REDACTED]. He was also one of SNR [REDACTED] and  
5 would sometimes SNR [REDACTED]. Miss Jack was  
6 an educational teacher who taught the boys who weren't  
7 very good at reading or writing. She would also come  
8 away to summer camps with us. Mr GFG [REDACTED] was also  
9 educational, but would come away to summer camps.

10 'Mr Herron was the carpentry teacher who came in  
11 from outside to teach us during school hours. He didn't  
12 have access to our dormitories or anything.

13 'There was Mr HCM [REDACTED], the science teacher, who  
14 passed away and was replaced with Mr LXT [REDACTED], who had  
15 fought in the war in Burma.

16 'GHZ [REDACTED] taught us wrestling. There was a  
17 painter and decorator called Mr LYI [REDACTED] who was  
18 nicknamed "LYI [REDACTED]", who also taught us judo.  
19 I'm unsure what exactly his role in the place was meant  
20 to be. He was a big guy.

21 'There was GIC [REDACTED], who was the physical  
22 training guy. We called him "GIC [REDACTED]" because  
23 he had been shot in the bum in the war. Mr GBE [REDACTED]  
24 was the gardener. His name was GBE [REDACTED].

25 'There was a night watchman, Mr GUH [REDACTED]'

1           He then goes on to talk about his routine at  
2           Dr Guthrie's from paragraph 41:

3           'We got up in the morning about 7.00 am. We were  
4           woken up by the night watchman Mr **GUH**. He would put  
5           the lights on to get everyone up and then go off his  
6           shift.

7           'We would get up, strip the bed down, get our shoes  
8           on, run downstairs and run around the football pitch  
9           once, still in our jammies. We then went straight to  
10          the swimming pool, took our shoes and pyjamas off and  
11          got into the pool to swim a length of the pool, naked.  
12          I was okay because I could swim before I got there, but  
13          some boys struggled.

14          'We got out of the pool, put our pyjamas and shoes  
15          back on, went back upstairs to the dormitory and made  
16          our beds. Then we got dressed and went down to the  
17          dining room for breakfast.

18          'We all lined up in the square in our school classes  
19          and went to our classrooms. We got back into the square  
20          for break, then back to classes. We got out at  
21          lunchtime, had our lunch in the dining room, then played  
22          in the square before going back to classes for the  
23          afternoon. We got out for a bit after school again.

24          'During the winter we could do indoor activities  
25          after school, like singing classes or making table

1 lamps, which Mr Heron came in to do with us. He was  
2 great.

3 'We all lined up in our houses in the square at  
4 lunchtime and after school. Each house name would be  
5 called out in turn. The captain from each would step  
6 forward and announce how many boys were present, how  
7 many were on home leave or elsewhere. It was like  
8 checking in at the army and we were like wee  
9 mini-soldiers.

10 'We used to play football --'.

11 This is him talking about the weekends, my Lady:

12 'We used to play football at 11.00am on Saturdays  
13 against other outside teams.

14 'We went to Liberton Kirk every Sunday, which was  
15 the church near the home. We would see normal people  
16 and we wanted to talk to them, but we weren't allowed  
17 to. It was horrible having to go back to the home after  
18 that.

19 'Boys like me, who were sentenced by the courts,  
20 could get home leave some weekends to go home and see  
21 their families. Other boys, who were in there because  
22 they didn't have families who could look after them,  
23 didn't have that option.

24 'I got to go home and see my family about once  
25 a month.'

1           'John' then goes on to talk about meal times and  
2           food, and says:

3           'We all had our meals in the dining room, which was  
4           a big room with long tables, like in a boarding school.  
5           It smelled really good. I loved the food and there was  
6           plenty of it. We got three courses.'

7           Then going on to washing and bathing, he says:

8           'There were showers and toilets on each landing.  
9           There was a shower room with seven shower heads in it.  
10          We lined up outside with our toothpaste and went in  
11          seven at a time to get showered. The soap was in the  
12          showers, so we used that.

13          'We had a uniform and all wore shorts and a shirt  
14          during the day. It wasn't anything fancy. We wore the  
15          same things for a week, including our underwear and  
16          socks, before they went away to get washed.'

17          He then names the seamstress who was there and he  
18          says:

19          'We went to her if we needed anything mended or  
20          replaced. She also did the washing every week.'

21          'John' goes on to talk about school and teaching at  
22          Dr Guthrie's, and he says, from paragraph 55:

23          'We had the usual classes like English, maths and  
24          science. The classes were good and I felt like my  
25          education was good in there. The teachers came in from

1 outside to teach in classes.

2 'Mr GII was a wee bit belt happy. If he thought  
3 you'd done something wrong, he would get you into his  
4 office to belt you.

5 'I really liked Mr Herron, the carpentry teacher.  
6 He was a wee guy with glasses. He was really good.  
7 I was good at techy drawing and making stuff. I made my  
8 mum a wee fold-up coffee table in his class. I also  
9 made elephant bookcases for her. Some of these were in  
10 after school classes in the winter. I was really proud  
11 of the things I made.

12 'We also learned other things, like map reading and  
13 orienteering. This was when we went out on camping  
14 trips, so we learned things outside of the classroom as  
15 well.

16 'GIC was supposed to be the physical  
17 training guy, but he just got us to play murder ball,  
18 which was quite violent. He would just make the teams  
19 and stand back and watch us. He was also in charge of  
20 the swimming and pool area at all times. Not all the  
21 boys who came to Dr Guthrie's could swim and GIC was  
22 supposed to teach them how to, but I never saw him  
23 teaching anyone. Some boys would be holding on to the  
24 edge for dear life. GIC was in charge and he  
25 would be shouting at them to get into the shallow end.



1 It was about six feet at the deep end, so it was quite  
2 deep.

3 'There were adult men that would come into the pool  
4 area who I never recognised. They would be dressed in  
5 tennis whites and the gym was next to the pool, so maybe  
6 they were going to play badminton after. They would  
7 come into the pool area and talk to GIC as  
8 boys were running about naked. It was weird.

9 'Mr GHZ taught us wrestling and Mr LYI taught  
10 us judo. LYI had a big, proper judo suit and so did  
11 the boys.'

12 Then he talks about leisure time, from paragraph 62:

13 'We could play in the scare during school breaks and  
14 after school. There were playing fields nearby where we  
15 could go and throw flying discs or play football, but we  
16 could only go there when staff took us. We weren't  
17 allowed to go ourselves.

18 'We were also taken to the gym by the staff. They  
19 built a new gym in there while I was there.'

20 He then speaks about trips and holidays from  
21 paragraph 64:

22 'Mr LXT, the science teacher, took me and my pal,  
23 to his caravan a couple of times. It was at  
24 River Esk in Dalkeith. It was a lovely setting. He had  
25 a wee cigarette holder which he used to keep his

1 Woodbine cigarettes dry which he had from when he was in  
2 the war in Burma. He would give us some cigarettes too.  
3 He was alright and felt like a grandad. I don't know if  
4 he took other boys to the caravan. He would drive us  
5 there and we would just be there for a couple of hours,  
6 then he would drive us back.

7 'We were taken on the bus to Edinburgh to see The  
8 Sound of Music when it came out in the cinema. That was  
9 good.

10 'I learned map reading and orienteering with  
11 Mr Keddie. He was a good teacher. We started learning  
12 at Pentlands. We then moved up a level and did  
13 Lammermuir Hills and the Cairngorms, which were proper  
14 camping trips. That was good.

15 'During the summer holidays, all the boys would go  
16 to North Berwick for summer camp for about six weeks.  
17 We would sleep in tents and huts. The houses mixed with  
18 each other more during this time. There was the usual  
19 fighting between boys, but they were happy trips because  
20 we had a bit more freedom. We did things like  
21 canoeing.'

22 Then he talks about chores and work:

23 'We had to clean our own dormitories every day and  
24 they would get inspected by a senior member of staff,  
25 like Mr GFC to make sure they were clean enough.

1 If it wasn't, then we would have to clean the whole room  
2 again. It was mostly always clean though because it was  
3 cleaned every day, so never had time to get dirty.

4 GFC would take a few boys out during the school  
5 day to clean out horse stables. I don't know where they  
6 were or who they belonged to. He took me a couple of  
7 times a month. I would be with a few other boys. He  
8 took different boys as well, so maybe he took boys daily  
9 or a few times a week to clean these stables.

10 'When I was about ten or 11 years old,  
11 Mr GBE got me and a few other boys to pick  
12 potatoes in some farmer's fields. We did this for about  
13 three weeks and it was during our school day, so we did  
14 this instead of going to school.

15 'The farmer would come in his tractor and me and  
16 a few boys would jump on the back and he would drive us  
17 down to his field at Liberton Braes. He would be  
18 ploughing the potatoes up with his tractor and we had to  
19 go after him and pick the tatties and bag them. The  
20 farmer would be shouting at us for not going fast  
21 enough. We were just wee boys! It was good to get out  
22 of the home, but it was proper labour. We stopped for  
23 a cup of tea and our dinner and were made to get right  
24 back at it. We got money for it which staff would keep  
25 for you.

1           'Me and another five boys were taken up to  
2           Glenfeshie for a few days to paint a hostel there.'

3           He talks about family contact then, and 'John' says:

4           'I got paper to write home to my mum. It was rubber  
5           stamped at the top with Dr Guthrie's address, the way  
6           you get in the prisons. I think my mum only found out  
7           I had been moved there because I wrote to her and told  
8           her.

9           'I started to get home at the weekends to see my  
10          family after I had been there for about nine months.  
11          I would play football on a Saturday morning and leave  
12          just after 1.00 pm in the afternoon. I would be given  
13          bus fares and sent out the door. I would get the bus  
14          from the Braes to Waverley Train Station and then get  
15          the train to Glasgow Queen Street Station, then get the  
16          bus home to Springburn. My wee mum would be delighted  
17          to see me.

18          'I would need to be back at Guthrie's by 5.00pm on  
19          Sunday, so I wasn't home for long. After a while, I  
20          hurt my knee and couldn't play football, so I would get  
21          to leave at 9.00 am on a Saturday.

22          'I would get some money to take home with me. This  
23          was the money I made from the tattie picking.'

24          He then talks about birthdays and Christmas, and  
25          says from paragraph 77:

1           'Birthdays weren't celebrated because most of the  
2           staff saw the boys as subhuman.

3           'We went to Liberton Kirk, which was the church next  
4           to the home. It was really nicely decorated at  
5           Christmas and we would go there. Some boys would sing  
6           Christmas carols.'

7           He says he remembers his wee pal and names him  
8           singing Little Donkey:

9           'He had the voice of an angel. Seeing ordinary  
10          people from the community at the church gave your heart  
11          a wee lift and you wanted to talk to them. Your heart  
12          soon dropped again when you realised you had to go back  
13          to the home.'

14          He then talks about visits or inspections from  
15          paragraph 80:

16          'I only got one visit at Dr Guthrie's because I was  
17          getting home leave. My mum and dad came once because my  
18          dad was home from England and I hadn't seen him for  
19          a long time. They just turned up and the staff came and  
20          found me and told me to go for a walk around the  
21          football field with them. Then we came back to the home  
22          and got a cup of tea before they left.

23          'I don't recall anybody from outside ever coming  
24          into the home. I don't recall anybody ever asking how  
25          we were getting treated. It felt like we were isolated.

1           'One time, footballers came to open our new gym when  
2           it was finished.'

3           Then he names a particular football player who had  
4           moved from Hibs to Aston Villa and that he came to the  
5           home, and he says:

6           'He must have been about 21 years old at the time.  
7           I knew things weren't right in the home and we never saw  
8           anybody from outside, so I wanted to say something to  
9           them, but I couldn't.'

10          In relation to healthcare, he says from 83:

11          'There was a matron who wore a nurse's outfit and  
12          she had her own surgical area. I don't remember her  
13          name because I never had a lot to do with her.

14          'I had to go and see her a few times after my knee  
15          was hurt and she gave me jags in my knee. She wasn't  
16          very caring.

17          'I was complaining to staff about a pain in my side  
18          for ages and nobody listened to me. It was a long time  
19          before a staff member took me to hospital, where I got  
20          my appendix out. After the operation, I had a big wound  
21          that was stitched up and it had puss coming out of it.  
22          I had to keep telling the staff and going to the matron  
23          to get it cleaned. I didn't get any further treatment  
24          until I was taken back to the hospital to have my  
25          stitches removed.

1           'My throat was all swollen and I had to get my  
2 tonsils out. I had to go and catch the bus myself to  
3 Sick Kids Hospital because nobody was able to take me.'

4           He then talks about running away, at paragraph 87:

5           'The place wasn't locked up, so you could just walk  
6 out and run away. You would probably even get a couple  
7 of hours' grace before you were caught by the police and  
8 brought back. I never ran away though, because it would  
9 just cause grief for your family. The boys who ran away  
10 were sent to Rossie Farm in Montrose, which was like  
11 a secure unit. I knew it would be worse for me there  
12 and that I would never get to see my family.'

13           He then goes on to talk about bed wetting, and

14           'John' says from paragraph 88 that:

15           'The night watchman, Mr GUH [REDACTED] got the bed wetters  
16 up in the middle of the night to make them go to the  
17 toilet so they wouldn't wet themselves. If they already  
18 had wet the bed, he would make them get up and go have  
19 a shower.

20           'Mr GUH [REDACTED] was a creepy, big guy with a red,  
21 pock-marked face, who always wore a cardigan. He got  
22 called GUH [REDACTED] by the boys behind his back. The  
23 band, [REDACTED], who had brought out a record at the time  
24 called '[REDACTED]', which is about

25 [REDACTED] I don't know how he

1 got that nickname, whether it was from the time I was  
2 there or from before my time there, but he never did  
3 anything to me or anybody else I knew about.'

4 He then talks about abuse at Dr Guthrie's from  
5 paragraph 90:

6 'There wasn't any really kind of set discipline  
7 where you got punished this way for doing a certain  
8 thing. Boys who wanted to go home got threatened with  
9 their home leave being taken away and they did stop boys  
10 from going home. Other boys who didn't want to go home  
11 didn't get the same punishment.

12 'Most of the staff treated us like we were  
13 sub-human. They thought we were just bad boys and  
14 called the boys from Glasgow 'The Weegies and the rest  
15 were called 'The Teuchters'.

16 'Mr GII [REDACTED] would take you to his office to belt you  
17 if he thought you did something wrong. He would make  
18 you stand on a chair with your hand out and belt you  
19 three or six times on the hand, but he would catch you  
20 on the wrist. It was one of those belts that had the  
21 tongues at the end. If he thought you'd done something  
22 really bad he would tell you to bend over and touch your  
23 toes and belt you six times on the bum over your  
24 clothes. Nobody else would be in the office. If he  
25 took more than one boy for fighting or something we



1 would wait outside his office and go in one at a time to  
2 get belted. He belted me about six times and I would  
3 have marks on my wrists or welts on my bum or tops of my  
4 thighs afterwards. This happened during the early  
5 months of me being there because I soon wised up and  
6 learned how to behave.

7 'I didn't like LYI [REDACTED] at all. He was a big  
8 guy and would give you a whack with a big bunch of keys.  
9 I hated him. He was called "LYI [REDACTED]" because he was a big,  
10 lumbering guy with big, fat, sausage fingers. We only  
11 saw him when he was painting or decorating or when  
12 taking judo. He wasn't involved in the care of the  
13 boys.

14 'LYI [REDACTED] would come out of his painting and  
15 decorating place and he used to sit in the yard. Boys  
16 used to go for a sly smoke in the toilets and if anyone  
17 saw LYI [REDACTED] coming they'd warn you because we weren't  
18 allowed to smoke. LYI [REDACTED] would sometimes come into the  
19 toilets, line us up and smell our fingers to see if we  
20 had been smoking.

21 'This one day, me and some of the boys were in the  
22 toilets and LYI [REDACTED] came in, lined us up and smelled our  
23 fingers. I hadn't been smoking, but he said I had been.  
24 I said I hadn't and maybe swore. He hit me, bang, with  
25 his hand, and I shot right through the yellow bat-wing

1 doors of a cubicle. I went like a bullet into the  
2 cubicle and whacked my knee against the toilet pan.  
3 I think I was physically sick with the pain. I was  
4 about 11 years old at the time and he was huge.

5 [LYI] took me to the matron and told me  
6 under no circumstances was I to tell her what happened  
7 in the toilets. He said, "You will never mention what  
8 happened in the ablutions". The matron wasn't that  
9 caring. She didn't ask me what happened to my knee, but  
10 gave me jags in the knee, which might have been  
11 painkillers, but I don't know.

12 'My knee was swollen and huge after that, so I had  
13 to go back and see her a few times. She kept giving me  
14 jags, even when it was really swollen. Years later,  
15 I found out from an orthopaedic surgeon that you're not  
16 supposed to do anything to a swollen knee until the  
17 swelling goes down.

18 'I wasn't the only one. I saw boys get the side of  
19 their heads burst open by [LYI]. It was like  
20 a ritual. He would just crack you willy-nilly. I knew  
21 boys who got their head bust from him. He would carry  
22 a big bunch of keys attached to his trousers on a chain,  
23 like a jailor, and he'd whip it off the chain and whack  
24 boys with them for small reasons, like if he thought you  
25 were being boisterous. He'd usually hit you on the back

1 of the hand. He'd be standing with his big painter  
2 overalls on, with his big round head. He wasn't a nice  
3 man at all.

4 'LYI [REDACTED] would use his judo classes as an excuse to  
5 throw boys around. Some boys got it more than others.  
6 He would do it to me and rag doll me about, even after  
7 hurting my knee. He would pull a move on you and have  
8 you on the floor and he'd be lying on top of you with  
9 his whole body weight. Then he would explain to the  
10 other boys how he had done it and that they should pay  
11 attention as they would be doing it next. But the whole  
12 time he was talking he would still be lying on top of  
13 you as you struggled. He did that to some boys,  
14 including me, like he was trying to dominate you. He  
15 would let other boys get up straight away.

16 'Mr LXT [REDACTED] knew LYI [REDACTED] hit boys. Nobody did  
17 anything about it. Other staff would also hit boys with  
18 the back of the hand as well.

19 'There was a wee boy [and he names him] in the home  
20 who was the only coloured boy in the school. He was the  
21 same age as me. He had a terrible time there and got  
22 battered and bullied by the staff and the other boys and  
23 I know it was because of his colour. He was a cracking  
24 wee guy and I really liked him. He knew how to stick up  
25 for himself and I would weigh in and help him too, but

1           there was only so much I could do.

2           'Staff would threaten boys by saying they would be  
3           sent to The Farm, which was a closed block on  
4           Rossie Farm, where we would be locked up. It was like  
5           a secure unit. Boys were threatened with this all the  
6           time if staff thought you were lying about something or  
7           being unruly.

8           'There were things that went on at summer camp that  
9           you just knew didn't feel right. You would see a staff  
10          member walking along the beach with a boy at 11.00 pm at  
11          night, when everyone should have been in bed in their  
12          tents. We would see Mr LXT walking along the beach  
13          at night with a boy or two.

14          'Mr LXT was nice to me, but anybody can put on  
15          a veneer and appear decent, so you don't know what was  
16          going on. I also saw GHZ, who took wrestling,  
17          on the beach at night with boys.

18          'Some boys there were on a care order and some had  
19          been sent there by the court, so there were two  
20          different kinds of boys there. We were all mixed  
21          together and you could see the strong from the weak  
22          being separated. The boys did that themselves. There  
23          was a wee boy ...'

24          And he names him and he says they had a nickname for  
25          him:

1           'You could see right away that he was a victim. He  
2 shouldn't have been in there.

3           'We were made to play really violent games, like  
4 murder ball. It was okay for us rough-tough Glasgow  
5 boys, but the wee soft ones got hurt.

6           'There were older boys hitting on younger boys,  
7 physically and sexually. Older boys had gone through  
8 puberty and looked like young men. Then you had wee  
9 boys running around.

10          'Certain teachers also took stock of what was  
11 happening and they could then pick out who the victims  
12 were to abuse themselves.

13          'It was a strange phenomenon in the swimming pool.  
14 We were all in there naked in the mornings and some boys  
15 would be running around with erections. Some younger  
16 boys would be holding on to the side of the pool, while  
17 older boys would be pressed up against them. GIC  
18 GIC would be watching and seemed to think it was  
19 all right, because he never stopped it. He would be  
20 standing at a distance watching some boys getting almost  
21 drowned by other boys and just let it happen.

22          'I had to intervene a few times to help my wee pal  
23 [and he names him] who was from Possilpark. He was in  
24 Stair House. I thought I saved him in the pool, but  
25 I didn't. He was raped by [redacted] and [redacted]

1 in Stair House.'.

2 Then he names [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]. He  
3 says that his friend told him this happened to him and  
4 that things weren't right in his dorm. Then he, 'John',  
5 says:

6 'I think this all stemmed from the messing about in  
7 the swimming pool.'

8 He then goes on to say from paragraph 110:

9 'I told Bill Gladstone, who ran the football team,  
10 what LYI [REDACTED] did to me. I had told him I couldn't play  
11 football after hurting my knee. He said I had been fine  
12 days before and asked why I couldn't play. I told him  
13 what LYI [REDACTED] did. I don't think he did anything about  
14 it or told Mr GZP [REDACTED]. I know that LYI [REDACTED]'s behaviour  
15 didn't get better.'

16 Then he says that he and his friend told Mr LXT [REDACTED]  
17 that things were happening in Stair House, and says:

18 'I think we thought we could confide in him because  
19 he was the newest member of staff.'

20 He says he took him and his friend down to his  
21 caravan with him, where he would give them Woodbine  
22 cigarettes and he felt like a bit of a grandad.

23 He then names two boys who were sent away from  
24 Dr Guthrie's, and says:

25 'I think they were sent way to Rossie Farm. That

1 made the threat from the staff about sending us to  
2 Rossie Farm if we were bad feel even more real.  
3 I wasn't going to complain about the staff at  
4 Dr Guthrie's to anybody in case they sent me to  
5 Rossie Farm, too.'

6 Then he says he'd be locked up with boys. It's the  
7 same boys he mentioned. These are the two boys, my  
8 Lady, whose friend said were [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]  
9 [REDACTED] of the Stair dormitory who had sexually  
10 assaulted his friend.

11 He then talks about leaving Dr Guthrie's, and says:

12 'I was in Dr Guthrie's for two-and-a-half years. I  
13 left because I was coming up for 13 years old. That was  
14 the age boys left, so I knew I would be going. I think  
15 I was told that I would be leaving in a few weeks and my  
16 family had been notified.'

17 He says:

18 'None of the boys had any belongings, so we didn't  
19 take anything with us when we left.'

20 He then says he went back home and he went to high  
21 school. He was still -- he says he was about 12 years  
22 old when he went back home. He did engineering at high  
23 school and he liked it.

24 He was home for about a year and got into a fight at  
25 school and then was back in court and sent to Larchgrove

1 for assessment, then on to an Approved School.

2 Then he talks about Larchgrove for the second time,  
3 at paragraph 117 and 118. When he was there he was  
4 13-and-a-half and just says it was exactly the same as  
5 the last time he was there. But he was bigger and this  
6 time he knew the ropes, and just describes an incident  
7 when he got a black eye from another boy, but says it  
8 was his fault. He was there for about six to eight  
9 weeks before he was taken to Geilsland, and he talks  
10 about Geilsland between paragraphs 119 and 166.

11 This part of his statement was read in during  
12 Chapter 5 and that was on 24 April this year, Day 438.

13 He was 13-and-a-half when he was there. He talks  
14 about manual labour, physical assaults by staff and  
15 usual punishments, inappropriate games like murderball,  
16 and talks about an incident where he banged his head on  
17 a concrete beam having to climb a cargo net. He was  
18 14 years old and ended up with a dent in his head as  
19 a result of that.

20 He left Geilsland as he was coming up for 16 years  
21 old and he moved home. Got a job at a knitwear company,  
22 but started hanging out with older boys and left his job  
23 and got in trouble and appeared in court just before his  
24 16th birthday. He was then sent to Perth Prison and  
25 Polmont.



1           He talks about that between paragraphs 169 and 191.  
2           These parts of his statement were read in on the first  
3           chapter for Scottish Prison Service, on 10 November last  
4           year, Day 388.

5           He was in Perth Prison for three weeks and then  
6           Polmont Borstal. He was 16 when he went to Polmont. He  
7           talks about physical assaults from staff. He was six  
8           weeks in Polmont and then six months at Cornton Vale and  
9           he was one of the individuals who helped build Cornton  
10          Vale at that time and his sentence was reduced.

11          He then talks about life after care from  
12          paragraph 192 to 197. He says he went back home, got  
13          a job in the construction industry and he travelled  
14          around doing labouring work. He went to London, ended  
15          up in trouble, and was in jail a few times.

16          'John' then met an artist and became his personal  
17          assistant and did that for eight years, but left that in  
18          2014. He ended up having a knee replacement and hasn't  
19          worked since then. He talks about the impact of his  
20          time in care between paragraphs 198 and 206. He resents  
21          not getting schooling in Larchgrove and being made to do  
22          manual work in Geilsland and wonders what he could have  
23          achieved if he had gotten an education.

24          He says he didn't even have qualifications, even for  
25          the manual skills that he learned whilst in care, which

1 held him back.

2 If I can go to paragraph 200 of his statement and  
3 just read that part:

4 'I saw an orthopaedic surgeon to get my knee checked  
5 as an adult and he asked if I had any bad impact  
6 accidents as a child on my knee because I had a hairline  
7 fracture the full length of my knee. I told him about  
8 what had happened with LYI and the toilet pan  
9 because that was the only thing I could think of.'

10 He then talks about his friend from Dr Guthrie's  
11 getting a job on the oil rigs. Then he says:

12 'He thought it was okay for the first six months and  
13 was making good money, but then he had to give it up  
14 after a while because he felt it was weird being in  
15 a closed space with all these other men. He told me it  
16 felt like being at Dr Guthrie's again and so he had to  
17 leave.'

18 He then goes on to say that he grew up distanced  
19 from his siblings because he had been in care, which  
20 broke the bond of growing up together in a house. He  
21 comments, at paragraph 205, that this all happened to  
22 him because he climbed into a funnel to get some heat  
23 from the laundrette as a child.

24 He says that as a parent himself he placed a lot of  
25 emphasis on education to make sure his son got the

1 opportunities he never had.

2 He talks about lessons to be learned between  
3 paragraphs 208 and 212 and says that it's imperative  
4 that secondary education is made available for young  
5 lads and lasses.

6 If I can go to something 'John' says at  
7 paragraph 209, he says:

8 'Children in care need to be shaped for the life  
9 ahead instead of just being contained.'

10 He talks about there needing to be proper  
11 registration of staff, proper structure of inspection  
12 and that children need to be asked how they're getting  
13 on regularly.

14 Then, at paragraph 213, he's made the usual  
15 declaration and he has signed his statement, and it's  
16 11 July 2022.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

18 I think we should stop now for the afternoon break,  
19 a short break, and then go on to the next read-ins after  
20 that. Thank you very much.

21 (2.55 pm)

22 (A short break)

23 (3.05 pm)

24 LADY SMITH: Now, just to catch up on names and identities  
25 that are protected my General Restriction Order, this

1 afternoon so far we've used the names Mr GFC  
2 GZP, Mr GII, Mr GFG, Mr HCM, Mr or  
3 LYI, GIC, GBE,  
4 Mr GUH, also known as GUH, Mr LXT and  
5 GHZ, none of these people are to be identified  
6 outside this room.

7 Now, Mr Sheldon, when you are ready.

8 MR SHELDON: My Lady, the next read-in is from the statement  
9 of an applicant who is known as 'John'. The reference  
10 for the statement -- I'm so sorry, my Lady -- is  
11 WIT-1-000000876.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

13 'John' (read)

14 MR SHELDON: 'John' gave live evidence in the 'Foster Care'  
15 Case Study. The reference for -- it was Day 295,  
16 14 June 2022. TRN-10-000000027. His evidence is at  
17 pages 114 to 188. There are some comments about  
18 Dr Guthrie's at pages 131 to 132, very briefly.

19 LADY SMITH: He gave live evidence in 'Foster Care', didn't  
20 he?

21 MR SHELDON: Yes. My Lady has the reference, I think.

22 LADY SMITH: Yes, I have that.

23 MR SHELDON: 'John' was born in 1952. He was at  
24 Dr Guthrie's between 1965 and 1968, so overlapping quite  
25 substantially with the last applicant that we heard

1 about.

2 LADY SMITH: Yes.

3 MR SHELDON: 'John' doesn't report much by way of abuse and  
4 for that reason it's perhaps an interesting contrast.

5 LADY SMITH: Although the last read-in very fairly reported  
6 a lot that was positive about Dr Guthrie's --

7 MR SHELDON: Yes.

8 LADY SMITH: -- in addition to the abusive features.

9 MR SHELDON: Indeed, my Lady.

10 So I can take 'John's' early life short, because he  
11 talks a bit about that in his 'Foster Care' evidence,  
12 but broadly he had rather unstable parents and was  
13 brought up by his grandmother until the age of about  
14 eight, when she died and he went into the care system.

15 He was then in a variety of Children's Homes and  
16 then foster care in the west of Scotland, mainly in  
17 Ayrshire, and had clearly some unhappy experiences in  
18 foster care.

19 If we jump then to page 7 of the statement and  
20 paragraph 31, 'John' tells us that he ended up in court  
21 in Ayr, 'though why I'm not sure'.

22 'The court sent me to Dr Guthrie's in Edinburgh  
23 under, I think, some sort of Child Protection Order.  
24 I have always felt that I was shipped off to Dr  
25 Guthrie's because things were happening in Ayrshire with

1 the social work that wasn't public knowledge. Edinburgh  
2 was miles away at a time when there were no motorways.  
3 Most of those in Dr Guthrie's were from the east coast  
4 and I only recall about three boys from Glasgow.'

5 Pausing there, my Lady, it may be that there was  
6 some knowledge of what was happening to him in foster  
7 care, but 'John' clearly doesn't know what the reason  
8 was.

9 He notes, at paragraph 32, the horrible experience  
10 that he had of living with his foster mother. He then  
11 goes on, at paragraph 33, to talk about his time at  
12 Dr Guthrie's. He says:

13 'When I arrived at Dr Guthrie's I went in a big  
14 front door where there was a meeting room, a gym hall  
15 and a long corridor. Upstairs there were four dorms,  
16 each of which had between 18 and 20 boys therein. The  
17 boys were split into houses and I was in House Yellow.  
18 There were usually about 110 boys there, aged from 11 up  
19 to 15. If there was 120, then it was considered full.

20 'The place had a playground, gardens and a swimming  
21 pool. It was a great place to be. SNR  
22 was GZP, but I don't know who ran the place,  
23 though it was an Approved School. When I arrived I was  
24 taken to a sewing room where I was supplied with all the  
25 clothing I needed before being shown about the place.

1 I was then put into a dorm that had only one bed and  
2 a locker. Between the two big dorms was a room where  
3 a number of staff slept overnight. I don't know how  
4 many staff there were, but there were teachers and cooks  
5 and staff that were on overnight.'

6 In relation to routine:

7 'We would get up at about 7.00/7.30 am. We would  
8 get showered and dressed then down for breakfast. If it  
9 was a nice day, we would go outside for a while before  
10 going to school. We would stop for lunch, then it was  
11 back to school. After school we would go to the gym or  
12 do something, another physical activity.

13 'Tea time was about 4.30pm and after that we would  
14 do some more activities which for some included music.  
15 There was always something to do in the evening. Lights  
16 out was about 9.00 pm.

17 'There were six or seven showers and each one had  
18 its own cubicle so we could shower in private.

19 'The food was all right and the only thing I recall  
20 not liking was the gravy, which was never done right.  
21 But the kitchen staff were all really nice. We all ate  
22 at small tables in a big room. You didn't get any  
23 snacks between meals.

24 'We were supplied with our clothes and uniform by  
25 the school.

1           'We went swimming and I learned karate there. We  
2           also played on a trampoline. The school owned a place  
3           down past Dunbar called Thornton Loch and we would go  
4           down there every year and pitch tents that we could  
5           sleep in. Sometimes the army would come in and take us  
6           away and show us their camps and guns.

7           'Members of staff taught us, though I was often in  
8           trouble for outbursts. I didn't like going to class and  
9           often helped those painting the place. When I left  
10          I couldn't read or write and didn't learn to until  
11          I worked in the steelworks when I taught myself while  
12          working on the cranes.

13          'I had been in Dr Guthrie's for about two years when  
14          I was given the job of collecting money from everybody  
15          and would then go across to the shop and get their  
16          newspapers, cigarettes or whatever. This was considered  
17          a top job to have and was a position of trust.

18          'The only thing I recall about healthcare was this  
19          strange thing they did, where they got us all into the  
20          dining room and would then measure our skulls and mark  
21          down the findings in a jotter. This was apparently to  
22          help some study being done at a university.

23          'There were two churches that we used and if you  
24          were there at the weekend you went to one of the  
25          churches. Other than that, religion wasn't a big thing.



1           'The other boys would go home for Christmas, but  
2           I didn't. I recall at least on one occasion I went home  
3           with a teacher and his family, which was a lovely time,  
4           and I would be back for new year. Birthdays weren't  
5           celebrated.

6           'You got money on a Saturday, two shillings and  
7           sixpence, and I would go into Leith and get fags and  
8           matches and go to the cinema. Anything you did have you  
9           could keep in a wee cupboard in your dorm.

10          'I could be wrong, but I think there was a small  
11          dorm used for those who wet the bed, but there was never  
12          a problem about this and boys weren't humiliated if it  
13          happened. Nobody made a big fuss about it and I think  
14          wet sheets were simply taken away and washed.

15          'I never got any visits and most of the other boys  
16          would go home at the weekend, usually leaving about 30  
17          or 40 boys there. They were unable to grant me leave,  
18          apart from one period when I returned to Burnside  
19          Children's Home for a week. It was never found possible  
20          to make contact with my immediate family.

21          'There was a psychologist who used to come over from  
22          Geilsland to speak to me. I spoke to her both in Dr  
23          Guthrie's and Geilsland, where I went next. I don't  
24          recall her name, but she has since died.'

25          Pause there to note there was a Janet Hassan who was

1 quite a well-known psychologist and who certainly worked  
2 in the schools around that time.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

4 MR SHELDON: We saw reference to her in relation to  
5 Balgowan, my Lady.

6 LADY SMITH: Yes.

7 MR SHELDON: 'No social workers ever came to see me.  
8 I always thought that the staff in Dr Guthrie's  
9 genuinely cared about us and we could sit and talk to  
10 staff about how we were getting on.

11 'I never saw a social worker when I was there and  
12 I think all contact with social workers in my life ended  
13 when I went to Dr Guthrie's, despite the fact that I was  
14 allegedly there under a Child Protection Order. I would  
15 never admit that to the other boys as they were all in  
16 for having committed some crime or other, so if I was  
17 asked what I was in for I would just make up a crime.

18 'I don't recall seeing any inspectors coming in to  
19 review Dr Guthrie's, but I suppose it's possible that it  
20 did happen and I just wasn't aware of it.'

21 Of course, we have seen some evidence that  
22 Mr McPherson was there from time to time:

23 'As with all the various places I was in, I had no  
24 contact with my family while in Dr Guthrie's.

25 'The only discipline I recall was being put in

1 a cell to calm down for a couple of hours. I think  
2 I was the only person ever put in there and it would  
3 happen if I got into an argument with another boy and  
4 I would go berserk. There was no hitting and I think  
5 the worse done was getting a telling off from Mr GZP  
6 in his office. On rare occasions, I think some boys got  
7 lines or maybe you would have privileges, like swimming,  
8 withdrawn. The belt was never used.

9 'I'm not aware of anybody ever running away, though  
10 it's possible that some of the boys missed their parents  
11 and did run away. You could walk out of the place  
12 whenever you wanted, but you wouldn't go far and  
13 everybody would return when they were supposed to.'

14 Under the heading 'Abuse at Dr Guthrie's':

15 'I don't recall anything at Dr Guthrie's that  
16 I would describe as abusive. Yes, we got shouted at now  
17 and again, but you are talking about keeping over 100  
18 teenage boys under control, so there had to be at least  
19 some sort of discipline.'

20 He then talks about leaving Dr Guthrie's on turning  
21 15 and he said he was sad to be leaving because:

22 'It was the first place I had been when I felt I had  
23 security.'

24 After staying again in the West Coast, he was taken  
25 to Geilsland in Beith and he was there for about two

1 months in 1968. Again, he says:

2 'I had no complaints about Geilsland, SNR  
3 by EZD. I suppose my only complaint was it  
4 wasn't Dr Guthrie's, which I missed.'

5 He goes on to talk about some aspects of the layout  
6 and routine in the place. But, again, my Lady, he  
7 doesn't describe really any abuse taking place at  
8 Geilsland, certainly not that he was aware of.'

9 At paragraph 69, he says that the belt was given at  
10 certain times:

11 'But I never got it because I was bad, but never  
12 that bad. EZD would give the belt when it was  
13 necessary. He didn't believe in the regimented way of  
14 looking after young boys and believed that if something  
15 went wrong it was better to sit down and discuss what  
16 might be wrong with somebody in the background that was  
17 making them behave in such a way. Yes, he would shout  
18 at you sometimes, but shouting never hurt anybody.'

19 Again, my Lady, there is a certain contrast with  
20 other evidence that we have.

21 LADY SMITH: Yes, there certainly is.

22 MR SHELDON: My Lady, I'll just say a word or two about life  
23 after care. In his evidence in 'Foster Care', he does  
24 talk about that a little, but his evidence focused  
25 mainly on records, certainly his feelings that he had

1           been denied records unfairly.

2           He notes, at 71, that he went to Southampton at 16  
3           and joined the Merchant Navy, met his wife when he was  
4           20 and they got married, and some years later had their  
5           first child. They went on to have three sons and three  
6           daughters. He notes that none of them have a record  
7           because:

8           'I always made sure that they had a different  
9           childhood to me.'

10          He says something about his working life and then  
11          his health, which took a turn for the worse in 1988 and,  
12          at 75, under 'Impact', he says:

13          'Due to the lack of affection I received in growing  
14          up I always found it difficult to show affection to my  
15          children. That changed when my grandchildren arrived  
16          and I was able to show them affection and hug them.

17          'For me one of the biggest impacts has been  
18          rejection. I spent my childhood being rejected by  
19          everywhere I was placed, until I ended up in  
20          Dr Guthrie's. It still seems strange to me that the  
21          only place that didn't reject me was an Approved School.

22          'Being rejected so often made it difficult for me to  
23          form relationships and put trust in friends and it  
24          wasn't until I met my wife that I realised somebody  
25          loved me for just being me. It still took a couple of

1 years for me to put my trust in my wife and have  
2 children, but we have been together ever since.

3 'I certainly don't trust social workers due to their  
4 complete lack of support in my early life. This is  
5 affecting me to this day as there are problems with one  
6 of my grandchildren and I truly believe that the social  
7 workers involved have things completely wrong. I don't  
8 like working with them, but the rules and regime mean  
9 I have no choice.

10 'I often think about my time in care and think about  
11 those who are no longer with us. I think that given how  
12 my early life was my life hasn't worked out too bad.  
13 I also became very cynical in life and it takes a long  
14 time for me to trust people. I think my time in care  
15 has made me more aware of danger and that has helped me  
16 guide my own children through life.

17 'Because of my time in care I came to believe that  
18 your time as a child should be spent being a child.  
19 Unfortunately, I passed this to my children and wish  
20 I had made them realise how important education is for  
21 a chance to improve your later life and that of your  
22 family.'

23 He says he's about to start seeing a psychologist to  
24 help with the constant pain because of his arthritis.  
25 He says he has never seen a counsellor with regard to

1 his time in care. He says he's never reported anything  
2 that happened in his early life to anybody in a position  
3 of authority and certainly not the police:

4 'My wife doesn't know much about my childhood and  
5 I would never discuss such things with my children.'

6 He then goes on to talk about the issue of records.  
7 Under 'Lessons to be learned', he says:

8 'In my opinion there are two or three reasons why  
9 somebody would speak to the Inquiry. You either do it  
10 to help build better facilities, so that people learn  
11 from the mistakes of the past or you do it for revenge.  
12 You can rule out revenge as far as I'm concerned,  
13 because those involved are all dead and you don't get  
14 revenge on dead people. If you believe in God, then  
15 they've gone to hell and that's the end of it.

16 'For me, this is about the truth coming out and the  
17 hope that children in care in the future will be better  
18 cared for. Children didn't matter when I was in care  
19 and that has to change.

20 'You have to give children in care some targets to  
21 achieve. A routine for them would help and give them  
22 a sense of security, but being able to work towards  
23 something gives them something to look forward to.'

24 He has made the usual declaration, my Lady, and  
25 signed and dated the statement.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MR SHELDON: I will hand over again to Ms Forbes, my Lady.

3 MS FORBES: My Lady, the next statement is from an applicant  
4 who is anonymous and known as 'David'. The reference  
5 for his statement is WIT-1-000001122.

6 Again, my Lady, 'David's' statement has been read in  
7 previously and I will refer to that as we go through his  
8 statement.

9 'David' (read)

10 MS FORBES: 'David' was born in 1955. He talks about his  
11 life before going into care between paragraphs 2 and 12.  
12 He was born in Lennoxton in Glasgow and doesn't really  
13 know anything about his life before going into care,  
14 except what he's been told years later by a family  
15 member.

16 He knows that his mother suffered from mental health  
17 issues and he was sent to Quarriers when he was probably  
18 very young, around about two. He talks about Quarriers  
19 from paragraph 13 to 52. His earliest memories are from  
20 around five years of age and he says whilst there he  
21 suffered physical, mental and sexual abuse and, in  
22 particular, he was made to touch a member of staff on  
23 his privates and eventually made to masturbate this  
24 member of staff. This man would take his trousers down  
25 and put his penis between his legs. That happened on



1 quite a few occasions. He sums up his time there as  
2 being 'horrible and disgusting' and left in  
3 [REDACTED] 1963, when he was about eight years old.

4 He went back home to stay with his mother and his  
5 mother's partner, but about a year later, when he was  
6 around nine, he was taken back into care. That related  
7 to some incident involving him and others taking money  
8 off someone. He was taken to court in Govan and  
9 sentenced to three years and taken to Larchgrove.

10 He talks about Larchgrove between paragraphs 60 and  
11 75. These parts of his statement were read in during  
12 Chapter 4, on 20 March of this year, Day 426.

13 He was in Larchgrove temporarily until a place could  
14 be found to do the three years. Whilst there he  
15 suffered physical assaults from a staff member. He  
16 wasn't in there long, but was back and forward in there  
17 before going to Dr Guthrie's and also The Kibble.

18 In relation to some factors that are relevant to  
19 what happened to him in -- later, at Dr Guthrie's, he  
20 talks about abuse at Larchgrove and that was in the form  
21 of sexual abuse from other boys and he was made to  
22 masturbate several older boys.

23 Again, he doesn't know how long he was there for and  
24 he says that it was okay, other than what happened there  
25 with the other boys. He was then taken to Dr Guthrie's.

1 He talks about his time at Dr Guthrie's between  
2 paragraphs 76 and 89 of his statement. If I could go to  
3 paragraph 76, he states:

4 'Dr Guthrie's looked like a big castle. You went up  
5 a drive and through a main gate that took you up to the  
6 school. On the inside there was a big square with doors  
7 all the way round it.

8 'I don't know who ran Dr Guthrie's or what it was  
9 when I first went there. It was boys only and it wasn't  
10 until later I found out it was an Approved School. The  
11 boys were about the same age as they had been at  
12 Larchgrove, which was between nine and sixteen.

13 'It seemed like there were thousands of boys there.  
14 There were loads of dorms and they were all upstairs  
15 with about sixteen boys in each. You could walk right  
16 round and there were wings off of it. Downstairs there  
17 was the dining room, laundry and offices. I can't  
18 remember if there were showers there.

19 'The staff that I can remember there were SNR  
20 SNR, Mr GZP, and a guy called GVI.  
21 I might be getting confused though because I was only  
22 there for a short time. I got sent elsewhere between  
23 the ages of nine and thirteen and then was back at  
24 Dr Guthrie's for another spell later. They might have  
25 been there the second time.'

1           He then talks about the routine at Dr Guthrie's at  
2 paragraph 80:

3           'When I first arrived I was scared. I didn't know  
4 where I was going and I didn't know who the people were  
5 that took me through or where they were from. I think  
6 it was the social work, but I'm not sure. I think I got  
7 taken to meet the headmaster and was then shown about.

8           'I went to school at Dr Guthrie's. There was a hall  
9 there and there were teachers that were separate from  
10 the staff there. We got classes with the normal  
11 subjects.

12           'You were free to go about your dorm or go outdoors  
13 in the grounds. There was games, boardgames and things  
14 to do.

15           'I ran away, but I can't remember if that was the  
16 first or second time. As a punishment for running away  
17 you would get battered and belted.'

18           He then talks about abuse at Dr Guthrie's at  
19 paragraph 84:

20           'The same things that had happened to me at  
21 Larchgrove started to happen with the older boys at  
22 Dr Guthrie's. It was just one boy at a time, but there  
23 were several of them who made me do it. It was  
24 happening a lot and they would drag me into the toilet  
25 block or back to the dormitory to make me do it.

1 I don't want to go into the details again. What was  
2 happening with me was also happening with other boys.

3 'There was something else vulgar that happened that  
4 I can't talk about. I think the staff knew what had  
5 happened as they were always around me after that.

6 'The staff used to call me names. They called me  
7 snotty because I was always crying and had snot running  
8 down my nose. This was because I was so unhappy about  
9 what was happening with the older boys. Nobody ever  
10 asked me why I was so unhappy.

11 'The minister came to see me and took me to his  
12 room. He asked me if I knew where I was going and said  
13 I didn't. He said they were going to put me somewhere  
14 else. I think his name was maybe Mr Jones because  
15 I'm sure he gave me a new testament when I was leaving  
16 with his name on it, showing who it was from. This was  
17 the first time I had ever met him.

18 'He never said why I was getting moved, but I think  
19 it was because of what the older boys were making me to  
20 do them and I think the staff knew what was going on.  
21 I was happy that I was going to be getting out of there.  
22 I'm not sure how long I had been in Dr Guthrie's. My  
23 mind said I was there a long time, but it could have  
24 been six months, maybe longer.

25 'A few weeks later I got taken to another Approved

1 School.'

2 This was a place in Arbroath. He states that he  
3 can't remember how he got there, but it might have been  
4 the same people who took him from Larchgrove to  
5 Dr Guthrie's.

6 He then talks about that school from paragraphs 90  
7 to 114. He thinks he was about ten or 11 when he went  
8 there. He talks about some physical abuse from a staff  
9 member and thinks that he left after the end of his  
10 sentence, but he's not sure if he did the full three  
11 years or got out early.

12 He was sent back to Glasgow to live with his mum and  
13 was back getting into mischief and ended up back in  
14 court for breaking into a school and stealing the  
15 teachers' belts. He wrecked the place and stole the  
16 belts and he was sent to Juvenile Court. Then they  
17 referred him to the Children's Panel. Panel said he was  
18 unruly and he was being sent to an Approved School and  
19 he was taken straight to Larchgrove. This is Larchgrove  
20 the second time that 'David' talks about from  
21 paragraph 120. Again, this was read in, in Chapter 4,  
22 on 20 March, Day 426.

23 This time it was a short spell for about 28 days,  
24 perhaps, remanded or detained for reports. He was back  
25 to the Sheriff Court and sentenced to two years in

1 Dr Guthrie's. He thinks by this time he was 13 or 14,  
2 the second time he went to Dr Guthrie's. He talks about  
3 that from paragraph 124 to 134. If I can go to  
4 paragraph 124, 'David' states:

5 'I think Mr GZP was still SNR when I  
6 went back there. He was all right, while we  
7 were there. The other staff I remember were Mr GVI  
8 and Mr GFG .

9 'I was there for 18 months and it was different boys  
10 from before that were now there. The routine was  
11 exactly the same as it had been when I had been there  
12 before. I went to school while I was there, but never  
13 sat exams.

14 'There was a big sports centre, playing field and  
15 swimming pool. We did a lot of sport on the football  
16 field and did wrestling, boxing and trampolining in the  
17 evenings. We were also made to play murderball.

18 'I never had any visitors or saw a social worker or  
19 anybody like that whilst I was at Dr Guthrie's. I did  
20 get to go home sometimes for the weekend, or maybe at  
21 times in the holidays. I would get the train back  
22 through to my mum's.

23 'I ran away a couple of times whilst I was there  
24 this time. I got the strap across the backside over my  
25 clothes from the deputy headmaster, who was called

1 Mr Rush something. Maybe Mr Rushford. He would give us  
2 six of the belt. Other teachers would send us to him if  
3 we did anything wrong and he would belt you. I don't  
4 think there was any record kept of how often or why  
5 I got belt.

6 'Mr GZP also used to make me sit in a room and do  
7 the alphabet all the time whilst the others were out  
8 doing what they wanted. It was a punishment, but he was  
9 punishing me for nothing.'

10 He then talks about abuse at Dr Guthrie's while he  
11 was there the second time, from paragraph 130. 'David'  
12 said:

13 'When I went back to Dr Guthrie's the same kind of  
14 abuse happened a couple of times, where I was dragged  
15 into the toilets and made to masturbate an older boy  
16 again. It was just that one boy who made me do it  
17 twice. He hadn't been at Dr Guthrie's when I had been  
18 there before. I was about 13 or 14 and started to stand  
19 up for myself, so it stopped. I don't know if this was  
20 happening to other boys. I never told anybody about  
21 what he had made me do.'

22 He then says he and another guy, who he names, who  
23 was also there at the same time and was a well-known  
24 guy:

25 'Ran away one time up to near where a ski slope was

1 in Edinburgh. Mr GVI and Mr GFG chased us in  
2 a Land Rover and tried to knock us over. I don't know  
3 who was driving, but we fell over trying to get away and  
4 they got out and chased us. The two of them battered us  
5 both whilst we were on the ground. They started kicking  
6 us to the body. We got taken back to the school and the  
7 deputy teacher gave us the strap across the backside  
8 over our clothes. I can't remember his name. It was  
9 a usual teacher's belt with two tongs at the end. We  
10 got hit at least six times each with the belt.

11 'We went swimming a lot and when we went in the  
12 swimming pool we always had to swim naked. I found this  
13 really strange and the teacher made us do life saving  
14 and it wasn't nice doing that naked. I don't know the  
15 teacher's name, but we all called him by the name "GIC  
16 GIC". He was in his 50s and was always shouting  
17 and pointing at you. He never came in the water  
18 himself.

19 'After I got the doing from Mr GVI and  
20 Mr GFG, I wrote to my mum because I had got the  
21 doing and my face was all bruises. After I wrote the  
22 letter I sneaked outside the school to send the letter.  
23 My mum came to school a couple of weeks later and  
24 attacked one of them. I'm not sure which one it was.  
25 I was there and she was cursing and swearing at them.



1           'I can't remember what the staff said. I just  
2           remember my mum was bawling and swearing at them about  
3           what they had done to her boy. She said, "Look at the  
4           state of him". I still had bruises on my thigh and my  
5           stomach. I got told to leave and didn't see my mum  
6           again, but she told me later she had got physical with  
7           them after I was sent out.'

8           He then talks about leaving Dr Guthrie's and he says  
9           that he left at the end of his sentence and went home.  
10          If I can just read from paragraph 135:

11          'I left Dr Guthrie's at the end of my sentence and  
12          got sent home on a train. I can't remember who told me  
13          I was leaving, but something had been put in place as  
14          I got a letter from my mum saying she was looking  
15          forward to me being back home again.'

16          He then says he went back to his mum's and he talks  
17          about the fact that he was meant to be at school, but he  
18          was skipping it again and getting into mischief. He was  
19          breaking into things and stealing out of vans. He ended  
20          up at the Children's Panel a couple of times and given  
21          a warning to start going to school and behaving, but he  
22          never did either.

23          When he was about 15-ish he was back in court or  
24          before a Children's Panel and he was sent to Kibble. He  
25          says that he was in Larchgrove, though, for a short

1 period first. He talks about that from paragraph 141 to  
2 142.

3 This was just a short period. He says that this  
4 time at Larchgrove, which was the third time -- there  
5 were gangs and he saw people getting stabbed in the  
6 legs, but that never happened to him. By this time, he  
7 was bigger, stronger and more streetwise.

8 He was then sent to Kibble and he talks about that  
9 between paragraphs 143 and 162.

10 He was meant to be there for two years, but he did  
11 about a year. 'David' talks about a lot of fighting  
12 between the boys during which staff wouldn't intervene.  
13 There was a lot of gangs and gang fights. There were  
14 also physical assaults from staff.

15 He left Kibble when he was about 16. He went back  
16 home. Things were just the same. He says he was  
17 drinking a lot and he was fighting with gangs and in  
18 trouble with the police.

19 Then he says, from paragraph 163, that he ended up  
20 in the Sheriff Court, charged with attempted murder,  
21 which was dropped down to serious assault and he was  
22 sentenced to three years at Polmont. He thinks that  
23 this was in 1973, when he was 17. He as still at Govan  
24 High at the time. He says that's where he met his wife  
25 and later they got married, in 1976, when he came out of

1 Polmont.

2 Before going to Polmont he was in Barlinnie for  
3 about, maybe, three months before being transferred and  
4 he had no issues whilst he was in Barlinnie.

5 In relation to his time in Polmont, what 'David'  
6 says about that was read into the Inquiry on 16 November  
7 last year, Day 391, and he talks about it between  
8 paragraphs 168 and 178. There were physical assaults by  
9 a member of staff and he volunteered again as  
10 a plasterer for Cornton Vale and he was in Cornton Vale  
11 for a while. There were no issues and he left from  
12 Cornton Vale when he was about 18. He only did one year  
13 of a three-year sentence and he had no issues at Cornton  
14 Vale.

15 He talks about his life after care from  
16 paragraph 181. He went back to his mum's. He was  
17 getting drunk and in trouble for breaches of the peace  
18 and things like that, and couldn't get a job because of  
19 his convictions. He moved in with the woman he married,  
20 but the years following were very hard. There were  
21 a lot of deaths in his family. His uncle died, his  
22 brother was murdered. He had three daughters and a son.  
23 His wife disappeared when one of his daughters was six  
24 months old, and he was a lone parent and brought up the  
25 children on his own.

1           He struggled with drinking, but fought to try and  
2           make sure that nothing happened to his children.  
3           Eventually got divorced and he got involved with the  
4           Govan Initiative, who train people back into work. He  
5           had trouble getting a job because of disclosure and went  
6           to college, started an HNC in community development, but  
7           didn't finish it.

8           His son was sadly murdered. He struggled with  
9           depression. Then he found out information about his  
10          early life from a family member, found out who his  
11          father was and tracked down some of the members of his  
12          father's family. He never worked in a paid job since  
13          the time his son was murdered, but 'David' says he  
14          has volunteered --

15        LADY SMITH: Was it his son or his brother? Paragraph 186.

16        MS FORBES: My Lady, I think his brother was murdered and  
17          also his son as well, but I'll just check. Yes, he  
18          talks about picking a coffin for his son at  
19          paragraph 194 and, at 193, it's redacted, but the  
20          details are given --

21        LADY SMITH: Two close members of the family.

22        MS FORBES: Yes. I think it's redacted because it gives  
23          quite a lot of very specific information about the  
24          murder.

25        LADY SMITH: Yes, of course.

1 MS FORBES: Yes, my Lady, quite a lot of tragic events.

2 He says he has volunteered though at soup kitchens  
3 and helped the homeless.

4 Talking about the impact, 'David' says from 203  
5 onwards that that part of his statement, the latter  
6 part, relates to his time in Quarriers and he talks  
7 about the fact that he's had issues with drinking and  
8 drugs.

9 But, at paragraph 217, he tells us that he has  
10 a loving family of his own and they're very supportive.  
11 He's blessed with grandchildren and would do anything to  
12 protect them.

13 If I can go to paragraph 219, he states:

14 'I'm not sure whether I would have had a better  
15 education if I hadn't gone to institutes and  
16 Approved Schools. The reason I say that is when I was  
17 at Dr Guthrie's for maths we did algebra and when I went  
18 back to Govan High after that they were just teaching me  
19 simple stuff like one and one. I never had a consistent  
20 education because of all the disruption and I think this  
21 affected me because I probably would have made something  
22 of my life.'

23 He then talks about his hopes for the Inquiry. At  
24 paragraph 265 and 266, he says:

25 'There should be more vetting for people working in

1 care and there should be an independent body.'

2 My Lady; if I can go then to the last paragraph,  
3 where he makes the usual declaration, at 267, and  
4 'David' has signed that. It's dated 8 November 2022.

5 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

6 What is the plan?

7 MS FORBES: My Lady, my learned senior, Mr Sheldon, has  
8 a short one that hopefully should take up us to  
9 4 o'clock.

10 LADY SMITH: Well, if we can fit that in, it would be very  
11 helpful, Mr Sheldon. Thank you.

12 MR SHELDON: Yes, my Lady. I think we can take this  
13 relatively short.

14 This is an applicant who is known as 'Jacob'.

15 'Jacob' (read)

16 MR SHELDON: His evidence was read in for the Geilsland  
17 chapter on Day 438. The reference for that is  
18 TRN-12-000000071.

19 We don't appear to have any records for 'Jacob', but  
20 he says he was in Dr Guthrie's from about 1966 to 1968,  
21 so we're still broadly in that period, mid to late  
22 1960s.

23 My Lady, the background was at least partly read in  
24 during the CrossReach hearings, so I'll take that short  
25 and just go straight to paragraph 9, page 2.

1 I should have noted that he was born in 1953, so he  
2 seems to have gone to Dr Guthrie's when he was about 12  
3 or 13.

4 He says:

5 'Dr Guthrie's Boys' School was in a big stone built  
6 building in its own grounds on Lasswade Road, at  
7 Liberton, Edinburgh. Inside there were four dormitories  
8 upstairs, one called Argyll and another call Newhaven.  
9 I can't remember what the others were called.

10 'There was also a swimming pool inside and outside  
11 there was a square where we used to play. Mr GZP was  
12 SNR, although I never saw much of him. SNR  
13 SNR was a guy called Mr GII, I think. He was  
14 a small man in his 50s and was balding and wore glasses.  
15 I had heard he used to be a bare knuckle fighter.

16 'I would say there were maybe ten staff in total who  
17 were all men, except for one lady who came in to teach.  
18 Among the rest of the staff I remember a man called  
19 Mr GHZ, he was a bit more approachable than the  
20 others. They were all pretty strict.

21 'I would estimate there were between 80 and 100-  
22 boys at Dr Guthrie's. Perhaps there could have been  
23 more. I think the youngest would have been about 12 and  
24 the oldest about 14.'

25 LADY SMITH: Just a moment, Mr Sheldon. Have we got

1 a problem with displaying this statement?

2 MR SHELDON: I didn't give you the statement reference.

3 I do beg your pardon. WIT-1-000001040.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 MR SHELDON: He goes on at paragraph 12, page 3, to talk

6 about routine. He says he doesn't remember anything

7 about being taken to Dr Guthrie's:

8 'As far as I remember nobody told me why I was being

9 moved from ...'.

10 His previous placement:

11 '... whether that was just to have been a temporary

12 placement or whether I was moved because they couldn't

13 handle me, I don't know. There is certainly mention in

14 my records of behavioural problems.'.

15 So it certainly seems he has seen some records,

16 my Lady.

17 LADY SMITH: Mm hmm.

18 MR SHELDON: 'I think there were between ten and twenty boys

19 in each of the four dormitories. We were woken early in

20 the morning and had to get washed at the sinks before we

21 got dressed and went downstairs to the canteen for

22 breakfast. At the side of our beds we all had a wee

23 unit where we kept our clothes.

24 'After breakfast we went outside to the square to

25 play. I don't remember being at school in the morning.



1 After lunch we were back out on the square and then we  
2 went in for school. I don't remember having any chores  
3 to do at any time.

4 'In the evening, it was lights out about 8.00pm and  
5 staff used to patrol about telling whoever might have  
6 been making a noise to be quiet.

7 'I'm not sure what happened if a boy wet their bed.  
8 I could have done it myself. I don't recall. I think  
9 boys who wet their bed had a rubber sheet, but I don't  
10 remember what happened to them. I have no recollection  
11 of any boy being punished for wetting their bed.

12 'We all ate together in the canteen and the food was  
13 alright. There was enough of it and everyone ate it  
14 all. But we did have to eat it quickly. Breakfast was  
15 usually porridge and, later, there might be mince and  
16 tatties. We also got jam sponge occasionally.

17 'There were eight showers next to the dormitories  
18 and we all had to have a shower every night. In the  
19 morning we'd just wash ourselves at the sink.

20 'We all wore the same clothes which were thick  
21 corduroy shorts, a shirt and a jacket. Dr Guthrie's  
22 provided everything and it all got washed once a week.  
23 I recall that there was a big cupboard where clothes  
24 were put on a rail on wheels and it was then pushed back  
25 in for everything to dry.

1           'Most of our leisure time was spent in the square  
2           where everybody would be standing about chatting. Some  
3           boys used to do some skating and everyone was in little  
4           groups. I don't remember any free time at night and  
5           I don't think there was a TV.

6           'I do remember playing football on a Sunday and now  
7           and again at other times. One time I managed to score  
8           a goal from the halfway line. One of the staff,  
9           Mr GHZ, was an ex-footballer and I thought he was  
10          a good man. There was another member of staff involved  
11          with the football too and he was okay as well.

12          'Those two staff put my name and another two boys'  
13          names forward to train with either Heart of Midlothian  
14          or Hibernian football clubs. I went a few times, but  
15          nothing came of it. One of the other two was really  
16          good at dribbling and I thought he'd become a  
17          professional footballer, but I don't know if he did.

18          'We also went swimming twice a week in the pool at  
19          Dr Guthrie's, but there wasn't much else. We were never  
20          taken to the cinema or anything like that. We had some  
21          school in the afternoon, but there wasn't much. There  
22          might have been some school in the morning as well, but  
23          I don't recall. There would be 15 or 20 boys in the  
24          classroom and we were taught in a room upstairs by  
25          a lady teacher who was brought in. I always used to sit

1 right at the back and never learned much.

2 'There was reference in my records to something  
3 about a doctor, but I can't read it and I don't recall  
4 seeing a doctor or a dentist at any time.

5 'Religion wasn't a big thing at Dr Guthrie's.  
6 I don't even remember going to church on a Sunday.

7 'I remember we went camping in big brown army tents  
8 for two or three weeks in a field near the beach where  
9 Torness Nuclear Plant is now. I remember walking to  
10 Dunbar and picking shells up on the beach while we were  
11 there.

12 'Another time, we went to Forfar, where we stayed in  
13 what would now be called a log cabin. There were maybe  
14 about eight boys there for two or three days and we  
15 spent most of the time walking in the hills. I remember  
16 finding antlers and being shown how things are made out  
17 of them, which was quite interesting.

18 'Birthdays weren't celebrated at all. When  
19 Christmas came some people used to go home, but I never  
20 did and nor did a few of the other boys. I don't  
21 remember if there was anything special done by the staff  
22 at Christmas. I don't even remember if there was  
23 a Christmas tree.

24 'I had no visits from any social worker or official  
25 of any sort and I don't remember anyone coming to see

1 other boys either. I don't remember anyone from outside  
2 coming to inspect the place at any time either. The  
3 only one of my family that came to see me at  
4 Dr Guthrie's was my older brother. He had joined the  
5 army and I think he was probably about to go to Germany.  
6 I would say he came after I had been at Dr Guthrie's for  
7 about a month and I remember standing talking to him at  
8 the door for a short time before he left. There was  
9 a member of staff standing with us and my brother just  
10 told me to look after myself and went away and that was  
11 the last time I saw him.

12 'It was a very strict regime at Dr Guthrie's. We  
13 were shouted at a lot and we had to stick to a lot of  
14 rules. If we had finished a meal, for example, we had  
15 to sit with our arms crossed and stare straight ahead  
16 until we were told we could leave the table.

17 'Early one morning ten or fifteen boys, including  
18 me, ran away from Dr Guthrie's. We slid down a fire  
19 escape pole from the dormitories and we all scattered.  
20 A lot of the other boys were caught fairly quickly, but  
21 three or four of us stayed out all night. Later on the  
22 next day we were caught by the police and taken back.'

23 Under the heading of 'Abuse at Dr Guthrie's', he  
24 says:

25 'There was always a member of staff watching us when

1 we showered and when we went swimming. The staff made  
2 us swim in the nude. We never wore trunks. The boys  
3 were all the same age group, but during the winter they  
4 also told us to go outside and roll in the snow in the  
5 field with no clothes on before going into the pool.  
6 I can't remember the staffs' names, but there were  
7 a couple of them.

8 'The staff who watched us varied, depending on their  
9 shifts, and I suppose I didn't think much of it at the  
10 time. You just did what you were told. Looking back  
11 though, I think that was a bit weird. I think there was  
12 maybe something sexual about it.

13 'At that time we used to get the belt at school and  
14 I got it a couple of times at Dr Guthrie's. However  
15 that wasn't the worst punishment. One time I got in  
16 trouble for something and Mr GII [REDACTED] SNR  
17 SNR [REDACTED] at Dr Guthrie's, punished me for it. He told me  
18 to clench my fist and hold it out and when I did he  
19 brought his clenched fist down on mine. He hit me very  
20 hard with his knuckles and it was painful. He did that  
21 on three separate occasions during my time at  
22 Dr Guthrie's, including after I'd run away.'

23 He says:

24 'I never reported anything that happened to me at  
25 Dr Guthrie's to anyone. There was nobody that I could

1 have spoken to anyway.'

2 He notes that he knows that he was then moved to  
3 Geilsland in [REDACTED] 1968. He would then have been 14  
4 and all he remembers of leaving Dr Guthrie's is being  
5 told to pack his stuff and heading off in a car that was  
6 waiting outside:

7 'It was only me that was taken and the car was  
8 driven by one of the staff Dr Guthrie's straight up to  
9 Beith.'

10 My Lady has heard about his experiences at  
11 Geilsland, where he experienced marked physical abuse in  
12 the form of clearly irregular corporal punishment.

13 LADY SMITH: Yes.

14 MR SHELDON: I think the material on 'Impact' was taken at  
15 that time as well. But it's perhaps worth noting, in  
16 common with the last applicant, that he says when he  
17 left Geilsland:

18 'My reading, writing and spelling was very poor.  
19 I tried to teach myself over the years, but even to this  
20 day it's not good.'

21 So that, my Lady, is 'Jacob'.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

23 That is nearly 4 o'clock. We'll stop then for today  
24 and resume at 10 o'clock tomorrow morning with an oral  
25 witness, who will be the first of -- remind me: how many

1 witnesses tomorrow?

2 MR SHELDON: Two in the morning, my Lady.

3 LADY SMITH: That's great. Very well.

4 Before I rise, three names, one, people who were  
5 present during the Geilsland evidence will remember me  
6 mentioning **EZD** name. He's not to be  
7 identified outside this room and we have also had  
8 Mr **GVI** and **GIC** known as **GIC**. He's  
9 not to be identified outside here either.

10 I'll rise now until tomorrow morning.

11 (3.56 pm)

12 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am  
13 on Wednesday, 29 May 2024)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1	INDEX	
2		PAGE
3	Submissions by Mr Sheldon .....	1
4	Submissions by Mr Macpherson .....	3
5	Alison Scott (affirmed) .....	6
6	Questions by Mr Sheldon .....	7
7	'John' (read) .....	89
8	'John' (read) .....	116
9	'David' (read) .....	128
10	'Jacob' (read) .....	142
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		



